The Right to the City from a Local to a Global Perspective
The Case of Street Vendor and Marketer Organizations in Urban Areas in the Copperbelt, Zambia

Lennert Jongh
ABSTRACT

Jongh, Lennert (2013). *The Right to the City from a Local to Global Perspective: The Case of Street Vendor and Marketer Organizations in Urban Areas in the Copperbelt, Zambia*

Human Geography, advanced level, master thesis for master exam in Human Geography, 30 ECTS credits.
Supervisor: Ilda Lindell
Language: English

The aim of this thesis is to investigate the workings of multi-scalar networks that connect informal economy organizations that are active locally, nationally and internationally. The study adopts a ‘right to the city’ framework wherein the relation between the local and the global is discussed. The main questions that were addressed in the research were (I) how do local, national and global networks among street vendors and marketers and their organizations shape the resistances of street vendors and marketers and (II) how do local, national and international networks among organizations that work for street vendors and marketers contribute to street vendors’ and marketers’ claims to the rights to the city. Qualitative interviews were conducted with street and market vendors operating from urban areas in the Zambian Copperbelt as well as with organizations dealing with market and street vendors in the same geographical area. Results showed that networks operating on different geographical scales served the street and market vendors as well as their organizations different purposes. Findings are related to the relative importance of the global for the local as well as contemporary theories of democracy and citizenship.

Key words: street vendor organization, market vendor organization, informal economy, urban Africa, right to the city, local, global.
SUMMARY

The present study investigated the workings of networks that were formed among marketers and street vendors, as well as among organizations that work for marketers and street vendors. The study adopted two theoretical perspectives that were considered of relevance to the findings. The first theoretical stance discusses the relation between the local and the global. The importance of the local for achieving globalization or global change has been discussed by many scholars and has implications for the importance of local resistances. For the present study, the researcher not only attempted to show how local resistances and strategies can have global implications, but also to investigate how international networks affect local resistances. The second theoretical stance was considered especially of relevance for urban resistances. The researcher used the ‘right to the city’ framework to discuss how street vendors and marketers, organizations and their networks attempted to increase the access of street vendors and marketers to different processes that involve the production and use of urban space. The researcher perceived claims on the right to the city as having implications for new understandings of citizenship and democracy, too.

Two research questions were developed: (I) how do local, national and global networks among street vendors and marketers and their organizations shape the resistances of street vendors and marketers and (II) how do local, national and international networks among organizations that work for street vendors and marketers contribute to street vendors’ and marketers’ claims to the rights to the city.

The field work of this thesis was conducted in three urban areas in the Zambian Copperbelt. Qualitative interviews were held by the researcher with street vendors and marketers, representatives of their organizations and with the authorities. To assess the influence of networks on the functioning of these organizations, organizations with and without an (inter)national network were included. Similarly, among street vendors and marketers both members and non-members were included to assess the benefits that street vendors and marketers experienced from their membership to an organization.

Findings showed that networks on different scales, as well as those formed among marketers and street vendors compared to those formed by organizations, had different functions. For instance, local networks among marketers and street vendors served to provide knowledge about businesses or financial support. Local organizations, on the other hand, were also able to provide the marketers and street vendors with one voice while negotiating with local authorities regarding the existence of markets or street vending in the city. National networks provided information regarding how street vendors and marketers engaged in their businesses elsewhere, and how organizations dealt with the local authorities. International networks provided the national and local organizations insights in possible solutions that were usually then also proposed to the local and national authorities in negotiations. Results indicated that street vendors and marketers attempted to ensure their right to the city by collaborating with the local authorities. Negotiations were to be held by their organizations, as marketers and street vendors were powerless in negotiations with local or national authorities.

The findings were discussed by showing how global networks affected local resistances, and how local resistances contributed to knowledge regarding strategies on a national level. The importance of organizations for achieving a right to the city of street vendors and marketers were discussed through notions of ‘insurgent citizenship’ and ‘deep democracy.’
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 1: Introduction</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Cities in the ‘global South’</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Informality, Urban Governance and Organizing in Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 The Informal Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 Urban Governance and Organizing in Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Overview Study</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Research Questions</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Organization of the Thesis</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 2: Theoretical Framework</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Glocalization</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Globalization and the Role of the Local</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 The Local versus the Global</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4 Politics of Resistance</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5 Networks between ‘Places’</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 The Right to the City</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 Lefebvre’s Right to the City</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Implications of Lefebvre’s Ideas</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 Its Potential and Critiques</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4 Recent Developments of Lefebvre’s Ideas</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4.1 Deep Democracy</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4.2 Insurgent Citizenship</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 3: Methods</strong></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Qualitative Interviews</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Ethical Issues</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Participants</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 Selection of Organizations</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Approach of the Organizations</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Selection and Approach of Participants</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Interviews</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1 With Street Vendors and Marketeers</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2 With Representatives of Organizations</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3 Conducting the Interviews</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Limitations</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Discussion</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 4: The Setting</strong></td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 National Context
   4.2.1 Socio-Economic Situation 30
   4.2.2 Political Situation for Street Vendors and Marketers 30
4.3 Description of the Area 32
4.4 Organizations of Interest 34
   4.4.1 Alliance for Zambian Informal Economy Associations 35
   4.4.2 Marketers Organizations 35
   4.4.3 Street Vendor Organizations 36
   4.4.4 Other Organizations 37
4.5 Related Organizations 38
   4.5.1 National and Local Authorities 38
   4.5.2 Zambian Congress of Trade Unions 38
4.6 Conclusion 38

Chapter 5: Glocalization and the Right to the City in the Copperbelt 39
5.1 Introduction 39
5.2 Organizing at the Local Level 39
   5.2.1 Informal Networks 39
   5.2.2 Formal Networks 42
   5.2.3 Effects of National Networks on Local Organizations 44
   5.2.4 Effects of International Networks on Local Organizations 45
5.3 Organizing at the National Level 47
5.4 Organizing at the International Level 49
5.5 The Right to the City 50
   5.5.1 At the Local Level 50
   5.5.2 At the National Level 52
   5.5.3 At the International Level 52
5.6 Conclusion 53

Chapter 6: Discussion 55
6.1 Introduction 55
6.2 Aim and Research Questions of the Study 55
6.3 Findings related to Glocalization 56
   6.3.1 From Local Resistances to Global Changes 56
   6.3.2 From Global Networks to Local Resistances 57
6.4 Findings related to Right to the City 58
   6.4.1 Lefebvre's Right to the City 58
   6.4.2 Changes in Citizenship and Democracy 59
6.5 Limitations 60

Chapter 7: Conclusion 61

Bibliography 62

Appendices 66
   1: Questionnaires Street Vendors and Marketers 66
      Street Vendors 66
      Marketers 67
   2: Questionnaire Representatives Organizations 68
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The present thesis would not have been possible without the continuous support and guidance of my supervisor, Ilda Lindell. She has been extremely valuable in providing new insights to the empirical material and offered continuously other suggestions for improvements. The Nordic Africa Institute and SIDA are to be thanked for providing the opportunity for the researcher to conduct a field study in Sub-Saharan Africa.

The many participants and participating organizations are to be thanked as well. The enthusiasm and openness of the interviewed organizations and marketers and street vendors significantly facilitated the conduct of the field study for the researcher. The academic support provided by the Copperbelt University, University of Zambia and Southern African Institute for Policy and Research helped the researcher to understand urban life in Zambia and provided a framework which also facilitated the conduct of the field study.
ABBREVIATIONS

AZIEA  Alliance for Zambian Informal Economy Associations
CBTA  Cross-Borders Traders Association
GDP  Gross Domestic Product
ILO  International Labor Organization
KCC  Kitwe City Council
KR  Kwacha Rebased
LCC  Lusaka City Council
MLGH  Ministry of Local Government and Housing
MMD  Movement for Multiparty Democracy
MNC  Multinational Corporation
NCC  Ndola City Council
PF  Patriotic Front
SAP  Structural Adjustment Programme
SSA  Sub-Saharan Africa
VAN  Vendors Association of Ndola
WIEGO  Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing
WYLM  Watch Your Life Movement
USVF  United Street Vendor Foundation
ZANAMA  Zambian National Marketers Association
ZATMA  Zambian Traders and Marketers Association
ZCTU  Zambian Congress of Trade Unions
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

1.1 CITIES IN THE ‘GLOBAL SOUTH’

Currently, about half of the population resides in urban areas. Current and historical trends suggest that the urban population is about to grow much more rapidly than the non-urban population, especially in developing countries. For instance, in Africa, the current urban population of about 408 million urban residents is expected to grow with about 80% to 742 million urban residents in 2030 (UNFPA, 2007, p. 7-8). Urban environments become thus more and more important as the majority of the citizens will live in these environments. These trends are especially visible for the ‘global South’\(^1\), where in 2030 80% of the total global urban population resides (UNFPA, 2007, p. 7-8).

Another reason that urban environments are especially important for our societies, is related to the resistances that are often located in these environments. Cities offer opportunities for ordinary citizens to instigate political changes. For instance, revolutions in the Middle East, also known as the Arab Spring, were mainly initiated from within the urban centers.

Arguments between scholars differ as to why urban environments are often the center of resistances and political changes. Some have looked at the site-specific characteristics of cities. For instance, Sassen (2004) considers cities to be the most optimal location for mobilizing large amounts of residents. Others have identified resistances as an opposing force to globalization. They, therefore, argued that resistances should be aimed against the driving force of this globalizing power. Some, for instance, have identified the capitalist class as the driving force behind globalization, and they merely perceive cities as a strategic battlefield for resisting the powerful capitalist class (e.g., Harvey, 2003). Other scholars have identified multinational corporations (MNCs) as the driving force behind globalization. According to them, the location of MNCs in (global) cities, therefore explains why the majority of the resistances are taking place in cities (e.g., Sassen, 1996, 2004).

The importance of cities for the current era of globalization becomes clear when we consider the various attempts that scholars have done to describe the importance of each city, by looking at the transnational connections between cities. These so-called ‘global cities’ are especially crucial for the contemporary global political economy as the majority of the MNCs are located in these cities (Sassen, 1996). Yet, almost all of these cities are located in the ‘global North’\(^2\) (e.g., Friedmann, 1986). But yet, different findings suggest that ideas about a ‘global city’ aspires many city-planners and politicians in the ‘global South’ and thereby affect their ideas about how a city should look like (e.g., Robinson, 2006). For instance, the informal economy, which forms a great part of the national economy in the majority of countries in the ‘global South’ (World Bank, 2010) is largely neglected or even pressured to disappear by local and national authorities (Robins & Askoy, 1996). Although the majority of the research on

---

\(^1\) Scholars generally refer to the ‘global South’ as consisting of the Caribbean and Latin America, Africa and Asia. These geographical areas are expected to include all the developing nations globally.

\(^2\) Scholars generally refer to the ‘global North’ as the developed world, and includes the continents North America, Europe and Oceania.
global cities has been conducted in the ‘global North’, studies on cities in the ‘global South’ have also shown a hampered local development and a neglect of the needs of the local residents (Robinson, 2006, p. 221-2) due to their aspirations to become ‘global’.

The present study aims to shed more light on urban processes in the ‘global South’, and more specifically in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), by studying organizations that work with street vendors and marketers in different urban areas in Zambia.

The link between the local and the global, shortly explored above as well, is to be more rigorously investigated in the present study. Scholars have extensively discussed the extent to which local resistances can be considered useful in countering globalization (for instance, as in the cities described above). Yet, so far, only Lindell (2009) showed the importance of a global network for local resistances. The present study is designed to continue this research by studying whether, and how, a global scope of organizations is beneficial for local resistances.

This first chapter serves different purposes. First, a description will be provided of the background of informality, urban governance and organizing in SSA. The theories will be shortly introduced here as well. Second, the present research including the research questions and the organization of the thesis are discussed.

1.2 INFORMALITY, URBAN GOVERNANCE AND ORGANIZING IN SUB-SAHARA AFRICA

1.2.1 The Informal Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa

Different meanings have been attached to the concept of the ‘informal sector’ (McGrath & King, 1995), in this paper we adopt the definition as provided by the International Labor Organization (ILO; ILO, 1997, as cited in ILO, 2004, p. 64):

“Very small units producing and distributing goods and services, consisting largely of independent self-employed producers in the urban and rural areas of developing countries, some of whom also employ family labor and/or a few hired apprentices, which operate with very little capital or none at all; which utilize a low level of productivity; and which generally provide very low and irregular incomes and highly unstable employment to those who work in it.”

This definition portraits workers in the informal sector as mostly unregistered, unregulated and as unable to access organized markets or institutional support. Even if they are registered or covered by some aspects of the law, then they are still often unprotected in the workplace by social security and labor legislation (ILO, 2004, p. 64).

Street vendors and marketers form one part of the informal sector, as working in the independent service sector. Other sectors are, for instance, formal sector employees and self-employed who work part-time in the informal sector, unpaid household or family labor (ILO, 2004, p. 64).

Although in the past the informal sector was mainly perceived as a transitory phase that characterized economies in developing countries, nowadays the recognition of the importance and permanency of this sector has been widely acknowledged (e.g., Burbach et al., 1997; Castells, 1998). The informal sector provides employment and income-generating opportunities for (formally) unemployed people and plays a key role in the distribution chain of goods and services, especially in the rural areas. Informal activities are considered not only to be crucial for the poor, but also for the development
of the economy in general. Recent studies show the linkages and interdependencies between the formal and the informal sector. For instance, Castells and Portes (1989) showed that in a variety of contexts, large firms exploit labor in the unregulated, informal, economy to cut down the production costs.

The growth of the informal sector in Africa has been generally attributed to the collapse of the state. For instance, Hart (1992) concluded that the crisis of state capitalism that led to the neoliberal reforms in the 1990s and the Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) have had enormous costs due to the inability or failure of many governments to provide jobs or housing. In combination with the high levels of poverty, low levels of education and high rates of HIV/AIDS in southern African countries, this has led to an exacerbation of the problems, with increasing inequalities as a consequence (Poku, 2001), thereby affecting the distribution of social groups and activities in African cities (Mulenga, 2001).

Estimates by the The World Bank (2010, p. 20-4) suggest that the informal economy in SSA produces between 30 (South Africa) to over 60 percent (Tanzania) of the total Gross Domestic Product (GDP), making SSA globally the region with the second-highest, after Latin America and The Caribbean, average percentage of informal activities (The World Bank, 2010, p. 33). Moreover, of all the measured countries within SSA, the percentage of GDP produced in the informal economy has grown from 1999 to 2007 (The World Bank, 2010, p. 20-4), suggesting an increasing importance of the informal sector for economies in SSA.

Of the informal employment, an estimated 70 percent takes the form of self-employment in SSA (ILO, 2002). A majority of the self-employed are street vendors and marketers, as they mostly work independently and on their own. They are mostly found in urban areas, as these areas offer them the best opportunities for their businesses (e.g., Hansen, 1997, p. 34). Yet, their existence is often threatened by the local authorities (Robins & Askoy, 1996), for instance, as they prefer having a modern market or a city without street vendors.

1.2.2 Urban Governance and Organizing in Sub-Saharan Africa

Despite that the majority of the workers in SSA is part of the unregulated, or informal economy, they have been put under severe stress by the local authorities, who have, more often than not, not been very supportive of vending, be it on the streets or in the markets (e.g., Hansen, 2004). Generally, such behaviors of the authorities have been attributed to their desires of becoming a ‘global city’, which does not have place for an informal economy (e.g., Robins & Askoy, 1996).

The neglect of city planners and politicians for the needs and well-being of their own citizens, especially the poorest, creates a need for the urban poor to organize themselves. For instance, they need to create a voice which enables them to negotiate with the local authorities about their desires and needs. It is therefore that these urban organizations often advocate their resistances under the notion of the ‘right to the city’. A term originally from Lefebvre (2006, p. 413), which has currently inspired not only local organizations, but also scientists to deploy different visions of the city (e.g., Purcell, 2002). These alternative visions of the city are often accompanied by particular theories of citizenship and democracy as well (e.g., Holston, 1998; Appadurai, 2001).

In their efforts to represent the poorer urban inhabitants, urban local organizations have often also formed (international) linkages among themselves. These linkages have led, for instance, to the formation of an international organization...
involved in issues that street vendors face all over the world, StreetNet International. By doing so, these organizations have led to the formation of the so-called, ‘globalization from below’ or ‘global civil society’ (e.g., Hardt & Negri, 2000). Furthermore, this has stimulated debates between scholars regarding the importance of ‘place’ and ‘space’ for the local struggles (e.g., Hardt & Negri, 2000), including debates on scale (e.g., Lindell, 2009).

These theories will be further elaborated in the theoretical framework.

1.3 OVERVIEW STUDY

The present study explores the organization of street vendors and marketers from the local to the global scale. The study focused on different organizations that work with street vendors and marketers. The importance of transnational networks has extensively been discussed by Lindell (2009), for instance, and suggests that global networks are not only beneficial for organizations’ operations abroad, but are also valuable for the resistance strategies of local and national organizations. The present study intends to substantiate these suggestions by examining the effectiveness of global networks for national organizations, and of national and global networks for locally operating organizations.

The present study also attempts to understand how scalar relations, between the local, national and the global, shape street vendors’ and marketers’ claims to the right to the city. This study considers these claims to be dependent on street vendors’ and marketers’ membership to an organization which forms networks locally, nationally and globally. The present study also considers these claims to be related to the development of new understandings of democracy (Appadurai, 2001) and citizenship (Holston, 1998, 2009).

The study was conducted in three towns in the Zambian Copperbelt. Conducting field work in different towns allowed the researcher the opportunity to explore different challenges that street vendors and marketers faced in these areas, as well as how the organizations, that operate in these different geographical areas, functioned.

1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

One of the core aims of this study is to investigate the relation between local and global influences. The following research question has been developed therefore,

*How do local, national and global networks among street vendors and marketers and their organizations shape the resistances of street vendors and marketers?*

With this research question, the researcher aimed to unravel how networks that are formed at a local, national and a global level shape resistance strategies of street vendors and marketers. The researcher aimed to make a distinction between networks that are being formed among street vendors and marketers themselves, and among organizations that work for street vendors and marketers. The researcher aimed to unravel the different functions that networks at different scales fulfill.

The second, more specific, question that was developed, was

*How do local, national and international networks among organizations that work for street vendors and marketers contribute to street vendors’ and marketers’ claims to the rights to the city?*
With this research question, the researcher aimed specifically to examine whether networks at different scales, such as local, national and global, contribute differently to the claims of street vendors and marketers to the right to the city. The researcher was, for instance, interested in whether local networks shape these claims differently than national networks. Furthermore, the researcher also aimed at exploring whether efforts of organizations that work for street vendors and marketers also generated new forms of democracy and citizenship among street vendors and marketers. The researcher considered these new forms of democracy and citizenship to be related to the rights to the city. The next chapter discusses these concepts more thoroughly.

1.5 ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS

The present chapter provided an introduction to the thesis. It briefly introduced the general context, informality and SSA, organizing capacities among informal workers, and the theories and research questions. The relation between the local and the global and the right to the city theoretical accounts are further elaborated in the next chapter.

The methods that the researcher has used to explore the theories in a field study, are described in chapter three. Chapter four presents the local context in which the field study was conducted. The relatedness of the local and the global in organizations working for street vendors and marketers in urban areas in the Zambian Copperbelt is reported in chapter five. In this chapter, the claims that are being made by street vendors and marketers and their organizations to the right to the city are also reported.

In chapter six, the findings from the field study that was conducted in the Zambian Copperbelt are related to the theories. Chapter seven concludes with a summary of the findings in relation to the theories.
CHAPTER 2
THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 INTRODUCTION

In order to understand how resistances are being fought in the ‘global South’, the current chapter describes two relevant theories. The first theoretical stance is relevant for understanding the effects of the local on the global and vice versa. The scope of local organizations has often expanded across local boundaries and includes national organizations or networks, and sometimes even international organizations. In the first section a description is provided that links insights from different scholars about the relation between the local and the global and the functioning of networks on a local to a global scale.

The second theoretical stance that is presented in this chapter is chosen to provide an understanding resistances in an area of particular interest for this thesis, that is urban areas. This theoretical stance describes the origin of the idea of the ‘right to the city’ and contemporary developments about how to accomplish the right to the city by different scholars.

These theories will be used in chapter six to provide an understanding of the findings of this study which are presented in chapter five.

2.2 GLOCALIZATION

2.2.1 Introduction

In the first part of this chapter the relation between the local and the global is described. By doing so, this part aims at showing that resistances at the local level are important for achieving global changes and how global networks facilitate local resistances. Major theories on connecting local places, for instance by establishing global networks ‘from below’ are also discussed.

2.2.2 Globalization and the Role of the Local

The effectiveness of local resistances has been seriously doubted by a number of scholars (e.g., Hardt & Negri, 2000; Robinson, 2007ab). These and many other scholars perceive globalization, and the spread of capitalism and neoliberalism as the main motive of the existence of resistances (e.g., Sassen, 1996; Harvey, 2003, Bromley, 2003; Meiksins-Wood, 2006). Therefore, they also urge that resistances should be aimed towards influencing the driving forces behind globalization. As these scholars have identified different driving forces of globalization, they also consider different resistance strategies to be the most suitable. For instance, Hardt and Negri (2000) acknowledge that the global comes from all earth’s residents (‘multitude’), yet they together constitute a global structure that needs, for this reason, to be resisted on a global scope in order to be successful. Others have argued that resistance is the most effective on a national level, as nation-states still affect largely how globalization is expressed on a national level (e.g., Harvey, 2003; Meiksins-Wood, 2006), or that resistances should be directed towards United States, as they are the drivers of the contemporary era of globalization (Bromley, 2003). Less territorial bounded resistances are expected to be the most successful according to Robinson (2007ab) and Sassen...
(2004). Robinson (2007ab) perceives the transnational capital class, which has no geographical boundaries, as the driving force behind globalization, which suggests that struggles should also be transnational in order to be fruitful. Sassen (2004), on the other hand, considers cities to play an important role in the production of globalization. According to her, globalization is produced by MNCs which are primarily located in (global) cities, and resistances against globalization should therefore also take place here. Furthermore, Sassen (2004), identified cities also as the optimal location where resistances against globalization could be taking place, as it is here where both formal and non-formal political actors are present, and where people with different cultural and national backgrounds live together.

What becomes evident in these different theories is the differing importance that is attached to the local in globalization. Some scholars interpret globalization to be just a global phenomenon, which also needs to be resisted on a global scale (e.g., Hardt & Negri, 2000; Robinson, 2007ab), whereas others consider certain political territories to be important mediators in these processes (e.g., Harvey, 2003; Meiksins-Wood, 2006), and Sassen (2004) even grounded global processes in different localities. Subsequently, the value that these scholars attach to local resistances is also very different. The discussion on the role of the local is to be further elaborated on the next section, wherein the local and the global will be discussed as a binary.

2.2.3 The Local versus the Global

Very different meanings have been attached to the local and the global. Often, the local is even portrayed as a victim of globalization (Massey, 2004, p. 14). For instance, Escobar (2001, p. 155-6) associated the global ‘with space, capital, history and agency while the local, conversely, is linked to place, labor and tradition – as well as with women, minorities, the poor and, one might add, local cultures.’ Thus, the ‘global is represented as sufficient, whole, powerful, and transformative in relation to which the local is deficient, fragmented, weak and acted upon’ (Gibson-Graham, 2002, p. 27). In this binary of the global and the local, they are not only associated with different attributes, but the global is even considered to have more power than the local (Gibson-Graham, 2002, p. 29; Marston et al., 2005, p. 427).

Yet, as shown in the account as provided above by Hardt and Negri (2000), it is the local that constitutes the global. Thus, the local-global binary could be challenged on the basis that both constitute each other (Massey, 2004, p. 15). The relation between the local and the global, and place and space, becomes obvious in the ‘global city’ theory of Sassen (1991), for instance.

In her theory, Sassen (1991) provides an account of the groundedness of global forces in local places. She speaks about ‘global cities’ as cities where many MNCs have their head quarters and from there steer their production process and the entire management of the corporation. These ‘global cities’ are therefore the local groundedness of globalization. One could perceive ‘global cities’ therefore as the result of globalization. Yet, as command centers of many MNCs are located in these ‘global cities’, they are also the centers where globalization is being produced and maintained (Sassen, 1991). The importance of place becomes clearer when she recognizes the significance of affiliated and subsidiary institutions that characterize certain cities which attracts these MNCs towards these places (Sassen, 1991). Such findings suggest possibilities of local politics to intervene in creating the conditions for shaping a global city (Allen, 2003). The absence of MNCs in other cities also suggests that the relation
between the global and the local varies between places (e.g., the global is more present in global cities than in other cities). Consequently, the influence of local politics to challenge globalization possibly also varies between places. Moreover, such findings even suggest, in the case of global cities for instance, that to ‘challenge globalization’ might also mean to challenge, rather than defending, certain local places (Massey, 2004, p. 20).

The above discussion shows the importance to ‘appreciate the interrelatedness of the geographical scales and, in particular, the idea that while the ‘local’ exists within the ‘global’ the ‘global’ also exists within the ‘local’’ (Dicken, 2000, p. 459). This two-way relationship between the local and the global has been termed globalization (Swyngedouw, 1997), and it suggests that globalization is simultaneously taking place from ‘above’ as from ‘below’ (Murray, 2006, p. 56). These findings suggest that one needs to focus also on multiple scales of analysis to understand the forces of globalization (Lindell, 2009).

This discussion suggests that processes both on a local as on a global level are involved in the production of globalization. Both should be considered as important drivers of globalization. Furthermore, some localities can be considered to be more important in steering globalization than others. Such findings would also suggest that local resistances might be more fruitful in certain localities than in others. Generally, the theories presented here have also implications for resistance strategies. These will be elaborated in the next section.

2.2.4 Politics of Resistance

As introduced briefly above, successful resistance strategies have been widely discussed among different scholars (e.g., Harvey, 2003; Hardt & Negri, 2000). These discussions have resulted in two opposing perspectives. The first perspective considers local, place-based, resistances to be viable against globalization (e.g., Gibson-Graham, 2002, 2008; Sassen, 1991), whereas the second perspective emphasizes the transnational character of resistances (e.g., Hardt & Negri, 2000).

The first perspective, which stresses the agency of the local subjects, corresponds largely with Massey’s (2004) and Sassen’s (1991) theories, wherein they ground globalization in local places. The second perspective, which stresses the importance of transnational networks as resistance strategies, is, on the other hand, more congruent with notions of ‘globalization from below’ and the existence of a ‘global civil society’. These ideas resemble more the stances of Hardt and Negri (2000), for instance, where they also advocate the agency of the global and neglect agency of the local for opposing global forces.

Contemporary resistance analyses have tended to focus on either one of these particular scales as appropriate and sufficient for understanding resistance. However, in an attempt to reconcile these two different stances, Lindell (2009) argued that we need to understand the ‘mutual constitution of the local and the global in this context [which] opens up the possibility of a politics that combines resistance at multiple scales’ (Lindell, 2009, p. 126, emphasis in original). In her article, she showed how an international network of a local organization supports their activities and negotiating powers on a local level (Lindell, 2009, p. 132). Not only is the members’ increased international knowledge facilitating their resistance, interventions from international alliances of the organization also showed how local politics can be influenced by global networks (Lindell, 2009, p. 132). Thus, she showed how both the local and global scale
are mutually constituted, and how global networks facilitated local resistances. Her findings are congruent with attempts by Massey (2007) and Amin (2004) who also emphasized the importance of interactions at a variety of scales to construct a notion of a ‘place’.

Instead of focusing on how the local and the global constitute global processes, Lindell (2009) argued that we should also look at how global processes affect local processes. Adopting such a perspective would allow us not only to be able to constitute the global, but also to constitute the local from both the global and the local. Therefore, such an approach would significantly contribute to the notion of ‘glocalization’, and the idea where the ‘global’ is also present in the ‘local’. This theory is considered to be very relevant for discussing the present findings, which will be done in chapter six. Arguments of others, for instance Routledge (2003) and Cumbers et al. (2008) follow a similar line of reasoning. They will be shortly introduced in the next section.

2.2.5 Networks between ‘Places’

Similar to Lindell (2009), Routledge (2003) also argued that contemporary grassroots globalization networks act on multiple scales, both local and transnational. For instance, resistances that become part of a network remain locally embedded in their specific context (Routledge, 2003, p. 336). More so, the identification of the activists with a particular place can also be of strategic importance for mobilizing others who identify themselves also with these places (Bosco, 2001). According to Routledge (2003, p. 337), many place-specific features offer possibilities for tensions within the networks, that may hamper the development of grassroots globalizing networks (Harvey, 1996).

Besides the important notion of scales in these networks as discussed by Routledge (2003), for a more detailed description of these networks, which are refered to as ‘global justice networks’, see Cumbers et al. (2008). For the present study, it is suffice to mention that Cumbers et al. (2008) also relate to Massey’s (2005) view of places, as drawing from both within and from the outside. Therefore, they perceive these networks as negotiating ‘action that is deeply embedded in particular places and the fostering of coalitions that are more spatially extensive’ (Cumbers et al., 2008, p. 193).

The theories that have been discussed above theories will be drawn from in order to confer meaning out of the findings that are presented later in this thesis. The relation between the local and the global and how networks are able to contribute to both local and global functioning, according to what has been found in the field study, will be further elaborated on in chapter six. In this chapter, a focus is put on the functioning of networks of marketers and street vendors, and their organizations, from a local to global perspective. These are, for instance, benefits that are derived from global networks for local organizing capacities.

In the remainder of this chapter, a description is now offered on resistances that in urban areas, which is the major focus of this thesis. The importance of such resistances has already been mentioned in the first chapter and briefly above (e.g., Sassen, 1991), but a more theoretical account is offered below. As described in the first chapter, street vendors and marketers often experience problems for guaranteeing their workplaces in urban areas. Therefore, organizations that work with street vendors and marketers often engage in negotiations with authorities to ensure that the needs of the
marketers and street vendors are being heard. For this reason, the present study adopted the ‘right to the city’ as an important theoretical stance.

2.3 THE RIGHT TO THE CITY

“The right to the city is [...] is a right to change and reinvent the city more after our heart’s desire. [...] The freedom to make and remake [...] our cities is [...] one of the most precious, yet most neglected of our human rights.” (Harvey, 2012, p. 3-4)

“Cities for people, not for profit.” (Marcuse, 2009, p. 195-6)

Cities are not only considered to be of crucial importance in the contemporary global political economy (e.g., Sassen, 1991), they have also been called ‘man’s most consistent and on the whole, his most successful attempt to remake the world he lives in more after his heart’s desire’ (Park, 1967, p. 3). Urban democratic principles have, for these reasons, gained enormous importance in the last decades, and even stimulated the creation of new forms of democracy, such as ‘deep democracy’ (Appadurai, 2001), and citizenship, such as ‘insurgent citizenship’ (Holston, 1998).

Yet, the idea of the ‘right to the city’ has been put forward already in 1968 by the French philosopher and sociologist Henri Lefebvre (Lefebvre, 1996a, p. 158-9). Urban political and economic reforms in the French capital Paris, wherein the rich could occupy the gentrified center and the poor inhabitants were forced to move to the rundown suburbs, led Lefebvre to conclude that the shape of the cities was no longer controlled by its inhabitants, but instead by profitability: capitalism (Purcell, 2002, p. 99). Lefebvre (1996a, p. 158), therefore, suggested radical political and economic reforms that would allow the city to be shaped according to ‘the interests of the whole society and firstly of all those who inhabit’. The right to the city would entail the reappropriation of the urban space by the city’s inhabitants.

Nowadays, Lefebvre’s ideas have created a common ground for the many urban resistances in the ‘global South’. Global capital flows have transformed the urban landscapes as well as the urban policies of the majority of the cities in the global south. Often at the expense of the local, poor, inhabitants of these places (e.g., Shatkin, 1998). Scientifically, discussions about an alternative urban landscape often involve changing democratic principles (e.g., Holston & Appadurai, 1996).

In the next section, the original ideas as put forward by Lefebvre are discussed, including its implications, potential and challenges. Afterwards, more contemporary ideas about urban democracy are described.

2.3.1 Lefebvre’s Right to the City

According to Lefebvre (1996b, p. 194-5), the right to the city “signifies the right of citizens and city dwellers, and of groups they (on the basis of social relations) constitute, to appear on all networks and circuits of communication, information and exchange.”

Although Lefebvre called it the right to the city, it is considered to be a moral claim, founded on principles of justice and ethics and morality, consisting of multiple rights. It is not just a right to public space, a right to information, or a right for a certain service,
rather it is the right to a totality. To be able to influence the shape of the city, and to allow for a more democratic and equitable city that permits to fulfill the needs of all urban inhabitants (Marcuse, 2009, p. 192-3).

Lefebvre attached the right to the city to ‘the right of not being marginalized in decision-making, nor to be channeled into certain political discussions or decision-making processes and not into others on the basis of one’s similarity or difference from other individuals or groups’ (McCann, 2002, p. 77-78). Thus, Lefebvre envisioned that all urban inhabitants, or even residents that depend on the city, should have a central place in the decision-making processes. If citizens elsewhere are affected by decisions being made in one city, then they should also be allowed to have a say in these processes (Purcell, 2002, p. 104).

The spatial perspective was essential in Lefebvre’s ideas. For instance, he acknowledged that achieving these objectives depended on ‘an essential quality of urban space: centrality’ (Lefebvre, 1996b, p. 195). According to Lefebvre, space is social as it is produced in reciprocal relations. It is both shaped by, and shapes social relations (Shields, 1998, p. 159-60). Lefebvre distinguished between three different notions of space (Lefebvre, 1991, p. 36-44). With the first, ‘conceived space’, he meant the conceptualized space, the mental constructions of, creative ideas about and representations of space. This domain was mainly dominated by ideologies of scientists, politicians, planners, etc. The second notion of space, ‘perceived space’, refers to the relatively objective, concrete space people encounter in their daily environment, and includes the prescribed appropriation of space as laid out by planners and others. It serves as the spatial grid we navigate in and thereby create continuity between ideology and daily practice in a taken-for-granted sense. Finally, he identified ‘lived space’ as the stage where social life unfolds, where the prescribed appropriation of space is contested. Here, the physical space is turned into symbolic space, where alternative appropriations and alternative conceptualizations of space are expressed (Lefebvre, 1991, p. 36-44).

In his theorizing, Lefebvre connected urban space with social relations, and thus producing urban space involves reproducing the social relations. Thus, the production of urban space is not just about planning the material space, it involves producing and reproducing all aspects of urban life. Subsequently, the right to the city also forms ‘a transformed and renewed right to urban life’ (Lefebvre, 1996, p. 158).

The right to the city involves two principal rights for urban inhabitants: the right to participation and the right to appropriation. The right to participation entails that urban inhabitants should play a central role in the decisions that contribute to the production of urban space. These decisions could be under the auspices of the state, like a policy decision, of capital, like an investment decision, of a multilateral institution, like WTO trading ruling, or another institute that influences the production of space in a city. Furthermore, these decisions can be made at different scales too. It could, for instance, involve any level of the state, for instance, national, provincial or local, or corporations which operate at any scale, for instance, global, national or local. Although Lefebvre is not completely clear regarding the exact role that inhabitants should play in these decisions, it is clear that they should have a central and direct role in the decision-making processes (Purcell, 2002, p. 102).

The other right, the right to appropriation maintains the right of inhabitants to physically access, occupy and use urban space. This notion is mainly used by those who advocate the right of the people to be physically present in the space of the city (e.g., Capron, 2002; Isin, 1999; Salmon, 2001). Lefebvre, however, includes a much broader
and structural meaning of the right to appropriation. For instance, according to Lefebvre (1996, p. 179), this right also entails the right to produce space, so that it meets all the needs of the inhabitants. Thus, the right to appropriation confronts directly with ‘the conception of urban space as private property, as a commodity to be valorized (or used to valorize other commodities) by the capitalist production process’ (Purcell, 2002, p. 102-3).

The present section showed the content of the original ideas of the right to the city as proposed by Lefebvre. His distinctions between different spaces (conceived, perceived, lived) and different specific rights (right to participation and appropriation) suggest that he proposed changes on different terrains regarding decision-making and political processes in urban environments. These different notions will be used when analyzing the findings of this study. Now, a description is offered which further elaborates his ideas.

2.3.2 Implications of Lefebvre’s Ideas

The ideas put forward by Lefebvre implied many changes in the current political economic rules and regulations. His ideas have been interpreted by a variety of scholars (e.g., Harvey, 2012) and the researcher considers his ideas to be connected to theories of other scholars as well (e.g., Holston 1998, Appadurai 2001). Below, a discussion follows regarding the changes that his ideas suggest.

The first implication of his ideas, specifically Lefebvre’s right to appropriation, involves a radical change of the present forms of enfranchisement in liberal democracies (Purcell, 2002; Harvey, 2012). Liberal-democratic citizens have an institutionalized voice in the decisions of the state. Yet, the decisions that produce urban space often also fall outside the scope of the state, and this would imply that the scope of enfranchisement should be expanded beyond the state structure. Citizens should be given influence over decisions made by investment firms as well, for instance. The indirect influence of the state (via tax regulations for example) is not considered to be sufficient (Purcell, 2002, p. 102). Harvey (2012, p. 4-5) relates urbanization dialectically to capitalism, in such a way that capitalism produces the surplus products that urbanization requires and that capitalism also needs urbanization to absorb the surplus products that it is perpetually producing. He then continues that neoliberalism has been oriented towards privatizing the control over the surplus. The right to the city would accordingly entail ‘greater democratic control over the production and use of surplus’ (Harvey, 2012, p. 22). The observation that the right to the city falls more and more in the hands of (quasi-)private interests - the mayor of New York is a billionaire and so is the mayor of Mexico City for instance (Harvey, 2012, p. 23) - further suggests the importance of expanding the scope of enfranchisement, as state control over the production of urban spaces is fading.

These changes also challenge the current social relations to capitalism. The property rights of capitalists have allowed them to produce urban space to their own interests, as they owned these urban spaces, so that it maximized its exchange value. The right to appropriation would confront the capitalist’s ability to do so and thereby resist the current hegemony of property rights (Purcell, 2002, p. 103).

Second, closely related to the previous point, is the notion of a changing form of citizenship. The right to the city involves a radical change from the traditional form of citizenship. Nowadays, citizenship is mainly determined by our nationality, that is all political loyalties are hierarchically subordinate to one’s nation-state membership.
According to the right to the city, citizenship should be shaped by cities. All people who inhabit, produce and reproduce the city are eligible to influence decisions that affect the urban shape, regardless of their nationality (Purcell, 2002). So instead of the nation-state membership, the urban should become the hegemonic scale, to which other scales are to be subordinate (Purcell, 2002, p. 103).

Third, the current rigidity of scales is challenged. In Lefebvre’s ideas, the structure of scales becomes much more malleable, complex and overlapping. Decisions that affect urban space are made at different scales and urban residents should have a say in all these decisions, regardless of the scale where these decisions are made. More so, even if citizens elsewhere are affected by decisions being made in one city, they should also be allowed to have a say in the decisions (Purcell, 2002, p. 104).

In this section the three most significant implications of Lefebvre’s ideas have been discussed. Some of these implications provided similarities with what has been discussed before. For instance, in line with section 2.2, the relation between the local and the global becomes apparent in these theorizations too. Global decisions affect local processes, which, according to Lefebvre’s ideas, local residents should be able to influence therefore as well. So, the right to the city would stimulate the local participation in decisions that are made on a higher level. In chapter six, an attempt is made to connect these implications to the findings. Below, the potential of this ideas in the contemporary global political economy and the critiques are shortly discussed (see further Vogiziades (2012) for a longer discussion on the critiques, or Purcell (2002) for the fit with the contemporary global political economy).

2.3.3 Its Potential and Critiques

The ideas of Lefebvre and the interpretations of these by other scholars, seem to match to at least some extent with the current global political economic developments. Lefebvre’s ideas of the changed importance of scales fits, for instance, the delegation of responsibilities from the nation-state level to either a transnational or a regional level (Purcell, 2002). Furthermore, these changes also affect notions of citizenship. Purcell (2002, p. 566), for instance, identified three major changes in citizenship. First, there is a rescaling of citizenship, such that the hegemony of the national-scale political community is weakened by the creation of communities at other scales. Second, citizenship is being reterritorialized, such that the tight link between the nation-state’s territorial sovereignty and political loyalty have been increasingly questioned. Third, citizenship is being reoriented, away from the nation as the predominant political community. These changes allow for the emergence of new forms of citizenship, among which, according to Purcell (2002), urban citizenship is one of the potentials to replace the former forms of citizenship.

These findings suggest that the creation of an ‘urban citizenship’ that is part of Lefebvre’s ideas potentially match with contemporary global political changes. The transformation of the nation-state offers possibilities for alternative forms of citizenship, of which urban citizenship is a potential solution. Ideas of urban citizenship will be further discussed in the discussion, for the interpretation of the findings of this study.

Nonetheless, the ideas of Lefebvre have been criticized as well. The concept of a ‘city’ or ‘urban’ is nowadays difficult to maintain, as there is hardly a distinction anymore between the urban and the rural (Harvey, 2012, p. xv). These findings imply that political struggles will determine who is considered to be part of the urban area and who not (cf. Swyngedouw, 1997; Purcell, 2006).
Other critiques involve the application of the ideas of Lefebvre. How central should the citizens be in the decision-making process? And how to decide which citizens are being empowered to make these decisions? For instance, when it concerns a community building in a suburb, should the citizens that live in the suburb be given more power than citizens that live further away, but that are still affected by its construction? These questions remain unanswered in the ideas of Lefebvre. And it is here that most of the scholars are struggling with (Purcell, 2002).

2.3.4 Recent Developments of Lefebvre’s Ideas

More recent work by other scholars draw upon, or are somehow inspired by, the ideas of Lefebvre. Holston and Appadurai (1996, p. 197) have interpreted the ideas of Lefebvre as follows,

‘right becomes more of a claim upon than a possession held against the world. It becomes a claim upon society for the resources necessary to meet the basic needs and interests of members rather than a kind of property some possess and others not. […] But in terms of rights to the city and rights to political participation, right becomes conceived as an aspect of social relatedness rather than as an inherent natural property of individuals’

Their theories about deep democracy (Appadurai, 2001) and insurgent citizenship (Holston, 1998, 2009), have been used by other scholars (e.g., Knudsen, 2007) to describe how the right to the city could be accomplished. As they both focus on different developments, the researcher perceives their contributions merely to support each other, rather than competing with each other.

2.3.4.1 Deep Democracy

Appadurai (2001) stresses the importance of a new kind of citizenship. Cities have become more like states, as they operate increasingly independently from their regional and national boundaries in the networked global economy. In a time where contradictions between the wealthier and the poorer parts of the cities have increased, it is up to the poor to reclaim their space and ensure their enfranchisement. According to Appadurai (2001, p. 25), the movements of the urban poor mediate these contradictions and represent the effort to reconstitute citizenship in cities. With ‘deep democracy’ he refers to the efforts that these movements are doing to accomplish their objectives.

He perceives this effort of the movements to revive democratic principles and to constitute an effort to have democracy without borders. Networks of these urban movements transcend the local place, and provide new deep democratic politics of the locality. It is thus the construction of citizenship and democracy from below. Therefore deep democracy could be perceived as a means to fully achieve the right to the city as explicated by Lefebvre.

The ideas of Appadurai (2001) follow closely the global political developments, with the transformation of the nation-states and the more independently functioning (city) regions. Appadurai (2001) also sees here the possibilities of the urban poor to reclaim their space. Furthermore, Appadurai (2001) also links the movements of the urban poor to a new form of citizenship, and connects thereby the local with the global. This theory of Appadurai (2001) links closely with the right to the city of Lefebvre, provides possibilities for the urban poor to accomplish their rights, and also strengthens
the importance of networks from the local to the global for achieving this objective. The theory of Appadurai (2001) will be further elaborated when linking it to the findings of the present study.

2.3.4.2 Insurgent Citizenship

The researcher identified the notion of ‘insurgent citizenship’ (Holston, 1998, 2009; Friedmann, 2002) as closely related to the right to the city, deep democracy and also related to the connection between the local and the global, as described in section 2.2. According to Holston (1998, 2009), movements from below, which are also important in the theory of deep democracy of Appadurai (2001), provide opportunities to claim rights to the city and gain citizenship. Insurgent citizenship is presented as the opposite of top-down, more formal forms, of citizenship (Holston, 1998). It rather focuses on people that are formally excluded, and aim to assemble their entitlements based on informal tactics (Maringati, 2011, p. 65). Holston (1998) stresses that claims of right to the city are established by gradual encroachment.

The potential for achieving insurgent citizenship is related to the contemporary global political economy by Friedmann (2002). According to him, the shifting powers from the nation-state to MNCs and international organizations requires a citizenship that strengthens the spaces of deliberative democracy from below (Friedmann, 2002, p. 70). Membership to a local organization is considered to be of crucial importance for expanding democratic principles and rights (Friedmann, 2002; Holston, 2009). According to Holston (2009), this membership provides the urban poor with a new urban citizenship due to three different urban processes: (I) a new kind of participation based on residents’ own grassroots organizations through which they articulated their needs in terms of rights, (II) a new understanding of the basis of their rights and their dignity as bearers of these rights, and (III) a transformed relation between the state and the citizens, generating new legal frameworks, participatory institutions and policymaking processes (Holston, 2009, p. 257).

Holston’s (1998, 2009) concept of insurgent citizenship provides a mean to achieve the right to the city. Compared to the right to the city as proposed by Lefebvre, Holston’s view of the right to the city centers around legal claims, and actual rights, in contrast to the moral dimension that Lefebvre also considered when talking about the right to the city.

The importance of local organizations becomes evident in both Appadurai’s (2001) as in Holston’s (1998, 2009) theories. These organizations fulfill a central role in achieving insurgent citizenship and deep democracy. Moreover, in line with previously presented possibilities for obtaining an urban citizenship, Friedmann (2002) also argues that the present global political economy allows for the existence of the creation of a citizenship from below.

2.4 CONCLUSION

The purpose of the present study is to test the different theoretical frameworks that have been provided in this chapter. First, the study was designed to test the interrelatedness between the local and the global in the resistances that are described in this thesis. Second, the study was designed to test how claims on ‘rights to the city’ affect the formation of new kinds of citizenships and democracies.

Regarding the first objective of this study, a description in this chapter has been
provided of the different meanings that scholars have attributed to local resistances for achieving global changes. Although some scholars have doubted the fruitfulness of local resistances, a majority still considers local resistances to be meaningful. The latter stance can mainly be attributed to their views that the local and the global are strongly interrelated. Scholars argued, for instance, that the local and the global constitute each other, and that global forces also have local expressions, or are grounded locally. In these theorizations, the focus has been on how local resistances are able to produce global changes. In the present study, the researcher would like to add another aspect which also shows the interrelatedness of the local and the global. That is how global processes affect local resistances. Therefore, the researcher is also very interested in unraveling effects that local (or national) organizations experience due to their (inter)national networks. Thus, the researcher is also very interested in finding out how processes on a higher scale affect resistances that take place on a lower scale.

Regarding the second objective of this study, a description in this chapter has been provided to show new forms of democracy and citizenship. The researcher perceives these new forms strongly connected to prevailing ideas of the ‘right to the city’ of Lefebvre. The study aims at providing insights in the networks that are being formed between marketers and street vendors and their organizations and to which extent these stimulate participants’ right to the city and the formation of deep democracy and insurgent citizenship.

The theories that have been discussed in this chapter, including the two main objectives as described above, will be connected to the findings in chapter six. In this chapter, the researcher also strives to complement or develop the theories that have been presented in this chapter.
CHAPTER 3

METHODS

3.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter a description is provided of the methods that were used by the researcher to collect the data. These methods were chosen at it provided the researcher the best opportunities to answer the research questions that were posed in chapter one. The geographical area that was chosen for the conduction of this study, urban areas in the Zambian Copperbelt, are further discussed in the next chapter.

In this chapter, first a review of benefits and disadvantages of using qualitative interviews, including ethical considerations, is provided. Then, the recruitment of organizations, participants and the content of the interviews is discussed. Finally, limitations of the present study are discussed.

3.2 QUALITATIVE INTERVIEWS

The data collection consisted foremost of interviews that were conducted by the researcher with street vendors, marketers and organizations working on behalf of street vendors and marketers. The researcher used semi-structured interview schedules, which can be found in the appendices, which allowed the researcher to spontaneously follow-up interesting answers from the participants. Interview schedules were also regularly adjusted over the course of the research. Not only to match the language that was being used by the participants, but also to be able to pursue interesting findings.

An advantage of conducting interviews, over using questionnaires for instance, is that it allows the interviewees to ‘construct their own accounts of their experiences by describing and explaining their lives in their own words’ (Valentine, 2005, p. 111). It offers both the interviewees as the researcher to respectively completely explain and understand the experiences of the interviewees (Bryman, 1988). Material collected in such a manner is considered to be rich, detailed and multi-layered (Burgess, 1984).

The objective of this method is not to be representative, but more to ‘understand how individual people experience and make sense of their own lives’ (Valentine, 2005, p. 111). The researcher also engaged in a process called triangulation (e.g., Valentine, 2005, p. 112). By using different sources the researcher attempted to verify the accounts of the different interviewees.

As suggested by Valentine (2005, p. 113), it is recommended to interview people who differ on important characteristics, for exploring how these differences affect people’s construction of the reality. In the present study, the researcher tried to do so by approaching street vendors and marketers that different on important characteristics, including their location. The researcher incorporated different urban areas, but also attempted to have some variety within each urban area, for instance by visiting different markets and by approaching marketers in different sections of each market. Furthermore, the researcher also attempted to interview as many males as females, and to include interviewees who sold different merchandize (e.g., perishables, prepaid phone cards, books, DVD’s, clothes, etc.). By doing so, the researcher attempted to test whether the experiences of people that different on these characteristics differed.
3.3 ETHICAL ISSUES

The differences between the researcher and the majority of his interviewees were easy to recognize for both the interviewees as the researcher. These differences were mainly related to a privileged position of the researcher, in terms of wealth and education, for instance. The researcher also recognized, though not anticipated beforehand, that the research was still embedded in a context of colonialism (Smith, 2003).

The researcher tried to deal with these issues by focusing on commonalities between the interviewees and the researcher. For instance, many of the vendors and marketers were passionate about football, religion, and aspired traveling, topics the researcher could also easily relate to. The researcher also tried to overcome the power difference by sitting next to the interviewee, or in case of a lack of chairs, by sitting on the ground. These efforts were duly noted by some vendors, who recognized that the researcher was ‘very different than the other white men present’.

One issue that could not be overcome was the gender of the researcher. The researcher experienced in some instances very hesitated female interviewees. Whether this was due to the gender of the researcher, general expectations about the gender roles in Zambia or a combination of both, remained difficult to evaluate. Generally, the researcher experienced that males were much more easy to approach and open than the majority of the female street vendors and marketers.

In general, for qualitative research, three ethical principles have been identified (cf. Orb et al., 2001). The first one, autonomy, implies that participants have the right to be informed about the study and then freely decide whether to participate in the study or to withdraw from the study without any consequences (e.g., Kvale, 1996). The extent to which they are to be informed is indicated by informed consent, which signifies a reasonable balance between over- and under-informing. The second principle, beneficence, refers to the researchers’ intentions to do good for others and to prevent harm. Orb et al. (2001, p. 95), therefore, recommend researchers to ensure the anonymity of the participants. The third principle, justice, refers to equal share and fairness. It implies that a researcher recognizes the vulnerability of the participants and their contributions to the study. It not only suggests that researchers should listen to the voices of the minority and disadvantaged, but he/she should also protect those that are the most vulnerable (Orb et al., 2001, p. 95-6).

In the present study, the researcher attempted to fulfill these three principles. Participants were before interviewing always informed about the purposes of the study, and they were always asked whether they wanted to participate. Furthermore, the researcher always asked participants if they allowed the researcher to tape interviews, and informed them that they could always ask the researcher to turn it off at any time during the interview. In the present thesis no names of participants are written, instead participants are characterized in general terms (like representative, street vendor or marketer). The researcher also always tried to include the most poor and disadvantaged in the research.
3.4 PARTICIPANTS

3.4.1 Selection of Organizations

The focus of the present study on informal networks brought one organization in particular to the forefront: Alliance for Zambian Informal Economy Associations (AZIEA). In Zambia, this is the only umbrella informal economy organization that also has an extensive international network. This organization was, therefore, considered to be very important for answering the research questions.

Other organizations that were of interest had to fulfill at least one of the following criteria. Organizations either had to (I) be affiliated to AZIEA, (II) be present in the Copperbelt, especially Kitwe and Ndola, or (III) represent street vendors and/or marketers. Although the researcher attempted to include as many organizations that fulfilled all these criteria, he also selected on purpose organizations that fulfilled some, but not all of these criteria. In doing so, the researcher was able to assess the effects of differences between the organizations. For instance, by comparing a street vendor organization that did belong to AZIEA versus one that did not belong to AZIEA, the researcher was able to evaluate how organizations benefitted from the (international) networks of AZIEA.

The researcher was able to speak to members and representatives of ten organizations, including AZIEA. These organizations are more thoroughly introduced in the next chapter. The researcher also attempted to include organizations and authorities that were either dealing with these organizations or with issues of street vending and markets. Regarding the authorities, the Kitwe City Council (KCC) was included on a local level, and the Ministry of Local Government and Housing (MLGH) was included as they are the national authority dealing with issues of street vending and marketers. Some of the researched organizations also collaborated with these local and national authorities.

The Zambian Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU) was included for two reasons. First of all, for their established collaboration with AZIEA – AZIEA is affiliated to the ZCTU. Second, as ZCTU is the biggest national trade union in Zambia, the researcher was also interested in gathering information regarding their activities in the informal economy. These organizations are also introduced more thoroughly in the next chapter.

3.4.2 Approach of the organizations

AZIEA was approached with the help from my supervisor. Via AZIEA contacts were established with the other organizations, sometimes with help of the districts coordinators (e.g., of Kalulushi and Ndola). The other organizations were approached by the researcher himself.

3.4.3 Selection and Approach of Participants

Of the informal economy organizations, as described above, interviews were conducted with the leaders, or people in management positions, local coordinators and their ‘ordinary’ members. These members were in about half of the cases recruited via the leaders of the organization. In the other half of the cases the researcher was able to locate the members independently by randomly approaching street vendors or marketers. After having established a contact with a street vendor or marketer, the researcher always used these contacts to establish contacts with other street vendors or
marketers. This so-called ‘snowballing’ (cf. Valentine, 2001, p. 117-118) is normally used by researchers for gaining access to participants that are generally difficult to approach.

Both the snowballing method and the random approach of street vendors and marketers were also used to include street vendors and marketers that were not a member of any organization. Their answers were also considered to be valuable as these may provide evidence in the reasons for them not to become a member.

Totally, the researcher spoke with fourteen (national) representatives of the ten organizations that were included in this research. The researcher was also able to include seventy street vendors and marketers, of which half of them was a member of an organization and the other half was not. Some of these street vendors and marketers were also part of the structure of the organization, as a regional or local coordinator, for instance. The majority of the interviewees were males, even as the researcher observed that the proportion males/females was about equal among street vendors and marketers. Reasons for this incongruence have been described in paragraph 3.2.

3.5 INTERVIEWS

3.5.1 With Street Vendors and Marketers

Interview schemes that were used to interview street vendors and marketers are presented in appendix 1. Generally, the researcher followed these schemes, although he also often posed follow up questions to interesting answers provided by the interviewees. The objectives of the semi-structured interviews with street vendors and marketers were to unravel the reasons for them to (not) become a member of an organization, and whether they perceived any benefits/disadvantages of (not) being a member. Furthermore, if interviewed street vendors or marketers were a member of an organization, the functioning of the organization was discussed and they were asked regarding the (inter)national network of their organization and how that affected the functioning of the organization and themselves on the streets or in the markets. When inquired about the networks of their organization, street vendors and marketers were specifically asked to what extent their organization collaborated with the local or national authorities, AZIEA, other (inter)national organizations, and/or with the ZCTU. If participants were not able to recollect any of these existing networks, the researcher specifically asked whether the participant was aware of, or had heard of, AZIEA or the ZCTU, and whether they knew whether their organization collaborated with these organizations. Interviews with street vendors and marketers generally lasted between five minutes to over three hours, depending mainly on their knowledge of the existing organizations and networks, which depended primarily on their membership to an organization and their involvement in this organization.

Interviews were conducted at the spots in the markets or on the streets. All the interviews started by an introduction of the researcher and the participant (e.g., the researcher asked what they were selling, how long they have been on the streets, etc.). Then, gradually, the researcher directed the conversation towards the subjects of interests. Generally, the vendors and marketers continued working during the interviews. Thus, interviews were sometimes interrupted as there was business going on. The researcher did not experience these interruptions as problematic. They actually gave both the researcher and the participant time to think about the posed question(s) or write down the answers. For interviews that lasted over 30 minutes, participants were
offered a soda as a reward for their time and efforts.

Interviews were usually conducted in English, as the majority of participants was also fluent in English. In some instances, the researcher collaborated with students from the Copperbelt University or the University of Zambia. Depending on the preferred language of the participants, some interviews were then conducted in the local language and translated to English by the student. Rarely, other translators were also used. When directed to members of an organization, the leader or districts coordinator of this organization sometimes also functioned as interpreter, but only in instances when the participants were not able to speak English.

Answers to the questions were directly written down by the researcher. In almost all cases, the researcher summarized and completed the ‘recordings’ of the interview after each interview.

3.5.2 With Representatives of Organizations

Semi-structured interviews with representatives of the organizations were mainly conducted to unravel their connections/networks with other organizations, authorities or other institutes, including their links to the national and local authorities, with trade unions and to organizations operating internationally or outside of Zambia. Questions were framed so as to stimulate a discussion about what these links contributed to the organization, both to the management as well as for their members. The entire interview schedule is shown in appendix 2.

Of all the organizations, the researcher was able to either speak with the general director or with the secretary-general. Generally, the researcher only spoke with one spokesperson of each organization and only once. Exceptions were interviews with AZIEA, where the researcher spoke with three different representatives, and Zambian National Marketers Association (ZANAMA), where the researcher spoke twice with the same representative. Interviews lasted between 30 minutes to over 3 hours per interview. For interviews lasting longer than one hour, participants were given a small reward for their time and effort. All interviews were conducted independently by the researcher in English. The majority of the interviews were held in the offices of the respective organizations. In some instances, for instance, when the organization lacked office space, interviews were held in restaurants or cafeterias. All interviews were tape-recorded and transcribed afterwards.

Interviews with related institutes and organizations, such as the local and national authorities and ZCTU, focused specifically on their perceptions of the functioning of the informal economy organizations, especially AZIEA and the other interviewed organizations in the research. The researcher was mostly also interested in their perception regarding the collaboration of their institute with these organizations, and how they mutually contributed, if they did so, to each other’s functioning.

Interviews with these organizations and institutes were also conducted in English, tape-recorded and transcribed afterwards. Interviews lasted between 45 minutes to over 2 hours, and were in all cases conducted in the offices of the representatives of the organizations. The researcher was always able to speak within each organization with the person in charge of the collaboration with the informal economy organizations (ZCTU) or street vending and market places (local and national authorities).

For KCC, two meetings were arranged. The first meeting was held with the responsible of the council together with three representatives of the street vendors. The
second meeting was only with the representative of the city council. For the national authorities, the MLGH, one meeting was arranged only with the person in charge present. With the ZCTU, two meetings were arranged with a representative from the main office in Lusaka and one other meeting with the representative of their regional office in Kitwe.

3.5.3 Conducting the Interviews

From the beginning, the researcher behaved and dressed differently when interviewing representatives of the organizations compared to interviewing street vendors and marketers. When interviewing the representatives of the different organizations, the researcher attempted to dress more formally. He also tried to stimulate an interesting discussion, so that it would be rewarding for the interviewee as well. When interviewing street vendors and marketers, the researcher dressed informally and normally attempted to sit down next to the marketer or street vendor. When such opportunities were lacking, the researcher sat down on the ground next to the street vendor or marketer.

Over the course of the study changes were being made to the interview schedules. For instance, questions that did not seem to provide any valuable answers were adjusted or removed from the interview schedule. Furthermore, the focus of the interviews were changed over the course of the study, as interesting answers by interviewees provided inspiration for the researcher to deepen certain specific issues.

Over time, the language being used by the researcher also changed. In the beginning, he found that certain words were not very common to use in Zambia, which made him adjust his language accordingly. For instance, the researcher started to use the word ‘marketer’ instead of ‘market vendor’, which was generally not understood by participants. Other phrases that he started using were, for instance, ‘at the end of the day’ and ‘eating money’ which locals respectively used instead of ‘in the end’ and to indicate corrupted individuals.

The researcher also noted, primarily in the beginning of the study, that he sometimes had trouble listening carefully to the replies of the interviewees whilst simultaneously thinking about a suitable next question.

3.6 LIMITATIONS

The aim of the present study is not to provide a representative account of the functioning of organizations and networks. Rather, the present study aims to demonstrate how organizations and their networks affect the livelihoods of street vendors and marketers. By conducting qualitative interviews, the researcher attempted to understand how organizations, street vendors and marketers experience the existence of the organizations and their networks. Thus, it remains questionable to which extent these findings may be generalized to street vendors and marketers working elsewhere, or to other informal economy workers in the same geographical region.

Although the researcher attempted to always ensure that the interviewees were able to speak freely and to write down, or record, their answers as carefully as possible, in some instances these objectives were severely constrained. For instance, the use of representatives of an organization as interpreters possibly affected the responses of the interviewees. Moreover, the use of interpreters in general might have affected the interpretation of the questions posed by the researcher, as well as the translation of the
answers (cf. Kapborg and Berterö, 2002). Possibilities for correct transcriptions were also sometimes hindered as conducting interviews in a loud environment severely affected the quality of the taped interviews. These problems were not only encountered when conducting interviews in a restaurant, but also in an office with the windows open which allowed the noise from outside to enter.

3.7 DISCUSSION

The present study focused on the effects of networks on the organizations and livelihoods of street vendors and marketers. In the present chapter a description is offered on how the researcher gathered the data to assess the functioning of organizations and their networks. By including participants that have different functions, for instance, are representatives of organizations or street vendors, and by using different methods of approaching participants, that is by randomly approaching or by using other marketers or street vendors for recruiting participants, the researcher attempted to gain a diverse understanding of the functioning of organizations and networks.

The next chapter discusses the local circumstances in which this study was conducted. The data that was actually gathered using these methods is discussed in chapter five.
CHAPTER 4
THE SETTING

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The present study was conducted in urban areas in the Zambian Copperbelt. In the first chapter, the ‘global South’ and SSA have been introduced to a large extent. The present chapter elaborates more on the Zambian context and in particular also on the specific urban areas where the research has been conducted. This chapter also provides a short overview of the organizations that were included in this research.

The importance of the local context should be emphasized, especially when using qualitative methods, which aim towards obtaining a deeper understanding of the functioning of networks and organizations. The findings of the present study, which are to be discussed in the next chapter, should be handled carefully and seen in relation to the local settings. Differences between local settings would further limit the generalization of the present findings. For instance, organizations and networks might work very differently in other places, or between other informal economy workers, depending on local configurations (e.g., national laws or conducts).

4.2 NATIONAL CONTEXT

4.2.1 Socio-Economic Situation

Currently, Zambia is among the poorest nations in the world. According to the Human Development Index, the country ranks 163rd out of the totally 186 measured countries worldwide (UNDP, 2013). For instance, life expectancy falls below 50 years (UNDP, 2013), and more than 80 percent of the population works in the informal sector (Living Condition Report, 2004), contributing to over 50 percent to the GDP (The World Bank, 2010, p. 21).

A few years after Zambia’s independence, in 1964, it was one of the most prosperous countries on the African continent. Despite the availability of a variety of resources, among which mineral resources like copper, political reforms by the state decreased the GDP per capita. Declining copper prices after 1975 and political turmoil in neighboring countries significantly hindered economic development. In an attempt to make the economy grow, the government, supported by the SAPs, adopted more liberal policies in the 1990s (SARPN, n.d.). Yet, these led primarily to a growing unemployment, increasing inequalities, deteriorating health (including a high HIV/Aids prevalence rate) and a decline in the accessibility to education (Hansen, 2010, p. 15). Foreign direct investments have increased, especially from Asian investors, but simultaneously limited local participation (Gadzala, 2010; Hansen, 2010). The declining formal sector has also led to a rising youth unemployment, even under graduates (Hansen, 2010). These factors have all led to a growing informal sector in Zambia (The World Bank, 2010, p. 21).

4.2.2 Political Situation for Street Vendors and Marketers

In the past, the handling of street vendors by the local and national authorities has been very inconsistent. In some periods street vending was allowed, whereas in others street vendors were regularly chased off the streets and their makeshift stalls,
locally called ‘tuntemba’s’, destroyed. Consequently, the number of street vendors has also fluctuated heavily in the past. In 1998, for instance, street vending reached ‘anarchic proportions’, which changed the capital city ‘into one huge outdoor shopping mall’ (Hansen, 2010, p. 17). Four months later all the tuntemba’s were destroyed by the local authorities, and the street vendors had disappeared from the Central Business District (CBD) (Hansen, 2010).

The highly ambivalent relation between the authorities and street vendors is strongly influenced by politics. According to Resnick (2011) local authorities’ regulations intended to ameliorate the urban poor are hindered when the ruling local party is different than the ruling national party. Decreased urban poverty would then by the local population attributed to the local ruling party at the expense of the national ruling party. Thus, by limiting the financial transfers from the national to the local level, the national ruling party is able to successfully prevent such changes. This situation has limited, for instance, the Lusaka City Council’s (LCCs), ruled by the Patriotic Front (PF), ability to successfully fight poverty, as the national ruling party was Movement for Multiparty Democracy (MMD) (Resnick, 2011).

Another important finding is that the street vendors also have a certain power. For instance, it was only after realizing that the majority of the street vendors were not able to vote that the LCC destroyed all the tuntemba’s (Hansen, 2010).

In their campaign for the 2011 elections, the PF3, who won the elections, promised the street vendors to allow them to vend on the streets and to find a proper alternative for them. Thus, since 2011, street vending is tolerated on the streets, albeit still illegal by law. The national government requested the local authorities not to harass the street vendors anymore (Unknown, 2011). Thus, street vending has risen tremendously in the major cities, including Lusaka, Kitwe and Ndola (Unknown, 2012).

The PF even stimulated the formation of a new national street vendor organization, the United Street Vendor Foundation (USVF). This organization cooperates closely with the government to represent the interests of all street vendors nation-wide. These developments suggest that the government is perhaps more willing to cooperate with the street vendors than they were in the past - some form of local cooperative attempts between the local city councils and street vendors were observed by the researcher - even if the researcher also still had the impression that the ultimate goal is to remove all the street vendors at some point in the future (e.g., personal communication with LCC and KCC, 2013).

The current changes in the handling of street vendors also affected the livelihoods of marketers. Many complained about the lack of business – as customers bought from street vendors instead now – and have left their stands to sell on the streets as well. The researcher observed that some markets had indeed some empty stands, for instance, the new

---

3 They call themselves a ‘pro-poor government’ and promised to create employment for the poor people.
(see picture one) and old Nakadoli market in Kitwe. Thus, many street vendors are not ‘real’ street vendors, as they actually also have stands in the markets, but prefer to sell their merchandize on the streets.

Another measure that was taken by the PF when they came into office that affects profoundly the livelihoods of marketers is their decision to fully implement the Markets and Bus Stations Act of 2007. One of the regulations of the act, which has never been implemented before is the prohibition of the existence of organizations to operate in the markets. This has led to, among others, the deregistration of the formerly biggest national marketers organizations: ZANAMA and Zambian Traders and Marketers Association (ZATMA).

The political affiliation of ZANAMA with the former ruling party (MMD) had led to more conflicts, which altogether made ZANAMA decide to take this case to the courts (personal communication with ZANAMA, 2013). ZATMA, on the other hand, was affiliated to the now ruling party (PF), and was still hoping to obtain a pardon from the government (personal communication with ZATMA, 2013).

At the time that the research was conducted, there were no organizations actively present on the markets. Although some structures were still in place, the local authorities were fully responsible for running the markets. Representatives from the local authorities were present on the market, called ‘market masters’, who were assisted by marketers to handle urgent issues in the markets. Market masters also reported these issues to, and had regular meetings with, the responsible persons at the local authority (personal communication KCC, 2013; personal communication market master Chisokone market Kitwe, 2013).

4.3 DESCRIPTION OF THE AREA

The geographical scope of the present research was limited to the Copperbelt region in Zambia, and included observations and interviews with the target group in the urban areas of Kitwe, Ndola and Kalulushi.

The motivation for choosing the Copperbelt area in Zambia was twofold. First, the researcher wanted to extend urban findings of SSA beyond the capital cities. Most of the research in SSA has been conducted in the capital cities. By including a different area than the capital city, the researcher aimed at extending these findings by studying a different urban area. Second, most of the organizations that were of interest to the present study were located, or had their main office, in the Copperbelt. The researched areas are described into greater detail below, but first the Copperbelt region is shortly introduced.

Mining has, since the opening of the first mine in 1929, formed the backbone of the Zambian economy. Especially copper has been the major export product of Zambia. These mines are mainly located in the center of Zambia, in a region called the Copperbelt. Consequently, drops in copper prices have often led to crises in Zambia, and especially in the Copperbelt region, where the majority of the formal jobs are in the copper industries. Thus, fluctuations in employment possibilities often have a direct impact on the necessity of people to work in the informal economy (e.g., Heidenreich, 2007). Furthermore, it may also have geographical implications. For instance, when a new mine opens somewhere, many people go there in the hope to find employment, or otherwise to increase their informal businesses, as the welfare is then expected to increase in that particular region (personal communication street vendors and marketers,
At the time that the study was conducted, some mines were closing in the researched areas and opened in the western parts of the Copperbelt, around Solwezi.

The study was conducted in three different areas in the eastern part of the Copperbelt, namely Kitwe, Ndola and Kalulushi. Kitwe, the biggest city in the Copperbelt, and after Lusaka the biggest of Zambia, had also mining as the core economic activity. Here, retrenched residents are often self-employed in the informal sector (UN-Habitat, 2009).

Street vendors were mainly found in the CBD of Kitwe, around the bus stations and the biggest market in the city. A distinction between two kinds of street vendors could be made. Some vendors sold at the outskirts of the market on wooden flounders that they have created themselves. Others sold primarily from their blankets, alternatively cars, at the pavement along the main streets. Hawkers were also found at the bus stations in Kitwe. Vendors would also come from neighboring (urban) areas, like Kalulushi, to sell their goods here on the streets.

Marketers were found in different markets in the CBD and surrounding neighborhoods of Kitwe. The biggest market, Chisokone (see picture two), was located in the CBD, adjacent to the bus station. The researcher also visited Nakadoli market, the old and the new one, in one of the neighborhoods of Kitwe.

Both these markets were community markets, implying that all the marketers have constructed their own shops. The researcher found Chisokone market very dirty. Not only was there garbage lying around everywhere, which created a disgusting smell especially in the heat of the afternoon, but the presence of water underneath the wooden constructed paths, created possibilities for spreading diseases – cholera outbreaks were common during the rainy seasons last years. Other problems that were reported by the marketers were the street children who used their market places as sleeping places during the night and defecated there. The old Nakadoli market, on the other hand, was somewhat cleaner, even as there was also garbage lying around here and there, and the paths would turn into mud during and after the heavy rains of the rainy season. The new Nakadoli market, where shops were constructed by the municipality, was very clean, but characterized by a lack of business, marketers and higher fees. Thus, the majority of the marketers preferred to stay in the old Nakadoli market instead.

Both Chisokone and Nakadoli markets were sectioned, such that marketers who sold similar items were grouped together. Distinctions could be made, for instance, between marketers who sold clothes, hardware and appliances, and perishables.

Ndola, after Lusaka and Kitwe, the largest Zambian city, is located only about 50 kilometers from Kitwe. Like in Kitwe, street vendors flocked the main streets of the city, especially around the newly constructed Chisokone market and the bus station. In general, the streets were cleaner and less trafficked than in Kitwe.

Besides the Chisokone market, the researcher also visited a market in Chifubu.
The latter market was characterized by much less customers than the former, which was located more in the center of the town. 

Street vendors were hardly found in Kalulushi, the smallest of all investigated locations. At the outskirts of the markets, some street vendors were found. These were selling from self-constructed wooden trading places. Along the streets, people had also erected tuntemba’s, mainly to sell from their own garden, adjacent to the streets.

The majority of the marketers had stands in one of the main markets in the urban area, Loako or Patason. These markets consisted primarily of self constructed shops and stores. A smaller part of these markets was constructed inside a big hall, which offered its workers protection against the weather. Facilities, maintained by the local authorities, were also present in these markets, although poorly functioning. Compared to the other markets visited in Ndola and Kitwe, the market in Kalulushi was in a very well state. The condition of the paths was reasonable and there was hardly any garbage found within the market. Thus, observations of the researcher suggested that this market was better maintained than the other visited markets in the other urban areas on the Copperbelt. Smaller markets that were visited by the researcher were characterized by a lack of both sellers as buyers.

4.4 ORGANIZATIONS OF INTEREST

As described in the previous chapter, organizations have been selected due to their connection to AZIEA, their activities in the Copperbelt, and/or whether they represent street vendors and marketers. The major characteristics of the selected organizations are presented in table 1.

Table 1. Characteristics of the selected organizations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name organization</th>
<th>Target group</th>
<th>Geographical Scope</th>
<th>Affiliated to AZIEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AZIEA</td>
<td>Informal Economy Workers</td>
<td>National</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watch Your Life Movement</td>
<td>Physically disabled in the informal economy</td>
<td>Regional (Copperbelt)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vendors Association of Ndola</td>
<td>Street vendors</td>
<td>Local (Ndola)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross-Borders Traders Association</td>
<td>International traders – street vendors and marketers</td>
<td>International</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuapia Poultry Farmers and Women’s Association</td>
<td>Primarily females working in the agriculture</td>
<td>Local (Ndola)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tunteamba Association</td>
<td>Street vendors</td>
<td>National</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambian National Marketers Association</td>
<td>Marketers</td>
<td>National</td>
<td>No*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambian Traders and Marketers Association</td>
<td>Marketers</td>
<td>National</td>
<td>No*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Street Vendor Foundation</td>
<td>Street Vendors</td>
<td>National</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingston Marketers in Hardware</td>
<td>Marketers in Hardware</td>
<td>Local (Kitwe)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* ZANAMA and ZATMA used to be members of AZIEA in the past
As table one shows, the researcher was able to interview six affiliates of AZIEA, of which the majority was directly involved with street vendors and marketers. The other organizations were all directly involved with either street vendors or marketers. Of these organizations, ZANAMA and ZATMA used to be members of AZIEA and Kingston had also received some support from AZIEA. Thus, only the USFV, a recently founded organization had no connection to AZIEA at all. Below, each organization is shortly introduced.

4.4.1 Alliance for Zambian Informal Economy Associations (AZIEA)

AZIEA was founded in 2002 in a collaboration between already existing informal economy organizations (e.g., ZANAMA) and the ZCTU. AZIEA is an umbrella organization of informal economy associations in Zambia. Currently, it has 16 affiliates. AZIEA is important for its affiliates for two main reasons. First, they provide workshops for the management of its affiliates and for the members of their affiliates. Second, they provide a voice for all the informal economy organizations that have joined AZIEA. AZIEA has an extensive network with different national and international stakeholders. Nationally, AZIEA is linked to the ZCTU and national and local governments. Internationally, AZIEA has a range of different donors, and they are members of StreetNet International, Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) and War on Want. Their international scope provides possibilities for international exchanges, both for AZIEA as for their affiliates, which adds also quality to the workshops that they offer.

AZIEA operates in all the provinces in Zambia. They have a national committee consisting of six members and then regional coordinators, who arrange meetings and support the national committee by taking care of different matters in their specific region (e.g., regarding selection of members for international exchanges or workshops).

4.4.2 Marketers Organizations: Zambian National Marketers Association (ZANAMA), Zambian Traders and Marketers Association (ZATMA) and Kingston Association

ZANAMA was the biggest national organization present in the markets in Zambia. Their structures extend to all the provinces in the country, although their presence is exceptionally noticeable in the cities around the Copperbelt. Their aims are to represent market vendors in negotiations with the authorities and to provide them with workshops that facilitate their businesses.

ZANAMA was founded in Kitwe in 1999 by a former marketer. Since then, they have extended their scope and activities. They have been a member of AZIEA since AZIEA was founded. They have links to both local, such as the city councils (e.g., KCC and Ndola City Council (NCC)), as well as to the national authorities. Furthermore, they also established connections to microfinance institutions to help their members getting loans to stimulate their businesses.

ZANAMA worked with elected market representatives who have regional gatherings that are led by the regional coordinator. The regional coordinators are in contact with the executive committee. The marketers vote for their representatives, and these representatives vote for their regional coordinator, etc.

ZANAMA became especially political active during the campaigns for the elections in 2011. They were supported by the then ruling party, MMD, and this political party supported ZANAMA as well.
ZATMA, the second-largest organization that was present in the markets in Zambia, originated also in Kitwe, from former members of ZANAMA. Their structures are less vast as ZANAMA’s structures, and their main focus also lies on the Copperbelt. Their aims are similar as those of ZANAMA. Their political affiliation was, however, with the non-ruling party before 2011, PF. Like ZANAMA, they also established connections with the local and national authorities and financial institutions.

Kingston association is a small local organization, specifically focused on marketers who sell hardware and appliances. They originated at the Chisokone market in Kitwe and they currently have about 50 members. They are extending their scope to other markets in Kitwe, e.g., the Nakadoli market, to include marketers from these markets in their organization as well. Their aims are especially to facilitate the business skills for the marketers involved in the same business.

Although they are not officially affiliated to AZIEA, they have had some help from them, for instance when applying for funds at the authorities or from other donors.

4.4.3 Street Vendor Organizations: United Street Vendor Foundation, Vendors Association of Ndola (VAN) and Tuntemba Association

The USVF is the biggest organization in Zambia that represents street vendors and hawkers. They have been founded in 2011 by the MLGH. They function as representatives of street vendors towards the local and national authorities. They completely depend on the government for their funds.

The organization is not yet represented in all the provinces, but their aims are to spread to all the provinces as soon as possible. Their main task is to advise the authorities on how to deal with street vending. As they have become only recently into existence, so far they have been able to register street vendors in the major urban areas of Zambia (e.g., Lusaka, Kitwe, Ndola, Kabwe), they have zoned the different streets and appointed representatives for each zone. Their plans are to group street vendors together who have similar businesses, to invest money for the procurement of equipment so that their possibilities to make profits improves. Furthermore, they aim to improve the situation for street vendors, for instance by providing sanitary facilities on the streets or to legalize certain streets for street vending.

Their organization consists also of regional coordinators, who have been elected by the local street vendors. Currently, they also try to govern the streets, in the sense that their representatives emphasize street vendors to behave properly. In case of any trouble, representatives of this organization also mediate between street vendors to solve issues. If they are unable to solve it, then they report these problems to the regional coordinators.

USVF has only links to the government, especially MLGH and Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives, and local authorities (e.g., city councils). They are not part of AZIEA or have established (international) links to other (informal economy) organizations. For the execution of any of their plans, they depend upon approval and funds of the government.

The Vendors Association of Ndola (VAN) was founded in 2005, and is a member of AZIEA. Currently, they have about 50 members, their membership has sharply decreased during the last years. They are an association that assist street vendors, both by offering workshops for them to increase their business skills, as well as in negotiating with the local authorities, the NCC.

Geographically, they are limited to the city of Ndola. They work with street
representatives who coordinate street vending in their part of the city. Furthermore, they have also grouped street vendors together depending on their goods (that is vendors selling hardware in one group, those selling perishables in another, etc.).

_Tuntemba Association_ was founded in Kalulushi. They strive to represent and assist street vendors, in particular those who are selling from their tuntemba’s. Recently, they have been able to extend their structures outside of Kalulushi to other areas of the Copperbelt and beyond. They are also affiliated to AZIEA.

4.4.4 Other organizations: Watch Your Life Movement (WYLM), Tuapia Poultry Farmers and Women’s Association, and Cross-Border Traders Association (CBTA)

The _Watch Your Life Movement (WYLM)_ was founded in 1998 in Ndola. They were founded to specifically empower and organize physically disabled workers in the informal economy. Currently, they have about 1100 members of which the majority (650) is from Ndola. For achieving their aims they organize workshops and represent disabled workers at the authorities.

Currently, they also encourage non-disabled workers to join the organization, to stimulate the integration between the disabled and the non-disabled workers. They especially strive to create more awareness of the existence of the organization, so that they can attract donors or other organizations so to create a national network as well. At the time of the visit, they were negotiating with an organization from Lusaka that wanted to be incorporated in WYLM.

The workers that they represent are active in very different segments of the informal economy. Some work as teachers, others as marketers or street vendors, or from home in small enterprises.

The _Tuapia Poultry Farmers and Women’s Association_ is mainly present in the surrounding, agrarian, communities of Ndola, of which Tuapia is one. Membership to this organization is limited to mainly females. The organization supports them by organizing workshops. These workshops cover primarily two different subjects, to teach their members agricultural skills to increase their productivity and profits and to increase their knowledge about women’s rights. They are also affiliated to AZIEA.

The _Cross-Border Traders Association (CBTA)_ is a big international grassroots organization, active in surrounding countries of Zambia as well. Their aims are to create employment in these countries by stimulating cross-border trade and creating international networks among traders. By investigating market prices in different countries, they aim to be identify commodities that are beneficial for transport across the border.

They assist their members not only by giving workshops about doing business, but also by informing them about the border customs, to facilitate their abilities to transport goods from one side of the border to the other. These goods are then sold from their ‘warehouses’ to marketers or street vendors, for example.

In their activities they cooperate closely with their fellow members in other countries as well as with the local and national authorities, the national tax company for instance. They are a member of AZIEA.
4.5 RELATED ORGANIZATIONS

4.5.1 National and Local Authorities

The national center of power, that is where all the head quarters of ministries are located, is Lusaka, the capital city. Yet, many departments also have regional, or smaller, offices in the Copperbelt, primarily in Ndola, which is the administrative center of the Copperbelt. The ministry mainly concerned with issues concerning the markets and street vending is MLGH. This ministry prescribes how the local governments should deal with current issues regarding the markets and street vending.

Only larger urban areas in Zambia are governed by the city council. They are informed by the MLGH on how to respond to the current issues in the markets or regarding street vending. Both Kitwe, by the KCC, and Ndola, by the NCC, are governed by city councils.

4.5.2 Zambian Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU)

The biggest of the two national labor unions in Zambia, the ZCTU, has affiliations with 34 trade unions in Zambia. They are also part of the International Trade Union Confederation and they work in close cooperation with the ILO and the national authorities. For the present study their role is considered to be of importance as AZIEA, as the only informal economy organization, is affiliated to them.

4.6 CONCLUSION

After having introduced the ‘global South’ and SSA in chapter one, the methods in chapter three, the present chapter has further introduced the local context. Although this local context offers similarities to general processes in the global South or in SSA, certain processes are also unique for Zambia.

Political changes in Zambia, for instance regarding the allowance of street vendors and the deregistration of the market organizations, have possibly implications for organizing capacities of street vendors and marketers. These developments might therefore affect also the workings of the organizations that work with street vendors and marketers. These changes may also have affected the results of the present study, which are discussed in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 5
GLOCALIZATION AND RIGHT TO THE CITY IN THE COPPERBELT

5.1 INTRODUCTION

After having introduced how the research has been conducted in chapter three, and the local context and background information about the researched organizations in chapter four, in this chapter the findings from the conducted research are presented. These findings are structured so that they match the structure of the second chapter, where the theoretical framework was presented. First, organizing capacities of street vendors and marketers at a local level are presented, including their organizations. Afterwards, the scope is expanded from local to national and to global. By doing so, the researcher aimed at showing the intertwined relation between the local and the global. Finally, the findings that are directly linked to the right to the city are presented. Here too, the results are structured on different scales, starting from local and ending with the global scale.

5.2 ORGANIZING AT THE LOCAL LEVEL

The researcher observed that organizing capacities among street vendors and marketers on a local level can be divided in two different categories. First, there are the, what the Zambians refer to as ‘chilemba’s’, informal networks among street vendors or marketers. Second, there are the more formal local organizations of street vendors and marketers into registered organizations.

5.2.1 Informal Networks

“We are all in the same situation, which makes us all [street vendors and marketers] colleagues. We have to help each other.”

Marketer, Loako market, Kalulushi, tailor, regional coordinator ZATMA

Mutual support and help among street vendors and marketers can be further divided into two different categories: they can provide financial support and solidarity. Regarding the financial support, many street vendors and marketers, although it seemed to be more common among marketers than street vendors, formed small groups wherein they save money for one another. As one street vendor noted

“We have formed a group with 20 street vendors. We all contribute KR25 [$ 4,-] per day and then at the end of the day, one of us gets like KR500 [$ 80,-]. I used this [money] to pay the school fees [for my children]. It is up to the vendor where he wants to use it for...”

Female street vendor, Kitwe, 46 years old, selling second-hand clothes

Typically, these groups consist of between five to twenty people. Normally, each member would save a small amount of his/her profits every day, which would be gathered at the end of the week and been given to one member of the group. In some instances, as mentioned by the street vendor above, the group would divide the money at the end of each day. Then, the next day (or week) the saved profits of all the members go to another member. Many of the marketers and street vendors mentioned that they use this financial support to cover big expenses, like the earlier mentioned annual school
fees or uniforms, or to boost their businesses, by investing in their capital.

When asked whether they had sometimes issues regarding deciding who would get the money at the end of the week, the majority of the marketers responded by saying

“No no no... we always look at who needs the money the most [and then] we decide together who gets the money at the end of the week.”

Male marketer, Chisokone market, Kitwe, selling second-hand clothes

Although in some groups, there had been issues in the past, for example

“Cheaters [people who did not contribute], we have kicked them out of our group. We only want sincere vendors in our group.”

Same female street vendor as above

The majority of the groups seemed to function well, as explicated by the marketer mentioned above. In instances where people did not contribute to the groups, then the other members would stand up against this person and most likely expel this member from the group.

The existence of these groups were reported by both marketers and street vendors, regardless of whether they were or were not a member of a (local) organization. The researcher did not encounter any mixed groups, consisting of both marketers and street vendors, suggesting that groups consisted exclusively of street vendors or marketers. Yet, not all marketers or street vendors could allow themselves to be part of these groups, as some of them indicated,

“How I am supposed to save money for someone else? I can hardly eat myself at the end of the day from the money that I am making.”

Female marketer, Nakadoli market, Kitwe, selling vegetables

These so-called ‘hand-to-mouth’ marketers or vendors, those who use all their profits in purchasing food at the end of the day, saw no possibilities to save up money for others, and could not form, or be part of, such informal saving groups. This reason appeared to the researcher to be more common for vendors and marketers selling perishables, like vegetables, than among those who sold other items.

A lack of interest or willingness to cooperate, was also sometimes mentioned, for instance

“I am just on my own here. Like everybody else. We all just work for ourselves. [...] I am just here to do business.”

Male street vendor, Kitwe, middle twenties, selling mobile phones

In some instances, even though there were no structural saving groups, marketers and vendors still contributed to one another,

“When someone has a funeral, one of us goes around to collect some money for that person, so that he [or she] is able to go there. [Since the deregistration of ZANAMA] we do not collect so much anymore.”

Male marketer, Chisokone market, Kitwe, 43 years, selling second-hand clothes

In some instances, informal networks seemed to compensate for the previously existing formal networks. Yet, according to many marketers, the revenues that were collected nowadays were less than when formal market organizations were still active in the
markets.

Regarding the second function of these ‘chilemba’s’, solidarity, both street vendors and marketers were eager to collaborate with their fellow vendors or marketers. The researcher interpreted these collaborations as, so far as possible, even more informal than the first category of the ‘chilemba’s’. Basically, it just meant that street vendors and marketers would help each other when they encountered problems. These problems might vary from taking over ones selling place when someone cannot be there to informing each other about ones business strategies.

“First she [a physically disabled woman] was begging in the streets, there in the corner [points in the direction where she is]. But, we [the physically disabled] should not be begging in the streets. So I helped her, gave her some money, and now she is also selling airtime [prepaid phone cards].”

Male street vendor, Kitwe, 43 year, selling prepaid phone cards, physically disabled

Many street vendors told the researcher that it was common to talk to other vendors when they had ideas to venture into the businesses that the other vendor was engaged in. For instance,

Vendor: “I would like to sell diapers [additional to my current business], because I see many people [walking around] who are pregnant or who have babies.”

Researcher: “But how do you know whether that business is going to give you something [is profitable]?”

Vendor: “We talk to other vendors who are doing that business. Now, I have talked to a vendor sitting there [points in the direction where she vends], and she told me a little bit about how she goes about her business.”

Researcher: “Like what kind of information did she give you?”

Vendor: “Euhm... how much she sells a day and for what prizes.”

Researcher: “Would she tell you everything about her business?”

Vendor: “We do tell each other a lot.... But... she would never reveal to me her source [where she gets their merchandize from]. And this is the most important information [...] because that would decide how much profit I can make out of it. [...] So, now I have to start looking for the cheapest source, but that is the most difficult to find out.”

Part of a conversation with female street vendor, Kitwe, now selling baby clothes

This part of the conversation shows the willingness of vendors to help each other by sharing relevant information that might give the other vendor an impression of the viability of a business. Yet, as stated above, and expressed by other vendors and marketers as well, the most crucial information is often not disclosed in such local networks. As vendors and marketers also compete with one another, especially if they sell in the same street or zone in the market, they would, for instance, never disclose their distributor, where they purchase their products from. According to many marketers and street vendors, this piece of information is crucial for them to be able to make a profit, or a profit at least as high as your competitors. Vendors and marketers often reported difficulties to find a reliable and cheap distributor for the purchases of their products. However, some vendors and marketers reported that they were able to retrieve such pieces of information from networks on a larger scale, which will be discussed
later.

This kind of help was found to be existent among the majority of street vendors and marketers, regardless of whether they were a member of a (formal) organization or what kind of products they sold. Rarely, street vendors and marketers reported to be completely on their own, for instance

“I just came here and tried some business… I did not get any help from anyone. You just try something and see if it works.”

Male street vendor, 23 years, Ndola, selling DVD’s

Such responses were not very common though, and mainly heard from street vendors who started vending on the streets only recently, after the promise of the national authorities that they would not be harassed by the local authorities.

Local solidarity was also observed between vendors or marketers and their local distributor.

“Normally they [the distributors] won’t let you [the vendors] purchase goods on credit [pay distributor afterwards for the goods that you bought from him/her]… But now, I have been here for such a long period [over 5 years], they know that I am a sincere vendor. [...] It helps me to expand my variety [assortment of prepaid phone cards], which increases my profits.”

Male street vendor, Kitwe, 43 years, selling prepaid phone cards, same as mentioned earlier

Building trust between local distributors and the vendor, based on a longer period of positive collaborations, which facilitates the ease, or possibility at all, to buy merchandize ‘on credit’ seemed to help the vendors in their businesses. By offering a greater range of their products, they are able to cater for a larger population, which increases their profits.

5.2.2 Formal Networks

According to many vendors and marketers that were a member of an organization, their membership of a local organization contributed to feelings of belongingness and support. For instance,

“We all [members of WYLM] considered it to be important to meet other [physically disabled] people to see what challenges they have… We can talk about the problems that we encounter… And discuss how we have been able to overcome some of these challenges. [...] It is also helpful to see that other face similar challenges as we do”

One of the members of WYLM, informal teacher, Ndola

The latter aspect, sharing ideas about how to overcome difficulties that informal economy workers face, was also mentioned by other organizations as being very important. For instance, when asked VAN about what they missed the most now that their membership had decreased significantly, the leader mentioned first,

“We lack information…when it comes to brainstorming, there are only a few people that are contributing, so we do not get a lot of new information or ideas. [Before] when

---

4 According to the representative of the VAN their membership had decreased due to the promise of the national authorities that vendors could vend freely on the streets. He explained that vendors did not experience the need to be a member of an organization anymore to feel secure on the streets.
you put up a suggestion, at least you have a good numbers of ideas coming in from various people…. Look at it now, if there are only five or ten members, the income of more ideas is limited… With a big number of people, a big number of ideas are coming in. So that is at the advantage of the organization.”

Representative of VAN

Furthermore, being a member of an organization also increased the power of street vendors and marketers, for instance, when negotiating with the local authorities. Before they became a member, many street vendors and marketers reported having feelings of powerlessness to act against the measures that were taken by the local authorities. For instance,

“They [officials from the municipality] laugh at us [marketers]. They know we have to work all day to make a living. But when we go there [municipality council], they just let us wait as long as they can. And I have been there many times, but never have they listened to what we have to say.”

Marketer, Loako Market, Kalulushi, about the relation with the local authorities now that ZANAMA and ZATMA are deregistered

As a member of an organization, street vendors and marketers told many positive stories regarding possibilities of these organizations to negotiate with the local authorities,

“At some point all vendors were removed on the streets, except those who were a member [of VAN]. We were the only ones allowed to vend [due to the negotiations of VAN with the local authorities].”

Female street vendor, Ndola, zone representative VAN, sells perishables

“The municipality wanted to raise the levies […]. They even had plans to demolish this whole market and build a new one. Efforts of ZANAMA were able to prevent those things from happening.”

Marketer, Patason market, Kalulushi, regional coordinator ZANAMA

According to many members of the organizations, they also benefitted from the ‘formalization’ of some of the functions of the ‘chilemba’. For instance, street vendor and market organizations, like VAN, offered their members financial support when they experienced financial problems. In other instances, it was easier for members to receive financial support from other members, as this was also stimulated by the organizations. For instance,

“We always used to go around [the market to gather some money from the marketers] to help one [marketer] who had just lost a relative.”

Marketer, Loako market, Kalulushi, regional coordinator ZATMA

In the last two sections, the benefits of an informal and a formal local network has been described. The findings suggest that these networks are especially important for feelings of solidarity and community, financial support and also for negotiating with the local authorities. The findings also suggest that informal and formal local networks fulfill similar tasks. For instance, with the disappearance of the formal organization, informal networks can be formed among the street vendors and marketers in an attempt to take over these tasks. Yet, the findings suggest that formal local organizations are crucial for representing marketers and street vendors for negotiations at the local
authorities. The next section elaborates on how local organizations are affected by national networks.

5.2.3 Effects of National Networks on Local Organizations

The local value of the organizations seemed to depend largely on the network that they have with other organizations. For instance, representatives of different organizations indicated that their credibility and recognition as an organization, and thereby also their negotiation powers with the local authorities, becomes much better when they are affiliated to a national organization. Especially when this organization is well-known country-wide. As one representative noted,

“Through AZIEA we have come to be known, we have been recommended to other [organizations]. [It] increase[s] the visibility of the organization.”
Representative WYLM, Ndola

Interestingly, having a national network is even considered to be more important than the size of a local organization in terms of their negotiation powers. As the representative of one organization informed,

“We don’t lose any power in the negotiations with the council, it doesn’t matter for the council if this association has only 50 members [instead of the 100 members before].”
Representative VAN, Ndola

These findings suggest that just being affiliated to AZIEA, which is relatively well-known among the authorities, would significantly facilitate the local organizations in their local negotiations. Furthermore, the support that is offered by AZIEA in the form of workshops, for both the management of these organizations and their members, stimulates the development of, among others, the negotiation capacities of the local organizations.

“[We have had workshops from AZIEA] about negotiation skills, business skills [and] about gender, where some of our members participated. [...] They told us about how we should be negotiating with the [local authorities], and how other organizations do that.
Representative WYLM, Ndola

According to the representatives of the local organizations, local problems were often overcome by knowledge that they gained from other areas in Zambia. Exchanges are reported as having a huge impact on the lives of the marketers and street vendors, of which the majority hardly seemed to leave their place of residence or work. Members of organizations reported to have learned a significant deal by visiting other urban areas in Zambia. For instance, they see how other street vendors and marketers work and how they approach and are being approached by the local authorities. Learning experiences of street vendors and marketers can also include very simple things, for instance,

“By visiting friends [other vendors and marketers] in other places in Zambia, I have come to learn how to market my products on my stand. They need to be visible for the people passing by.”
Street vendor, Kitwe

The majority of the representatives of the organizations also considered these exchanges to be very valuable, as they were able to gain information regarding the
management an organization, and how other organizations dealt with the local authorities, for instance.

Moreover, the local authorities, in this case the KCC, also reported to have at least two annual visits to other municipalities and their councils to discuss how they manage street vendors and marketers. One such a visit, to Ndola, for instance, showed the KCC that, despite the existence of street vending, streets can still be kept clean, as is the case in Ndola. After inquiries, they found out that the NCC just cleans the streets more often than the KCC does. Afterwards, the KCC also adopted plans to clean the streets more often than there were doing up to now. Thus, these exchanges form an educational experience for both the members and leaderships of organizations, as well as for the local authorities.

According to the vendors and marketers, these exchanges are especially interesting for them as it allows the possibility for them to network with other street vendors and marketers than those in their own urban area. The lack of competition between vendors and marketers that operate in different geographical areas allows for the opportunity to discuss ‘sensitive’ matters, including their distributor. Thus, these kinds of exchanges provide possibilities for marketers and vendors to establish their own networks outside of the area where they work which might facilitate them for doing their local businesses. For instance, one of the interviewed street vendors in Kitwe reported that,

“I have a friend [colleague vendor] in [a place 40 kilometers away], with him I share all the secrets of my business. We even have the same supplier…. Sometimes I pick up things for him at our supplier [in Tanzania], and sometimes he does that for me. We help each other…”

Street vendor, Kitwe, selling books

These findings suggest that regional collaborations between marketers or street vendors serve a very different purpose, and might even be as, or perhaps even more, important for marketers or street vendors than local existing networks. Again, these networks were reported by marketers and street vendors regardless of whether they were a member of an organization.

This section showed the importance of having a national network for the functioning of local organizations. National workshops not only improved local organizations’ negotiation powers, it also taught representatives about managing an organization and supported their members in their businesses. Furthermore, regional informal networks among vendors and marketers were also in some instances able to provide them with crucial information for their businesses. In the next section, effects of international networks on local organizations are presented.

5.2.4 Effects of International Networks on Local Organizations

In the present study, AZIEA was the only organization officially linked to international partners, among which War on Want, StreetNet International and WIEGO. For organizations that were locally active, the international collaborations of AZIEA helped them in various ways. Both representatives of local organizations as well as their members were always extremely excited about possibilities for international exchanges. Conversations of the researcher with members of different organizations who had been on exchanges suggested that their experiences from international exchanges were incomparable to national exchanges or just the exchange of knowledge. According to
the majority of the street vendors and marketers, it helped them to gain some perspective concerning their own situation,

“You see, I had no idea that people in other countries are facing similar problems like we are. But we [street vendors and marketers] in Zambia are not the only ones with these issues. Everywhere in Africa, people are having these problems, right?! [looks at researcher for a confirmative answer]”

Marketer, Chisokone market, Ndola, selling hardware and electrical appliances

When asked how international exchanges have so big impacts on street vendors and marketers, a representative of AZIEA responded,

“Knowledge about the situation in other countries gives street vendors more understanding about their own situation and also gives them more confidence that a solution will be found for their current tough circumstances and livelihood struggles.”

It became also clear to the researcher that observations of marketers and street vendors regarding differences in other countries were gladly taken back to their own situation. For instance, leaders of local organizations would have gathered new ideas of how to deal with the local authorities, or possible solutions for their problems. As one leader reported,

“In Zimbabwe [where he has been on an exchange visit] the organization [which works also with physically disabled informal economy workers] is even getting workshops specific for [physically disabled] informal economy workers. Now, I try to lobby at AZIEA to have [those] here as well... And I think they [AZIEA] have come to see the possibility [in arranging that] too.”

Representative WYLM, Ndola

Marketers and street vendors often reported that they noticed differences in how street vendors and marketers in other countries dealt with the authorities or customers. These observed differences helped them in their own businesses too. A few responses from the marketers and street vendors regarding international exchanges or international knowledge dispersed through the network,

“On one exchange I talked to a business man, who told me that you can plan for success. That is what I am trying to do now.”

Male street vendor, Kitwe, about an exchange to the United States

“[I have learned how important it is] to have a clean environment. Since [then], I am selling the fruits in plastic bags, and I try to have water for customers that want to eat the vegetables direct[ly] on the street. I also want to have some information for them on how they can prepare some meals.”

Female street vendor, Ndola, sells perishables, about benefits from international information

“By talking to the members and director of an organization I learned how to do handle the cash, and how important it is to be financially disciplined. We also saw there how the market was operated. A committee collected the levies and put this money directly back in the market for cleaning and collecting garbage. They hired even people from the market to do this.”

Male market and street vendor, Ndola, sells electrical appliances and shoes, about his exchange to Kampala, Uganda
The researcher also noted that the confidence of local organizations about possible solutions was increased by seeing these solutions working elsewhere.

Awareness of possibilities for an international exchange stimulated marketers and street vendors also to actually join local organizations. For instance,

“When we joined AZIEA, we got directly more members....Only because they [street vendors] knew that they could be elected to go on an international exchange when they joined us.”

Regional representative of Tuntemba Association, Kalulushi

Such findings suggest that the membership of a local organization to AZIEA, which made them part of an international network, also had positive results on local organizing capacities.

The international network of AZIEA, and their international donors, not only provided international exchanges, but allowed AZIEA also to provide a financial compensation, to cover travel expenses for instance, for members that visited workshops of AZIEA. These workshops were often held locally – organizations active in a specific region would invite some of their members to participate in such a workshop. Thus, lowering the threshold of visiting workshops also facilitated the development of capacity-building among the members of local organizations. For instance,

“When normally there are more people at AZIEA workshops than those organized by [mentions another national organization], just because you get some [financial] compensation to go there.”

Marketer, regional coordinator of ZANAMA, Kalulushi

The present section showed how organizing internationally affects local organizing capacities. The findings suggest that international knowledge stimulates both the businesses of the marketers and vendors as well as the generation of new ideas for representatives of local organizations on how to deal with authorities, for instance. Furthermore, the findings also suggest that even having an international network stimulates marketers and street vendors to become a member of a local organization. Having international donors possibly also allows for financial compensation which could positively affect local capacity-building, as shown in the example above. Now, a description is provided of functions of organizations on a national level, including effects of international networks on national organizations.

5.3 ORGANIZING AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL

Many of the interviewed local organizations are thinking of ‘scaling up’ their activities, they aim at covering a greater geographical area. According to the majority of the local organizations, their objectives to become national in scope, can be achieved by following two different strategies. A representative of a local organization expresses these strategies,

“We are really trying to expand... For Kitwe, Chingola and Luanshya ... we had one time a programme under AZIEA, where we articulated issues on how WYLM was operating. And then there were a number of people [from Kitwe, Luanshya and Chingola] interested in [our organization]. So, we organized them. Last year when we had a meeting there was a colleague from us [a physically disabled vendor] from
Lusaka, where they [also have an organization and] wanted to affiliate to us, so we said that we can accommodate them... Through [a] meeting we are going to assess whether they can be part of us or not. Whether the vision fits with [ours], I think that is the major concern. I think if we would have gotten the resources, we would have been there already.”

Representative of WYLM, Ndola

These findings suggest that a local organization either (I) tries to organize people by themselves in surrounding areas, like Kitwe (about 50 kilometers), Luanshya (about 30 kilometers) and Chingola (about 100 kilometers) in this case, or (II) tries to link up with an organization that is possibly located further away and active on similar issues, in this case the organization in Lusaka (about 400 kilometers). The latter strategy is also confirmed by a representative of another local organization,

“Our vision is to have a national street vendors organization, where VAN can be incorporated in. We have talked about this with the Vendors Association of Mansa at a meeting at AZIEA. We are now looking at the possibilities. Then we can also link to organizations in other countries, like [the Kenyan] KENASVIT [Kenya National Alliance of Street Vendors and Informal Traders]... or go to Malawi to see how they do it [organize street vendors and talk to the local authorities] there.”

Representative of VAN, Ndola

Three other points can be made from these quotes. First, limited resources severely hampers expansion ambitions of local organizations. For instance, WYLM has not been able yet to visit the organization in Lusaka that wanted to affiliate to them due to their lack of financial resources. Alternatively, expanding gradually in the region helps them to keep travel costs and other expenses when national meetings are to be held low. The same representative already mentioned that sometimes representatives from Chingola could not attend these meetings due to their limited financial possibilities and time. Similarly, VAN and WYLM meet, together most often with Tuapia Poultry Farmers and Women’s Association, just because all three of them are located in Ndola, even though their issues can be considered to be very different in general.

Second, both quotes show the importance of a national platform, which is now offered by AZIEA, for networking possibilities between local organizations. The international collaborations and donors of AZIEA stimulate other organizations also to organize themselves nationally. They offer a platform where representatives of the different, local, organizations can meet and engage in networking activities.

Third, the organizations consider ‘scaling-up’ as crucial in order to be able to be linked to international networks. To be recognized by international networks, one needs to be recognized first nationally, as ‘local organizations have no chance of linking directly to international networks’, as one representative of a local organization explained. It would also offer them possibilities to talk to the national authorities, what ZANAMA and ZATMA, with their national scope, already have been doing in the past. For instance,

“Zambia was liberalizing since 1991, [so] we thought everything is supposed to be liberalized, including markets... [So] we [were] giving them examples wherein competition is the core agenda. We have seen private schools and private hospitals, the whole sector was liberalized and there was [this] competition [between the] government [and the] private sector, [and] as a result you have quality provision of services. If we can have our own markets, and the government can also have their own
markets, then we can compete, and through that competition people can choose which market they [want to] belong to. In one case, the president puts up a proposal in which ... markets could also be owned by marketers themselves [next to the markets owned by the] government... Unfortunately, a few months later, that president [Mwasana] died; so this dream was shattered. There came a new government, and we started fresh.”

Representative of ZANAMA, about their negotiations with the national authorities

International exchanges where representatives of affiliates of AZIEA take part in, also helped them in their negotiations on a national level. For instance, regarding the idea of having privately run markets,

“In Uganda, where [the] government has empowered marketers to own such markets, [where we went]... Zambia is a very democratic country compared to Uganda, which is run by a soldier. And what if a soldier can do this, ‘what about you democrats?’ [we asked the government]. So ... we used to convince them on such issues. At one point ... some of the government officials verified what we told them... That is how exchange visits are helping us.”

Representative of ZANAMA, regarding the influence on exchange visits on their negotiations

Such statements suggest that knowledge that is acquired from abroad directly affects possible solutions that are suggested on a national level. In similar vein, knowledge from Zambia is also being exported to other countries. Regarding negotiations with the national authorities,

“We have developed very good relations with the national authorities... We even advice our colleagues [representatives from the same organization in another country] on how to deal with the national authorities... Then we advice them sometimes not to approach them aggressively...You see, they sometimes have more problems [with the national authorities] than we do.... We try to help them on how to handle these.”

Youth Representative of CBTA

Collaboration on a national level with other actors also increases chances of being recognized by international actors. AZIEA, due to its connection with the ZCTU, has, for instance, been able to start projects with other international trade unions.

The findings from this section suggest that national organizing capacities are considered important by the organizations for various reasons. It would give the organizations capacities to also negotiate with the national authorities, as ZANAMA has done, for instance. Furthermore, they also allow possibilities for networking between different local organizations and to become affiliated to international networks. International networks contribute to national organizing capacities in a variety of ways. For instance, the findings suggest that it helped the organizations to come up with new solutions that were then presented to the national authorities. Findings also suggest that it increased organizations’ confidence with which these solutions were presented and their negotiation strategies as organizations learn from each other about viable strategies in their respective countries.

5.4 ORGANIZING AT THE INTERNATIONAL LEVEL

After talking to many representatives of the different organizations, the researcher was able to distinguish between two different functions that international networks fulfill. First, they seemed to give the organization financial support. Second,
they seemed to increase their knowledge regarding a variety of issues. Thus, the majority of the national organizations were also very eager to collaborate with other, internationally active, organizations that can help them to develop. For instance, the USVF, which lacked such international networks, mentioned financial resources and knowledge as the two major drivers for becoming part of an international network.

The majority of the national organizations mentioned two different forms of knowledge that organizations are mostly looking for in international networks. First, the organizations would like to learn more about the management of their own organization. Second, the organizations would like to increase the knowledge of their own members. Thus, information about improvement of businesses, for instance regarding writing business plans, accounting, etc., is also highly valued by these organizations.

According to meetings with many representatives of national organizations, information gathered internationally is generally trickled down. In the present study, AZIEA, which has the most extensive international network, receives this information from their international collaborators, for instance during a StreetNet International workshop or a social forum. In some instances, AZIEA’s affiliates are also invited to these meetings. Then, AZIEA distributes this information further through their established network in Zambia, by organizing workshops where their affiliates are present. The affiliates are then responsible for ensuring that all their members become aware of this information, as not all of their members can be present on workshops of AZIEA.

This section showed the different objectives of having an international network. Findings suggest that organizations are eager to have international collaboration to increase their knowledge as well as their financial resources.

In these sections, the benefits of having a national organization and an international network as perceived by the street vendors, marketers and the interviewed organizations has been discussed. Findings suggest that national and international organizing capacities affect local and national organizing capacities positively in a variety of ways. National and international organizations seem to contribute not only to the local businesses of the marketers and street vendors, but also to the knowledge gathered by the organizations which affects their negotiation positions with the local and national organizations. In the next section, the importance of organizing on different scales is specifically related to the right to the city framework.

5.5 THE RIGHT TO THE CITY

In the present section an overview of the activities of the organizations regarding the right to the city is given. This section is so organized that first activities at a local level, then at a national and lastly at the international level are discussed.

5.5.1 At the Local Level

Recent political changes, as described in chapter four, have a big impact on the circumstances under which marketers and street vendors operate.

The current political situation of street vendors, which one representative of AZIEA repeatedly characterized as “a honeymoon”, is highly appreciated among almost all street vendors. Interviews with street vendors indicated that cooperation with the local authorities is one strategy of street vendors to ensure that the current situation lasts as long as possible. For instance,
“We engage regularly in collective street sweepings... Every street vendor is expected to participate, if someone continues to sell then we force him or her to stop selling and help us.”

Street vendor, Kitwe, selling DVD’s, regional coordinator USVF

“We always make sure that we clean up the place from where we were selling. If I see someone leaving without cleaning, I always tell him or her to do that."

Street vendor, Kitwe, selling prepaid phone cards

From interviews with different USVF’ zone representatives and other street vendors, both members and non-members in Kitwe and Ndola, it seemed that the USVF was the most involved in trying to stimulate street vendors to collaborate with the local authorities. For instance, regional coordinators of USVF had bought sweeping materials and encouraged other street vendors to participate in regular collective street sweepings, as the above quote also suggests.

Street vendors also reported other strategic individual choices that would secure their vending on the streets. One street vendor, for instance, deliberately opted for selling newspapers besides his merchandize. He knew that selling newspapers on the streets was not illegal. According to him, engaging in this business prevented him from being chased off the streets in the past.

Organizations also tried locally to ameliorate the circumstances under which street vending takes place. Representatives of many street vendor’ organizations reported attempts to motivate the local authorities to provide facilities on the streets. These facilities varied from requesting sanitation to street lighting or paving the roads from where vending took place.

In the past, when street vendors were regularly chased off the street, belonging to a street vendor organization also allowed street vendors sometimes to continue vending. For instance, VAN, as reported above by a member of VAN, has been able in the past to ensure that their members’ could continue vending.

For marketers, the deregistration of organizations active in the market, seemed to affect the quality of facilities negatively. A majority of marketers from different markets informed the researcher that toilets had been closed or were not working properly anymore. Others also reported problems of security,

“ZANAMA used to hire security people... But now, they [street kids] can just come in the market and take some of your goods... There are also a lot more fights going on now.”

Marketer, Chisokone market, Kitwe, selling rice and nuts

“They [ZANAMA] used to offer us secured storage where we could put our merchandize during the night... The municipality also offers something like that, but I do not really trust them.”

Marketer, Chisokone market, Kitwe, selling second-hand clothes

However, not all marketers agreed that the lack of security by ZANAMA caused more internal problems than when market organizations, in this case ZANAMA and ZATMA, were still active in the market,

“It is much more relaxed now...Before, ZANAMA and ZATMA members used to fight a lot, for no reason really...”

Marketer, Nakadoli market, selling second-hand clothes
“...these fights even led to lower businesses, as customers were sometimes afraid to enter the market.”

Marketer, Chisokone market, selling bags

As acknowledged by regional coordinators of both ZANAMA and ZATMA, ZANAMA and ZATMA have been able to prevent plans of the local authorities to raise the market fees, or to even erase the complete market. According to the regional coordinator of ZANAMA in Kalulushi, this latter plan of the municipality of Kalulushi was prevented by interventions of ZANAMA.

Workshops offered by marketer organizations aim to increase the negotiation skills of the marketers with the local authorities. However, without having a formal organization that represents them, as indicated earlier, marketers have difficulties of being heard by the local authorities about the problems that they face in the markets. According to some marketers in Kalulushi, even when they go together as a group, the authorities do still not do anything with their complaints (e.g., about non-functioning toilets).

5.5.2 At the National Level

Strategies of organizations at a national level to ensure marketers’ and street vendors’ right to the city differ significantly from strategies at the local level. Regarding street vendors, AZIEA focused on changing the policies regarding street vending. The current situation, with street vending still being illegal according to law, is a continuous threat for the existence of street vendors.

To facilitate such lobbying, AZIEA depends on the collaboration and efforts being done by the ZCTU as well. Being the biggest trade union in the country, ZCTU is in close contact with the government, and therefore able to influence their policies regarding informal economy workers.

Regarding the marketers, according to ZANAMA and ZATMA, they engaged in lobbying with the national authorities. According to ZANAMA, their capabilities to represent marketers was under a severe threat with the creation of the Markets and Bus Stations Act in 2007. To protect their existence, they decided to become politically affiliated to the then leading party, the MMD. ZANAMA also tried to lobby for the allowance of privately run markets at the national authorities, as described above.

5.5.3 At the International Level

According to primarily AZIEA, ZANAMA and ZATMA, the international collaborations help them to represent marketers and street vendors nationally and locally and to claim their rights. Their international perspective provides them with knowledge and financial possibilities that strengthen their position while negotiating with the national and local authorities.

The researcher noted that international knowledge might also facilitate the confidence with which solutions are suggested by these three organizations at a national level. For instance, seeing privately run markets in Uganda strongly increased the conviction of ZANAMA that privately run markets should also be possible in Zambia.

Organizations also mentioned that they adjusted their negotiation strategies according to suggestions being made by organizations active outside of Zambia. Similarly, the CBTA also proposed strategies to informal economy organizations working outside of Zambia, see the quote above. These findings suggest that
organizations may also help each other regarding negotiation tactics.

The descriptions given in this section show how local, national and international organizations have attempted to use their presence and networks on different scales to represent the rights of street vendors and marketers in negotiations with the local and national authorities. Furthermore, the findings also suggest that the disappearance of the market organizations, by their deregistration, directly had a negative effect on the rights of the marketers. The findings also suggest how the strategies at the different levels differ from each other. For instance, locally, organizations may strive to obtain better facilities for the street vendors and marketers that operate in one urban area. At a national level, organizations’ lobbying regarding changing national policies for street vendors and marketers possibly affects street vendors and marketers countrywide. National negotiations have thus the potential to affect the local situation of street vendors and marketers too.

5.6 CONCLUSION

The findings in this chapter suggest different that organizations that work with street vendors and marketers help them in various ways. Not only provide these organizations them with workshops to increase their business skills, but they also ensure that street vendors and marketers are represented to local and national authorities. They provide one voice for the marketers and the street vendors which seems to strengthen significantly their powers in negotiations.

Street vendors and marketers reported to have informal networks mostly on a local level, although some networks on a more regional or national level were in some instances reported as well. The findings suggest that each of these networks served different purposes. Street vendors and marketers valued local networks as being important for financial support and providing information about the viability of new businesses. More regional networks, on the other hand, were also of importance as street vendors and marketers lacked direct competition with one another, which seemed to facilitate their cooperation and sharing of sensitive information regarding their businesses.

Organizations that were part of the present research differed in their geographical scope, that is the scales on which they were active. Some organizations were active only locally, whereas others were active on a national level and internationally as well. Findings suggested that local organizations benefit from being part of a national network as it increased their negotiation capacities with local authorities. For instance, local organizations could increase their knowledge regarding negotiation strategies as well as possible solutions. Also, just being a member of a nationally recognized organization seemed to facilitate the respect of the local authorities for the local organizations.

Both local and national organizations benefitted from international networks that they are part of as it increased their knowledge substantially regarding the situation of street vendors and marketers abroad. It helped them to come up with new solutions for the issues that street vendors and marketers faced. They also learned from other organizations about how to deal with local and national authorities, for instance regarding their strategies and tactics during negotiations.

Potentially, a national organization also facilitated exchanges of information between different urban areas within Zambia. Yet, limitations in both time and financial means limited such exchanges in some instances. Meetings were sometimes only
arranged between parts of the national organization, as other parts were unable to attend due to a lack of money or time.

For the same reasons, the researcher observed that local organizations primarily engaged in networking with other organizations in the same geographical area, for instance, in the same city. These networks seemed to be formed exactly because the organizations are present in the same area – no other direct links between the objectives or target groups of the organizations were always found - which limits their costs, in both time and finances, to network.

The present findings showed how scaling up of organizations, and networks between organizations on higher scales than at which they are primarily active facilitated the functioning of the organizations on the scales on which they act. Thus, national and transnational collaborations facilitated the working of local organizations in their local resistances and transnational collaborations facilitated the working of national organizations. Furthermore, the present findings also suggest that networks at different levels also serve different purposes, and thereby contribute differently to the functioning of the organizations.

These results suggest that local organizations benefit from global organizing, which shows the interrelatedness of the local and the global. Furthermore, organizations also facilitate street vendors’ and marketers’ right to the city, and they make use of national and international knowledge to do so as well. The links between the findings and the theoretical framework is to be further elaborated in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 6
DISCUSSION

6.1 INTRODUCTION

The present chapter connects the findings, as presented in the previous chapter, to the theoretical framework, as presented in chapter two. Before doing so, the aim and the research questions of the study, as presented in chapter one, are first repeated and answered.

6.2 AIM AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS OF THE STUDY

The main objective of the present study was twofold. A first question was developed to specifically examine the relation between local and global influences. This question was,

How do local, national and global networks among street vendors and marketers and their organizations shape the resistances of street vendors and marketers?

This research question was formulated to explore the formation of networks on a local, national and international level, and how these networks on different scales facilitated the resistance strategies of street vendors and marketers. With this question, the researcher also wanted to explore whether networks formed among street vendors and marketers had different functions that networks among organizations that worked for street vendors and marketers.

Theoretically, this question offered the possibility for the researcher to connect the local to the global. A majority of scholars (e.g., Massey, 2004; Lindell, 2009) consider local resistances to be important for achieving global changes. Moreover, some scholars (e.g., Lindell, 2009) also argued that global networks are important for local resistances. These theorizations provide evidence for the interrelatedness of the local and the global.

The (geographical) scope of the present study limits a fuller understanding of the extent to which local resistances shape global changes. The study did show, however, that organizations working in urban areas in the Copperbelt are very eager to propose, and possibly implement, solutions to the authorities that have reached them through participation in international networks. If such strategies are followed on a larger scale, that is, also by other organizations in- and outside of Zambia, they possibly lead to global changes.

The present study showed that national and international networks between organizations stimulated local and national resistances in various ways. First of all, just being a member of national organization increased the respect of the local organizations by the local authorities. Second, workshops offered on national level increased also local organizations’ knowledge regarding how to engage in negotiations with the local authorities. Third, a national organization, like AZIEA, also offered possibilities for local organizations to exchange information on specific challenges that they faced and possible solutions. National organizations benefitted from an international network as it provided them with knowledge about how organizations and marketers and street vendors deal with their challenges in other countries. Furthermore, their participation in
international networks also gave them more knowledge about accepted solutions elsewhere, which they then often also proposed during negotiations with the national authorities.

The second, more specific, question that was developed, was

*How do local, national and international networks among organizations that work for street vendors and marketers contribute to street vendors’ and marketers’ claims to the rights to the city?*

This question served to unravel how networks operating at different scales facilitated the claims to right to the city of street vendors and marketers. Furthermore, related to the ideas of Lefebvre (1995, 1996ab) are contemporary suggestions for new forms of citizenship (Holston, 1998, 2009) and democracy (Appadurai, 2001).

The results from the present study suggest that local organizations often engage in negotiations with the local authorities, whereas national organizations have possibilities to negotiate with the national authorities. The strategies and tactics for these negotiations are often derived from knowledge that the local organizations have accessed through their network. Negotiations at a national level often involve having possibilities to change national laws, whereas at a local level, negotiations usually only have local consequences. Suggestions that have been made by the local and national organizations to advocate rights to the city of street vendors and marketers are often derived from knowledge and experiences gained elsewhere in- or outside of Zambia. Developments in new forms of citizenships and democracy are elaborated below.

**6.3 FINDINGS RELATED TO GLOCALIZATION**

*6.3.1 From Local Resistances to Global Changes*

The debate between scholars about the importance of local resistances for global changes, where some scholars argued that there local resistances are fruitless (e.g., Hardt & Negri, 2000), whereas others suggest that local resistances have possibilities to create global changes (e.g., Gibson-Graham, 2002; Massey, 2004; Sassen, 2004). The scope of the present study, in which organizations and networks have been researched on a local, or regional, level severely limits conclusions that can be drawn about the effectiveness of these resistances for global changes. Some findings of the present study do suggest, however, that local resistances and strategies are being shared via a national or international network to organizations operating elsewhere. Local strategies, for instance regarding negotiation tactics, are often shared with a, on a bigger scale operating, network and organizations. The CBTA, for instance, shared their tactics for dealing with the national authorities with organizations operating elsewhere. Similarly, local and national solutions that are dispersed via an international network, or exchanges, often provide valuable insights for other organizations when they are negotiating with the authorities. For instance, observations of ZANAMA that privately run markets are possible elsewhere, made them decide to propose this solution to the Zambian authorities as well.

These findings do not necessarily imply that local resistance lead to global changes, but they do suggest that strategies of local resistances are often shared across regions and borders, which provides a possibility for a global change. However, this global change is then to be accomplished by similar local and national resistance strategies rather than changing the global structure at once. Global change is then to be
established by changing local configurations in different places simultaneously.

The findings from the present study also showed that organizations are often capable of engaging in negotiations with authorities who are active at the same scale as they are. For instance, it is very difficult for VAN, a local street vendor organization, to engage in negotiations with the national authorities. Negotiating with local authorities, that is, with the authorities that are active at the same scale as they are, has shown to provide benefits for the members of local organizations. Such findings would suggest that in order to successfully change global structures or institutions, an organization or network at the same, global, scale is required. The majority of the organizations that were involved in the present study were, via their membership to AZIEA, part of a global network, but the researcher was unfortunately not able to interview these international organizations or networks (e.g., WIEGO, StreetNet International, War on Want) regarding their global negotiation strategies.

In this section, the effect of the local on the global is described. A description has been offered to show how the global consists of different localities. The next section shows how the global (and national/international) is reflected in local resistances.

6.3.2 From Global Networks to Local Resistances

The relatedness of the global and the local also becomes apparent by studying how global networks affect local resistances. In the present study, the researcher has not only focused on global networks per se, but also on the effects of networks formed between local and national organizations and how these stimulate their local or national resistances. The findings suggest that national organizations benefit from international networks, and local organizations benefit from both national and international networks. These findings are congruent with the findings as presented in Lindell (2009), where she also showed how national and international networks are beneficial for the resistances of local organizations. These findings suggest that glocalization (cf. Swyngedouw, 1997), or in this case the presence of the global in the local, becomes especially visible. For instance, solutions and strategies from other countries are easily adopted and applied in the local context in Zambia. Thus, local resistances in Zambia become affected by global ideas, or ideas that have been floating around elsewhere. In that sense, these findings also are congruent with Massey’s (2005) idea of a place as drawing from within and from the outside.

What also became apparent in the study is that resistances, even if they become globalized, are still very dependent on the local context. For instance, the recent political changes have had a serious impact on organizing capacities among organizations that work for street vendors and marketers. They fit thereby with the notion of global justice networks which also suggest that even as resistances become part of a network, they remain locally embedded in their specific context (Routledge, 2003, p. 336), meaning that the local context remains to play a major role in the expressions of these resistances. For instance, many street vendors, marketers and their organizations also acknowledged that city councils and local municipalities behaved very differently towards street vendors and marketers. Such findings also suggest that local differences influence how the resistances are taking place.

Additionally, the study also suggests that a national organization sometimes intervened in local negotiations that are normally handled by a local department of a national organization. For instance, when local negotiations were not going as expected, the national organization often took over the negotiations. As the national committee
has profoundly more power than their local department, they often also had more possibilities to guide the negotiations into their desired directions. These findings suggest that local politics are not only influenced by global networks, but also by national networks.

The importance of ‘place’ and ‘locality’ becomes also clear when studying the existing networks and functioning of the different interviewed organizations. The findings suggest that collaborations between (local) organizations are more intensive when they share the same geographical area. For instance, the interviewed organizations in Ndola meet each other more often than they meet with organizations from other places, even though the commonalities among these organizations in Ndola were not always obvious to the researcher. Furthermore, when the local organizations aim to expand their (geographical) scope, they prefer to do so by expanding first in areas that are close by, before organizing marketers and street vendors in areas that are located further away.

These findings suggest that place and place-specifics are still very important for organizations working in the informal economy, and specifically with marketers and street vendors.

6.4 FINDINGS RELATED TO THE RIGHT TO THE CITY

6.4.1 Lefebvre’s Right to the City

Lefebvre’s right to the city was divided in two different claims. The first claim concerned the right to participation, whereas the second concerned the right to appropriation. With the first claim, he focused on the rights of urban inhabitants to play a central role in decisions that contributed to the production of urban space. Furthermore, as decisions could be made by different institutions, outside the scope of the state and on different scales, urban inhabitants should be given a voice in all these decisions regardless of the scale. With the second claim, Lefebvre maintained the right of urban inhabitants to physically access, occupy and use urban space. Furthermore, he also included in this second claim the right of all inhabitants to ensure that the produced space meets all their needs (Purcell, 2002).

Findings from the present study suggest that organizations that work with street vendors and marketers focus on claiming both these rights. All the interviewed organizations attempted to give street vendors and marketers, and other informal economy workers, a voice at the local authorities and to ensure that their needs would be heard in the production of urban space. Furthermore, the multi-scalar operations of the different organizations interviewed in this study led to attempts of them to provide a voice for street vendors and marketers at local and national levels. However, connections of informal economy organizations were limited to the authorities and did, for instance, not cover any links to private planning companies that were eligible to plan for parts of the urban areas.

Regarding the second right, the right to appropriation, street vendor and marketer organizations assisted street vendors and marketers so that they could continue vending from the streets or in the markets. Their negotiations with local authorities seemed to have prevented the abolishment of the existing markets, and allowed sometimes the members of street vendor organizations to continue vending on the streets.

Concerning the agency of marketers and street vendors themselves, the findings
from the present study suggest that marketers and street vendors possibly perceived that they had some agency to ensure their right to appropriation, for instance, they engaged in strategic choices of their businesses or attempted to collaborate as good as possible with the local authorities. Yet, regarding the right to participation, street vendors and marketers did not seem to have any voice without a formal organization representing them. For achieving this right, a crucial role was thus played by formal organizations of street vendors and marketers.

Lefebvre (1996b) also made a distinction between three different kinds of spaces. Regarding the conceived space, that is the mental construction or representation of space, the present study suggests that organizations were able to create some ‘space’ for marketers and street vendors among city planners and politicians. For instance, proposals were being discussed for legalizing vending in certain streets. Regarding the current prescribed use of space, the perceived space, however, there was no prescribed space for street vendors (yet), whereas the markets were prescribed for the marketers to do their businesses. In the future, though, there might also be prescribed spaces for street vendors, depending on whether the plans are actually being carried out. Finally, Lefebvre (1996b) also identified lived space, where the physical space is turned into symbolic space and where the prescribed appropriation of space is contested. The findings from the present study suggest that street vendors engage continuously in contesting the lived space, just by vending from the streets. Currently, their presence is not contested though by the local authorities.

Taken together, the results from the study suggest that marketers’ and street vendors’ right to the city in the conceived and the perceived space are stimulated by their organizations, whereas street vendors have opportunities to ensure their right in the lived space themselves. These findings, therefore, supplement Knudson’s (2007) conclusions, wherein she perceived the right to the city to be especially present in the lived space. Yet, organizations that work for marketers and street vendors also seem to add rights to the city of street vendors and marketers in the conceived and perceived space.

6.4.2 Changes in Citizenship and Democracy

Current ideas that the researcher perceives to be linked to the ideas of Lefebvre, such as concepts of ‘deep democracy’ (Appadurai, 2001) and ‘insurgent citizenship’ (Holston, 1991), also relate to the findings of this study. For instance, interviewed organizations that work with street vendors and marketers have shown to be able to provide a voice for marketers and street vendors and therefore strive to increase democratic principles in the researched urban areas. Nowadays, the needs of the street vendors and marketers have been mainly neglected by the local authorities. Yet, efforts by these organizations have shown to improve the conditions of street vendors and marketers. However, recent changes in the context also suggest how decisions can be simply taken by a powerful national authority. Furthermore, collaborations between organizations, as found in the present study, suggest a globalization from below, where networks of organizations allow them to cooperate internationally and with other organizations within Zambia, which is an important part of the ‘deep democracy’ concept as proposed by Appadurai (2001).

In contrast to Holston’s (1998) findings regarding informal economy workers’ knowledge about rights and their claims that they make to pursue these rights, the present study did not encounter many street vendors and marketers that were aware of
their rights and made direct claims to ensure that their rights were being met. Rather, street vendors and marketers experienced that they also belonged in the city and that they should be accepted unless alternatives were proposed to them. Feelings of community, solidarity and recognition that the organizations created among the street vendors and marketers suggest that a sense of citizenship was being created by the organizations. The gradual encroachment, which forms part of the insurgent citizenship, was abruptly disturbed by the deregistration of the market organizations in Zambia. Recent political changes for street vendors facilitated the encroachment of street vendors in the city though.

Changing forms of citizenship, as described by Purcell (2002), which would allow for a new form of urban citizenship, have not really been found in the present study. The results of this study do not suggest more malleable scales either, as was suggested by Purcell (2002). Furthermore, suggestions by Harvey (2012) that citizens should be able to influence decisions outside the scope of the state, were not found either. These findings suggest that these developments have not yet taken place in the researched areas, or that these changes can be considered as optimal outcomes, which might be reached in the future.

6.5 LIMITATIONS

The aim of the present study was to increase our knowledge about the functioning of networks and the relation between the local and the global as applied on organizations working with street vendors and marketers in the Zambian Copperbelt. The nature of the study, working with qualitative interviews, was not to provide an account that could possibly be generalized to other geographical areas, street vendors or marketers, or organizations that work for other informal economy workers. The researcher did not aim to select a representative sample of street vendors and organizations, but he purely selected cases that were most interesting for the present study. Generalization of the findings is a major limitation of the present study. The researcher merely attempted to provide an account of experiences of street vendors and marketers and their organizations regarding their perceptions of the influences of networks operating at different scales.
CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION

The present study investigated how national and international networks influenced national and local organizations that worked for street vendors and marketers. Findings showed that local and national resistances are positively affected by national and international networks. Results have been discussed from two different theoretical accounts. First, the relation between the local and the global was discussed. This discussion showed that local resistance strategies are, via the national and international networks, dispersed to organizations that operate elsewhere. Furthermore, this knowledge is used by the organizations in their negotiation strategies and solutions that they propose to the local and national authorities. Such findings demonstrate the existence of the global in the local and provide possibilities for achieving global changes as well.

Second, the results have been discussed in notions of the right to the city (e.g., Lefebvre, 1996ab), and changing ideas about democracy (Appadurai, 2001) and citizenship (Holston, 1998). The findings showed that organizations that work for street vendors and marketers have the ability to provide a voice for them in negotiations with the local and national authorities. A combination of agency of the street vendors and marketers and of street vendor’ and marketers’ organizations showed that marketers’ and street vendors’ right to the city are pursued on different dimensions as identified by Lefebvre (cf. Purcell, 2002). The study showed the formation of networks among these organizations, which indicates the existence of a globalization from below, which forms part of the notion of deep democracy (Appadurai, 2001). Street vendors and marketers also put moral claims on their existence in the city, suggesting some form of insurgent citizenship as well (Holston, 1998). Yet, these insurgent citizenships are very insecure, as authorities are very powerful to influence gradual encroachments of the street vendors and marketers.

The present study showed the importance of the local context for organizing capabilities. For example, organizations working with marketers, and to some extent also those that worked with street vendors, experienced huge problems due to new regulations. Such findings stress the importance of taking the local conditions into account for assessing organization capacities. Furthermore, they also suggest that solutions that might work in one place cannot simply be applied to other localities.

Differences between localities become also apparent in research findings described from areas beyond SSA. For instance, Holston (1998) reported how urban poor in Brazil have become aware of their rights and start to claiming these more and more frequently. Yet, in Zambia, the researcher did not find such trends among the participants. Reasons as to why in certain areas on the globe these trends are being found, whereas they remain absent in other (yet), remain unclear. Does it also have something to do with geography? That is, has the discourse of rights spread under certain geographical areas, but not yet reached others? Again, local features possibly also affect such developments. For instance, correct functioning of the legal system, that is, at least the absence of widespread corruption, possibly facilitates the believe of street vendors and marketers in their opportunities for successfully claiming their rights.
Marcuse, P. 2009. From critical urban theory to the right to the city. City, 13, pp. 185-197.
Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, 30, pp. 416-432.
APPENDICES

Appendix 1  Questionnaire for Street Vendors and Marketers

Street Vendors

Do you organize yourselves sometimes amongst yourself?
  Do you organize to clean the streets together, for instance?
  Do you know who organizes this?

Do you know if there is an organization that works with street vendors?
Are you a member of this / one of these organization(s)?
  When did you become a member?
  Why did you become a member?
  How did this organization support you? (What did they do for you?)
  Have you attended activities (meetings/workshops) from this organization?
    How often and how many?
    How did these workshops help you doing your business? (What did you learn?)
    How was the information from these workshops conveyed to the other members?

If not, have you been a member of an organization in the past?
  Why did you leave the organization?

If not, why do you not want to be a member of an organization?

Do you know if this organizations is/was part of an international network?
  How do you know this?
  Have you experienced any benefits from their international network?

Do you know if this organization was affiliated to the ZCTU?
  How do you know this?
  Have you experienced any benefits from this affiliation?

Marketers

Do you cooperate with other vendors (e.g., give them some money when they need that or sell goods for them)?
  With how many?
  How much money do you give each other?
  For which occasions?

Do you organize yourselves sometimes amongst yourself?
  Do you organize to clean the market together?
  Do you know who organizes this?
  Is there also an organization for this market?

Are you a member of a ‘formal’ organization (e.g., ZATMA/ZANAMA)?
  When did you become a member?
  Why did you become a member?
How did this organization support you? (What did they do for you?)
Have you attended activities (workshops) from this organization?
    How often/many?
    How did these workshops help you doing your business? (What did you learn?)
    How was the information from these workshops conveyed to the other members?

Do you know if these organizations were part of an international network?
    How do you know this?
    Have you experienced any benefits from their international network?
    Why are exchanges so important for your business?

Do you know if these organizations were connect to a trade union?
    How do you know this?
    Have you experienced any benefits from their this connection?

How has the situation changed since both parties have been abolished/do not exist anymore?
    Do you feel safe/secure? (Do you feel more vulnerable now without these organizations?)

Do you get any support from the local authorities in doing your business?
How satisfied are you with the efforts being done by the local authorities?
What could they improve?
Appendix 2  Questionnaire for Representatives of Street Vendor and Marketer Organizations

General questions
What does your organization exactly do?
Who does your organization represent?
How many members do you have / people (e.g., street vendors) do you think you represent?
Do you have a focus on a particular population group (youth/females/disabled)? Why?
Which activities does your organization plan for your members/people you represent?
How often do you organize these activities?
How can people join these activities?
In which city/cities/areas is your organization active?
Is your organization active in specific neighborhoods in this/these city/cities?
Are the activities the same that you organize in these different cities/neighborhoods?
Are the objectives of the activities/organizations the same in these different cities/neighborhoods?

Regarding their Network
With which organization(s) is your organization mostly in contact?
With which organization(s) does your organization actively collaborate?
Why did your organization choose to collaborate with this/these organization(s)?
And what does this collaboration exactly entail? (e.g., how often do you meet?)
How do you perceive the similarities/differences between your organization and the other organization(s)? (e.g., hierarchy of organization, objectives, activities, people they represent, scale)
Does your organization strive to collaborate with other organization(s)?
With what objectives? (e.g., to gain power, increase geographical scope, accomplish local objectives?)
Does your organization strive to collaborate with organization(s) that are active in another country?
Do you attach a different value to an international collaboration than domestic collaborations?
How do your members benefit from the (international) collaborations that your organization has?
(i.e. what has changed/improved for them since the collaboration?)

Is your company part of a labor union? Which one? Why (not)?
Does your company strive to become part of a labor union? Which one? Why (not)?
What does this collaboration exactly entail? (e.g., how often do you meet?)
Do you attach a different value to a collaboration with an international labor union than with a domestic union?

Extra questions for the umbrella organization
Why would organizations collaborate with your organization? (e.g., what do you offer them?)
How does your organization aim to increase its power? (e.g., more collaborations?)
How does your organization decide whether an organization is suitable for
collaboration?
Is your organization part of an international network?
   If Yes: Which?,
   If No: Do you strive to become?
How does this international network support you in your activities?
How do your affiliates profit from this international network?
Do you aim to extend your international connections? With which organizations and why?