XVI Nordic Musicological Congress
Stockholm 2012

Proceedings

Editor Jacob Derkert
Coeditor Peder Kaj Pedersen

XVI Nordic Musicological Congress
has been supported by

The Royal Academy of Music, Sweden
The Tobias Norlind Foundation

Stockholms universitet
The XVI Nordic Musicological Congress took place in Stockholm in August 2012. It included four keynote lectures each with a separate theme, four independent panels, and about seventy individual presentations. Of the individual presentations at the congress, twenty-one here re-emerges as papers, submitted as such and accepted by peer review.

The papers appear under three headings. Theoretical issues collect papers that try to answer questions of a general character, though with different extensions – either defined internally, e.g. tonal music or music with dipodic two-pulse, or contextually, in this case the sound logo and the audio-visual commercial, with all that such phenomena implies of socio-economic structures, functions, etc. Analytical problems broadly can be subdivided into studies of individual works or techniques and styles of authors on the one hand, and studies focussed on musical interpretation and performance on the other. The latter manifest the correlation between a shift from a near exclusive concern with musical works to an equally serious study of musical performance, and the introduction of recordings as relevant analytical artefacts. Historical questions include a wide variety of approaches. An initial essay on historiography is followed by a series of historical studies on diverse questions of ideology, music education, reception, and repertoire transmission.

The texts are from authors active in the Nordic countries, but also Canada, Germany, and Poland. The epithet “Nordic” in the last analysis is a matter of arrangement and organisation (involving the musicological societies of Denmark, Finland, Norway, and Sweden), and of the acceptance of the Scandinavian languages for presentation, but little else. And that is how it should be.

Finally, thanks to Peder Kaj Pedersen, Aalborg University, Denmark, for his work as coeditor, and to the anonymous readers included in the editorial work.

Stockholm, July 12th 2014

Jacob Derkert

---

1 For further details, see the Preface and content of the booklet *XVI Nordic Musicological Congress, Stockholm 2012: Abstracts*. In print: Department of Musicology and Performance Studies, Stockholm University 2012. Electronic: Department of Musicology and Performance Studies, Stockholm University 2014 (includes Addendum).
SHORT COMMENT ON EDITORIAL PRINCIPLES

The manuscripts submitted by the authors have been standardized for citations and bibliographical references. They are not standardized for matters of designation (e.g. E flat is designed as either E flat or e♭, depending on text), though revisions have been made in certain cases in dialogue with the authors. The position of the caption above or underneath a figure or table also varies between papers.

Jacob Derkert
CONTENTS

THEORETICAL ISSUES 1

TUIRE KUUSI

ADJECTIVE EVALUATIONS OF NONFAMILIAR CHORDS – CONNECTIONS BETWEEN CHORD CHARACTERISTICS, ADJECTIVES AND EMOTIONS 3

PIOTR PODLIPNIAK

THE EVOLUTIONARY ORIGIN OF GESTURAL MEANING IN TONAL MUSIC 14

JACQUELINE PATTISON EKGREN

IMPLICATIONS OF ACCENT PATTERNS IN NORWEGIAN STEVN: OLD NORSE HÁVAMÁL TO HIP HOP 26

ANDERS BONDE

BETYDNINGEN AF MELODI-INTERVAL OG RYTME FOR LYDLOGOER S BRANDTILKNYTNING 41

CHARLOTTE RØRDAM LARSEN & ANSA LØNSTRUP

THE POLYPHONY OF SENSES AND EXPERIENCE 58

CHARLOTTE RØRDAM LARSEN

MUSICAL FIT IN COMMERCIALS: FROM “ATTITUDE TOWARD A BRAND” TO “ATTITUDE TOWARD SENSUALITY” 58

ANSA LØNSTRUP

PERCEPTION OF AUDIO-VISUAL COMMERCIALS ADVERTISING MULTISENSUOUS COMMODITIES 68

ANALYTICAL PROBLEMS 77

ANNA PULKKIS

THE ALLURE OF THE NORTH: TONAL STRUCTURE AND TEXT IN SIBELIUS’S “NORDEN” 79

TIMO VIRTANEN

A JIGSAW PUZZLE WITHOUT A PICTURE: JEAN SIBELIUS’S LATE SKETCHES AND THE EIGHTH SYMPHONY 89

SAKARI YLIVUORI

FROM FAIR COPY TO DRAFT: A MANUSCRIPT STUDY ON SIBELIUS’S TANKE, SE, HUR FÅGELN SVINGAR 109
CAROLA FINKEL

SWEDISH FOLK MUSIC IN KURT ATTERBERG’S SYMPHONIES 122

ALEXIS LUKO

MUSICAL REPETITION IN THE FILMS OF INGMAR BERGMAN 133

KATE MAXWELL & JAMES R. SIMPSON

PAGE, PERFORMANCE AND PLAY IN MEDIEVAL TRANSMISSION AND REINTERPRETATION: PRESENCE AND ABSENCE IN THE OXFORD ROLAND AND GUILLAUME DE MACHAUT’S LE LIVRE DU VOIR DIT 144

BERTIL WIKMAN

“AUTHENTICITY,” “WERKTREUE” AND THE MUSICAL WORK. VLADIMIR HOROWITZ’S PERFORMANCE OF SCHUMANN’S TRÄUMEREI. 154

MAGNUS ANDERSSON

READINGS OF FINN MORTENSEN’S SYMFONI, OP. 5 164

HEIDI KORHONEN-BJÖRKMAN & RITVA KOISTINEN

MUSIKINSTRUMENTETS INVERKAN PÅ GESTALTNINGEN AV DEBUSSYS FLICKAN MED LINHÅRET. DIALOG MELLAN EN PIANIST OCH EN KANTELEMSIKER 173

HISTORICAL QUESTIONS 187

OLLE EDSTRÖM

THE USE OF ADORNO AND ELIAS IN THE HISTORY OF 18TH CENTURY MUSIC 189

MÅRTEN NEHRFORS

E.T.A. HOFFMANN’S IDEAL OF SONG 202

LENA HASELMANN

”O, HVOR JEG VILDE ONSKE AT DER I MIT EGET LAND VAR ANLEDNING TIL AT FAA DYGTIG Undervisning!” HOYERE MUSIKKUTDANNING I NORGE OG BERLIN SOM REISEMÅL FOR SKANDINAVISKE MUSIKSTUDENTER (1850 – 1900) 212

KENNETH SPARR

DEN GITARRSPELANDE SOCKERBAGAREN
OM CARL JOHAN GRAFSTROM OCH HANS GITARRSKOLA 223

PEDER KAJ PEDERSEN

NIELS W. GADE VIOLIN CONCERTO OP. 56: SUPPLEMENTARY COMMENTS TO THE CRITICAL EDITION 239

MARIT HØYE

SEQUENCES OF GERMAN ORIGIN AT NIDAROS 248
Theoretical issues
TUIRE KUUSI

ADJECTIVE EVALUATIONS OF NONFAMILIAR CHORDS – CONNECTIONS BETWEEN CHORD CHARACTERISTICS, ADJECTIVES AND EMOTIONS

1. Introduction

Many studies examining listener perceptions of musical features use adjectives as a method. Adjectives describe quality, and music can be said to have qualitative features. If music includes qualities, they can be recognised in music, or the listeners can associate qualities with music. But can we say that certain qualities are features of a musical object, if a number of listeners spontaneously associate those qualities with the musical object? Are judgements of this kind learned (for example, the idea of major mode as “happy” and minor mode as “sad”)?

Adjectives, qualitative features, perceptions, evaluations, and emotions are interconnected. Music can evoke emotions in listeners, or listeners can associate certain qualities or emotions with or recognise emotions in music, even though the emotions are not evoked in them (see discussion in Gabrielsson 2001; Kallinen & Ravaja 2006; Evans & Schubert 2008). Usually these qualities or emotions are expressed with adjectives.

Qualitative features associated with music and qualitative judgements of music can be connected either with structural parameters of music – parameters that are constantly present in a piece of music – or with parameters that vary from one presentation to another. Structural parameters, in turn, are connected with pitch organisation and rhythm (and texture as a combination of these two), with instrumentation and loudness. In the present study I concentrated on harmony, which is one feature of pitch organisation and a complex component of music; specifically, the focus of this study was on chords. I have, on purpose, left out a number of parameters that affect perception and judgement of music, because there are lots of studies on these, while minor attention has been paid to harmony (often it has not been analysed at all), and sometimes harmony has been understood in a limited manner as a distinction between the major and minor mode (Laurier, Lartillot, Errola, & Toivainen 2009).

The present study is not one of music emotions even though it has some connections with them (for emotions, see Gabrielsson & Lindström, 2001; Zentner, Grandjean & Scherer 2008; Juslin & Sloboda 2010; Errola & Vuoskoski 2011). Instead, the point of view of this study is music-theoretical. I used only tetrachords
and pentachords, and most of the chords were unfamiliar to the listeners; they were chords that are not used in Western tonal music. Pitch-class set-theory provided the theoretical background for the study. The tetrachords and pentachords represented tetrad and pentad classes. The chord voicing (permutation) was free, and the intervals between successive pitches were also free, indicating free octave shifts (for basics of pitch-class set-theory, see e.g. Forte 1973; Straus 1990).

2. Aim

The aim of the study was to examine estimations of nontraditional chords. The study examined the role of both chordal characteristics and set-class properties in the listeners’ evaluations. The chordal characteristics that were examined were chord span, transposition and voicing, while the set-class properties were the degree of consonance, interval-class content and cardinality. Yet another aim was to examine the connection between the characteristics, adjectives and emotions.

3. Experimental design

Altogether 47 participants (33 female; average age 34.9 years; range 19–66 years) evaluated chords in Experiment 1 (below, Ex.1). All were music listeners, and 40 participants had music as an active hobby (playing an instrument or singing). Thirty-two participants had been studying music non-professionally (average 9.19 years; range 1–40 years), and eleven participants professionally (average 1.43 years; range 1–14 years). In Experiment 2, 40 participants (19 male; average age 44.8 years; range 21–67 years) evaluated the chords. Of them 33 had music as an active hobby. Twenty-two participants had at least some formal studies in music, either professional (average 1.6 years; range 1–10 years) or non-professional (average 8.4 years; range 1–42 years).

There were altogether 132 chords in Ex.1. The chords represented 10 tetrad classes and 12 pentad classes; six chords were formed from each class. In Ex.2 there were altogether 126 chords, of them 64 were tetrachords and 62 pentachords. The set-classes were, however, restricted to four tetrad and four pentad classes.

In both experiments the set-classes were selected among all classes of the same cardinality according to their degree of consonance (calculated using the Huron model of consonance, which is based on the interval-class content of the class; Huron 1994). The Huron consonances for tetrad classes range from -0.809 (most dissonant) to 0.579 (most consonant), and those for the pentad classes, from -0.588 to 0.479. In Ex.1 the degree of consonance of the set-classes varied along the range. In Ex.2, four
classes were clearly dissonant, while the other four were clearly consonant (see Table 1 for the classes and consonance values). The set-classes are labelled using so-called prime forms. For example, set-class [02479] indicates a prime form with intervals 2 (M2), 4 (M3), 7 (P5) and 9 (M6) semitones up from the lowest pitch, and it is the pentatonic chord.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tetrads classes; Huron consonances</th>
<th>Pentads classes; Huron consonances</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ex1</td>
<td>Ex2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0124]; -0.507</td>
<td>[0124]; -0.507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0126]; -0.378</td>
<td>[0134]; -0.311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0134]; -0.238</td>
<td>[0246]; -0.238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0248]; -0.077</td>
<td>[0256]; -0.041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0137]; -0.041</td>
<td>[0137]; -0.041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0348]; 0.261</td>
<td>[0357]; 0.383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0368]; 0.297</td>
<td>[0358]; 0.579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[0358]; 0.579</td>
<td>[0358]; 0.579</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Set classes and Huron consonance values

All chords representing the same set-class share the properties of that class (e.g. cardinality, degree of Huron consonance, interval-class content etc.). As stated, the study also examined characteristics that are independent of the class. The chords were composed so that the chord span and register were systematically varied. In Ex.1 there were three levels of chord span, two levels of lowest pitch, and, consequently, three levels of highest pitch (Example 1; upper staff). In Ex.2 there were two levels of chord span, and two levels of highest pitch, additionally, each chord type was represented by a number of chords. The high chords were always transpositions of the lower ones (Example 1; two lower staves). The example also shows that the class affects the character of the representative chords. All chords representing class [02479] are consonant and without semitones. Additionally, the chord voicing affects the intervals between pitches within the limits set by the class. Because of these limits it was, for example, not possible to form chords with spans of 11 or 13 semitones to represent class [02479], and hence the span of the narrow chords representing the class was either 10 or 14 semitones.
In Ex.1 the chords were played one at a time (six repetitions in a slow tempo) in random order, and the participants were asked to write one or two adjectives to describe each chord. In Ex.2 the participants heard chords in nine-chord sequences (each sequence was played three times), and they were asked to evaluate the chords with given adjectives (one adjective at a time). The adjectives for Ex.2 were selected from the most important adjectives of Ex.1.

4. Results

Altogether 3412 adjectives were obtained with free adjective association in Ex.1. The adjectives were categorised into 62 classes (below, adjective categories). In altogether 19 cases (and mainly with pentad classes) a connection was found between set-class and adjective category, indicating that some kind of overall character (instead of voicing) guided evaluations. For example all chords representing the pentatonic class [02479] were evaluated as peaceful/calm, and chords representing the whole-tone pentachord [02468] were evaluated as incomplete/unfinished. It is easy to understand that all chords representing the chromatic pentachord [01234] and four additional dissonant pentad classes were evaluated as quarrelsome/irritating. Yet the most dissonant tetrachords were not systematically evaluated using such adjectives; it seemed that the chord voicing became more important for evaluations when the chords had fewer pitches.

The chordal characteristics were also found to affect evaluations. The wide chords in high register were evaluated as clear/bright if they were relatively consonant, and quarrelsome/irritating if they were relatively dissonant. The narrow and low chords, on the other hand, were evaluated as dark/gloomy regardless of the degree of
dissonant. Narrow pentachords in low register were also evaluated as tight/small if they were dissonant, and as rich/grand if they were consonant. The chords evaluated as tender/warm were consonant, not wide and were in low or middle register. Chords that were evaluated as threatening/dangerous were dissonant and had small intervals (m2 or M2) in low or middle register (lower than ab1). Interestingly, chords consisting of the minor triad and one extra pitch were not evaluated with adjectives from the category sad/melancholy, even though chords consisting of the major triad and one extra pitch were evaluated with adjectives from the category happy/joyous.

The chord data (132 chords) were factor analysed, but the resulting factor structure was not clear. Altogether 18 factors had eigenvalues higher than 2.0, and these 18 factors explained 87.7% of variance. The first four factors had eigenvalues of approximately 10.0 or higher, but together they explained only 46.3% of variance. In order to reveal the structure of the adjectives, the adjective data (62 adjectives) were analysed using multidimensional scaling. A three-dimensional structure (stress .228 and RSQ .860) was interpreted as having relaxedness – tension as Dimension 1; amount of energy as Dimension 2; and happiness – melancholy as Dimension 3 (see Table 2). A connection can be found between the dimensions and the three-cluster model by Hu, Bay & Downie (2007) even though the experimental design was totally different in the two studies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Adjective categories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D1 + relaxedness</td>
<td>peaceful/calm (3.00); clear/bright (2.82)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>distressing/vexatious (-1.31)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2 + low energy</td>
<td>tender, warm (1.61)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- high energy</td>
<td>clear/bright (-2.66); quarrelsome/irritating (-2.20);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>nervous/anxious (-1.59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D3 + happiness, ease</td>
<td>joyful/happy (1.21);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- melancholy, depressing</td>
<td>melancholy/sad (-2.62); threatening/dangerous (-2.09)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. The three dimensions and the adjective categories at the ends of the dimensions. The table shows only adjective categories that have absolute coordinates larger than 1.5, or, if there are no such categories, the category with the highest absolute value.

Only four adjective scales were used for evaluations in Ex.2. The adjectives were clear/bright, (representing high energy + low tension), tender/warm (low energy + low tension), quarrelsome/irritating (high energy + melancholy), and sad/melancholy (melancholy). Adjectives representing valence were not used in Ex.2, since Ex.1 showed valence (also disgust) to be of limited importance with nontraditional chords.
The analyses of Ex.2 showed that the listeners were mostly guided by the degree of consonance. Table 3 shows that the evaluations on three adjective scales correlated with the degree of consonance (measured both with the Huron consonance and the number of IC 1 instances); only estimations on the scale sad/melancholy did not seem to be affected by the degree of consonance. The chord span did not seem to affect evaluations at all. Both adjectives sad/melancholy and clear/bright were, to some extent, found to correlate with the highest (and with the lowest) pitch of the chords. Surprisingly, the pitch height correlated more strongly with the scale sad/melancholy than with the scale clear/bright. The table also shows the correlations between adjective scales. As can be seen, the scale clear/bright correlated to some extent with all other scales. Contrary to the study by Eerola & Vuoskoski (2011), the correlation between melancholy/sad and tender/warm was extremely low.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Sad/melancholy</th>
<th>Clear/bright</th>
<th>Quarrelsome/irritating</th>
<th>Tender/warm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Huron consonance</td>
<td>-1.59</td>
<td>0.655*</td>
<td>-0.847*</td>
<td>0.840*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chord span</td>
<td>-0.045</td>
<td>-0.079</td>
<td>0.042</td>
<td>-0.068</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest pitch</td>
<td>-0.627*</td>
<td>0.431*</td>
<td>0.204</td>
<td>-0.132</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowest pitch</td>
<td>-0.408*</td>
<td>0.382*</td>
<td>0.108</td>
<td>-0.032</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardinality</td>
<td>0.052</td>
<td>-0.038</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>-0.129</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IC 1 content</td>
<td>0.156</td>
<td>-0.627*</td>
<td>0.795*</td>
<td>-0.825*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tender/warm</td>
<td>-0.110</td>
<td>0.726*</td>
<td>-0.825*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarrelsome/irritating</td>
<td>0.138</td>
<td>0.671*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clear/bright</td>
<td>-0.494*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. Correlations between chordal or set-class parameters and adjective scales. Significance at the .001 level is indicated with *, N = 126.

As in Ex.1, the chord data of Ex.2 (including 126 chords) were factor analysed. A two-factor solution explained 93.6 % of the variance, but Factor 2 did not add interpretability to the solution, since the absolute correlations between the factor loadings and the parameters were approximately the same for both factors (see Table 4). Factor 1 alone explained 73.4 % of variance. As a whole the multidimensionality of the results obtained in Ex.1 seemed to be flattened into monodimensionality in Ex.2.
Table 4. Correlations between chordal or set-class parameters and Factors 1 and 2. Significance at the .001 level is indicated with *, N = 126.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Factor 1</th>
<th>Factor 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Huron consonance</td>
<td>-.833*</td>
<td>.762*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chord span</td>
<td>.067</td>
<td>-.096</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest pitch</td>
<td>.409*</td>
<td>.288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowest pitch</td>
<td>.205</td>
<td>.269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardinality</td>
<td>-.067</td>
<td>.043</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IC 1 content</td>
<td>.757*</td>
<td>-.697*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1 shows the factor loadings of each chord plotted against the Huron consonances. All chords representing the same set-class (indicated by the set-class label) are on the same vertical line. The figure shows that the dissonant chords are less dispersed on Factor 1 than the consonant chords. The figure also shows that the chords are located on Factor 1 according to transpositions, and the division into high and low transpositions is clearer with dissonant chords than with consonant chords (the exceptions are marked with L or H). As can also be seen, chord span was not important for estimations (which could already be understood from the correlations).

Figure 1. Factor loadings plotted against Huron consonances. High + narrow chords (black); high + wide chords (dark grey); low + narrow chords (light grey); low + wide chords (white).
Since all dissonant chords have rather similar loadings on Factor 1 (the loadings are between 0.341–0.994), it is not possible to differentiate the dissonant set-classes on Factor 1. The consonant chords have more variation in factor loadings, yet it is not possible to differentiate the consonant set-classes either. Some consonant chords locate at the "dissonant end" of Factor 1, even though the majority (51/66 = 77.3%) of the loadings are lower than 0.

5. Conclusions

Ex.1 showed that all listeners spontaneously associated the same adjectives with certain chords. It is possible to say that those chords included qualitative characteristics (e.g. were clear) and that the characteristics were recognised by the listeners. It is also possible to say that the chords included musical parameters that were associated with qualities by the listeners (high register + consonance associated with clarity). Such division is, however, merely philosophical rather than music-theoretical in nature. Since the listeners were asked to describe chords with freely chosen adjectives (Ex.1) or evaluate the chords with given adjectives (Ex.2), the study did not examine emotions evoked in listeners. This is one reason for results that differed from those of earlier studies; chords can be described as clear, but clarity is not an emotion evoked in listeners. Another reason was the experimental design that used chords instead of excerpts of music and nontraditional and nonfamiliar chords instead of familiar tonal chords.

When the chord data collected with free adjective association was analysed, an extremely complex structure was revealed. Yet the chord data collected with four predefined adjectives proved to be mono-dimensional. The result might indicate that the number of dimensions always diminishes when the listeners are asked to evaluate objects one by one with predefined scales; earlier studies on emotions have also explained their data with only a few dimensions (e.g. Thayer 1989; Schimmack & Reisenzein 2002; Hu et al. 2007; Eerola & Vuoskoski 2011). Another reason for the reduction of dimensions might have been the chord material; in Ex.1 the chords represented various points of the consonance–dissonance continuum, while Ex.2 used either very dissonant or consonant tetrachords and pentachords (see discussion of stimuli chosen in terms of discrete emotions in Eerola & Vuoskoski 2011).

The results showed that the chord voicing becomes more important with decreasing cardinality, indicating that the set-class might become more important with increasing cardinality. With trichords the listeners were sensitive to small changes in voicing when they heard familiar chords (Kuusi 2009), and it seems
reasonable that the increasing number of pitches makes it more difficult for the listener to perceive small details of chord voicing.

In conclusion it seems that listeners can recognise various emotions in harmony – unless the limited stimuli and the use of predefined adjectives restrict the evaluations.
REFERENCES


http://mto.societymusictheory.org/issues/mto.09.15.5/mto.09.15.5.kuusi.html


PIOTR PODLIPNIAK

THE EVOLUTIONARY ORIGIN OF GESTURAL MEANING IN TONAL MUSIC*

Introduction

Gestures are inseparable from music. The fact that in all cultures people move while listening to music, indicates that music perception demands a type of sensorimotor coupling (Janata & Grafton 2003). Musicians move their bodies also when playing instruments and singing. In the Western tradition, conductors use gestures in order to communicate their intentions to the performers. Probably the most obvious example of the tight connection between music and gestures is dance in which dancers, through moving to music, establish a spatiotemporal reference frame in synchrony with musical cues (Leman & Naveda 2010). This close connection between music, gestures and motion is often reflected in metaphors which people use in order to describe music (Zbikowski 2002). Because almost every human motion is interpreted as a gesture and both motions and gestures are described in the same ways, these metaphors indicate that, at least in some cultural traditions, music and gestures are very closely related (Zbikowski 2011). Although in the humanistic tradition metaphors are commonly considered as arbitrary cultural constructs (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980), it seems that in this case language reflects something more, which is deeply rooted in people’s minds. Whether this close relation is conditioned biologically or culturally has remained the subject of many heated debates (Williams et al., 2009). Either way, the contemporary knowledge suggests that the close relations between human gestural and vocal activities emerged in the process of evolution (Mithen 2006). Therefore, a gestural character of speech, singing and instrumental music seems to be a part of human nature.

Apart from this character, body movements play an important role in communication between people (Arbib et al. 2008). As part of bodily communication, movements are applied in musical performance not only as an activity necessary to sing or play instruments but also as the expressive and social codes (Davidson 2005). These codes convey extra-musical meaning, which is interpreted by co-performers and listeners. Importantly, because in the expression of meaning some of these codes are often indispensable and therefore obvious some

* This work was supported by the Polish National Center of Science [grant number 0101/B/H03/2011/40].
scholars are convinced that musical meaning, especially the emotional one, originates in the body action (Cross & Morley 2009:67; Panksepp & Trevarthen 2009). If this is true, gestures are inscribed in all forms of music independently of the composer’s or performer’s intentions. Additionally, at least to some extent and unconsciously, the audience interprets musical meaning with the help of their gestural associations.

The Origin and Specificity of Gestural Meaning

The history of gestures is much older than our species and it is connected to the evolution of movement control in animals. The use of body movement in communication is ubiquitous among animals and it may have various functions (Wilson 1975). Body posture could manifest such information such as the animals’ intention, its emotional state or symbolic meaning of external referent (Griffin 1992). A communicative use of body movement demands, however, something more than motor function. In order to communicate by means of movements, animals have to possess the ability to control the production of body signs as well as to assess and interpret them. Although it is known that communication by means of movement is possible even in animals with very simple nervous systems (e.g. bees (Dyer, 2002)), these abilities are first and foremost related with emotional and cognitive operations. From the evolutionary point of view emotions and cognition are younger than the motor function; therefore, the use of body movements as a communicative tool is particularly popular among vertebrates. Moreover, the more complicated the nervous system and social relations among particular species, the more elaborate the communicative tools can be. The enormous development of a nervous system in the lineage of *Homo sapiens* evolution together with the social character of our species suggest that body communication become complex in the evolution of human predecessors. It also indicates that their movement communication and the present one share the same elements. This results from the fact that in the brain evolution separate layers appeared above older structures (without replacing them) and they developed new distinct functions (Roederer 2003; Striedter 2005). Because of that, in the human brain the phylogenetically newer brain structures (for example the prefrontal cortex) control evolutionarily older structures. It means that motor function cannot be turned off but only inhibited. However, this indicates that, by means of inhibition, the newer brain structures can involve motor activity in new functions including communication.
There are some scientific indications that gestural expressions are strictly connected to sound expressions and within some range of forms they could create a universal emotional code (Clynes 1977; Merker 2003). Some evidence from social studies demonstrates that the rhythmic organization of both verbal and gestural communication leads to the mutual entrainment of speech and gesture (Davis 1982; Montagu & Matson 1979). Additionally, the coupling of speech and gestures is so strong that when speakers stutter, they tend to stop gesticulating until the speech is recovered (Mayberry et al. 1998). The inseparability of motor function from emotions and cognition additionally indicates that gestures have played an important role in the evolutionary origin of language (MacNeilage 1998; Arbib et al. 2008) and music (Mithen 2006). It means that pre-conceptual motor categories influence and restrict conceptual meaning in language which impacts also the musical meaning.

Apart from the abilities, which enable gesticulation in language, people are endowed with some music-specific cognitive mechanisms connected to body movement. Namely, humans are able to perceive beat in music and synchronize their body movements with the beat (Large 2000; Repp 2006). The beat perception and the synchronization have probably a special affinity with the auditory system (Patel et al. 2005). Although this ability is not unique to our species (cf. synchronization among some parrot species according to Patel et al., 2009), which suggests that this ability did not originate by means of natural selection for music (Patel 2008), the representation of musical meter in gestures is specific to human music activities. This increases the range of possible gestural meanings conveyed by music.

What kinds of meaning gestures carry in music? It seems that they could be connected with different kinds of meaning. First of all, it has been suggested that physical posture and gesture may influence the perception of emotions in music (Davies 1994; Jackendoff & Lerdahl 2006). Because emotions are multidimensional phenomena composed of intensity, valence and category of emotions, the emotional meaning of gestures could contain information about all these dimensions. Apart from that, gestures are probably very useful as an iconic tool which communicates among others spatial and temporal information (the speed and direction of movements, the position of objects etc.) and physical features (e.g. the size of objects). Thanks to cross-modal associations used in the creation of conceptual metaphors, gestures could also convey more abstract meaning such as social relations and could serve as culturally specific symbols.
What kind of meaning specific gestural feature communicates depends on its evolutionary age. From this perspective every kind of meaning has a hierarchical character and it consists of both fundamental and more elaborate signs, like the conceptual one. The evolutionarily older the meaning is, the more universal it is for the separate taxa (Mammalia - class, Primates - order, Hominidae - family, Homo - genus, Homo sapiens - species). For instance, some of special forms of the human sound expression allow communication with other species (e.g. so-called the pet-directed speech (Stockmann 1979)). Also many human responses to gestural stimuli are similar to the animals’ reactions. On the other hand, the exceptionality of some human behaviors and the postulated adaptive character of language (Pinker 1994) and music (e.g. Mithen 2006; Levitin 2006), suggest that there exist the set of specific communicative features which are exclusive to Homo sapiens and independent of culture (Kuhl 1999). For example the iconic character of gestures is a universal trait of human communication. According to Steven Mithen this element was present already in Homo ergaster gestural expressions and was preserved in later hominids communication (2006:155). Iconic character of gestures allowed additionally imitating different features of objects, animals, people, situations etc. Indeed, mimesis is an important ingredient of musical meaning.

Furthermore, because of the influence of a specific cultural environment on people’s communicative systems different kinds of culture-specific codes are created as part of a particular culture, they are understandable only among its representatives. According to Jane Davidson and Stephen Malloch some of these codes are the sociocultural and they “can provide formal and intimate information for co-performers and audience” (2009:569). In the case of body gestures these codes are composed of emblems (symbolic body movements), illustrators (a form of gestural description of content, e.g. loudness, rhythmic accents), affect displays (culture specific movements revealing emotional states), regulators (movements which maintain and regulate interaction between performers and audience) and adaptors (personal habits) (ibid.; see also Ekman 1977; Ekman & Friesen 1969).

The two components of musical structure

The structure of tonal music, similar to speech structure, is composed of two separate and to some extent independent components (Merker 2003). One of them, which organizes music at the suprasegmental level, is indiscrete and composed of features difficult to categorize. Like in language, this component consists of elements such as melodic contour (a contour of pitch variations), manipulation of tempo (like
accelerando and diminuendo), manipulation of loudness (crescendo and
decrescendo), different kinds of emphasis (rhythmical or dynamical stress), etc. These
traits, named by musicologists ‘performance features’, are not specific to music and
are observed both in other kinds of human vocal expressions (such as speech,
laughter, etc.) and in sound expressions of some animals (Merker 2003). Although
the meaning of these traits could be influenced by some cultural habits in the case of
communication of basic emotions their meaning is usually independent of culture.
Moreover, it seems that information conveyed by these features is understandable
not only to humans but also to some nonhuman species. It suggests that this kind of
communication is evolutionarily old and depends on the inherited proclivities to
understand such features in a universal way. As Bjorn Merker observes, “we had no
trouble recognizing the drama of the accelerated crescendo sung for us by the Kloss
gibbon female, nor was the elegance of the soft landing she performed with the
descending glides of her decelerated coda lost on us” (2003:405). Also in our
communication with pets ‘performance features’ play an important role and are
probably responsible for a part of mutual understanding between our pets and us
(Stockmann 1979). We share the ability to recognize this kind of meanings “[…] by
virtue of our biological status as apes, primates, mammals and even vertebrates”
(Merker 2003:405).

The second component of musical structure is connected to the segmental level.
This component is composed of discrete categories of musical pitch and sound
duration. Although the pitch categories and time proportions between notes depend
on cultural specificity of particular musical system, it is suggested there are some
universal rules which govern the syntactic orders in all tonal music (Lerdahl &
Jackendoff 1983). There is an analogy between grammar in language and musical
syntax because segmental level in speech depends on culture-specific phonemes and
the organization of them is generative like in music. Yet, the tight connection
between syntax and semantics in language is not observed in any music. What is
more, the musical segments are discriminated on the basis of pitch whereas
phonemes on the basis of timbre. Therefore, the segmental level of musical structure
is not only human-specific, but also music-specific.

**The gestural character of music performance features**

The evolutionary connection between motor and emotional functions implies that
there exists a deep gestural basis for expressing emotions. Because performance
features have an evolutionarily old character and are particularly effective in the
communication of emotions in a universal way, they should induce specific dynamic
motor patterns of motion in listeners. Unfortunately, there are not many empirical
studies concerning production of motor patterns in response to music (Scherer &
Zenter 2001:378), so it is difficult to assess the actual connections between gestures
and the suprasegmental level of musical structure. Nevertheless, this connection is
probably responsible for the predominant urge to gesticulate during speaking and
singing as well as for the production of specific gestures by instrumentalists during
performances. Moreover, it seems that body movements help performers in the
expressive interpretation of music (Davidson & Dawson 1995). The spatial and
temporal character of gestures additionally indicates that there are hidden meanings
in particular features of gestures and features of sound expressions in speech and
music. These meanings usually influence the conceptual categories in which people
describe music. These categories are usually connected to the metaphors of space (in
the case of melodic contour and dynamic manipulations), and to the metaphors of
time (in the case of temporal manipulations) and they are ubiquitous among the
majority of cultures. Although a culture can avoid this influence at the conceptual
level (e.g. the spatial metaphors of high and low pitches in the Ancient Greek in
comparison to the contemporary Western cultures), the emotional meanings
conveyed by means of particular suprasegmental sound organization and relevant
gestures remain rather stable.

The connection between gestures and musical syntax

Because of the hierarchical character of musical meaning some meaningful elements
of indiscrete components of sound organization could be incorporated into the
syntactic order of music. According to some scholars (e.g. Calvin 1990; Molino
2000), the ability to generate syntactic organization in language and music is possible
thanks to a more general mechanism responsible for the preparation and
organization of throwing movements. From this point of view the temporal
organization of activities is the foundation of all syntactic rules both in language and
in music. Because the alternation of movements in time is the core element of every
gesture, some elements of musical syntactic structure could be connected to gestural
meanings too. Similarly to the planning of the movement sequence in gestural
expressions, human minds have to prepare the order of musical sound sequence
according to syntactic rules.

One of the important syntactic orders in music is rhythmic organization, which
usually contains a variety of temporal patterns from simple isochronous sequences of
notes to more common polyrhythmic sequences composed of temporal intervals of
different durations. Apart from rhythmic phrase, which organizes every course of
music in a particular rhythmic order, music contains also a metrical organization.
This distinguishes music from other forms of human sound expressions. Of course,
not all music is metrical but a periodic structure at multiple time scales plays an
important role in the great majority of music (Nettl 2000). Like in dance, gestures
accompanying music could generally mirror the hierarchical arrangement of strong
and weak beats found in musical rhythm patterns (Brown et al. 2005). This
unconscious proclivity to do that reflects probably the motor nature of emphasis,
which plays a crucial role in syntactic rules connected with the rhythmic
organization of music. Additionally, the urge to emphasize the regular accents in
music by gestures helps listeners to perceive temporal regularity in music
performances (Largea & Palmer 2002). Because stress is important in respect to both
the metrical and the rhythmic phrase patterns, emphatic gestures are used as one of
syntactic tools in the temporal organization of music. However, emphasis is not only
a domain of rhythm. It is also linked with the importance of particular pitches in
tonal organization. Therefore, emphatic gestures are strongly coordinated with the
syntactic rules of tonal organization too. Another element of syntax connected to
pitch organization is a pitch interval order. A sequence of pitch intervals is directly
related to melodic contour. Insofar as a melodic contour is a part of indiscrete
suprasegmental organization the intervals order is composed of discrete constituents
— pitch categories. It does not mean, however, that spatial associations with the
direction of melodic contours are irrelevant at the syntactic level of music order.
Actually, it seems that not only the direction but also the size of an interval
influences the spatial association. Even though it is not clear whether the mirroring
of the size of an interval in gesture, or reflecting other spatial properties in gestural
movements (e.g. ascending and descending or arch interval sequences) are culture-
specific or not, this gestural character undoubtedly influences the perception of
syntactic order in music. Furthermore, the size and tonal character of an interval
could perform also the emphatic function. In all these cases emphatic gestures
convey, apart from syntactic information, the emotional meaning.
Conclusion

The gestural character of music is related not only to the obvious performative function of body movements. As has been demonstrated, communication is an equally important function of body movement in music. Yet, this function is not music-specific and has an evolutionarily old origin. From this point of view in expressing gestural meanings music is to some extent similar to speech. Thus, it is probable that, apart from the universal gestural traits of language, culture-specific gestural features of the mother tongue prosody influence the gestural expression in music. Nevertheless, there are some music-specific elements (such as metrical gestures) which play an important role in the syntactic organization of music and which convey additional meanings. Although the evolutionary reasons of the development of human abilities to synchronize with musical beat are so far unknown, their biological origin is unquestionable. Most importantly, the gestural character of music has a hierarchical order. The most universal and probably communicatively most effective the evolutionarily older kinds of gestural meanings are. The gestural character of musical syntax seems to be music-specific but it can contain some more general elements. Apart from that, musical expression is always filled with culture-specific as well as individual gestural icons and symbols the understanding of which depends on the audience’s cultural knowledge.
References


Introduction: Continuum from steady beat to free rhythm

Songs sung without accompaniment present a continuum from a steady beat to free rhythm. The rhythm ranges from the strictly steady (isochronous) beat of rock, disco and hip hop, through “looser” rhythms such as swing, jazz, free-jazz, sung accentual poetry, and sung (or sung-spoken) poetry with free rhythm. Stev (nystev and gamlestev) seem to be a type of sung accentual poetry, that is, “based on true speech accents” (Bridges 1921 [1901] and PEPP 1993 s.v.) with complex meter (irregular, non-isochronous). Stev (sg., pl.) are found nearer the free rhythm end of the continuum.

Norwegian stev have a complex meter that defies standard musical notation, yet these songs have survived many centuries through oral tradition. Nystev (“new stev”) may date as far back as 1223 (Mortensson-Egnund 1914 based on Möbius 1873a), gamlestev (“old stev) being older still. How can songs with irregular rhythm survive for hundreds of years in an oral tradition? The secret of this remarkable robustness may lie in accent patterns.

What then is this irregular rhythm? Stev-singers, called kvedarar (kvedar, sg., -ar pl.), have performed stev traditionally with rhythmically irregular “foot-taps”. In spite of the irregular time, listening reciter-singers can be observed to foot-tap simultaneously, empathetically rather than with conscious awareness. The foot-tap points are found to be congruent with poetic accents that are also word accents as in normal speech, and they also share tonal characteristics (Ekgren 1981, 2009: 214ff).

Although Norwegian stev as performed traditionally in Telemark and Setesdal have an irregular rhythm, they present a predictable accent pattern that has a structure and characteristics of accentual verse. The stev rhythmic unit can be described as a complex (non-isochronous) two-pulse rhythm centered around paired accents in the text (Ekgren 2009). This “dipod” (two-accent unit), asymmetrical in nature, seems to be an essential building block in both nystev and gamlestev, thus linking these two forms together. However, the dipod is not unique to stev.
Stev models: simple (steady beat, isochronous) or complex meter?

Above is a brief introduction to my model for stev as understood from traditional performance (Ekgren 1975-2011). The model assumes dipods having complex rhythm, a two-pulse that may have a swing to it or may take its time and linger on. The complex rhythm, revealed by foot-taps in performance, rests upon the dipodic paired accents which form the core of a phrase in the text. Old Norse poetry and modern songs can give us more insight into this dipod.

The customary model defines stev as having 4-accent lines with simple (isochronous, accents equidistant) meter (Lie 1967:497 §1651). This model and mine have been compared (Ekgren 2009 and 2011) and are relevant to discussion of simple or complex meter in stev.

Another model proposes explicitly that stev originated from dance: 1) from mazurka (Steffen 1898) and 2) from Telemark spring-dance song, called springarstev (Eggen 1928:359-61, 1939:67) which is a dance tune with words and not included in the term stev as used here, based on Bo (1977 [1957]) and D.G. Myhren (1980:166-67). Although within the springarstev measure the rhythm is asymmetric, each measure is basically equal in duration and hence isochronous on that level. Theories of nystev from dance were accepted by Heusler (1923:575), H. Lie (1967:495 §1649), Holzapfel (1993:181), Egeland (1998) Kvideland (2002), and Lilja (2006:410-11). This model and empirical evidence contradicting it have been treated earlier (Ekgren 2001, 2009, 2011).

A purpose of this paper is to clarify differences between the models of simple and complex meter. The stev two-pulse (non-isochronous two-pulse dipods) is quite different from steady beat (isochronous) 4-accent lines. As example, we will see that if one tries to create meaningful dipodic phrases from 4-accent lines, one will not necessarily succeed. Comparing the dipod and the 4-accent line is essential because, as said, the traditional definition of stev has been 4 accents per line, in all 4 lines of the nystev stanza, and lines 1 and 3 of gamlestev (lines 2 and 4 of gamlestev have 3 accents).

Characteristics of the stev 2-pulse accent-pair dipod as building block: Nystev and gamlestev

The stev 2-pulse accent-pair dipod is shown in a nystev and then a gamlestev. By looking at older and newer poetry through the filter of the sung stev two-pulse dipod, stev can help us be aware of dipodic characteristics in other poetry, which in turn
enables us to understand the stev two-pulse itself. To illustrate the 2-pulse in nystev, here is a text as sung by Ånund Tveit, from Setesdal (Ekgren 1976: film #1) (Spaces separate dipods; “//” separates lines.)

Å kor eg kjeme hell kor eg vankar // så gieng du alli or mine tankar
Å kor eg reiser hell kor eg fer // å i tankan’ ser eg deg mot meg fer.

Here comes the two-pulse in the older type of stanzas, called gamlestev. with text as sung by Svein Krøntveit from Telemark (Ekgren 1976: film #5b).

Vinden leikar i bjørkeli // bekkjen han ute suslar
Med smiledøkkji/ så ven og blid, // den guten te Anna ruslar.

In Setesdal alone there are over 25,000 nystev and gamlestev texts (Austad 1985:[7]), but only some 43 nystev melodies and 3 gamlestev melodies (Sandvik). All nystev melodies and texts are interchangeable. The same is true for gamlestev. For the performer, the text is primary, not the melody.

**Stev text nestled in the dipodic rhythm**

Perhaps you have experienced how only 2 or 3 words can create a whole thought and a picture. Performance emphasizes the following elements:

- The meaning in each phrase, which can be so concise as to be a whole thought and picture.
- The natural “speech accents” in main words, characteristic of accentual poetry (Bridges 1921, *PEPP* 1993s.v.). These accents “carry” the poetry.
- Alliteration, which is repetition of the same initial sounds in main words within a dipod or in neighboring dipods. This alliteration is not necessarily structured as in the Old Norse fashion, but can be found, and was evidently more prevalent earlier in Norwegian folk song tradition, according to Knut Heddi (1901).
- The words and their accents are bound together in pairs of two accents, creating a dipod.
- Another element, found in stev, and hypothetically possible in Old Norse poetry, is the foot-tapping, which as a cognitive pattern shows where the *kvedarar* (singer-reciters) emphasize their words, without their being consciously aware of foot-tapping. Foot-tapping when heard as prominent accompaniment emphasizes all elements occurring on the foot tap points.
- Taking time for the text, especially in the 2nd part of the dipod, which is the cadential, thetic, “resting” part of the dipod, is typical for stev. This short-long pattern is confirmed by film-frame analyses (Ekgren 2009, 2011). The singer may dwell on tones in this part, signaling emphasis for the end of the phrase and allowing ample time for listeners to reflect upon the meaning of the text.

- Performance also emphasizes that accents are bound together by meaning and thought into 2-accent, 2-pulse phrases, and into something called “thought rhyme”, a concept which we talk about later.

- The dipodic phrases are rather independent or “self-contained”, with no words straddling (split) between dipods.

Comparing the 4-accent line and the two-pulse

We take as example a steady beat 4-accent line of poetry, scanned as follows: u/u/u/u/ (“u” = unaccented syllable; slash “/” = accented). Such poetry is time-regulated or time-directed, keeping a steady beat when performed, for example the following:

A syllable delectable // can create a spectacle
Making catastrophic rhyme // or forming poetry sublime.

If one tries to divide a 4-accent line into 2 dipods, the results may be division that even splits words, such as we see here, “making cata-” and “strophic rhyme”. These groupings have no meaning, and therefore are not meaningful phrases characteristic of stev. In this sense a 4-accent line of poetry is not necessarily divisible into two meaningful dipods. In addition, weak, meaningless syllables, such as “-ble” are promoted to stress prominence in the example above. Thus, the term “4-accent line” may be an imprecise and inadequate definition for stev.

Stev do not belong to 4-accent poetry in which weak and strong syllables (unaccented and accented syllables) alternate. Stev are also not time-controlled as the 4-accent line may be. As mentioned before, we can think of a continuum between two extremes of performance of poetry and music. At one end is time-directed poetry, with clocklike beat (isochronous 4-accent-line example) or with time-directed measures (dance music repeating the rhythm of a dance step pattern). At the other end of the continuum can be poetry in “free rhythm” performed in a variety of spoken and sung styles. We stress again that stev with its dipods lies near the free-rhythm end.
We will now look at older and newer poetry through the filter of the sung stev two-pulse dipod. First we look briefly at Hávamál from the 10th century and then a few examples of modern, primarily sung, poetry.

**Application of the dipod to Hávamál and “recovering” performance**

The accent-pair (dipod) is easy to see and hear in a stanza (#77) from Hávamál (from the 10th century), in Old Norse, translated into Norwegian, and into English.

**Hávamál stanza #77**

| Deyr fé,  
| deyia frendr,  
| deyr siálfr it sama;  
| eg veit einn  
| at aldrí deyr;  
| dómum sun dauðan hvørn. | Fé dor,  
| frender dør,  
| en sjøl dør på samme vis;  
| jeg vet ett  
| som aldrí dør  
| dóm over hver en død. | Cattle die,  
| kinfolk die,  
| oneself dies likewise;  
| one thing I know  
| that never dies:  
| judgment passed on mortals. |

Hávamál, stanza #77

We do not know how stanzas from Hávamál were performed, but they are suited to ballad and gamlestev melodies, as we hear in the following, stanza #3 from Hávamál. The Old Norse text is translated into Norwegian by Holm-Olsen, and into English (jpe).

**Hávamál, stanza #3 (Sung)**

| Eldz er þarf  
| þeims inn er kominn  
| ok á knæ kalinn;  
| matar ok váda  
| er manne þarf,  
| þeim er hefir um fiall  
| forið. | Eld trenger han  
| som inn er kommet,  
| og er kald om kne;  
| mat og klær  
| kan mann tenge,  
| som kommer fra ferd over  
| fjell. | Fire needs he  
| who in has entered  
| and in knee is cold;  
| food and clothes  
| can one need  
| who has journeyed over  
| mountain. |

Hávamál and thought-rhyme

In Hávamál, words form phrases that are nearly independent and suggesting “thought rhyme” and rhythm (Vedel 1919, Mowinckel 2004 [1962] vol. 2:159-60).
As example, the two words “Deyr fe” form a whole thought: “Cattle die”. The next phrase is parallel in thought: “Kinsfolk die.” The third example combines the first two: “Oneself dies likewise” (like cattle and kinsfolk). Against the backdrop of these three example comes an antithesis: “I know one thing // that does not die: // judgment o'er mortal men.”

Two-accent phrases in Old Norse poetry were called visuorð and considered the smallest building blocks of poetry, just as the stev dipod. What separated the two-accent visuorð? Perhaps extra time, as in stev performance, in order to emphasize the meaning of the phrase. There was no reason for a time-rushed, time-determined “beat” performance anyway.

The Old Norse poetic phrases and thoughts were latched together by alliteration (like/identical letters, like sounds, for example the d sound of “deyr” and “deyia” (Hávamál #77). However, Old Norse alliteration was special, systematic, structural rules, focused on emphasizing sound on specified initial syllable word accents. In short, stave-rhyme brought out the root of meaning and thought being conveyed. Such poetry was far from the 4-accent line example given above.

The stev two-pulse dipod has been applied to stanzas from Hávamál (10th century). The recordings (online) of Jon Storm-Mathisen, singing-reciting eddic Hávamál stanzas to dipodic gamlestev and old ballad melodies still in tradition, demonstrate how performance tradition of today can “recover” (Harris 2003, Tedlock 1983) how Hávamál might have sounded. Storm-Mathisen's work also points to a possible continuous, unbroken tradition extending through a millenium.

The dipod is also found in various modern songs. This is the subject of the next section.

The dipodic two-pulse in other genres

The dipodic two-pulse is not unique to stev; on the contrary it is found in a number of other genres, both sung and spoken. First, any song, no matter how slow, can be speeded up into a steady rhythm, whether into a 4/4 beat or into a regularly repeated dance rhythm, Also, accompaniment can change a melody that has no steady beat into music with either even beat or even measures. Thus we may not be aware of the dipod. Take hip hop rap for example. The steady hip hop beat and regular beat in performance may disguise textual dipods. This illustrates how text and music may have different rhythms, unlike the dipodic rhythm of stev text, which forms the dipodic rhythm in the melody.
Norwegian stev are normally independent one-stanzas in which the text governs the melody, the melody being subservient and fitting like hand in glove. The two-pulse can be found in Norwegian folk songs called *viser*, songs that have any number of stanzas, even more than 60. In such stanzaic songs, the dipod may or may not be in as pure a form as in stev (Ekgren 1983a, 1983b, 2002, 2009:219). The dipod can also be found religious folk tunes and ballads in Norway and folk songs elsewhere.

Here are a few examples of the textual dipod, alphabetically from a repertoire other than Norwegian folk music. (See the Reference List for sources.) Composition, performer, performance with or without accompaniment can bring out interpretive nuances of the dipod from rap to stev.

“Aufenthalt”: Rauschender Strom, brausender Wald

“Barbara Allen”: In Scarlet town where I was born

“Body and Soul”: I can’t believe it, it’s hard to conceive it

“The Sound of Music”: The hills are alive with the sound of music

Icelandic Laws: ... elldr up brennr, íaorð gróer ...

Prayers, such as “Our Father”

Rap: I was standin’ on the corner a-bidin’ my time

“Schön war, das ich dir weihte”: Schön war, das ich dir weihte

“September Song”: ... Oh, it's a long long time from May to December ...

“Summertime”: and the livin’ is easy. Fish are jumpin'

“Zur Rosenzeit”: Ihr verblühet süsse Rosen ...

Stev have helped us become aware of the special rhythm and features of the dipod, including in the examples here. Especially taking time between dipods where appropriate, as in stev, can help emphasize and enhance the meaning in the phrase, no matter what genre, song style, or type of singer.

A question that frequently arises is why it took so long to recognize the dipod. It was discovered 60 years ago, as we hear in the following.
Why dipods have not been recognized

The accent patterns in Norwegian stev have not been easy to document, with empirical evidence. Foot-tapping was not present in archive recordings. Filming has enabled a breakthrough for documentation of observations and the evidence: foot-tapping. Connection between nystev and gamlestev had been published (1942) but was apparently either not known or assessed any value by researchers. Thus what was written about gamlestev’s connection with Old Norse poetry form did not influence nystev theories.

Popular theories concerning the origin and essence of the enigmatic nystev favored isochronous rhythm, for instance, in the theory of stev originating from dance. Dance music has measures that are isochronous, whether mazurka/pols (Steffen’s theory 1898) or springarstev (Eggen 1928:359-61 and 1939:67). Lie was a follower of Eggen’s dance theory (1967:495 §1649) as well as expecting stev to be scanned as a regular classical Greek meter and expecting stev to have isochronous accents that allowed analysis by music notation (1967:497 §1651). Such analysis was a popular practice stemming from Joshua Steele (1779) through Roe (1823), Patmore (1857, see Roth), Lanier, Heusler (1925) and others. Had both Steffen and Lie used stev criteria from performance tradition as basis for their theories, stev research history would have had a decidedly different outcome. In the nearly 1200 nystev Steffen collected in 4 weeks, he says he never saw nystev danced (1898) Lie related that nystev was the most problematic Norwegian verse rhythm (Lie 1967: 495 §1648) but that the “melody carries the [traditional] singer over the prosodic difficulties” (Lie 1967: 497 §1651 trans.: jpe). Lie illustrates in music notation how the second main word in the dipod may be sung twice as long as the first. He obviously heard the dipod, without attributing importance to it.

Theories of foreign musical influence (Steffen 1898; Liestøl and Moe 1912:ii) and of isochronous meter seem to have overshadowed the work of two persons: Ivar Mortensson-Egnund and Idar Handagard. Mortensson-Egnund claimed that nystev went back to 1223 (Mortensson-Egnund 1914:57-64), based on Málsháttakvæði from ca. 1223 (Möbius 1873b). Handagard explained that stev must have dipods (dipodi) and Old Norse structural stave-rhyme that connects dipods (Handagard 1942). With the empirical evidence I have documented by filming traditional performance of stev and kveding (the traditional song style, see Ekgren 2002), the implications of the stev accent patterns show solid support for the unknown theories of Mortensson-Egnund (1914) and Handagard (1942, 1944) as well as for the research of Sandvik (1952),

Conclusion: A metrics-based model of Norwegian stev suggests that accentual poetry metrics based on traditional performance may provide a fresh paradigm for investigating complex meter in the dipod in stev and other genres as well. The new model brings text and music of stev into a broader context.
REFERENCE LIST FOR SONGS


“I was Standin’ on the Corner.” Rap, Grandmaster Flash.


REFERENCE LIST FOR PUBLICATIONS


Bjørndal, Arne and Alver, Brynjulf (1985 [1966]). - og fela ho lét..... Bergen: UF.


Greni, Liv. (ca.1962). “Overview of *stev* melodies from Setesdal in the NRK Folkemusikk Arkiv, transcribed and ranked by Liv Greni according to frequency in the NRK archives.” (See Ekgren 1999 b.)


UNPUBLISHED REFERENCES


Næst efter det visuelle sanseapparat er det øret, der oftest er kanaliseringsmålet for strategisk markedsføring (Lindstrøm 2005), og således er der et stigende antal private og offentlige virksomheder, der ”brander” sig selv både eksternt og internt gennem specialdesignede og patenterede ”musikalske signaturer”. Et særligt format i den henseende er ”melodilogoet”: en auditiv pendant til det visuelt animerede logo (Bronner 2004:39), der kan defineres som et kortvarigt motiv (typisk 1-6 sekunder). Almindelige brand-teoretiske retningslinjer anviser desuden en distinkt fremtrædelsesform (dvs. karakteristisk formgivning), genkendelighed og ikke mindst fleksibilitet med henblik på konsistent markedsføring - såvel ”horisontalt” via forskellige budskabskanaler (fx radio, TV, internet eller mobiltelefoner) som ”vertikalt” på tværs af flere samtidige kampanger - foruden kontinuerlig anvendelse gennem skiftende tidsepoker. Hertil kommer ”fit”, dvs. at et melodilogo skal være passende i forhold til det pågældende brands egenskaber og kulturelt indlejrede værdier. ¹ Som eksempler på melodilogoer kan nævnes “Intel Inside”-jinglen, der har optrådt i TV- og radioreklamer siden 1995 (Eks. 1); eller “Nokia Tune” (en fire takters frase i Francisco Tárregas ”Gran Vals” fra 1902), der siden 1994 har været standardringtone i Nokias mobiltelefoner (Eks. 2).

Eksempel 1: Intel

Eksempel 2: Nokia

Som det fremgår af ovenstående, er melodilogoet ikke noget nyt fænomen, men forskning, der fokuserer særligt på dette fænomen (ikke blot lydbranding generelt), er begrænset, og det er således intentionen i nærværende artikel at bidrage hertil. På baggrund af en redegørelse for eksisterende empirisk forskning i lyd- og melodilogoer præsenterer jeg med udgangspunkt i Bang (2011) dels en teoretisk ansats, der kombinerer indsigter fra strategisk markedsføring, socialsemiotik og musikvidenskab;

dels et konditioneringseksperiment vedrørende melodilogoers formgivning, på hvilken baggrund jeg diskuterer teorigrundlagets empiriske beleg. Ud fra en teoretisk baseret præmis om, at kombinationen af tonehøjde og varigheder (rytme) udgør et nødvendigt og tilstrækkeligt grundlag for at honorsere fordringer hvedrørende fleksibilitet, konsistens og kontinuitet, undersøger jeg, 1) hvilken betydning graden af artikulationsreduktion har for logo- og brandgenkendelse; 2) forholdet mellem afrapporteret brandgenkendelse og brandgenkaldelse (korrekt eller nær korrekt navnsbenævnelse); samt 3) hvorvidt tonesammensætning eller rytmisk karakteristik er afgørende for logo- og brandgenkendelsen.  

**Forskningen på området**


Af eksperimentelle studier kan nævnes Venkataramans (2007) undersøgelse af reklamefilm inkorporeret i TV-serier, og hvilken betydning et audiovisuel logo henholdsvis et visuel logo i reklamens afslutning har for 49 respondenteres evne til

---


Det er et fællesstræk for langt de fleste forskningsbidrag på området, at lyd- og melodilogoernes musikalske-formale struktur ikke tages med i betragtningen, og dermed fremstår Palghats eksperimentelle undersøgelse (2009) som en bemærkelsesværdig undtagelse. Med fokus på melodilogoers ”designkarakteristik” søger han ud fra et til formålet konstrueret stimulusmateriale at finde frem til den betydning, som antallet af toner, melodisk kurvatur og tonernes konfiguration ("chunking") har i forhold til respondenterens afrapporterede villighed til produktkøb, evne til at kunne genkalde (ynne) melodilogoet, graden af lydlogo-distinkthed ("signal sensivity") samt affektive respons. Et grundlæggende ræsonnement bag Palghats undersøgelse er, at formgivningen i sig selv leverer information, hvilket også synes bekræftet i resultaterne, og således er der tale om en i musikvidenskabeligt øjemed betydelig kvalificering i forhold til de øvrige forskningsbidrag. Vigtigheden af at fokusere på formgivningen kendetegner ligeledes nærværende konferencepræsentation, men til forskel fra Palghats undersøgelse henvises til et stimulusmateriale, der er baseret på eksisterende melodilogoer, og desuden inddrages andre uafhængige manipulerbare variable og afhængige målvariable, lige som proceduren i det afrapporterede eksperiment er anderledes.

En integrativ teoridannelse

Der aftegner sig visse teoretiske sammentænkningmuligheder, når det drejer sig om at kombinere melodilogoers distinkthed og genkendelighed med fleksibilitet, konsistens og kontinuitet. Van Leeuwen (1999) har lagt grundstenen til et sådant projekt, idet han ud fra et ”socialsemiotisk” ståsted søger et fælles teoretisk beskrivelsesgrundlag for talelyde, musikalske lyde og effektlyde. I den henseende sætter han bl.a. fokus på lydenes ”materialitet” eller ”substans”, til forskel for den
XVI NORDIC MUSICOCLOGICAL CONGRESS

syntaks, lydene indgør i og deres eventuelle semantisk-pragmatiske betydning (ibid.: 125f). Desuden definerer han en række ”sound modality cues” (formuleret som kontinuerede variable) med henblik på at karakterisere *graden af varians* i lyde og dermed lydnes *artikulationskompleksitet*. Således opererer han med variablene tonehøjde, varighed, lydstyrke, perspektivdybde, fluktuation, friktion, rumklang og direktionalitet (ibid.:172f), der hver især er karakteriserende for lyde. Disse variable kan betragtes som auditive modstykker til visuelle ”modality cues” (såsom graden af detaljerigdom, farvemætning og -differentiering, dybdpeperspektiv, lys- og skyggeforskell etc.), der tilsvarende karakteriserer billedobjekter som mere eller mindre velartikulerede og detaljerede i forhold til det, de betegner eller forestiller – fx fra todimensionelle stretegnegninger i aviser, over malerier med dybdpeperspektiv, til fotografier i høj oplosning (ibid.:159). Jo mere artikulationskompleksiteten reduceres inden for de enkelte ”cues”, des højere bliver abstraktionsniveauet. Samtidig må det forholde sig således, at kriterierne for et givet abstraktionsniveaus perciperede sandhedsværdi (dvs. hvor naturtro eller virkelighedsnært det opfattes) er bundet op på, i hvor høj grad det er muligt at indkapsle ”essensen” af det afbillede. I den henseende er det interessant at fremhæve den satiriske karikaturtegning, hvor afsenderudbudskabet ikke mindst bæres af visuel *distincthed og genkendelighed* til trods for en omfattende artikulationsreduktion (fx fravær af farver, dybde, lys/skygge, etc.). Karikaturtegningen udmærker sig ydermere ved en betydelig *fleksibilitet*, idet tegningens væsenstræk kan indgå i varierende kontekster gennem en længere årrække, sådan som man ser det forhold til toneangivende politikere i den vestlige verden (fx Margaret Thatcher i Storbritannien og Anders Fogh Rasmussen i Danmark).

Spørgsmålet er, om et korporativt melodilogo kan modsvare karikaturtegningens semantisk-pragmatiske effektivitet. Dette vil forde, at det pågældende logo i en reduceret artikulationsform fungerer som et arbitrært symbol, en art musikalsk ”brand-DNA”, dvs. er genstand for en kulturtel indlært, tillært og associativ betydningsdannelse, der tillige gør sig gældende, hvor meloditonnerne, afhængig af kontekst og budskabskanal, ”iklædes” forskellige klanglige farvenuancer. Her kan man således tænke sig en række forskellige sinustoner af kortere og længere varighed (uden harmonisk akcompagnement, vibrato, instrumental klangfarve og rumvirkning) som analogisk med et (visuelt) system af prikker og streger, forstået på den måde, at begge udtryksformer hver for sig er at betragte som figurative helheder, hvis abstrahering fra den perciperede sandheds-, naturligheds- eller virkelighedsopfattelse er betragtelig. En sådan reduceret artikulationsform, herefter
benævnt ”RAF”, er alene defineret ud fra van Leeuwens førstnævnte to variable (tonehøjde og varighed) og forekommer i den henseende velegnet til at honorere fordringerne vedrørende fleksibilitet, konsistens og kontinuitet. Dermed være imidlertid intet sagt om distinkthed, genkendelighed og ”brand fit”.

**Eksperiment**

I nærværende artikel fokuserer jeg som nævnt specifikt på logo- og brandgenkendelse samt brandgenkaldelse, og i forlængelse af første forskningsspørgsmål, vedrørende betydningen af reduktionsgraden, vurderer jeg ud fra indsamlede empiriske data (Bang 2011), om ovenstående RAF-koncept i den henseende er egnet som “brandmarkør” sammenlignet med den originale logoform. I positivt fald vil det indebære, at genkendelsesgraden efter RAF nærmer sig den totale genkendelse. Spørgsmålet står som det centrale i undersøgelsen og er relevant ud fra den betragtning, at hvis melodilogoer er *melodisk distinkte* nok til at vække genkendelse i RAF, vil de sandsynligvis også være genkendelige i forskellige klanglige formationer, speciel designet til givne kontekster (dvs. kulturer, kundesegmente, kampanjer etc.) og dermed have symbolisk værdi for de tilhørende brands. De to øvrige forskningsspørgsmål omhandlende forholdet mellem genkendelse og genkaldelse henholdsvis tonehøjde og rytme er i den forbindelse sekundære.

Til eksperimentet blev der udvalgt fem melodilogoer; dels allerede nævnte Intel- og Nokia-logoer (jf. Eks. 1-2) og dels melodilogoer fra JYSK (Eks. 3), McDonald’s (Eks. 4) og Elgiganten (Eks. 5).

![Exempel 3. McDonald's](image1)
![Exempel 4. JYSK](image2)
![Exempel 5. Elgiganten](image3)

Fælles for de valgte melodilogoer er, at de på undersøgelsesstidspunktet måtte anses for at være almindeligt kendte i Danmark, idet de alle er blevet eksponeret på landsdækkende reklame-tv i minimum otte år. De differentierer sig imidlertid væsentligt fra hinanden på en række punkter; også når de er ”egaliseret” i overensstemmelse med RAF, hvor harmonisk akkompagnement samt instrumentalfarver og de lydeffekter, der typisk kendetegner dem, er udeladt (jf.

---

3At det skulle forholde sig således, fremgår ligeledes implicit hos Palghat (2009), der, under henvisning til Bruners (1990) opsummering af forskning i instrumentklangens associative betydning, anfører: ”Texture appears to be more indicative of the sonic personality rather than an influence on recognition memory.” (Palghat ibid.: 31)
Tabel 1). Ud over en forskelligartet oprindelse (præeksisterende versus nykomponeret) og et varierende toneantal (5 til 13 toner), er eksempelvis JYSK-logoet karakteristisk i form af en åben finalisering på 2. skalatrin, mens de øvrige melodilogoer omvendt finaliseres lukket på 1. skalatrin eller, i tilfældeet Intel, halvåbent på 5. skalatrin. Hertil kommer det helt generelle forhold, at logoerne hver især er musikalsk unikke; dels hvad angår kurvatur, intervalfølge og ambitus; og dels rytmisk og metrisk.

Respondenter, testkonditioner og procedure

Eksementet blev tilrettelagt som en selvrapporteringsundersøgelse med deltagelse af 137 elever i alderen 16-20 år, fordelt på 7 gymnasieklasser i to skoler og med en samlet kønsfordeling på 69% kvinder og 31% mænd. Det eksperimentelle undersøgelsesdesign bestod af to individuelle testkonditioner ("Test 1" og "Test 2") med tonehøjde henholdsvis rytme som særskilte fokuspunkter, idet formålet var at undersøge, i hvilken grad disse to elementer hver især har betydning for genkendelsen af de pågældende melodilogoer og brands. Tempo og artikulationskompleksitet (klangfarve) fungerede i begge testkonditioner som uafhængige variable i en 5x4-procedure (jf. Tabel 2), hvor hver af de fem melodilogoer blev afspillet i fire forskellige versioner efter hinanden: fra det svært genkendelige (computergenererede sinustoner uden rytmisk differentiering henholdsvis samplede "lilletromme-kantslag" uden tonehøjdeinformation), via RAF og over til melodilogoet i dets originale klangform. Hver af de fire logoversioner blev afspillet to gange med en kort pause imellem.

Eksementet foregik i de pågældende gymnasieklassers undervisningslokale, hvor melodilogoerne (og de forskellige versioner heraf) blev afspillet via medbragt audio-udstyr (en iPod forbundet med en Tivoli-radio med AUX-indgang og en god indbygget højttaler). Alle 137 respondenter deltog i en af de to testkonditioner og afrapporterede via et afkrydsningskema (jf. Tabel 3), på hvilket af de fire trin (svarende til afspillet logoversion) de a) genkendte melodilogoet og b) genkendte det tilhørende brand. De blev desuden bedt om at angive navnet på det pågældende brand ("brandgenkaldelse") eller alternativt blot den produktkategori, som de fandt relevant i tilfælde af, at de ikke kunne nævne et specifikt navn. Det kunne

\[4\] Lige som "Nokia Tune" stammer McDonald’s- og JYSK-logoerne fra præeksisterende materiale (hhv. Justin Timerlakes 2003-hitsingle I’m Lovin’ It og den danske folkemelodi Jyden), mens Intel- og Elgiganten-logoerne er komponeret specifikt til de pågældende virksomheder. (Se fx Werzowa 2010: 80f.)
eksempelvis være ”computer” i stedet for ”Intel”. Følgelig opereres i undersøgelsen med to forskellige typer af brandgenkaldelse: en eksakt (eksklusiv) og en inklusiv.

Resultater

I Illustration 1a fremgår gennemsnitsresultaterne beregnet ud fra samtlige fem melodilogoer, mens resultaterne fra de enkelte logoer vises i Illustration 1b-f. Indledningsvis kan det konstateres, at logo- og brandgenkendelsen generelt (og helt forventeligt) er stigende i takt med, at først tempo og derefter klangfarven tilpasses i overensstemmelse med logoernes originalform. Dernæst skal det bemærkes, at den gennemsnitlige logogenkendelse efter trin IV ligger på 99% i begge testkonditioner, hvilket umiddelbart bekræfter logoernes omfattende eksponering og således validerer valget af de fem logoer som stimulusmateriale i en og samme undersøgelse.5 Hvad der imidlertid hurtigt springer i øjnene, er en markant forskel på genkendelsesgraden efter trin I, II og III i de to testkonditioner. Således er der ingen tvivl om, at ”brandidentiteten” overvejende findes i tonehøjdesammensætningen snarere end i rytmen, idet logo- og brandgenkendelsen efter trin II er ca. 8 henholdsvis 24 gange højere i Test 1 end i Test 2, mens forskellen næsten er udlignet efter trin III (RAF), hvor stimuli er de samme i begge testkonditioner.6 Dette betyder samtidig, at hvor tilføjelsen af tonehøjdeinformation i Test 2 forøger logogenkendelsen ca. 11 gange og brandgenkendelsen 37 gange, bidrager rytme i Test 1 til en forøgelse på blot 51% henholdsvis 58%. Dermed kan tredje forskningsspørgsmål besvares entydigt: at det først og fremmest er melodilogoernes tonesammensætning, som har betydning for logo- og brandgenkendelsen. At det forholder sig sådan peger på, at tonehøjdevariation rent fænomenologisk udgør det grundlæggende karakteristikum ved melodilogoer (og melodier i det hele taget), mens rytme er et organiseringsprincip.7

For besvarelsen af det første forskningsspørgsmål, herunder i hvilket omfang genkendelsen efter RAF matcher genkendelsen efter originalformen, beregnes den gennemsnitlige genkendelse efter RAF i forhold til den totale gennemsnitlige

5 Til forskel fra logogenkendelsen når den afrapporterede brandgenkendelse efter trin IV op på blot 72% i Test 1 og 63% Test 2, hvilket indikerer, at genkendte melodifraser ikke nødvendigvis kan kobles til deres ophav.
6 Den udlignede forskel efter RAF afspejles i høj grad i resultaterne på baggrund af de individuelle melodilogoer, hvilket ligeledes understøtter ’sample’-materialets validitet.
7 At dette ikke modsvares af brandgenkendelsesgraden på baggrund af Intel- og Elgiganten-logoerne (for begges vedkommende ingen genkendelse efter trin II i de to testkonditioner), kan formentlig tilskrives de to logoers forholdsvis indistinkte form, dersom enten rytme eller tonehøjde ikke er specificeret, for som det kan bemærkes, er de tilsvarende logogenkendelsesgrader efter trin II enten ikke-eksisterende eller begrænset (jf. Ill. 1b og 1f).
genkendelse (jf. Ill. 2). Her fremgår det, at logogenkendelsen efter RAF i de to testkonditioner udgør ca. 75% og 78% (dvs. samlet godt trefjerdede), mens andelen for brandgenkendelse tilsvarende ligger på blot 53% henholdsvis 62% (dvs. samlet lidt over halvdelen). Samlet set er dette ikke umiddelbart overbevisende, dersom RAF i tilstrækkelig grad skal kunne fungere som brand-markør, og det må dermed afvises, at RAF-konceptets honorering af fordringerne vedrørende fleksibilitet, konsistens og kontinuitet, kan udvides til generelt også at omfatte genkendelighed. Resultaterne tyder snarere på, at den klanglige form har ganske stor betydning, og at kombinationen af toner og rytme således ikke rummer tilstrækkelig information. Nu er det imidlertid væsentligt at pointere, at der netop er tale om gennemsnitsberegninger ud fra samtlige fem melodilogoer; for logoerne individuelt betragtet varierer resultaterne betydeligt. Det er fx karakteristisk, at den afrapporterede genkendelse af de tre præeksisterende melodilogoer samt respektive brands (Nokia, McDonald’s og JYSK) helt overvejende har fundet sted efter RAF (i gennemsnit 98% hhv. 75%), mens den tilsvarende relative RAF-genkendelse af de til formålet komponerede Intel- og Elgiganten-logoer i gennemsnit udgør 44% og 10% for logo henholdsvis brand (jf. Ill. 3). Grunden til denne forskel logoerne imellem kan ikke afgores ud fra respondentundersøgelsen, men det synes nærliggende at antage, at det skyldes dels logoernes intertekstuelle henvisninger, dels deres distinkte melodiske design i form af relativ stor ambitus samt markant rytmisk konfiguration (jf. Tabel 1).\(^8\)

Tilbage står besvarelsen af andet forskningsspørgsmål vedrørende forholdet mellem brandgenkendelse (efter trin IV) og korrekt eller nær korrekt benævnelse af brandnavn (brandgenkaldelse). Af resultaterne fremgår det ikke overraskende, at afrapporteret brandgenkendelse ikke nødvendigvis er ensbetjende med korrekt brandgenkaldelse, hvorfor sidstnævnte i gennemsnit ligger lavere end forstnævnte (jf. Ill. 4). Til gengæld nærmer den samlede brandgenkaldelse (med korrekt eller nær korrekt benævnelse) sig brandgenkendelsesniveauet, men det skal også bemærkes, at godt 38% af respondenterne slet ikke har angivet nogen benævnelse. Hvad der desuden er ganske iojnefaldende, er den store resultatmæssige spredning på tværs af de fem melodilogoer, hvor især Intel- og McDonald’s-logoerne skiller sig ud hver for sig med

---

\(^8\) De tre melodilogoer genkendes endda i udpræget grad på baggrund af meloditonerne alene trods fravær af rytmisk information (Test 1, trin II). Dette gælder navnlig Nokia-logoet (96%), hvilket kan skyldes det forholdsvis høje antal toner (13) og den karakteristiske kurvatur i form af nedadgående sekstspring (jf. Eks. 2).
3% henholdsvis 100% korrekt brandgenkaldelse. For Intel-logoets vedkommende viser det sig således, at langt de fleste respondenter, der har rapporteret brandgenkendelse, har angivet alternative computer- og elektronikorienterede benævnelsel som ”Dell” eller ”Windows”. Helt anderledes forholder det sig med McDonald’s-logoet, hvor samtlige 137 respondenter har genkaldt det korrekte brand, og ingen har skrevet eksempelvis ”Burger King” i stedet. Mere generelt ses en opsplittning mellem på den ene side McDonald’s-, Nokia- og JYSK-logoerne, og på den anden side Intel- og Elgiganten-logoerne, hvor sammenhængen mellem brandgenkendelse og korrekt brandgenkaldelse fremstår henholdsvis stærk og svag (jf. Ill. 5).

**Diskussion og afsluttende bemærkninger**

Noget af det mest bemærkelsesværdige ved denne undersøgelse er resultaterne for Intel-logoet: dels at melodilogo og brand efter RAF kun genkendes af forholdsvis få respondenter (jf. Ill. 1b); og dels at Intel-brandet i vidt omfang forveksles med andre brands. Hvad angår det første, kan det meget vel skyldes logoets stærkt begrænsede melodiske og rytmiske indhold. Således indikerer genkendelsesforøgelsen efter trin IV meget klart, at det er klangfarve og lydeffekter, som gør logoet distinkt, og dermed er Intel-logoet så at sige ikke ”RAF-funktionelt”. I og med, at det forveksles med andre brands, kan man ydermere betvivle dets fremtidige gennemslagskraft, hvor stadig flere korporative melodilogoer kommer på markedet og klinger i det offentlige rum; og hvor flere har visse ligheder med Intel-logoet (mht. toneantal og kurvatur), hvilket må føre til stigende anonymitet. Dette forhold er før så vidt interessant derved, at selv om ofte netop Intel-logoet fremhæves som et ”mønstereksempel” på lydbranding (Jackson 2003:2-3; Bronner 2004:51-52; Lindstrøm 2005:22; Roth 2005:25; Straka 2007:67; Kusatz 2007:52), lader det til ifølge undersøgelsen, at Intel på sigt ikke har fået det optimale ud af melodilogoet.

Helt anderledes forholder det sig eksempelvis med McDonald’s- og Nokia-logoerne, hvis karakteristiske rytmiske strukturer (todelt periodestrukturet med synkoper henholdsvis tredelt periodestruktur med tre lignedannede sekvenser) meget vel kan være årsag til, at det netop er disse blandt de fem, som har vakt størst genkendelse efter trin II i Test 2 (hvv. 14% og 11%). Det synes imidlertid rimeligt at antage, at dette ikke blot skyldes logoets distinkthed, men også (og måske især), at

9 For Nokia-logoets vedkommende kan dette eventuelt skyldes, at rytmen forekommer som SMS-lyd i mange af Nokias mobiletelefoner.
det er McDonald's-brandet, der (sammen med Nokia) i højeste grad appellerer til respondentgruppen aldersmæssigt. At dømme efter resultaterne gælder der ikke det samme for JYSK- og Elgiganten-logoerne, som begge har afløst en relativt lav brandgenkendelse og brandgenkaldelse sammenlignet med melodilogogenkendelsen (efter trin IV). En mulig forklaring i tilfældet JYSK kan være, at de 16-20-årige respondenter falder uden for kernemålgruppen, der er modtagelige for informationer om eksempelvis dyner eller havemøbler på tilbud og således ikke på samme måde har optaget JYSK-brandet i deres bevidsthed. Hvad angår Elgiganten kan det eventuelt skyldes butikkædens spredte varesortiment, der nok appellerer til unge (fx mobiltelefoner, iPods, computerspil og TV), men også til børnefamilier og ældre (fx vaskemaskiner og køleskabe).

Hovedanliggende i nærværende bidrag har imidlertid været at undersøges RAF-konceptets duelighed. Hvor markedsførings- og branding-teorier ofte peger på distinkthed, genkendelighed, fleksibilitet, konsistens, kontinuitet og "fit" som væsentlige fordringsmæssige fikspunkter, har RAF-konceptet potentiale til at opfylde dem alle, alt afhængig af kombinationsforholdet mellem tonehøjder og rytmeter. Ordvalget "potentiale" er ganske bevidst, for som det allerede er vist, er RAF ikke ensbetydende med genkendelighed og RAF-tilpassede melodilogoer dermed ikke nødvendigvis effektive i markedsføringsøjemed, hvilket også resultaterne på baggrund af Intel-logoet indikerer. Den eneste af ovenstående seks punkter, der under alle omstændigheder opfyldes med RAF, er fleksibilitet, hvorimod konsistens og kontinuitet i sidste ende er et spørgsmål om stringent markedsføring. Selve opfyldelsen af distinkthed, genkendelighed og "fit" er derimod et musikalsk anliggende med indbyggede fænomenologiske, psykologiske og sociokulturelle implikationer, og således er det netop det musikalske perspektiv, der har gjort det meningsfuldt at operere med to forskellige testkonditioner, hvor tonehøjde og rytme testes separat, og hvor førstnævnte tydeligt har vist sig at have den primære betydning for brandgenkendelsen og brand-identiteten.
REFERENCER


### Tabel 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Melodilogo</th>
<th>Oprindelse</th>
<th>Antal toner</th>
<th>Kurvatur</th>
<th>Ambi-tus</th>
<th>Mel. retning</th>
<th>Mel. finalisering</th>
<th>Varigheds-følge</th>
<th>Antal perioder</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intel</td>
<td>Nykomp.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>Halvåben</td>
<td>- · · ·</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McDonald’s</td>
<td>Præekst.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>→</td>
<td>Lukket</td>
<td>· · · ·</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nokia</td>
<td>Præekst.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>↓</td>
<td>Lukket</td>
<td>· · · · · · · ·</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JYSK</td>
<td>Præekst.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>Åben</td>
<td>· · · · · · · · ·</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elgiganten</td>
<td>Nykomp.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>→</td>
<td>Lukket</td>
<td>· · · · · · · · ·</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Tabel 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test 1: Tonehøjde (n=66)</th>
<th>Test 2: Rytme (n=71)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kun tonehøjde – langsomt tempo (RAF/t)</td>
<td>Kun rytme – halvt tempo (RAF/r)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kun tonehøjde – hurtigt tempo (RAF/t)</td>
<td>Kun rytme – originalt tempo (RAF/r)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tonehøjde og rytme i originalt tempo (RAF)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Originalt melodilogo (fuld artikulationskompleksitet)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Tabel 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jeg genkendte lydlogoet:</th>
<th>I) □</th>
<th>II) □</th>
<th>III) □</th>
<th>IV) □</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jeg genkendte brandet:</td>
<td>I) □</td>
<td>II) □</td>
<td>III) □</td>
<td>IV) □</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navnet på brandet:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Illustration 1a (Gennemsnit)

[Bar chart showing data for different tests and brands.]

Illustration ib (Intel)

[Bar chart showing data for different tests and brands.]

Illustration ic (Nokia)

[Bar chart showing data for different tests and brands.]
Illustration 1d (McDonald's)

Illustration 1e (JYSK)

Illustration 1f (Elgiganten)
Illustration 2

![Bar chart showing total recognition and RAF for different tests and brands.]

Illustration 3

![Bar chart showing RAF/Total for different logos and brands.]

RAF/Total

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Logo</th>
<th>Brand</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>McDonald's, Nokia og Jysk</td>
<td>Intel og Elgiganten</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Illustration 4

![Chart showing brand recognition and accuracy for different brands: Intel, McDonalds, Nokia, JYSK, Eliganten, and Egemsmitt.

Legend:
- Blue: Brand recognition
- Red: Correct brand recognition
- Green: Close to correct brand recognition
- Purple: No correct brand recognition

Illustration 5

![Chart showing brand recognition and accuracy for different brands: Intel, McDonalds, Nokia, JYSK, Eliganten.

Legend:
- Blue: Brand recognition
- Red: Correct brand recognition


CHARLOTTE RØRDAM LARSEN & ANSA LØNSTRUP
THE POLYPHONY OF SENSES AND EXPERIENCE

Introduction

The following two combined research papers are a collaborative part of a larger, collective research framework which examines sound and listening as a precondition for studying and understanding our omnipresent, mediated audiovisual culture. Media texts as purely visual phenomena have long been the object of scholarly investigation (cf. “visual culture” as a theoretical, well-articulated research field); however, the audio part of audiovisuality remains largely under-researched.

We have selected two examples of mediated, hyperaesthetic and multi-sensuous, yet audiovisual, media representations of staging complex and intertwined sensorial perception on media, and illustrate how they are both characterized by the use of hyperbole, by extensive and emphasized sound effects, by bodily movement and touch, and by other transitory stimuli, as well as by an overall characteristic humour, irony and “too much” redundancy. The central and shared question of our two case studies is how does the audiovisual, mediated commercial work for the senses altogether – through presentation and representation – in our sensuous experience of and signification-productive interaction with the commercials? The two papers can be read both independently and together. The few repetitions are there for pedagogical reasons and we hope they are acceptable.

CHARLOTTE RØRDAM LARSEN

MUSICAL FIT IN COMMERCIALS: FROM “ATTITUDE TOWARD A BRAND” TO “ATTITUDE TOWARD SENSIUALITY”

It should not come as a surprise to anybody that music and sound are used to sell products. Music is “used by advertisers for a variety of specific means by attracting attention, priming memory, carrying a message, avoiding barriers to communication imposed by different languages, or appealing to different age groups” (North and Hargreaves 2010:916). According to North and Hargreaves, academic research has focused on three uses of music in relation to advertising: music’s effect on the consumer’s emotional responses, how music and information, when used in

1 http://ak.au.dk/en/
conjunction, prime the cognition of the product, and sonic branding. This article presupposes the fact that, when it comes to advertising, music is an extra element that facilitates a visual dimension. To consider only the meaning of the sound ignores the fact that commercials are audiovisual.

Traditionally, research on the use of music in commercials (as well as the approach to advertising) has centred on an advertisement’s intermediation of a given product. But North and Hargreaves state (by referring to Brown and Stayman 1992) that a more recent approach to advertising is replacing this “attitude toward a brand” with an “attitude toward an ad.” This means that commercials are designed to please the consumer rather than highlighting the benefits of using the product (ibid.). Music has an important bearing on the consumer’s choice, as the consumer is more inclined to choose a product underscored by music that he/she likes (Gorn 1982:97). In other words, the consumer is susceptible to the sound of the advertisement and he/she allows this affective response to guide his/her choice of product. Using music in this way, to control the product’s desirability, is called musical fit, and can involve the product’s interaction with the hook line of a song, the consumer’s (stereotyped) connotation of a genre, or an energetic song, which implicitly promotes the idea that the product will transmit the song’s energy to the consumer. But the concept of musical fit seems to raise more problems than it solves. North and Hargreaves have identified how different studies suggest different effects of musical fit: Some show that music can encourage people to think of a product in a certain way, while others indicate that an incongruity between a product and the underlying music will stimulate the consumer, who will attempt to resolve the divide and, therefore, remember the product for longer. Still other results show that music can actually reduce the recall of a product, because the consumer invests cognitive resources in the music instead of the product. North and Hargreaves write: “[…] it is possible to produce a theoretical explanation of why memory for a product should be improved if the advert for it features congruous music, incongruous music, or no music at all” (North and Hargreaves 2010:918). Such problems might be related to the lack of appreciation that audiovisual media are interactive. An acknowledge of this interactivity seems to be present in the concept of sonic branding, which typically involves short bursts of music and sound, that have never before been heard in other contexts; the sound refers solely to the product, the company, and the pictures, and
it does not refer to or evoke other associations. However, both the concept of musical fit and sonic branding admit that the audio-dimension is not self-sufficient.

In previous research, I have shown how the semantic dimensions of the audiovisual changed with regards to Danish margarine commercials between 1936 and 2000 (Larsen 2012:22-43). In the early commercials for OMA-margarine, what North and Hargreaves refer to as an attitude towards the brand is achieved through the reciting of poetry or songs, often presented by an actor. However, in the later commercials, this has transformed into an attitude towards the ad, characterized by a more peer-to-peer-like address. The margarine commercials have shifted from a predominantly semantic or causal soundtrack, presenting the visual product and its use (“attitude toward a brand”), to tracks using aesthetic, visualized and musicalized elements (“attitude toward the ad”); this leads towards a more sensuous communication, which we might consider here as an “attitude toward the senses.”

This sensuous turn transcends the limitation of sound and pictures in themselves, though presented by a medium considered audiovisual. What is at stake here is how the sight and the sound are instruments in bringing about a multi-sensuous experience to the consumer.

The sensuous turn

We often think of sense impressions as demanding external stimulants – the body engaging with the natural world, for example – but, in relation to a commercial’s audiovisual presentation of a product, the broad sensory aspect is transformed into the audiovisual interface of the screen. We shall explore this idea by analysing some contemporary commercials, which are examples of what we might call the sensuous turn in relation to audiovisual media.

In his article, “HYPERESTICIA or The Sensual Logic of Late Capitalism,” David Howes identifies how a sensual logic is embedded in the turn from what he refers to as “industrial” to “consumer capitalism.” Whilst referring to historical examples as the visual turn (illustrated by the example of the voyeuristic, Benjaminian flaneur) to today’s worship of sensuous pleasure as a value in its own right, he states: “Indeed tapping the subjective sensory preferences of the consumer and creating enticing “interfaces” has come to take precedence over conventional design

---

2 Sonic branding can also refer to companies that use musicians or music with which they wish to be associated. Here I deal only with sound tracks.
principles.” (Howes 2005b:286-87). By this, he refers to the fact that it is no longer only tactile aspects that are taken into consideration in product design. Consumer capitalism is characterised by a multi-sensorial approach to the consumer. According to Howes, everything seems designed to create a particular state in the consumer, which he calls hyperesthesia (Howes 2005b:288). By multiplying the appeal to the consumer’s sensory channels, the consumer’s attention is aroused, as he or she is more likely to choose products that appeal to more senses simultaneously. Today’s consumer is defined as a hedonist (Jantzsen 2007:84), since emotions, well-being, and delight seem to play an important part in the consumer’s judgement. Consumers are offered aesthetic experiences, and they are themselves looking for pleasures.

One of the ways to involve more senses is the use of synaesthesia in commercials, which creates cross linkages between the modalities at a subconscious level. One example of this is the Zaltman Metaphor Elicitation Technique (ZMET); a system designed to exploit subconscious cross-linkages (Howes 2005b:292). By asking consumers what is and what is not the taste, smell, feeling, sound, etc., of a certain brand, the consumer’s subconscious is in fact tapped by uncovering synaesthetic equations in their minds involving image-collection, sorting, storytelling and videos as “People think differently when they think “in motion” than when they think in still images or pictures.” (Zaltman and Coulter 1995:2 here cited from Howes 2005b:292). The results are put into their so-called consensus maps which are used as a tool to discover which sensory transfers might facilitate a focus of our attention.

Howes is dealing with the producer’s interests in the consumer’s interaction with commodities. His concept of hyperesthesia points towards an increasing use of synaesthetic elements in product marketing; something that, in general, seems obvious when considering today’s TV commercials. Here we concentrate solely on how the audiovisual interface attempts to present us with a “multi”-sensuous dimension, even though three senses – taste, smell and touch – cannot be directly transmitted.

**The sensory/semiotic ratio**

The arthistorian Mitchell claims that all media are mixed media, and he discusses how so-called “visual media” always involve other senses. His main thesis is that all media are mixed media, since “the very notion of a medium and of mediation already entails some mixture of sensory, perceptual, and semiotic elements” (Mitchell 2007:399). What he suggests is to examine the differentiation within these
mixtures, since mixed media are certainly not always mixed in the same way or in the same proportions.

He argues for a media taxonomy (Mitchell 2007:400), which aims to refute the stereotypes of visual, verbal, or audio media. As an inspiration he uses Marshall McLuhan’s ideas of different “sensory ratios” for different media, according to which TV is a tactile medium, since it is an “extension of touch.” According to McLuhan, TV is a simultaneous extension and auto-amputation of our bodies and our senses, stressing “the dynamic, interactive character of mediated sensuousness” (cited from Mitchell 2007:399, c.f. McLuhan 1994:354). However, what Mitchell suggests is a double ratio for understanding media: one sensory ratio and one semiotic ratio; the latter generated from Peirce’s triadic sign theory: icon (resemblance), index (cause, effect connection), and symbol (conventional/cultural). Mitchell proposes combining the semiotic triad with another triad, namely, Hegel’s three, so-called “theoretical senses” (sight, hearing and touch) as primary blocks. He evolves the concept of ratio pointing at least five possibilities. It can refer to: a balance of power, that one sense can lead to another, that one medium can be nested in another, that the semiotic function or the sensory channel can be woven together and, finally, that the two parallel (and often separated) ratios or tracks – the sensual and the semiotic – may never meet, but may leave a gap which sometimes requires “a completion in the mind,” or an activity of imagination, which the consumer can perform. (Mitchell 2007:401). By unfolding Mitchell’s rough sketch, we might be able to establish how senses are presented as icon, index and symbol on the audiovisual screen, which appear to favour sight, sound and tactility (respectively).

**Representations of the senses**

This could provide a way of answering our central question: how does the audiovisual presentation (icon, index, symbol) work for our visual, auditory, as well as tactile perception and experience of commercials, which are increasingly presented to us through a screen? One early version of a screen is a painting. Susan Stewart identifies Caravaggio’s picture of Doubting Thomas as a representation of one sense: touch. Caravaggio “plays with the dynamic between the surface of the skin and the surface of the canvas. Through touch he represents a touch that penetrates the reality of the representation itself” (Stewart 2005:64). The wound is an icon that cancels itself out, because its resemblance (index) makes us doubt. Only by placing our own finger on the wound, can we establish that this wound – like other canvas wounds – is a trompe l’oeil effect (symbol). We are only able to discover the
enigmatic wound by touching; by being incredulous, like Thomas himself. Here the sensory/semiotic ratio is dominated by tactility, and the relationship between icon, index and symbol changes, since they merge into one another. Mitchell’s proposal of leaving behind the reified stereotypes and looking at the interchanges seems to serve its purpose, namely, to comprehend and discuss the complexity of the mediated sensuousness.

The commercials that we are dealing with here offer synaesthetic sense impressions. We define them as multi-sensuous, as the audiovisuality seems to evoke sensations of touch, smell, and taste, often transmitted by sound. David Howes describes how a shopper today is met by multisensory marketing – scents, sounds, and touch – that are all supposed to create a condition of hyperesthesia in the shopper. Our thesis is that, in commercials, we are met with the same multisensory hyperesthesia, yet transferred by the audio-visualty of the screen.

As a final remark, it is perhaps helpful to examine Ronald Barthes’ description of food advertising in France. Barthes sees food consumption as a communicative system, and points to the signifying power of food and the idea that food constitutes information (Barthes 1979:168). Energy-giving and light food is a sign of participation in modern life, as food is becoming increasingly associated with lifestyle choices and ever more bound up with particular situations. Barthes highlights this with the example of coffee, which is no longer marketed as a stimulant, but as a relaxant: “Coffee is no longer so much a substance as a circumstance” (op. cit. 172).

This tendency can also be seen in liquor commercials: what is highlighted in the commercials is society’s worship of activity and leisure, today reinforced by a strong involvement of the senses which underlines the hedonism and liquor is a transition to a sensuous pleasure.

**Martini commercials**

Our idea is to develop an approach to commercials, which takes into account how commercials involve the senses (or an attitude towards the senses). The evocation of taste, smell and touch is aroused and transformed by the audiovisual, which presents and represents the other senses (c.f. Andersen and Jantzen 2004). Unlike North and Hargreaves, who describe picture and sound as counterparts, we invoke the concept of polyphony, which we take to be equivalent to the multi- and hypersensuality of
the commercials’ expressions. The examples are Martini commercials\textsuperscript{3} from around the late 70s until today.

The Martini commercials from the 70s present us with what Barthes described as “health,” since they portray Martini as something that helps you to cope with life (Barthes 1979:171). Martini produces energy, makes you relax, gives you power. There are many series of these commercials, and they are all underscored by the Martini theme and words (see appendix 1).

In the late seventies, Martini commercials are dominated by sight and sound: the Martini theme is varied, and the pictures point to leisure and activity (indexically and symbolically). The senses are not mixed, but paralleled. Senses as smell, taste, and feeling are weakly addressed.

In this commercial series, more senses though are thematized – the sense of touch as a body breaks through the water surface, red lips and a mouth drinking from a glass, while the music and the lyrics underline the pictures. Sight and hearing are in focus. The melody line is always the same. The melody is an icon of Martini. The commercial points at activity, leisure and delight, and Martini is presented as an icon in these areas of life.

\textbf{Martini commercial 2008}

\textit{Narration:} From a window, we see people partying on the Mediterranean coastline (with Amalfi in the background)\textsuperscript{4}. A man, George Clooney, and a woman, Shannyn Sossamon, have both finished their drink, and they rush through the partying crowd for a new Martini. The film is shot in black and white; only the Martini logo has colour added in post-production.

\textit{Sound:} The sound of the sea gives the location of the setting, and then some drums begin to play. We hear the clinking of ice in Clooney’s almost empty glass, and, at the same time, an orchestral motif chimes in a kind of close or beginning: what is going to happen? Clooney hears the sounds of another emptied glass and spots this in the hand of a beautiful woman. Clooney seems interested, but a sound distracts both: again, the sound of ice in a glass, but this time louder and followed by the

\textsuperscript{3} My study is based on the Danish Digital Archive of screen advertisements, Danske reklamefilm. This contains 20 Martini commercials, from the 70s to the 90s (many of them undated). YouTube also has quite a number of Martini commercials, often with fairly reliable information regarding the time and location of the advertisements, and the actors who starred in them.

sound of a lid being replaced onto an ice bucket. With this sound, both rush towards the bar, accompanied by the sound of clinking ice and pouring Martini and the energetic (blues) riff from the orchestra. The woman takes the direct route: we hear her dropping her shoes, and the sound of sprinkling water and pouring Martini as she crosses a fountain to reach the drink. Clooney bumps into the other guests: we hear the vibrations. The sound of fluid from different sources rises. She arrives, grasps the filled glass, which clinks. The music stops. A tenor saxophone plays an upbeat melody as they wrestle over the drink, and anticipates George Clooney’s victory. He handles her a handkerchief and exclaims, “Belissimo,” but this exclamation turns out to refer to the Martini, and the slogan—“the most beautiful drink.”

**Sight:** This film is in black and white except for the Martini remedies. The pictures emphasize the aesthetic and sensuous. There is lots of gazing: the couple seem interested in each other at first, but the sound of Martini proves to be more tempting. We see the festival participants as obstacles as the couple rush for the drink.

**Taste:** They are both addicted to Martini, but it is described as “Belissimo” – a word connected with sight.

**Touch:** Touch is represented through the pouring of water, the chinking of ice in the glasses, the dropping of shoes, and the bartender’s sounds. And it is strengthened through the music.

In the commercial desire is aroused by hearing: the casting and the sight of the characters are made up to arouse desire, but instead the desire is awaked by hearing sounds, which turns into an urge for Martini. The tactile sense is the most pronounced, as it is represented by hearing the ice and the water. Semiotically, the ice refers to the making of a drink, partying and a symbol of pleasure. Also the semiotic level is facilitated by the auditory sense.
LITERATURE


**EXAMPLES**


**APPENDIX 1**

Try a taste of Martini
The most beautiful drink in the world
It’s the bright one,
The right one
It’s Martini
There’s much more to the world than you guess
And you taste it, the day you say yes
To the bright taste of the right one
It’s Martini
Anytime, any place anywhere
There’s a wonderful world you can share
It’s the right one
The bright one
It’s Martini
ANSA LØNSTRUP

PERCEPTION OF AUDIO-VISUAL COMMERCIALS ADVERTISING MULTI-SENSUOUS COMMODITIES

At the outset of our research, whilst examining audiovisual television commercials found on the internet website YouTube, we realized that such commercials are fairly complex and difficult to describe and analyze with regards to audiovisual perception and experience. It is well known that television commercials draw on aesthetics from other audiovisual genres; film, video, other television programs, and formats, etc. This intertextuality is rather elaborate, and is one of the most important sources of new commercial aesthetics and composition in which the expectation of a narrative, a possible emotional engagement through the commercial’s characters, is still present. As Marshall McLuhan writes: “all content of any medium is always an earlier medium” (McLuhan 1964:8). So it seems as though intertextuality and the phenomenon of nesting or braiding are widespread even within the audiovisual commercial.

Recently, it appears as though the hyperaesthetic commercials, which advertise multi-sensuous commodities and which are shared on the Internet and increasingly produced for several media formats, also draw on the strategies and aesthetics of the broad, contemporary art scene – dance, performance, installation art, conceptual and digital art – which are often multi-medial or audiovisual, and sometimes also include touch. At any rate, they do not rely solely on sight (c.f. Mitchell 2005).

Of course, the strategic communication – the purpose of selling things – is essential in the genre of audiovisual commercials. However, it also seems important to discover how this is balanced with the expectation and demands of a direct aesthetic and sensory-based appeal and experience of the commercials. We could refer to this as “the balancing of the aesthetic communication and the strategic intention” in audiovisual commercials.

So the field of our research connects and draws on several fields of study: 1) audiovisual styling in film, video and television genres; 2) strategic sound communication in commercials; 3) exhibited audiovisuality – sound in the (fine) arts; 4) hyperaesthetic and multi-sensuous but audiovisual, mediated consumer culture.

The perception and experience of audiovisual media texts such as audiovisual commercials is digital and mobile; through the use of mobile media (the laptop, the smart phone, etc.) and the convergence of film, television, video, and the internet, we are able to perceive and experience audiovisuals anytime and anywhere in our
everyday lives. We share and discuss them, and we use them for our own purposes; for fun, for entertainment, for astheticising and thus “staging” our daily life and transport, for presenting ourselves, and communicating our likes and dislikes, and in doing so, we construct and change identities and attitudes. In that sense, commercials form a natural part of our everyday perception and experience and, therefore, it could be argued that they also dominate our general, “unmediated” perception and experience. Hence the term audiovisual culture.

The above-mentioned fields are the conditional and cultural aspects which we also take into account when analyzing the commercials, and which are likely to appear in each commercial, in varying degrees.

In the article earlier mentioned, Mitchell (2005:260) develops the position that “all media are mixed media,” which entails “some mixture of sensory, perceptual and semiotic elements.” He refers to Marshall McLuhan and his concept of sensory ratios for different media. He in particular furthers McLuhan’s understanding of television as a tactile (and not a visual) medium or as an “extension of touch.” In fact, he views all media as both “extensions” and “amputations” of the bodily sensorium; a dynamic, interactive character of mediated sensuousness (ibid.:261).

However, what Mitchell suggests is a double ratio for understanding media: one sensory ratio and one semiotic ratio; the latter taken from Peirce’s triadic sign theory of icon, index, and symbol, which he combines with Hegel’s notion of the three, so-called “theoretical senses” – sight, hearing and touch – and the so-called “sub-theoretical senses” – taste and smell – which are not presented directly in electronic and digitized (technological) media. Finally, we think it is helpful to consider Mitchell’s idea that the two parallel (and often separated) ratios or tracks – the sensual and the semiotic – hardly ever merge, but leave a gap which sometimes requires a completion in the mind, or an activity of imagination, which the consumer could perform. And, since the two sub-theoretical senses (smell and taste) are not directly at play as media in the audiovisual media texts, we suggest that the third theoretical sense, touch, along with interactivity in the mind and imagination, could compensate.

From our analysis of the multi-sensuous commodity commercials we shall conclude (furthering Mitchell’s ideas) that: 1) there are no audiovisual media, only an audiovisual culture and, 2) the senses and modalities do not only work separately or for themselves but they “work for each other,” they cooperate and converge into synaesthetic and multi-sensuous configurations.
There seems to be a paradoxical relation between the visual dominance in our cultural knowledge logic, and the hyperaesthetic and sensual logic in the world of commodities and consumer culture (c.f. Howes 2005). Mike Featherstone (2007) considers the aestheticization of everyday life to be one of the main characteristics of postmodernism. By this he means that we live and perceive the aesthetic not only through art but through all our experiences; mainly objectified in commodities and consumption. But, when it comes to our theoretical understanding of how we experience the world and the phenomena, we still focus primarily on the visual (and secondarily the aural) as the most important sense. In our Western culture, we theorize and think that the senses work separately and according to the above-mentioned hierarchy, i.e. primarily through the three theoretical senses: vision, hearing and touch.

By studying both Western and non-Western cultures, recent research in the field of multimodal and sensory anthropology has shown that our sensuous perception is culturally defined and differentiated in several synaesthetic combinations. In his ethnographic research in Papua New Guinea, David Howes (2009) has found evidence of audio-olfactory synaesthesia, which is the configuration of sound and smell perception into “hearing a smell.” And this has likewise been found in African languages (the Dogon of Mali) (ibid.:228). The anthropologist, Steven Feld (2003), launched his notion of acoustemology based on extensive field research among people in the Papua New Guinea rainforest, and he concluded that auditory perception (hearing/listening) was decisive for their knowledge of and being in the world.

In the field of new aesthetic theory and philosophy, it is stated that the senses merge and work by modifying themselves through and for each other, in different synaesthetic configurations, constellations, and modifications. In his reading of Michel Serres’s *Five Senses*, Steven Connor demonstrates how difficult it is to separate out the senses. Furthermore, he persists in the requirement of knotting them together. His focus is on the skin as the sense organ, which stands for the way in which every sense “pockets up all other sense organs but in doing so stands as a model for the way in which all the senses in their turn also invaginate all the other senses” (Connor 1999:4-5). He quotes Michel Serres to further the idea that we hear through all our body parts (skin, feet, cranial box, abdomen, etc.). In other words: that we hear with our total “body-box.” And he also says that hearing constitutes the “social contract,” based on the propriocentric hearing (of oneself), which forms the model for all communication.
Madalina Diaconu’s research (2006) focuses on the general and specific difficulties of and need for establishing an aesthetics of touch, smell, and taste. This aesthetics should be based on contemporary artistic interests and practices, using all ephemeral material and appealing to the transitory or secondary senses (touch, smell and taste), as well as the primary but also transitory stimuli in art forms, such as music, theatre, and dance, etc. Precisely these art forms and their aesthetics seem to deliver important aesthetic and sensorial inputs to the audiovisual commercials in question. We might talk of new “sensotypes,” which are played out in the aesthetics of everyday consumer life and culture, and which are coined in the mediated audiovisual commercials in question.

A body walking, dancing and performing: exhibited and acting out, appealing to all senses

Case: Yves Saint Laurent – Elle – Coco Rocha

00.00 A deep, short, vibrating (keynote) tone is heard. We see a woman (the Canadian model and dancer, Coco Rocha) from behind, cat-walking forward in a postmodern, architectural environment: Institut du monde arabe in Paris.

The sound is echoing the surrounding space, activated by a keynote tone but still more accentuated by the sound of a “zoom,” paralleling the visual zoom, and by clicks of her high-heeled, black shoes; large acoustics and soundscape. A large, reverberating space is heard by her moving activity. Then she walks along a wall with many small on screens exhibiting the same woman eyes, with the sound of zooming (like the visual zooming “gaze”) sliding into a polyphony of whispering voices from the visitors around her, but visually accompanied by the many repeated eyes on the media screens she walks by. We have now followed the narration course from her moving and sensing outside in the real, cultural environment, to an indoor, performative, and media-dominated environmental setup; perhaps a fashion show or a similar event.

00.08 A sound effect accompanies her high-heeled shoes as they “cut up” the glass floor, leaving it with visible tracks of glass fragments or splinters. She turns around, followed by another “sweeping” sound effect of her pony-tail, swinging around in the same, circling movement. The audience turn their heads and look at her. A deep, abstract breathing in sound accompanies the visual close-up on her, 1. beautiful eyes, 2. nail-polished fingers, gliding down into a pocket, and, 3. her beautiful, pink lipstick painted and slightly-open mouth articulating a short indexical and high
frequency breathing in (and smelling). The hand picks up the perfume-vaporizer flacon (a dark, pink, geometrical, glass cylinder) signed with large YSL letters, followed by a drum-set upbeat and a weak, but clearly-felt/heard, high frequency, suspended, melodic-harmonic tension (dominant), and “released” by the downbeat (on the 1-beat).

At 00.15, the band starts playing and a woman’s voice sings in a high frequency, melodic and energetic 4/4: “Outside, inside – this is the moon without a tide” all with a heavy, steady and rhythmic feeling.¹ At 00.22, we hear the choir singing “Ooh, ooh – ooh, ooh – ooh, ooh – ooh, ooh” – the repeated refrain with only two tones and without words, but articulating admiration or perhaps astonishment.

What we see during the short verse sample and during the refrain is the rhythmic montage of the following visual shots: 00.16 one sparkling eye in close-up, reflecting the spotlights and screens; 00.17 from behind, we see her dancing and jumping in a performance, swinging, writing or painting in (touching) the air with a vaporizer (larger than the one in the pocket, though!); 00.19 whilst jumping high in the air, she/it leaves behind a visible, vertical “jet stream” track with the pink coloured vaporized perfume; 00.20 we see several fragments of her painting-writing, now also around her own body, still moving and dancing in an organic performance, but inserted with short, close visual reverse shots of the increasingly-astonished, open-mouthed audience (breathing in). Her dance performance is viewed from a dominant, high, distant camera perspective, with the audience in front of her. In the visual montage, there is also a close-up, looking down into her gaping jacket collar, where her naked cleavage is in focus – c.f. Steven Connors’ (and Michel Serres’) notion that “the skin stands for the way in which all senses both “pockets” up all other sense organs but in doing so stands as a model for the way in which all the senses in their turn also invaginate all the other senses” (originally cited p. 70). And notice that this naked part of the body is precisely where we normally place our perfume.

At 00.25, the scene as a whole is revealed: with a Parisian “backdrop” – the view through a huge floor-to-ceiling window-glass to the surroundings and atmosphere on the banks of the Seine – we see her standing on a podium in high-heeled shoes, her body dressed and almost covered in a geometrical, black suit with a gaping neckline.

¹ A musical sample/montage from the hit “Gold Lion” by Yeah, Yeah, Yeahs.
(a view to her modest breasts and light skin), while we hear “without a tide” from the singing voice-over. Coco Rocha dances and then stops, standing with her long, spread legs; leaving the sight of her vaporized writing on her left-hand side: the light, pink word “elle,” written in round, small letters, the handwriting we recognise from the visual branding of the fragrance. This writing is left in the air as a visual indexical and iconic symbol of the fragrance, while at 00.26, a mezzo voice-over speaks: “elle. the new fragrance. Yves Saint Laurent” [le nouveau perfume YSL], still accompanied by the musical and vocal “Oo, Oo”-refrain and with a short and close reverse shot of Coco Rocha’s face with the dominating eyes. In her last standing posture, we see her from a distance as the icon: an upside down black “Y” to the right but with the sensuous index written in pink with the ephemeral fragrant, but still visible symbol of “elle” which is moving a little forward in the air. The commercial finishes with a still photo of the pink flacon. The background is grey-black, and consists of the multiplied, small screens and the written version of the verbal utterance, “elle. the new fragrance. Yves Saint Laurent.” The music track fades with the motif, “Oo, Oo, Oo, Oo.”

The aesthetic communication and the strategic multi-sensuous appeal in this commercial are clearly operating through (the visual) body, which represents all senses. However, this is certainly set off by the sound (and music) since the sound both initiates and reflects the movement and action of the performer. It also activates our own (experiencing) bodies and, thus, touches and affects the audience through sound waves. What is really interesting is how this commercial also succeeds in representing the smell (the perception of fragrance) through the auditory instigated (initiated) and visual bodily action. It is a prime example of how to stage and compose the different senses and media into a multi-sensuous configuration, where the single senses “work for each other,” which, in turn, activates the audience’s imaginative and inter-sensorial work, for the sake of a multi-sensuous, multisemiotic, and synaesthetic experience. So the experience is quasi-live, and the perception balances between a semiotic ratio and a sensory ratio. This is, without a doubt, both an aesthetic artefact and a commercial. It is exhibited both on a diegetic stage (the podium) and on the “arty” media platform YouTube, where you can find everything from (mediated) professional and multi-medial artistic performances, such as graffiti, dance, concerts, video-recorded art exhibitions, fashion events, to video and film clips; but it is also a highly professional and effective audiovisual, multi-sensuous, and strategic mediated and mediatised commercial.
If a commercial wants to be successful on YouTube, it must (and often does) draw on the aesthetics of various media and art genres. To be successful on YouTube is to be watched, listened to, used, distributed and commented on.

Reading the various comments beneath the YSL.elle commercial on YouTube, it is obvious how it is perceived in the light of the experience of other aesthetic media genres:

1. Coco Rocha is an excellent pub for YSL Elle. A strong image, so urban and sophisticated, sensual and rebel, completely modern woman wearing the classic suit of YSL. The idea of using the perfume flacon simulating an urban writing on walls is fabulous new and cosmopolita. A daring attitude.
2. Wow! This High Heels are dangerous!
3. Coco rocks!!!!!!
4. her eyes.... O.O so beautiful!!!
5. I love the way they say Yves Saint Laurent! they say it soo fast its funny! I wanna become a model
6. I LOVE it when her stilettos scratch the black floor!
7. OMG I watch this ad everytime like the first time..Coco is sooooo damn sexy..her lips,eyes...just make me crazy...!
8. coco rocha, model from Canada
9. I cant imagine someone other than coco doing this. she's perfect for this ad! and yeah, SHE CAN MOVE!
10. Her feet must be really hurt after the commercial.
11. The scene takes place in the "Institut du monde arabe" in Paris!
12. Wonder if I could actually chip a floor by stomping on it with one of my new boots? Or a similiar effect.
13. coco coco coco coco!!!!!

Some of the selected comments listed above also reveal that the experience of the commercial has transcended the visual dominance (5, 6) and the sensorial deficiency of the audiovisual representation, since they mention touch (3, 9, 10, 12), as well as the synaesthetic configuration (1, 2, 3). The last comment 13 is a kind of creative, imaginative aural-musical paraphrase: “coco coco coco coco,” instead of “Oo, Oo, OO, Oo.” In conclusion, if we had to decide between the strategic intention and the aesthetic (artistic) communication I would vote for the latter and rather experience and enjoy this aesthetic commercial on YouTube than buy or use the fragrance. However, the full-scale synaesthetic and multi-medial real and live experience of the arty Parisian city of “elle” would be the most preferable – especially if we do combine the semiotic and the sensorial ratio of this artefact, experienced on YouTube, into an index, an icon, and a symbol of the atmospheres of Paris – and in doing so: echoing another famous YSL fragrance.
REFERENCES

http://www.stevenconnor.com/5senses.htm

Contemporary Aesthetics Vol. 4
http://quod.lib.umich.edu/c/ca/7523862.0004.008?rgn=main;view=fulltext


EXAMPLE

Yves Saint Laurent – Elle – Coco Rocha
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xTWmUItM01c&feature=grec_index, read June 30, 2012
Analytical problems
ANNA PULKKIS

THE ALLURE OF THE NORTH: TONAL STRUCTURE AND TEXT IN SIBELIUS’S “NORDEN”

Jean Sibelius (1865–1957) composed nearly one hundred songs for solo voice and piano.¹ The songs involve a wide variety of compositional techniques and expressive devices. This variety, together with Sibelius’s dedication to the expression of the poetic texts, has been acknowledged in the literature.² A less discussed issue is, however, that many compositional choices in the songs reflect Sibelius’s profound awareness of Late-Romantic tonal practice. The songs seek diverse paths out of classical diatonic tonality and its principles concerning harmonic functions and dissonance treatment. Most importantly regarding this article, many songs challenge the monotonal principle whereby the background structure is controlled by a single tonic; instead, their structures are based on interaction and tension between two or more equally significant tonal centers. Such “alternatives to monotonality” include directional tonality (proceeding from one center to another) and tonal pairing (two centers in juxtaposition or alternation) and appear in the music of, e.g., Schubert, Wagner, and Liszt.³

This article focuses on tonal structure and its relation to the poetic text in Sibelius’s song “Norden” (The North). Completed by December 1917, “Norden” became the first number in Sibelius’s last collection of songs, the Six songs with texts of Johan Ludvig Runeberg Op. 90. I read the structure of “Norden” as an example of alternatives to monotonality. Proceeding from the initial tonal center $A$ to the final tonal center $C$ as well as from obscurity to clarity, the structure is basically directional, although the interaction between the centers also appears complex and ambiguous. I also suggest that the structure may be associated with the ideas of longing and journey central to Runeberg’s poem. I begin with an analysis of the tonal structure of “Norden” and proceed to considerations on the relationship between music and text. I illustrate my analysis with an adapted Schenkerian graph, in which the monotonal fundamental structure is replaced with a more variable approach.

¹ For critically edited scores of Sibelius’s solo songs with piano, and for information on their genesis, publication history, and early performances, see Tiilikainen 1998–2005.
² An overview is provided in Sirén 1996.
Some special characteristics regarding texture and harmony render “Norden” unique among Sibelius’s songs and contribute to my interpretation of its structure. First, there are two distinct layers of texture: the piano maintains a homophonic syncopated texture, while the voice melody hovers above the chords in wide arches embellished with melismas. Second, the register of the piano part is restricted and the harmonies exceptionally dissonant in the context of Sibelius’s songs. For the first 27 bars out of 31, all harmonies include four (or five) tones, and for the first 22 bars, the chord tones are within the $c^1$ and $c^2$ range. The harmonies become more consonant towards the end of the song, especially when the register descends from b. 23 on. The first consonant triad appears in b. 27, and the final tonic is the only root-position triad in the song. Example 1, bb. 1–5 of “Norden” illustrates the two textural layers as well as the dissonant opening harmonies within the $c^1$–$c^2$ frame.

**Example 1 Bars 1–5 of “Norden”**

© Fennica Gehrman Oy, Helsinki.
Printed by permission
Figure 1 shows an overview of the form, tonal centers, and most significant harmonic events in “Norden.” The form may be described as AA’ (preceded by a one-bar introduction) and resembles a modulating period. The A (bb. 2–16) and A’ (bb. 17–31) sections begin (almost) identically. The A section concludes on the dominant of A minor (sufficiently implying a half cadence), and the A’ section modulates to C major. Simultaneously with the two-part form, the directional tonal structure proceeds from A to C, with tonal focus shifting from A towards C halfway in the A’ section. As a source of ambiguity, however, the c\textsuperscript{1}–c\textsuperscript{2} frame foreshadows C from the beginning. From the viewpoint of classical harmonic syntax, the final cadence indisputably confirms C as the final tonic, but the role of A seems vaguer. In the beginning of the song (see example 1), the harmonies allude to tonic and dominant functions in A minor, but the “tonics” (bb. 1–2, 4) appear to be in first inversion and include an extra tone (d\textsuperscript{#1}), and the “dominants” (bb. 3, 5) consist of the tones d\textsuperscript{1}–f\textsuperscript{1}–g\textsuperscript{#1} set inside the c\textsuperscript{1}–c\textsuperscript{2} frame (importantly regarding the directional process, the A’ section begins with a less dissonant “tonic” harmony, including f\textsuperscript{#1} instead of d\textsuperscript{#1}). In the “tonics,” the tone d\textsuperscript{#1} appears first and foremost as a color element, while its contrapuntal role remains local and somewhat indeterminate (cf., e.g., bb. 2–3 and 6–7). Also the question of the “right” enharmonic spelling of the tone (d\textsuperscript{#1}/e\textsuperscript{b1}) remains unclear; in all, Sibelius uses both d\textsuperscript{#1} and e\textsuperscript{b1} in the song, partly followed by regular resolutions. Enharmonic equivalence plays a more important role in the “dominant” harmonics, which associate, as sonorities, with the half-diminished seventh chord D–F–A\textsuperscript{b}–C. The tone g\textsuperscript{#1}, however, always resolves upwards to a\textsuperscript{1}. Sibelius frequently uses other ways than dominant–tonic progressions to establish tonal centers in his songs. In “Norden,” the voice melody acts as a crucial indicator of tonal center. The entire melody is based on two overlapping pentachords built on a\textsuperscript{1} and c\textsuperscript{2}, which appear both separately and merged to a stack of three thirds. In the beginning of the song, the melody outlines an A minor pentachord and unambiguously suggests A as the center.
**Figure 1** Form, tonal centers, and most significant harmonic events in “Norden.” Tonal centers are considered as pitches without reference to the mode of the tonal network around them; by the harmonic events, lower case indicates minor and upper case, major.

Example 2 provides a more detailed view of the tonal structure. On the upper staff, the voice melody shows a prolongation of $e^2$, structured by a drop to $e^1$ by the interruption in b. 16. The lowermost line, provided by the piano part, prolongs $C$. Because of the static $c^1$-$c^2$ frame, no actual bass line appears in bb. 1–23; the frame also remains unaffected by the interruption. Between these prolongations, the inner voice shows a descent from $a^1$ (bb. 1–23) to $g^1$ (bb. 27–31). Neighboring $g^1$s (and $b^1$s) prolong $a^1$ in bb. 1–23; the leading tones act as important indicators of $A$ as the tonal center. The pivotal point in the structure, bar 23, redirects the tonal focus towards $C$. The inner voice proceeds from $g^1$ to $a^1$ for the last time. Simultaneously, the frame breaks as $c^1$ activates and begins a stepwise bass descent. The tone $e$ in b. 27 serves as the bass tone of a first-inversion C major chord, which stands out as the first consonant triad and also marks the arrival on $g^1$ in the inner voice. Because $g^1$ originates from a stepwise inner-voice descent from the upper frame tone $c^2$ (bb. 25–27), it lacks a direct contrapuntal connection to $a^1$ prolonged earlier (as mentioned before, $g^1$ never functions as its enharmonic equivalent $a^b^1$, which would resolve to $g^1$). Acting as C:$I^6$, the chord in b. 27 launches the cadential progression II$^7$–V–I, with falling fifths in the bass. The C major conclusion realizes the insistent allusions to $C$ created by the $c^1$-$c^2$ frame. Also other events in the music foreshadow $C$ major. Tonal focus temporarily shifts towards $C$ for bb. 7–8 and 21–22, as the voice melody outlines a C minor pentachord with vague support from the harmonies (note how

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BB.</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2–16</th>
<th>17–31</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SECTION</td>
<td>Piano introduction</td>
<td>$A$</td>
<td>$A'$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TONAL CENTER</td>
<td>$A$ ($C$ foreshadowed --)</td>
<td>$A$</td>
<td>$A \rightarrow C$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HARMONIC EVENTS</td>
<td>a: “I” ($d^1$)</td>
<td>a: “I” ($d^1$) → “V”</td>
<td>a: “I$^6$” ($f^1$) → C: V–I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

4 Another possibility would be to read a stepwise bass descent $E$–$D$–$C$ in bb. 27–31, and to interpret the bass tone $G$ as an embellishing element above $D$. However, I prefer to highlight the fifth progression in the bass.
c₁–e₂–c₂–a₂ outlined in the melody becomes a vertical harmony in b. 8). In minor mode, these digressions do not too literally anticipate C major but enable the juxtaposition of similar melodic fragments in C minor and A minor, suggesting tonal pairing.⁵ The wide melodic arch in bb. 10–16, which culminates on g² in b. 13, shows the C major pentachord rather as merged into an a¹-based stack of thirds than as an independent pentachord on c². The same is true of the corresponding arch in bb. 23–29, which has contributed to my interpretation of no structural upper-voice descent from e² to c² in bb. 27–29.⁶ Moreover, c₂ in b. 29 is a dissonant tone over II⁷, and g¹ becomes the uppermost voice in the final tonic chord.⁷

Example 2 Middleground voice leading of “Norden”

⁵ On a “list of ways in which tonal pairing is commonly manifested in musical surfaces,” Christopher Lewis mentions “juxtaposition of musical fragments implying the two tonics in succession or alteration” (Lewis 1984:6).

⁶ Although g² in b. 26 is emphasized by f, I interpret it as an upper third above e², which in turn gets consonant support from C: I⁶.

⁷ A rhythmical displacement would be technically possible but counterintuitive. In Sibelius’s songs, the piano occasionally completes the cadence alone; another example of the voice melody ending on a predominant harmony is found in “Soluppgång” (Op. 37 No. 3).
Example 3 reduces the contrapuntal structure shown in example 2 to two 6–5-related triads on C. The reduction highlights the common tones (C and E) as well as the voice-leading proximity of the initial and final tonic triads (with the initial layered and dissonant situation simplified to a consonant triad). In his songs, Sibelius frequently pairs 6–5-related triads – (potential) tonics of relative keys – above a stationary bass. Such shift of focus from the acoustic properties of triads to their common-tone and voice-leading properties calls for a reassessment of classical ideas of stability among triadic inversions. The hierarchy between the first-inversion and root-position tonic triads depends much on the context; when the bass fails to indicate tonal center, other factors (as the voice melody in “Norden”) contribute. Sibelius seems to deliberately cherish the ambiguity created by the fact that a first-inversion minor tonic rests on the root of the tonic of its relative minor. In “Norden,” the $c^1$-$c^2$ frame acts as a source of such ambiguity, which also may be seen as a simultaneous type of tonal pairing. In the overall structure of “Norden,” however, a contrapuntal gap appears between the initial and final tonics. The inner-voice prolongation of $a^1$ ceases in b. 23 without proceeding to $g^1$, and reaching the root-position major tonic requires a breakdown of the $c^1$-$c^2$ frame. Sibelius does not treat the initial A-minor tonic as a function in C major; although rhetorically emphatic, the final C-major tonic is unable to control the entire structure. Finally, the directionally tonal structure is accompanied with and underlined by several other goal-oriented processes. The dynamic level steadily grows from piano ma poco a poco meno al in b. 1 to poco forte in b. 26 and further to forte in the penultimate bar 30. The harmonies grow more consonant beginning from the “softened” tonic chord in b. 17, and the register descends from b. 23 on. In all, the music proceeds from the chromatic and more ambiguous realm of “A minor” to the unambiguous, diatonic, and functional realm of C major. The voice melody is able to enter both worlds, but unable to take part in the tonal conclusion.

---

8 See, e.g., “Demanten på marssnön” (Op. 36 No. 6) and “Im Feld ein Mädchen Singt” (Op. 50 No. 3).
9 An approach to triadic harmony as detached from diatony, with emphasis on common-tone and voice-leading properties and drawing from Neo-Riemannian theories, is summarized and called pan-triadic in Cohn 2012. From the pan-triadic perspective, consonant triads are minimal perturbations of the perfectly even augmented triad, a property, which Sibelius sounds in his trademark 5–#5–6 progressions above a stationary bass. Half-diminished and dominant seventh chords, in turn, are minimal perturbations of the fully diminished seventh chord. The harmonies in the piano part of “Norden” represent (with the first “tonics” as notable exceptions) minimal perturbations of $G\#-B-D-F$ and $F\#-A-C-E\flat$.
10 I thus exclude the possibility of a monotonal reading where a prolonged VI of C major (a substitute for C: I) finds its way via V to I.
Example 3 Relation of the initial and final tonics

Johan Ludvig Runeberg’s (1804–1877) poem “Norden” (1833) belongs to his second cycle of *Idyll och epigram* (Idylls and epigrams), which are lyrical poems inspired by Serbian folk poetry. Sibelius likely used as his text source an edition which appeared in print in 1882 as part of *Johan Ludvig Runebergs samlade skrifter* [I].

“Norden” belongs to Runeberg’s many nature-inspired poems, where nature has an allegoric function and the nature imagery serves to symbolize human emotions and conditions. In the first strophe, a protagonist (whose age and gender is not specified) describes a flock of whooper swans (*Cygnus cygnus*) migrating South, when winter approaches and the lakes freeze in their Northern nesting sites. Instead of rejoicing in the pleasures of the South, however, the swans already long back to the North. In the second strophe, a resident of the South – a second protagonist imagined by the first protagonist – sees the swans “from the palm tree’s shade” and wonders what kind of a magic might lie in the North – “he who yearns from the South, his yearning seeks a heaven.”

The swan was a recurrent theme – almost a trademark symbol – in Runeberg’s poetry. Teivas Oksala has pointed out that “Norden” is extremely unconventional among the many Finnish poems about migratory birds. Typically in such poems, the birds sadly leave in the fall but are expected back in the spring as a consolation. “Norden,” however, approaches the subject more profoundly, and the longing expressed by the swans “reflects the transcendental longing of the Northern people.” “North” and “South” become more than mere geographical sites. The first protagonist watches the swans leave from the real North and pictures them arriving to the South, which thus is an imaginary place. The second protagonist –

---

11 Runeberg became acquainted with Serbian folk poetry when he translated Paul von Goetze’s collection of *Serbische Volkslieder* from German to Swedish in 1830.
12 Tiilikainen 2000.
13 Citated translations originate from the leaflet of the “Songs” box in the BIS complete edition of Sibelius recordings; the leaflet fails to mention the name of the translator.
14 Oksala 2004:46.
pictured by the first protagonist — then travels in his mind to an imaginary North. Reduced to the essentials, the entire journey takes place in the mind of the first protagonist and reflects a longing for an imaginary paradise, which resembles heaven or the Platonic world of ideas. Simultaneously, the real north becomes depicted as heaven on earth.

Acknowledging Sibelius’s love for whooper swans, he must have felt affinity with the text. Sibelius frequently wrote down his observations of swans, cranes, and wild geese in his diary, as he did on 23 November 1917, only a couple of weeks before completing “Norden”: “[I] saw a swan today. It was rocking on the waves at the edge of the ice.” In Sibelius’s setting of “Norden,” the A and A’ sections in the music correspond with the two strophes of the poem. The music reflects the nature imagery in terms of tone painting. The crisp dissonances in the piano part associate with the frozen Northern landscape depicted in the poem, and the calm contours of the voice melody associate with the swans “sailing” (“seglen”) across the sky. The association is even spatial: the voice melody soars above the piano’s landscape. Tawaststjerna (1978), however, associates the syncopated rhythm in the piano part with the strokes of the wings of the swans. Also mentioned by Tawaststjerna, the lamentative character of the voice melody reflects the idea of longing. Oksala aptly points out how the words “längtande” (“yearning”) and “långtar” (“yearns”) fall on the s which culminate the voice melody in bb. 13 and 26. As powerful rhetoric figures, the melody’s lingering chromatic descents from these high points further emphasize the essential words.

At a deeper level, the directional tonal structure — and the other goal-oriented processes accompanying it — captures the poem’s central ideas of journey and a desire for reaching a destination. The real North described in the beginning of the poem associates with the dissonant and elegiac A minor in the beginning of the song. When the second protagonist begins to speak in the beginning of the A’ section, the softened dissonances and a dolce instruction for the singer signal that a move away from the real North is taking place in the protagonist’s imagination. In b. 23, when a is abandoned in the inner voice, the real North as a destination becomes irreversibly replaced by the paradise-like imaginary North. The subsequent gap in

15 For Runeberg’s relation to the legacy of ancient Greece and Rome, see Oksala 2004.
17 Tawaststjerna 1978:247.
18 Oksala 2004:47.
the contrapuntal structure, however, suggests that the two Norths do not exist in the same reality. The \( c^1 - c^2 \) frame, which in the beginning of the song gave a silver lining to the picture of the Northern home, begins its transformation to a sharper image of the paradise. By the poem’s last word “himmel” (“heaven”), the voice melody reaches \( c^2 \), but the destination of the tonal structure – the C-major tonic – is reached in the next bar by the piano alone. By this setting, Sibelius suggests that the paradise remains (at least for the time being) unattainable for the protagonist.
REFERENCES


Timo Virtanen

A JIGSAW PUZZLE WITHOUT A PICTURE: JEAN SIBELIUS’S LATE SKETCHES AND THE EIGHTH SYMPHONY

The compositional process of Jean Sibelius’s Eighth Symphony and the destiny of the musical manuscript material for the work have inspired much speculation, guessing and fiction. In the literature, the subject has been discussed or referred to mainly in the light of the composer’s correspondence or other written documentation.1 Even though Sibelius is thought to have destroyed all musical manuscript material connected to the Symphony’s compositional process, it has also been discussed whether sketches, fragments, or other material might be found among the composer’s surviving manuscripts.2 The discussion has led to opposing conclusions (italics added):

(1) Given the abundance of preserved materials for this work [Eighth Symphony], one looks forward with great anticipation to a thoughtful, meticulous completion of the entire composition. […] A painstaking, conscientious undertaking would restore at least part of Sibelius’s ultimate musical legacy[…] (Josephson 2004:67)

(2) All that remains of the 8th Symphony is one page from a draft score and one snatch of melody ringed for the 8th in among the sketches for the 7th Symphony […] Also in the Helsinki University Library are some unidentified sketches dating from the late 1920s and the 1930s. In particular some of the sketches akin to the ringed melody in G minor […] in 6/8 and 2/4 time could be for the 8th symphony. (Kilpeläinen 1995:35) 3

The statements demonstrate the ambiguity of the subject of the research: how to build a jigsaw puzzle when there is no model picture and we do not even know whether the pieces belong to the one and the same picture?4 In this article I shall

1 The most extensive discussion of the “mystery” of the Eighth Symphony is found in Tawaststjerna 1985.
2 In addition to the views presented in the following, see Dahlström 2003:624. That the Eighth Symphony has got its own number (JS 190) in the catalogue of Sibelius’s works by Dahlström probably refers to the perception that the Symphony was at some point complete. Cf. also Kilpeläinen 1989:30: “[f]inally the work was completed, probably in 1938 […]”
3 Cf. also Kilpeläinen 1989:32: “[i]n addition [to the two above-mentioned sketches] there is other material: unidentified sketches and one score page that may be connected with the 8th Symphony.” Further Kilpeläinen 1992:156: “If the compositional process [of the 8th Symphony] lasted over ten years [1927–38], Sibelius must have written numerous sketches for the work. According to Levas there has been plenty of them. Thus, obviously many of the late sketches are for the 8th Symphony, even though Sibelius probably destroyed the majority of the material connected to the work.”
4 As Kilpeläinen (1989:32) puts it: “[t]he problem is that the object of comparison is missing, that is, we do not know what kind of a work it was question about.”
examine the opinions on the sketches for Sibelius’s Eighth Symphony given in the literature and offer some complementary and alternative interpretations of the observations. Because the mentions about the Eighth Symphony in Sibelius’s correspondence and other biographical sources have been discussed rather thoroughly in the previous literature, in this article they have only been referred to occasionally.

**Sibelius’s Late Manuscript Materials: An Overview**

In Sibelius’s biographical sources there are numerous mentions about the Eighth Symphony, but no information about his possible other plans for extensive works from the period following the Seventh Symphony (1924), the incidental music *Stormen* (“The Tempest,” 1925), and the tone poem *Tapiola* (1926). In his Sibelius manuscript catalogue, Kari Kilpeläinen has estimated altogether 76 manuscript units to be dated to the years after the Seventh Symphony (1925–1957) and including sketches for unidentified works (*Unidentified Fragments and Sketches*) (Kilpeläinen 1991:371–418). From these, eight units have been listed in the catalogue under the heading *Fragments and Sketches with Sights of Orchestral Purpose* and five under the heading *Fragments and Sketches with Sights of Vocal Purpose*. The largest number of the manuscripts has been placed in the category X (*Fragments and Sketches Instrumentation and Use Unknown*). 63 manuscript units belong to this category. The summary above is for the survey of the late sketches only approximate and given in order to exemplify the scale of the materials; it is to be noted that the number of sketch pages and individual sketches within the manuscript units varies largely: a manuscript can include only a single folio with a short fragment notated on either of the sides or consist of tens of tightly filled sketch pages.

According to Kilpeläinen, among Sibelius’s musical manuscripts from the late 1920s and from the 1930s there might very well be sketches for the Eighth Symphony, but for sure can be only said that “all that is left from the Eighth Symphony” is “one page of score draft” and “one snatch of melody among the sketches for the Seventh Symphony.” In his article from 2004, Nors S. Josephson also discussed these manuscripts. The manuscript including the score draft (0421)

---

5 As a general view of Sibelius’s completed works and arrangements after *Tapiola* (1926), see Dahlström 2003: 679. That the Eighth Symphony has its own catalogue number (JS 190) in Dahlström’s catalogue probably implies that the symphony is supposed to be a completed work. Cf. also Kilpeläinen 1989:30: “[…] the work however was completed, probably in 1938 […]”

6 Cf. also Dahlström 2003:661. The italized numbers refer to the signums given by Kilpeläinen the catalogue.
consists of one loose folio. On one side of the folio Sibelius has pencilled the words *Sinfonia VIII* and *Commincio* (“beginning”). Later he erased the words, but they still are clearly visible. On the reverse side, the pencilled score fragment consists of two easily legible measures written for oboes, bassoons, horns, violas, cellos, and double basses, as well as a couple of (possibly three) much more tentatively notated measures for woodwinds and horns (see Example 1). There is no key signature, but the signature of two flats can be deduced. Most probably the fragment does not represent a beginning of any work or movement (in spite of the word “commincio” on the reverse side): this is evident from the slurs visible on the oboe and bassoon staves, which are continuation for slurs beginning on a previous page (today lost), and this is also supported by the pagination 10 visible on the page. Assuming that the sketch is connected with the Eighth Symphony is probably due to the verbal hint looming on the reverse side of the folio (*Sinfonia VIII | Commincio*) and the handwriting, which reveals that the score fragment must be from Sibelius’s late years. In the light of this single manuscript witness there is no other ground for such assumption.

The “ringed snatch of melody” among sketches for the Seventh Symphony, mentioned by Kilpeläinen (and also discussed by Josephson), can be found in manuscript 0362, page [2]. On p. [2] of the manuscript there is a fragment written in black ink (Example 2). This fragment has been divided into parts by circling it and with annotations *II temat* (“second theme”) and *Trio*. With the exception of the passage annotated “trio,” the ideas in the fragment are familiar from the Seventh Symphony (mm. 134ff.). The “trio material” and the measures preceding it are underlined with strong lines and an annotation *obs* (“observe!”) in green pencil. Also, the fragment has been separated from the surrounding materials by circling and annotating it with *VIII* in lead pencil. Probably this has led the writers to assume that the “trio material” thus has been taken off, to be placed later in the Eighth Symphony.

---

7 For a facsimile picture of the page, see Tawaststjerna 1997:297.
8 Kilpeläinen (1991:73) does not give any estimation for the date of the manuscript.
9 Kilpeläinen 1989:32: “This thematic sketch in ink dates approximately from the years 1915–1917 […] Later, obviously when Sibelius went through his sketches in connection with the composition of the 7th Symphony and noticing the possibilities of the theme in question in the new symphony, he ringed it and cast it with number VIII.” Josephson (2004:54) states that “[t]he sketch is of a scherzo’s trio cast in a 6/8 dance meter and a G-dorian modality; a clear upper indication, VIII, points to the future Eighth Symphony.” In Example 1 of Josephson’s article the annotations have been placed, unlike in the manuscript, so that at the beginning of the Trio passage stands “VIII Trio.” This is somewhat misleading: “VIII Trio” is probably easier to understand as the “Trio of the Eighth” than the annotation in the original manuscript.
Example 1. 0421, page [2].
It is, however, hazardous to claim that *Trio* and the pencilled annotation *VIII* would specifically refer to the Eighth Symphony and to a trio of its supposed scherzo movement. More likely it the “second theme” (*II temat*) among the materials appearing in the Seventh Symphony has got the “Trio” as its pair. The pencilled, probably later markings could refer to a new placement of the “Trio” material within the compositional plan and could probably be understood only in connection with other sketches: Roman and Arabic numerals, as well as alphabets in the sketches for the Sixth and Seventh Symphonies as well as other works by Sibelius most often seem to refer to materials (“motives,” and the like), formal units, or passages and their order within the compositions, as can be seen in Examples 3a, 3b, and 3c.
Example 3a. *1739a* [20], staves 7–10; sketches for an unidentified composition.

Example 3b. *0390* [2]; sketches for the Sixth and Seventh Symphony.
Example 3c. 0387 [1a], staves 1–3; sketches for the Seventh Symphony under the text and on the reverse side of the folio.

In manuscript 0387 [1a] the Roman numerals possibly refer to “runes” of a work planned for orchestra (and voice[s]?): the word orkester is visible in the top left corner of the folio, and below the words I serien (?) (i form af en symfoni), Runorna I[,] II[,] III[,] IV, and II seri[en?] Runorna V[,] VI[,] VIII Epilog [?], “1st series [?] (in a form of a symphony), Runes I, II, III, IV” and “2nd series [?] V, VI, VIII Epilogue [?].”

To sum up, the annotation VIII does not at all unambiguously refer to the Eighth Symphony. The fragment possibly features a transition to a “Trio.” It is also be noted that in manuscript 0362 Sibelius did not precisely highlight in lead and color pencil lines only the “Trio” material, but the fragment annotated with obs and underlined seems to outline some kind of a transition from the “second theme” to the “Trio,” and the pencilled passage preceding the “Trio” could represent a continuation for the “second theme” (see Example 2b). Perhaps Sibelius intended this fragment to be an eighth piece – or maybe a bridge to the eighth piece – in the mosaic of the Seventh Symphony or some of its sections. That the “trio material” did after all not appear in the Seventh Symphony (or apparently in any other work) is in Sibelius’s case not in the least exceptional.¹⁰

¹⁰ That Sibelius would have in his sketches for a certain work showed a plan to transmit materials to another work would be exceptional – I do not know a single indication of that kind. In all, it is possible that the fragment at some point belonged to the plans for the Eighth Symphony, but the sketches do not offer further information about this possibility, and the ideas included in the fragment have not been detected, at least yet, in other manuscripts.
The "Commincio" Sketches

Although neither of the sketches discussed above is unequivocally connected with the Eighth Symphony, in the light of other surviving sketches there are reasons to return to manuscript 0421. The erased but still visible word "commincio" in manuscript 0421 appears twice on manuscript page 1747 [1a] (Example 4a). Both times the annotation is connected with a sketch (without clef or key signature, which can be deduced from later context and other sketches containing corresponding material) beginning with a melodic progression f2–g2–c2–d2 (the clef and the key of the sketches can be deduced from the later material and other sketches containing corresponding materials). This four-note progression is parallel with the progression A flat–B flat–E flat–F that appears in manuscript 0421 in the cellos, doublebasses and violas (see Example 1). In the first time on manuscript page 1747 [1a], the idea is followed by a broken-chord passage d1–b flat1–g1–d2, a neighbor-note idea d–c–c–d, and finally the same progression f–g–b flat which could be seen in manuscript 0421. After three or four hardly readable measures follows a passage probably in 6/8 metre and in G minor (see Example 4b).11 In the second "Commincio" sketch of the page there is no neighbor-note idea or broken-chord passage, but the 6/8 passage follows the opening measures immediately (m. 5 of the sketch; see Example 4a). As mentioned, the orchestral score draft on the reverse side of the "Commincio" annotation in manuscript 0421 does not represent a fragment from a beginning of a composition. However the "Commincio" sketches in manuscript 1747 [1a] seem to outline a beginning of some kind of a whole.12

---

11 Even though the first measures in the sketches seem to contain whole notes (and the meter would thus most probably be 4/4 or 2/2), the 6/8 metre could be – and I believe it also probably is – in effect right from the beginning: in his tentative sketches Sibelius often wrote notes lasting whole measures as whole notes regardless of time signature, and rhythmic details in general only indicatively.

12 Josephson (2004:63) includes manuscript 1747 [1a] to the sources connected to the Scherzo of the Eighth Symphony, but does not mention the connection between the "Commincio" sketches and manuscript 0421.
Example 4a. 1747 [1a], staves 11–20.

Example 4b. 1747 [1a], staff 12 (clef, key, and time signature added).

The idea built on seconds and a fifth in manuscripts 0421 and 1747 is parallel with an idea appearing on manuscript page 1327 [1], on staff 5 (staff 2 in Example 4a). This pencilled sketch in (aiolic) G minor and in 4/4 or 2/2 metre (ca. 20 measures?). The shape of the idea – long note following descending fifth and ascending second – is comparable with the four-note progression in the draft 0421. In 1327 [1] the opening idea is followed by the same arpeggiated ascent d–b flat–g–d and neighbour-note figure d–c–c–d which are present in the first “Commencio” sketch of
manuscript 1747 (Examples 5a and 5b). The relationship between the opening ideas in manuscripts 0421, 1747 [1a], and 1327 [1] is illustrated in Example 5c.

Example 5a. 1327 [1], staves 4–10

Example 5b. 1327 [1], staff 5, mm. 1–5 (clef, key, and time signature added)

Example 5c. Comparison between the opening ideas in manuscripts 0421, 1747 [1a], and 1327 [1]
Another sketch notated on staves 9 and 10 on manuscript page 1327 [1] (18 measures), is equally cast with G minor, but presumably in 6/8 metre (Example 4a). The material between the two “X”s also appears in the fragment notated on the four last staves on the page (cf. Example 4d) and in the “Commencio” sketches of manuscript page 1747 [1a].

This third and last sketch on the page (43 measures) the melodic progressions are for the most part the same than in the previous sketch (Example 5d). Within the passage there is one reference to instrumentation: Piz[z.], a chord to be plucked by string instruments.

Example 5d. 1327 [1], staves 11–14.

On the reverse side of the single folio of this manuscript there is a draft containing references to instrumentation right from the beginning (Example 5e): Cor. (m. 1), Cl. and Fg. (m. 5), Ob. and Ob. II (m. 9). Also this draft is in G minor and in 6/8 metre, and the melodic progressions parallel with those on the reverse side of the folio. Within the progressions notated for woodwinds occurs the pizzicato chord that appeared in the sketch on the reverse side. This draft probably outlines a passage from beginning of a work or a movement, because Sibelius has written the tempo and metronome indications at the top of the page.
The passages described above in 6/8 and sometimes also 6/4 metre can be found in several other manuscript pages. Josephson mentions these sketches as belonging to the “Scherzo” of the Eighth Symphony. Considering the instrumental references in manuscript 1327, and the chain of sketches leading via manuscript 1747 to the score draft 0421, connecting the materials with the Eighth Symphony seems plausible.
Surprisingly, in the literature there has been no discussion about two surviving orchestral score fragments and four sketches containing references to instrumentation which could be connected to the Eighth Symphony. These are (the two drafts of manuscript 1327 discussed above included):

1325 A score draft in lead pencil, with markings in blue and red pencil (Examples 7a and 7b). One folio folded horizontally, recto blank: 33 measures, with 10 opening measures crossed out and written again in a revised form. Key signature two flats, meter 4/4. Instrumentation: Fl., Ob., Cl. [in B], Bcl. [in B], Fg., Corni F, Timp., V[iolino] I, II, A[lt], C[ello], B[asso]. The date given in Kilpeläinen catalogue is 1924–1930.14

1326 Two pencilled score fragments. One folio, with notation on both sides; pagination 9 and [10]. Page [10]: Sibelius’s arrangement of Romans, Op. 24, No. 2, fragment.

Page 9 (Example 6): faircopied (?) page of orchestral score; 5 measures, the key signature of mm. 1–3, two flats, concluded from the accidentals, time signature in these measures presumably 2/4. In m. 4 the key signature changes to one flat, and the time signature to 2/2, with indication Tempo I:mo. Instrumentation probably 2 Fl., 2 Ob., 2 Cl. in B, Cl. basso in B, 2 Fg., 4 Cor. in E, 2 (?) Tr. (in ?), 3 (?) Tbn., Timp. and archi.

1327 [1] Third sketch on the page, notated in lead pencil and highlighted in red pencil, (Example 5c): 43 measures; key signature, two flats, can be deduced from the previous sketch (Example 5a) containing parallel material. Time signature presumably 6/8. Reference to instrumentation: Piz[z.] in m. 35.

13 With the exception of the first, Kilpeläinen (1991:376) has given the date 1930–57 for the manuscripts in the list.

14 The pencilled markings at the top right corner of the page probably refer to sums of money: Rm [Reichsmark] 4690 and Fm [Finnische Mark] 15860. No further information about the sums has been found.
1327 [2]  Pencilled draft on two to four staves (Example 5e). 53 (?) measures, key signature two flats, time signature 6/8, tempo indication All. mod., dotted half note = circa 100. References to instrumentation: Cor. and corno, cl., Fg., ob. and ob. II, Fl., and Piz.[.]

1328 [2]  Two pencilled sketches on two staves. First, 14 measures, key signature, two flats, as well as time signature, 6/4, can be deduced. Second, 57 measures, key signature two flats, time signature 6/4. Reference to instrumentation, Trä (”woodwinds”).


**On the orchestral fragments**

In the following, three of the fragments are discussed individually. These are the score fragment 1326 (p. 9), the draft containing references to instrumentation 1327 [2], and the score draft 1325.

1326, p. 9

Manuscript 1326, p. 9, is quite detailed and carefully (fair)copied score page (Example 6). The pagination (9) may indicate that the fragment has been cut off from opening section of a work or movement. The musical material of the fragment is not directly related with any other late sketch or manuscript.
The continuity draft with instrumental references belongs to a group of sketches containing similar kind of musical material (cf. manuscripts 1327 [1], 1328 [1, 2], and 1329 [1–3, 4]). 1327 [2] has been chosen to represent this group, because it is the most extensive of the sketches and includes all the material appearing in the
other fragments and more instrumental references – thus, it could be suspected that this fragment later in chronology than the others.

Presumably the fragment represents the beginning of a work or a movement, perhaps with a scherzo character. In the draft Sibelius has even indicated the tempo and metronome markings. The draft is for the most part notated on two staves, but this two-staff base has occasionally been completed with one, two, or three staves (see Example 5e).

The music outlined in the fragment is characterized by the pedal tone G in the horns, and the pastoral-like phrases in the oboes and other woodwinds. The harmony is flavored by striking dissonances: the third D flat–f appears above the pedal tone G (Example 5e, staves 6 and 7, m. 2) and the second C–D occurring below the fifth G flat–D flat in the oboes (the fifth and the sixth lowest staves, four last measures). Also the pizzicato B-major chord with the following duplet passage is a surprising turn in the G-minor context.

As mentioned, the material outlined in the draft has its connection through the sketches on the reverse side of the folio (see Examples 5a and 5d) and the “Commincio” sketches on manuscript 1747 (Example 4a) to the material in score draft 0421 (Example 1).

1325

Manuscript 1325 is the most extensive of the score fragments (Examples 7a and 7b). The fragment most probably features a beginning of a work or a movement. There is no tempo indication, but a metronome marking quarter note = 96– has been written in the top left corner of the page (an earlier marking 80–, has been crossed out). In places the handwriting is very unclear, but many of the ambiguous notes, accidentals, and passages in some instruments can be deduced from doubling parts. In the fragment, Sibelius has crossed out the opening passage, ten measures, in blue pencil. The passage wavers between B flat major and G minor, and occasionally there can be heard chromatic and startling dissonant harmonic turns. To mention some, in mm. 1–3, above the B flat of the timpani there is built a triad C–A–D (m. 1), then, in mm. 2 and 3, likewise a three-note sonority A–F–B flat. Perhaps even more striking is the simultaneousness of the fifth E–B (in the bassoons, horns, and cellos) and the fourth E flat–A flat/fifth E flat–B flat in the flutes and violas in m. 7, as well as mm. 8–10, where a fourth D flat–G flat in the flutes and violas is juxtaposed with the G-minor chord in the rest of the orchestra.
From m. 11 onwards Sibelius seems to have outlined the opening again, for instance, registraly re-arranged, but in many respects more tentatively than in the original opening. The opening gesture in the timpani, the tempo, and other characteristics of the fragment persuade to suspect that it is question of a draft for an opening of a large-scale work or movement. Is this an outline for the beginning of (the first movement of) a symphony?

At the first glance, the material appearing in manuscript 1325 does not seem to have connection with other sketches and fragments. Certain details are worthy of remark, however. At the latter half of the draft, the (sounding) second C–D is built in the same manner than the second in the bassoons and with the same pitches in manuscript 1327 [2], and in both manuscripts against this second there is juxtaposed the fifth G flat–D flat in the oboes (see Example 7c). If manuscript 1325 represents a beginning of a work, it could be understood as containing elements, which appear in a more continuous context in the “pastoral scherzando music” in manuscript 1327 [2].

Example 7a. 1325, upper part of the folio, staves 1–15.
Example 7b. *I325*, lower part of the folio, staves 21–36.

Example 7c. Comparison between manuscripts *I327 [2]* and *I325*.

**Conclusion**

The manuscript materials that have survived from Sibelius later years are quite extensive. A special challenge for the sketch study is put by the composer’s often very unclear handwriting and the lack of reference materials in completed scores from the period of the “silence of Järvenpää.” The extent of the late manuscripts reveals that Sibelius did not give up composing and that the Eighth Symphony probably was not
the only compositional plan and uncompleted and rejected work after *The Tempest* and *Tapiola*. The future research will doubtlessly open new perspectives to Sibelius’s latest production and stylistic development from the late 1920s to 1930s and 1940s.

The most thrilling enigma in Sibelius career as composer in the late years is the fate of the Eighth Symphony. Because the Symphony never appeared in the publicity as a finished work, the assumptions concerning the work and possible manuscripts connected to it will remain assumptions. However, even single fragments from Sibelius’s late years survived among his musical manuscripts, whether they originally were connected to the Symphony or not, as such are highly fascinating witnesses of his musical thinking and imagination, and may give some hint of his stylistic orientation after his last completed masterworks.
REFERENCES


Sibelius composed during 1888–1889 six original choral works: four works, *Ensam i dunkla skogarnas fann* (JS 72), *Hur blekt är allt* (JS 96), *När sig våren åter föder* (JS 139), and *Tanke, se, hur fågeln svingar* (JS 191) are written for mixed choir a cappella and two works are written for choir with piano accompaniment. Of the piano-accompanied works, *Upp genom luften* (JS 213) is written for mixed choir and *Vi kysser du fader min fästmö här* (JS 218) for female choir. Very little is known of the origins of these early choral works. They were not published during Sibelius’s lifetime and most probably were not performed either; nor did Sibelius list those works in any of his autograph work lists later. Since the works date from the composer’s studying period in Helsinki Music Institute (1885–1889), they may have been written as composition exercises for Martin Wegelius (1846–1906), who was Sibelius’s teacher at the time. However, the songs stand out stylistically from Sibelius’s counterpoint exercises from that time, such as several fugue expositions and harmonization exercises in strict chorale style. In addition, the composition exercises were usually written to the text *Kyrie eleison* or the like, whereas the six works mentioned above are written to secular poems in Swedish.

In the present article, I will first analyze the extant manuscript sources of one of the early works, *Tanke, se, hur fågeln svingar*, which contains several features that are characteristic to most of Sibelius’s early works. I will first present the special features of the work’s source chain. Thereafter I will analyze the compositional process visible in the manuscript sources and discuss some editorial problems proposed by its special features. *Tanke, se, hur fågeln svingar* appears in volume VII/1 of Jean Sibelius Works, the complete critical edition Sibelius’s works (hereafter referred to as JSW).

**Manuscript sources**

The only extant sources for *Tanke, se, hur fågeln svingar* are two autograph manuscripts currently kept in the National Library of Finland under signums 1053 and 1054. Of the two manuscripts, 1054 is written earlier, and it consists of two layers of writing: first, Sibelius wrote the entire song in ink, but made multiple emendations to it later.

---

1 For dating, see Kilpeläinen 1992:84, 90, 98–99, and 113. In addition, Sibelius also arranged a traditional folk ballade from Uusimaa *Ack, hör du fader Gyllenborg* (JS 10) for mixed choir a cappella.
The emendations are made in lead instead of in ink, and the layers are therefore easily distinguished from each other. The layer in ink is written in extremely careful hand-writing including all the necessary details for the song to be performed. Thus, the earliest surviving version of the song is not a draft, but a fair copy, and at the time of its writing, Sibelius probably considered the song to be completed.

The multiple emendations made 1054 partly almost unreadable. In addition, some of the emendations changed the music so much that the new version could not be written over the earlier reading as in most cases, but Sibelius had to write few bars of the new version to the other side of the paper. Therefore, a new fair copy was needed, and 1053 fulfills this need. Apparently, Sibelius was not satisfied with the version on the second fair copy either, since he made afterwards numerous emendations to the second fair copy, too. Luckily, Sibelius used again a lead pencil, when emending the fair copy written otherwise in ink; thus, the new layer also in 1053 is easily distinguished from the earlier layer written in ink.

The writing process visible in the two fair copies can be “frozen” to three successive versions. The second fair copy (1053) is not a third version, but it is merely a reproduction of the version visible already in the emendations of the earlier 1054. In the present study, the emendations written in lead to the first fair copy and the original reading written in ink on the second fair copy constitute together the second version of the work. Thus, the source chain and “the evolution” of the work can be presented in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>papers:</th>
<th>layers:</th>
<th>version:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1054</td>
<td>the first fair copy (in ink)</td>
<td>1st version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>emendations (in lead)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1053</td>
<td>the second fair copy (in ink)</td>
<td>2nd version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>emendations (in lead)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3rd version</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Both manuscripts described above have a two-fold function in the writing process. The first layer in ink is intended at the time of its writing to function as a fair copy. The emendations written in lead, however, nullify the manuscripts’ original functions; in neither of the manuscripts, the emendations are mere corrections to the fair copy. Instead, the emendations are written in a sketch-like manner: the emended layer consists of writing that could perhaps best be described as a short-hand notation or as notes-to-oneself kinds of markings that are meaningful to the author, but not necessarily to anyone else. The sketch-like emendations written on the second fair copy (1053) are with all likelihood intended to function as a draft to the third fair
copy – in a similar way the emendations on the first fair copy function as a draft to the second fair copy. Since Sibelius never wrote the third fair copy, the source chain is peculiar: chronologically, the first extant source is a fair copy, and the last is a draft.

Remarks on the compositional process visible in the manuscript sources

The first observation, when analyzing the compositional process seen in the manuscripts of Tanke, se, hur fågeln swingar is the lack of the preliminary sketches. Instead, already the earliest extant layer found in the sources was intended at the time of its writing as a fair copy. This naturally means that some sources are probably missing. It also means that the processes connected to generating the musical material remain hidden from our view and the compositional process in the focus of the present study could be perhaps best described as revisions or refinements.

Although Sibelius made quite many changes to the music, the fundamental structure of the song has remained the same during the writing process visible in the three surviving versions. Sibelius composed the poem’s three strophes in a ternary form (ABA’), in which the outer sections are in the key of D major and the contrasting middle section in D minor. In the first version, the B-section is longer, thus, the bar numbering of the A’ section differs in the first version, when compared to the second and the third versions.

All three sections have a strikingly similar underlying tonal structure: firstly, each section begins at a subdominant chord (G/g) reaching the tonic (D/d) in the second bar of the section and, secondly, each section emphasizes the third scale degree (F#/F). The third scale degree is also present in the climax at the end of the song. The most extensive alterations Sibelius made during the writing process, concern the motion from and to the third scale degree. For example, in the first version music of the B section comes to a stop at the F-major chord (in bar 19), which is then followed by an almost fanfare-like gesture, which lead the music to the dominant (bars 20–21; see example 1). In the second version, the emphasis of the F major is much more

---

2 In fact, surprisingly small amount of sketches for Sibelius’s choral works has survived. Since Sibelius’s choral works are fairly short in duration, it is possible that not many sketches have existed in the first place.

3 The up-beats to A-sections do represent the tonic in larger context, but they can also be interpreted as leading to the G-major chord. Especially in the beginning, the G-major chord in bar 1 sound like a tonic for a passing moment.
subtle; it still is somehow the turning point of the section, but in the second and third versions the music flows through the tonicization of F major without interrupting the larger-scale movement towards the dominant.

Example 1. Bars 16–21 of the first version and bars 16–18 of the third version (the ending of the B section).

Quite similar evolution is seen also in the outer sections. In the first version, the music stops at F-sharp major chord (bars 4 and 25); male voices’ gesture “lätt och fri/glad och så” marks a strong – again almost fanfare-like – arrival on F-sharp major chord. In the second and the third versions, male voices’ gesture forms a bridge that connects the two four-bar phrases to each other more fluently. Interestingly, reaching the third scale degree has evidently been a problematic task in the outer sections: Sibelius has written several different alternatives during the writing process (discussed in detail in Section 3, see especially example 2).

Another fascinating feature in the song’s writing process is the metrical shift occurring from the first to the second version of the B section. Strikingly, there are no up-beats in the first version’s B section, thus, it forms not only tonally but also metrically a strong contrast to the outer sections, in which practically all the phrases begin with an up-beat (the difference is visible also in example 1). Interestingly, Sibelius made the metrical emendation in 1054 simply by crossing out the bar lines.
and re-writing them one beat earlier. Similar emendation is also made to the last phrase of the song.

**Editorial problems**

The third version proposes an intriguing conundrum for the editor: parts of it exist only as sketch-like emendations on the fair copy of the previous version. As stated in Section 1, the sketch-like emendations written on the second fair copy are with all likelihood intended to function as a draft to the third fair copy, which Sibelius never wrote. Thus, the third version is chronologically the last version of the song, but there is no authoritative or “final” text in the strict sense. In the following, I will discuss four details as examples of the different questions raised by the sketch-like markings as the final reading.

**Detail 1: Bar 3**

The private nature of the emendations on 1053 becomes evident already by studying the emendations of bar 3 (and the up-beat to it). As example 1 shows, the appearance of the manuscript is far from the clarity of a standard fair copy.

Example 2. Bar 3 in 1053. (The song is in D major, thus, two sharps are applied).

Sibelius emended the original reading on the manuscript by crossing out and replacing the bass-notes at the up-beat with a quarter rest and sketching different
variants for a new bass line in bar 3.

I have been able to separate four different layers of bass-lines on top of each other in bar 3. The bass lines are shown in example 3 (a–d) in chronological order. The chronology of the first and the last bass lines can be deduced with certainty, since the first bass line (a) is the only one written in ink and the last bass line (d) is written directly on the first one without the “middle-steps” (b and c) in analogous bar 21. My hypothesis of the reciprocal order of the “middle-steps” is based on the placing of the notes and is not necessarily definite.

Example 3. Bass-lines in bar 3 in 1053.

The private nature of the emendations does not affect only the neatness, but also the actual contents of the writing. The most interesting detail in this respect is found at the up-beat to bar 3. With the added rest in the emended bass lines, the chord at the up-beat becomes an open fifth (c#–g#) without the third of the chord (e#) (see example 2). The missing third is highly questionable: did Sibelius really intend the up-beat to be an open fifth, which as a sound differs significantly from its surroundings? The question can be answered by studying the writing process as a whole from the first to the third version. The evolution of the up-beat is presented in the example 4, which shows that Sibelius actually returned to an earlier idea, when writing the third version: in the first version, the male voices are silent at the up-beat. When Sibelius made emendations to the first version, he wrote c# for bass and changed alto to g# (see version 2 in example 4). When Sibelius rewrote the quarter rest for bass (version 3) he did not alter the alto line respectively.

---

4 It is difficult to distinguish the layers from a black-and-white photocopy. The entire page is printed as Facsimile I in Ylivuori 2012.
5 In neither of the bars (3 and 21), Sibelius has written any triplet sign.
Example 4. The evolution of the up-beat to bar 3

In my interpretation, by crossing out the e# from the bass line Sibelius intended also alto line to be changed. But when writing a private document not intended for other people’s eyes, he did not have to write out such obvious details: the purpose of the manuscript was not to instruct the performer in a performance or to serve as a stichvorlage for an edition. In JSW, e# for alto appears in square brackets.6

Detail 2: Bars 7–8

In bar 7, Sibelius has indicated changes to the rhythms in a way that is familiar from also many other of his sketches (see example 5a). When writing a homophonic passage, Sibelius often wrote in his early works the exact rhythms for the soprano part only; for example, När sig våren åter föder (JS 139) dating from the same period is written for the most part in this fashion. In bar 7, the emended rhythms are written for soprano and bass part. It is evident from the texture that alto is to be changed as soprano, and tenor as bass (see example 5b), although not directly indicated by Sibelius.

6 In JSW, the work is laid out on four staves instead of two for the sake of the clarity – especially concerning the song texts.
Example 5. Bars 7–8 in *HUL 1053* and in my interpretation.

If the intention behind the penciled markings in bar 7 is unambiguous, the same cannot be said about the markings in bar 8. It seems that Sibelius has crossed out male voices’ gesture *flyga i*, but he has not written down anything to replace the crossed out passage. If we assume that Sibelius had an alternative in his mind, there are two options: 1) Sibelius crossed out the passage at first, but decided not make any alterations, after all. 2) Sibelius had an alternative reading already in his mind, but did not write it down.

Interestingly, both options are present in the writing process of the second version, which is an interesting parallel, since both the draft and the fair copy exist. Sibelius used the option 1) in bar 9, where he indicated the tenor line to be changed (from $d^1$ to $b$), but did not make the change in the fair copy after all. The option 2) is visible in the penultimate bar of the song, where Sibelius crossed out the last chord in the bar, but wrote nothing to replace it. The replacing chord is not written until on the second fair copy.

Naturally, if we lose the basic assumption of the existing alternative, there is also a third option: 3) Sibelius had no actual alternative in his mind, and the lines have more general meaning; such as *bör omarbetas* (should be revised) found in Sibelius’s hand-writing in several instances. Many works indicated by Sibelius with *bör omarbetas* were never revised.
Any of the three options described above is as probable as the others. The actual meaning of the penciled markings in bar 8 remains unknown to us due to the lack of sufficient information on the writing Sibelius intended as private. JSW follows the reading prior to the penciled markings (given in example 5b), but the markings have been commented in the section Critical Remarks.

Detail 3: Bars 19–20

The second version and my interpretation of the intended emendation on it are presented in the example 6 together with the picture of the original manuscript. In bars 19–20, Sibelius has altered the melody. The reasons for the alteration are easily found; in the first two versions, the rhythm of the melody tempts lead to false punctuation: "Är det gladt på jorden, hvila || Bland dess... (If it is joyous on the Earth, rest || among its...). In the third version, not only the rest at the end of bar 19, but especially the dotted quarter note at the beginning of in bar 20 bind hvila into Bland dess, and the phrase structure of the music complies with the structure of the sentence in the poem ("Är det gladt på jorden, || hvila Bland dess...").

The problems in this passage do not concern the melody; Sibelius’s intention is quite evident. It is the role of the other parts that raises the question. Besides the melody, Sibelius has indicated no changes in bar 19; does this mean that they are to remain as they are? The new melody fits together with the other parts, thus, it is probable, but beyond doubt that cannot be stated. But due to the lack of other evidence, the lower parts in bar 19 follow in JSW the reading in the manuscript.

---

7 The reason why the second beat in bar 20 is so smudgy is that Sibelius first changed the D major chord into b minor chord and then changed in back.

8 NB! The bar numbering differs in the first version; equivalent passage is found in bars 22–23 in the first version.

9 The added bass note d derives from analogous bar 2, in which Sibelius has made the emendation in question.
Example 6a. Bars 19–20 on 1053 (there is a system break between the bars).

Example 6b. Bars 19–20 in ink (the second version) and my interpretation of the penciled emendations
Detail 4: Bar 27

The penultimate bar of the work is strange in all three versions. In each case, there are excess beats in the bar, but Sibelius has indicated no change in the time signature and 3/4 seemingly prevails until the end. This has apparently raised some questions already in past; the work has been recorded twice, and in the recordings, the rhythms in the bar have been changed as presented in example 7b). Since the excessive beats are not a result of an emendation, but a recurrent feature of the passage, the rhythms have not been changed in JSW, but the change in the time signature has been indicated in square brackets.

Example 7. Bar 27 on 1053 and in recordings.

Conclusions

Based on all that is stated above, the question arises: Why Sibelius did not write out the third fair copy? Bearing in mind that the work dates from Sibelius’s studying period, there is a natural answer: Sibelius did not compose the work with the publication process as a goal, and therefore there was no factual need for a detailed fair copy. In my interpretation, this also means that there is a crucial distinction to be made: although the writing process does not end in the detailed fair copy, but in a sketch-like writing, this does not necessarily mean that the work itself would have
been left unfinished. Instead, it seems that once the problematic details – perhaps pointed out by the teacher – were solved satisfactorily, the work with it was considered completed. In fact, the lack of the authoritative note text of the “final” version is a highly typical situation in Sibelius’s early output.

Identifying the emendations correctly as a private writing plays a significant role in interpreting the sources of Sibelius’s early works. For example, in Kilpeläinen’s catalogue, 1053 has been categorized as a ‘fair copy’, and not, for example, as a ‘draft’ or a ‘fair copy containing sketch-like emendations’. Reading the manuscript as a fair copy (in Reiman’s terms, as a public document) has lead to some interesting interpretations in past: in both of the above-mentioned recordings, an open fifth is heard at the up-beat to bar 3. Although the recordings do follow the autograph reading in this specific detail, it can be argued that they do not present the work as intended by the composer; according to my interpretation, the open fifth is a direct result of reading the manuscript incorrectly as a fair copy and not as a private document. However, since the third fair copy does not exist, many problematic details (such as the up-beat to bar 3) remain without a definitive solution and are ideal subjects for further debate.

---

10 Kilpeläinen 1991:287. Naturally, Kilpeläinen is correct in a way, since the first layer in the manuscript is, in fact, a fair copy.
REFERENCES


CAROLA FINKEL

SWEDISH FOLK MUSIC IN KURT ATTERBERG’S SYMPHONIES

Swedish art music of the 19th century uses folk music mainly to portray pastoral scenes or in politically motivated compositions (Kube 2005; Tegen 2001). The use of folk music remained however only an effect, and gained – compared with other countries – no essential role in the serious music art music of that time. This role changed substantially at the beginning of the 20th century. For the composers, the influence of native folk music is a significant aspect of their works. Beside the use of direct quotations several stylistic elements were integrated in the personal style to get a “Nordic tone”. Folk melodies were used in orchestral music especially in rhapsodies (e.g. by Hugo Alfén, Andreas Hallén, and Oskar Lindberg) or suites (e.g. by Oskar Lindberg). There are several Swedish symphonies that in some parts have a Nordic sound, but normally they do not quote genuine folk tunes.¹ Kurt Atterberg is the only well-known Swedish composer who composed symphonies based exclusively on folk themes.

In the oeuvre of Kurt Atterberg (1887-1974) the reference to Swedish folk music is an important aspect. Many of his works are based on folk melodies (e.g. De västsvenska jungfrurna, En Värmlandsrapsodi and Bäckahästen). In four of his nine symphonies folk tunes are quoted. While in the Symphonies No. 2 and No. 3 only several tunes are processed, the entire thematic material in the Symphonies No. 4 and No. 8 is based on folk melodies. In the following paper I will focus on these two symphonies. On the one hand I present some folk songs and dances that Atterberg adopted in both symphonies and show how he transferred them into symphonic themes. On the other hand I show in which manner he processed the themes in these two symphonies. Both symphonies have the traditional four-movement structure of sonata form, slow movement, scherzo and finale with rondo respectively sonata form. In the paper I focus on the principal movements.

Atterberg composed his Symphony No. 4 g-minor op. 14 Sinfonia piccola in 1918. A wager with his friend Natanael Berg to write a “light” orchestral piece that should be no longer than 20 minutes was the cause for starting the composition. (Atterberg n.d. III:21; Hedwall 1983:252) The result of that little competition were Atterberg’s

¹ For example the 5th Symphony by Peterson-Berger or the 2nd Symphony by Stenhammar. A special case is the 3rd Symphony Same Åtnam by Peterson-Berger. The composer here processed five samic jojakar, which are combined with his own themes.
Sinfonia piccola and Berg’s Pezzo sinfonico. Atterberg started his work on 31st July and finished his symphony on 29th September 1918. (Atterberg n.d. III:22c) In 1944 – 26 years later – he composed his Symphony No. 8 e-minor op. 48. Like the 4th Symphony the composition is based on Swedish folk melodies. The premiere took place in Helsinki on 9th February 1945 under the direction of the composer. On that same evening he received a telegram with the words: “Tack för din underbart helgjutna symfoni. Med varm hälsning Jean Sibelius.”

Atterberg specified in his autobiography Minnesanteckningar the sources of the folk melodies on which the symphonies are based. Almost all pieces of the 4th Symphony are taken from the collection 200 svenska folkdanser. In the Symphonies No. 2 and No. 3 Atterberg already used several folk dances from the same book. Most folk tunes used in the 8th Symphony originate from the important collection Svenska låtar. Atterberg chose in addition some well-known folk songs.

Some of the folk melodies and symphonic themes are presented in the following pages. Several pieces are written in Dorian key, for which Atterberg had a great affection (Atterberg n.d. V:128). A melodic peculiarity of many Swedish and Norwegian folk tunes is the so-called “Grieg-motif.” It is a melodic phrase marked by the downward movement keynote - leading tone - fifth. Usually it is at the end of a phrase with accentuation on the fifth. Atterberg often uses the “Grieg-motif.” In his 4th Symphony Atterberg quotes especially polskas while in the 8th Symphony he uses various songs and dances. He adopts many folk tunes unmodified in his symphonies. Some of them are changed intensely in rhythm and character.

In the 8th Symphony the famous folk song Kavaljersvisan (Det gör detsamma, vart du kommer när du dör) is chosen as principal theme of the first movement. Apart from transliterating the tune from 2/4 to 2/2 time, the theme is almost unaltered.

Example No. 1: Atterberg, Symphony No. 8, 1st movement, bar 17ff (Principal theme).

---

2 Telegram from Jean Sibelius to Kurt Atterberg, 9th February 1945.

3 Arvid Vollsnes 2001. The phrase is typical for Griegs personal style (e. g. his piano concerto starts with that phrase). So “Grieg-motif” is a common name for that phrase.
A *vals* (waltz) from Öland is used as second theme in the scherzo of the 8th Symphony. It is a two-part lied form and is based on a Dorian scale. Atterberg uses the dance without any changes in the symphonic movement. The song “äär något alldeles enastående i sitt slag, och vi kan vara stolta över att ha en sådan pärla i vår folkmusik” (Atterberg n.d. VI:244e).

Example No. 2: Atterberg, *Symphony No. 8*, 3rd movement, bar 71ff (Second theme).

The vivid ritornello of the final rondo in Atterberg’s 4th Symphony is based on a *halling*. A *halling* is a fast solo dance with acrobatic jumps, originally danced by men in courtship. This dance is especially common in the Norwegian Hallingdal and Valdres, but it can also be found in the Swedish border country to Norway.

Example No. 3: Atterberg, *Symphony No. 4*, 4th movement, bar 6ff (Ritornello).

Atterberg modified the folk tunes especially for the slow movements in terms of measure, rhythm and character. The diastematic virtually always remains

---

4 *Svenska låtar. Småland, Öland och Blekinge*, vol. 18, No. 245.
5 According to Atterberg (n.d. III:29d) the chosen *halling* is “well known.” Therefore he does not give a reference for his source.
untouched. The first theme in the second movement of the 8th Symphony is a gånglåt (hiking song) from Gästrikland. Atterberg transliterated the tune from 2/4 time to 4/4 time but he keeps melody and rhythm nearly unchanged. However by choosing the slow tempo the nature of the brisk walking song changed dramatically. The gånglåt from Svenska låtar was not composed before 1870, but it contains some features that are characteristic for older Swedish folk tunes. The original song uses both the minor and the large Dorian sixth, but Atterberg utilizes only the Dorian sixth. In the gånglåt the seventh is also handled flexibly. It appears as a major and minor seventh. Atterberg instead chooses the minor seventh. The variation of the 6th and 7th tone is typical for ancient Nordic folk music. Furthermore, in both parts of the gånglåt the “Grieg-motif” acts as a kind of half-close.

Example No. 4: Gånglåt

The second theme in the slow movement of the 4th Symphony is based on a polska from Västergötland. The polska is the most popular and most common dance in Swedish folk music. It is a lively dance in 3/4-time. Because it is used in a slow movement in 4/4-time, Atterberg changed rhythm and character of the polska intensely. In contrast to all other themes, Atterberg also differs here enormously from the original. The theme is a very free variation of the dance. Atterberg already quoted the same polska in his 3rd Symphony, also as second theme of the slow

---

7 200 svenska folkdanser, No. 153.
movement. It is interesting to see the different characters in which the *polska* appears in both symphonies.

© by Breitkopf & Härtel, Wiesbaden – Leipzig

Example No. 5:
Above: *Polska* from Västergötland.\(^8\)
Middle: Atterberg, *Symphony No. 3*, 2nd movement, bar 439ff (Second theme).
Below: Atterberg, *Symphony No. 4*, 2nd movement, bar 47ff (Second theme).

\(^8\) For better comparing with the example from the 4th symphony, the dance is transposed.
The second theme in the first movement of the 4th Symphony is the only one that is a combination of two dances. On the one hand Atterberg uses a *ringdans* (round dance) from Östergötland⁹ and on the other hand a *polska* from Västergötland.¹⁰ Originally both dances are built as a two-part lied form, but Atterberg assembles the two folk tunes to a three-part lied form. The outer parts are based on the first four bars of the *ringdans* and in the middle section of the lied form the complete *polska* is used.

In his 4th Symphony Atterberg wants to show his fondness for the beautiful folk melodies through


The first movement of *Sinfonia piccola* is owing to the wager comparatively short. The movement immediately starts with the principal theme, a *polska* from Västergötland.¹¹ At the first time Atterberg only uses half of the dance and finishes it with the “Grieg-motif.” The repetition shows the complete theme. Then a short connecting passage leads to the second theme. As mentioned above the theme is a

---

⁹ 200 svenska folkdanser, No. 177.
¹⁰ 200 svenska folkdanser, No. 159.
¹¹ 200 svenska folkdanser, Nr. 175.
combination of two folk dances. While the character of the principal theme is boisterous and moving forward, the second theme is plain and reluctant. The development section follows directly, which can be divided in two parts. The head of the polska theme is exposed but not processed further. After that a second motif of the principal theme is heard. It ends with a long lasting tone. This motif appears alternately with a dotted rhythm. This section is characterized by extensive pedal points. Due to this and the long notes in the melodic line, this part of the development section has a quite static character. The second part deals with sequences and fragmentation of the head motif from the principal theme. In the recapitulation the polska is immediately presented in its complete version. The second theme follows after a shortened connecting passage. In the third part of the theme the two folk tunes - which before sounded alternately - are now played simultaneously as a duet. The movement ends with a short coda based on the second motif of the principal theme.

Like this movement the other movements sparsely use development techniques too. For example the scherzo lacks completely the development section which is typical for the scherzo form. Atterberg later sensed that as a fault. He revised the Scherzo in 1945 and added a development section.\textsuperscript{12} In the slow movement one theme is set as a canon in two voices.

The thread connecting the movements of the 8th Symphony is a combination of four chords (e-minor, e-minor, A-major, e-minor). On the one hand it appears in every movement (except the scherzo) and on the other hand each chord represents the key of a movement. The first movement begins with a slow introduction, which starts with the harmonic motto. In the introduction the head motif of the Kavaljersvisan (principal theme) is implied. The exposition presents the folk song first in its original version and then as a variation in a major key. Afterwards there is a development

\textsuperscript{12} All available recordings are based on the original version.
section that leads to the second theme. Through fragmentation and sequences the beginning of the *Kavaljersvisan* becomes a small motif, which then will be the accompaniment of the second theme. This theme is a *visa* (song) from Västmanland. The repetition of the theme is followed by a section with motivic thematic work, in which are confronted the second theme and a new motif (based on a *polska*). The official development section starts after that with the principal theme and its major variation, exactly like in the exposition (Atterberg n.d. VI:244c). So here the recapitulation is suggested, but the theme is followed by fragmentation und sequences, which deals only with the principal theme. An augmented form of the *Kavaljersvisan* signalizes the end of the development section. Because it processed only the principal theme, the recapitulation starts with the second theme. Atterberg calls this a “symmetrical sonata form” which he quite often uses in his symphonies. The second theme is followed by a small development section, in which motifs of both themes are confronted. The movement ends with an augmentation of the *Kavaljersvisan*, which is set in a kind of polytonal texture (Connor 1971:11).

Beside the harmonic motto the *Kavaljersvisan* is utilized to connect the single movements. It is used as an introduction of the slow movement and at the end of the symphony it sounds simultaneously with the first theme of the final movement.

In the 4th Symphony the thematic development and transformation is quite restrained. In the sonata movement the symphonic handling of the themes is reduced to the bare essentials. The briefness of the symphony certainly caused that. Instead of extensive development techniques Atterberg sometimes uses contrapuntal and combinatorial techniques. For some critics the reason for that supposed fault in the symphony lies in the use of folk music.

The objection was that folk melodies are not suitable as symphonic themes. Either the individuality of the folk tunes will be destroyed or development and thematic work on a longer distance – which is the foundation of symphonic composition – are not possible. Arnold Schönberg expresses these objections later in his essay *Symphonien aus Volksliedern*.

Die innere Organisation in der Volksmusik läßt keinen ‚ungelösten Rest‘ zu, dessen Folgerungen erst später gezogen werden sollen. […] zahllose Male wird eine kurze Phrase wiederholt, ohne mehr Variation als Transposition auf andere Stufen, eine

---

13 *Svenska låtar. Västmanland*, vol. 15, No. 170.
andere Instrumentation, [...]. Nichts anderes wurde dabei gesagt, das nicht schon in dem Volkslied bei seinem ersten Auftreten gesagt wurde. (Schönberg 1976:136–137)

But Atterberg did not anyhow intend to work in that way in his 4th Symphony. For him the most important aspect was the presentation of the themes in varied instrumentation against a colourful harmonic background. Atterberg writes about his composition:


The symphonic process in Atterberg’s 8th Symphony is more prominent than in the Fourth. Especially in the outer movements, the motivic thematic work is not limited to the development section, but also is found in the exposition and recapitulation. In the scherzo the themes are more processed than in Sinfonia piccola. But combination and counterpoint is also used at some points in his 8th Symphony. Due to the comprehensive occurrence of the Kavaljersvisa and a harmonic motto that interconnects all movements of the symphony, the symphonic principle of musical logic is underlined in Symphony No. 8.
LITERATURE


**Music scores**

**200 svenska folkmänser (n.d.).** Arrangement for piano. Stockholm: Abraham Lundquist (Abr. L. 1519)


– *Symphony No. 8 e-minor op. 48.* Stockholm: STIM.


ALEXIS LUKO

MUSICAL REPERTITION IN THE FILMS OF INGMAR BERGMAN

In Act III of Wagner’s *Tristan und Isolde*, a plaintive shepherd’s tune awakens Tristan from his death-like trance.¹ This is the tune Tristan heard upon the death of his mother and father, it is the tune he heard when Isolde offered him the magic potion, and now, this is the tune he hears as he yearns for death. The tune is a Wagnerian *leitmotif* and through repetition, invokes a surge of reminiscences. This final sounding of the *leitmotif* generates a profound musical moment (“melodische Momente”) manifesting what Wagner referred to as a “Gefühlswegweisen” or “guide to feeling” – an emotional sense-memory deep-rooted in Tristan’s psyche.²

Drawing musical parallels between Wagnerian music dramas and the films of Ingmar Bergman is hardly a stretch.³ In Bergman’s writings and interviews he acknowledged the impact of Richard Wagner’s operas and music dramas – especially *Tannhäuser*, *Lohengrin*, and *Der Ring des Nibelungen*. Further connections can be made between Wagnerian *leitmotivic* repetition and Bergman’s repetition of classical music excerpts in individual films.⁴ At three points in *Cries and Whispers* (1973), for example, Bergman reuses Chopin’s Mazurka in A minor, op. 17 nr 4, and no less than seven recurrences of both Bach’s Suite no. 3 and Schubert’s “*Der Leiermann*” are encountered in *All these Women* (1964) and *In the Presence of a Clown* (1997) respectively. Musical repetition, in fact, figures prominently in Bergman’s

---

¹ Tristan: “Must I understand you thus, you ancient, solemn tune with your plaintive tones? Through the evening air it came, fearfully, as once it brought news to the child of his father’s death. Through the grey light of morning, ever more fearful, as the son became aware of his mother’s lot. As he begat me and died, so, dying, she bore me. That ancient tune of anxious yearning sounded its lament to them too, asking me then, and asking me now, for what fate was I then born? For what fate? The ancient tune tells me once more: to yearn - and to die!”

² Discussed in Vazsonyi 2010:104. Also see Wagner 1911, IV:201-202.

³ Bergman speaks about his infatuation with opera and Wagner in a SVT interview with Camilla Lundberg titled “Ingmar Bergman och musiken,” Swedish Television, channel 1, 25 December 2000. *Laterna Magica / The Magic Lantern* reveals Bergman’s love for sneaking away to catch Wagner operas in Stockholm. See Bergman 1987). In his twenties (1941-42), Bergman volunteered at the Royal Swedish Opera, where he assisted the stage manager by signaling lighting cues and stage changes. According to Peter Cowie (1982:15) Bergman was “delighted by Wagner.” Also see Johansson 2008. Johansson’s research suggests that Bergman saw the *Tannhäuser* production with Brita Herzberg as Elizabeth at the Royal Swedish Opera on August 8, 1931 (ibid.:52).

Charlotte Renaud (2007) has identified many of Bergman’s musical quotations and has used the term “*leitmotif*” to describe repeated excerpts in his films. Musical repetition for Bergman can, as suggested by Renaud, sometimes serve a structural function in a film’s form by marking introductions, new chapters, interludes, and/or conclusions.

---


⁴ Bergman speaks about his infatuation with opera and Wagner in a SVT interview with Camilla Lundberg titled “Ingmar Bergman och musiken,” Swedish Television, channel 1, 25 December 2000. *Laterna Magica / The Magic Lantern* reveals Bergman’s love for sneaking away to catch Wagner operas in Stockholm. See Bergman 1987). In his twenties (1941-42), Bergman volunteered at the Royal Swedish Opera, where he assisted the stage manager by signaling lighting cues and stage changes. According to Peter Cowie (1982:15) Bergman was “delighted by Wagner.” Also see Johansson 2008. Johansson’s research suggests that Bergman saw the *Tannhäuser* production with Brita Herzberg as Elizabeth at the Royal Swedish Opera on August 8, 1931 (ibid.:52).
Bergman’s penchant for repetition infiltrates every aspect of his filmmaking. His
demic universes are inhabited by countless Karins, Almas, Mariannes, and Johans,
who grapple perpetually with reiterated themes of love, faith, death, and art.
One of the most famous examples of repetition is featured in *Persona* (1966), a film in which
Bergman repeats one entire scene – first shot from the perspective of the speaker
(Nurse Alma) and then from the perspective of the listener (Elizabeth Vogler).
Another repetition technique is found in *Sawdust and Tinsel* (1953), a film that
required many hours in the editing studio where Bergman made copies of
original footage so as to echo the cyclical pattern of a clown’s
repeated humiliations (Livingston 1982:43).

An oft-cited repetition technique for Bergman entails using two bodies to
represent disparate aspects of the same psyche, forming what some scholars have
referred to as the “character double.” Character doubles reappear in countless
Bergmanian contexts from *Persona’s* Elizabeth Vogler and Nurse Alma, to *The Seventh
Ekdahl and Ismael Retzinsky. Paul Luke has distinguished between different
character doubles in Bergman’s films, two of which are pertinent here: the
*amalgamative character double* and the *disjunctive character double.* The *amalgamative character
double* is inclined towards psychic mergence and features two characters who “mingle
and blend” and begin to “manifest the qualities of the other” until the boundary
lines between their identities become blurred (Luke1979:14). The *disjunctive character
double*, on the other hand, involves a doppelgänger relationship that evinces “psychic
divergence” wherein “ontological hostility” exists as characters define their own
distinctive identity (ibid:15f).

Building upon the scholarship of Charlotte Renaud, Egil Törnqvist, Per Broman,
and Paul Luke, this article investigates how, when and why musical excerpts are
recycled in Bergman’s films (Broman 2012). For Bergman, musical repetition can
function as an aural prompt to the viewer or a cue to an on-screen listener
(when heard in a diegetic context) to underscore unions and/or ruptures

---

5 Also see Renaud n.d. accessed August 20, 2012. This site also includes a list of musical excerpts in
Bergman’s films.

6 For a list of all recurrent names in Bergman films see Gado 2007:516-20.

7 Bergman repeats an entire sequence from the perspective of both the speaker and the listener when Alma
provides an unsolicited and scathing psychological analysis of her mute patient. This culminates in an eerie
image in which the faces of Bibi Anderson and Liv Ullman are fused together. See Sontag 2000:76.
between pairs of characters or “character doubles.” Bergman’s classical music quotations can also be understood as Wagnerian *leitmotifs* (Törnqvist 2007), which, when they resurface, undergo variations and transformations and serve to unlock emotional sense-memories for on-screen characters and audience members alike.

**In the Presence of a Clown**

*In the Presence of a Clown* (1997) features the manifold repetition of the opening to “Der Leiermann” / “The Hurdy-Gurdy Man” (the final organ-grinder song of Schubert’s *Winterreise* song cycle), to underscore the amalgamative character double relationship between a man and a clown. The main character, Carl Åkerblom, is a childish fifty-four-year-old inventor, recently committed to a psychiatric ward in Upsala Hospital. His thoughts are fixated on composer Franz Schubert and how he lived out his final days after receiving his syphilis diagnosis.

Carl receives intermittent visits from a white clown named Rigmor (“rigamortis”), an androgynous character who, according to Egil Tornqvist, balances “the cruel aspect [of death] with a maternal one” (Törnqvist 2003:142). Carl and Rigmor are secret friends and confidantes—character doubles who interact exclusively with each other. In a close-up at the opening of the film, male hands set down the needle on a gramophone player. The piano introduction to Schubert’s “Der Leiermann” is heard and before the voice of the song has a chance to enter, the needle is hastily lifted and the music stops. The camera moves to reveal the face of Carl Åkerblom. He replaces the needle, takes an anxious breath, bites down on his finger, and the opening measures to “Der Leiermann” are sounded again. As before, Carl stops the song before the voice enters and the camera angle changes to a long shot of his room in the psychiatric ward. Carl replaces the needle and listens to the introduction again and, after a few measures, his doctor enters to finally interrupt the momentum of this obsessive-compulsive listening session. We learn later in the film that the sounding of Schubert’s “Der Leiermann” happens to coincide with appearances of Rigmor the white clown, suggesting that the obsessive musical repetition of the introduction to “Der Leiermann” is symptomatic of a type of ritualistic behavior where Åkerblom is summoning (or indeed creating) Rigmor. As described by Susan Youens, the hurdy-gurdy doppelgänger of Schubert’s song (personified by the piano accompaniment) is created in the imagination of a wanderer (personified by the voice) “from within his wounded and alienated soul . . . making apparent a kinship uncannily close” (Youens 1991:299f). “Der Leiermann”
is musically fitting as the German lied becomes emblematic of narrative themes played out in the film. *In the Presence of a Clown* is, after all, a study in the alienation of self.

To parallel the unraveling of Carl Åkerblom, there is a remarkable secondary plot that entails a cinematic experiment – the invention of a crude precursor to the first “talkie.” The performance that Åkerblom and his crew mount is complex and bizarre to say the least: while a black-and-white silent film about Schubert’s life is projected for an invited audience, live actors stand offstage reciting, in real-time and in perfect synchrony, the film’s dialogue into microphones. Meanwhile, an in-house pianist plays the live “soundtrack.” Here, the Gesamtkunstwerk fusion of offstage voices, music, and on-screen image, come together in real-time to create the first sound film. But, like Åkerblom himself who psychologically collapses, his invention also experiences disintegration when a fire backstage causes an electrical failure. Without a screen image and without amplified sound, the actors are forced to perform the “talkie” live. Here, each individual part of the cinematic Gesamtkunstwerk (music, acting, and dialogue) is abstracted and exposed in its elemental form.

Remarkably, the “Leiermann” leitmotif too disintegrates – so that, eventually, appearances of the clown are accompanied only by the pitch 'A' played on the piano. This is an apt choice as 'A' is derived from the lowest note of the bare open 5th piano accompaniment and also from the final 'A' in the open-ended rising melodic utterance that drifts away at the end of the song as the wanderer asks inquisitively: “Shall I join you on your journey? Will you play the music to my songs?” Åkerblom does indeed decide to join forces with his own imagined hurdy-gurdy man. Rigmor, after all, becomes his physical partner, first through sexual intercourse, and later a spiritual partner through death.

**All These Women**

In *All these Women* (1964), Bergman takes the notion of the amalgamative character double to the extreme by featuring a famous cellist who, instead of merging with another human being, fuses with music itself.8 Throughout the film, Bergman repeats entire scenes and musical excerpts. The central character is introduced as one of the most

---

8 Tristan is often cited as the true “character double” in this film.
celebrated musicians in the world—a cellist simply known by the stage name of Felix. The film begins with his funeral, where his mistresses and his wife take turns paying their respects before burial. As each stops and contemplatively looks down at the casket, each repeats the phrase: “The Same, But Different.”

“The Same But Different” could indeed be the motto of the entire film as Bergman builds varied repetition into the narrative, visual, and musical fabric. The funeral scene itself is repeated multiple times, with different camera shots (wide shot, medium shot), film tones (colour, black and white, and sepia), pacing (normal, fast forward, and abbreviated), points of view (objective and subjectively imagined), and soundtracks (Bach’s Aria in G, organ music, and a mute voice track). Throughout the film, Bergman reuses the Aria from Bach’s Suite nr 3 for Orchestra in D major no fewer than seven times and, upon each repetition, it too is “the same but different.”

The first time Bach’s Aria is sounded, Felix’s biographer Cornelius (who is looking to dedicate his next biographical magnum opus to recounting the life story of Maestro Felix) has just arrived at Felix’s villa “Tremolo.” He stumbles upon an after-dinner cello performance for Felix’s mistresses in the music room. It is worth mentioning here that, throughout the film, as viewers, we never actually get to see Felix’s face or hear his voice and, in this scene, we are only privy to close-ups of the women as they listen to his private concert. The second time we hear the Aria, it is in the imagination of Cornelius, who has just been told by the Maestro’s impresario Jillker that, were the Maestro to die, it would make for a stunning concluding chapter to his biography. For a brief moment, we enter the critic’s private thoughts and, to the accompaniment of Bach’s Aria, he imagines himself at Felix’s funeral. We hear Bach’s Aria for a third time from behind the locked door of the pool house. While Felix practices inside, his mistresses sit poolside, swooning to the sweet sounds of his cello. That night, Felix performs in yet another private performance for the women—but this time, he provides us with a tantalizing view of the back of his head. A clever segue to the next scene allows Bach’s Aria to pass seamlessly from Maestro Felix’s bow to Cornelius, who hums a few bars from the privacy of his bathtub.

After his death, Felix’s only remaining claim to fame is a gramophone recording of the same Bach Aria that his six widows, his music agent, biographer, and chauffeur listen to at his memorial service. When a new cellist arrives to take Felix’s place, the event is celebrated with nothing other than a performance of Bach’s Aria! By failing to reveal the face or voice of Felix throughout the film, Bergman paints him as a soulless musical-being. One might even say that over the course of the film
Felix becomes a part-human part-musical amalgamative character double – the dehumanized embodiment of Bach’s Aria.

**Cries and Whispers**

Robynn Stilwell has referred to the border region wherein diegetic music transforms into non-diegetic music or vice versa as a “fantastical gap” – “a transformative space, a superposition, a transition between stable states.” (Stilwell 2007, 184-202). Nowhere does Bergman explore this “fantastical gap” more poignantly than in *Cries and Whispers* (1972) with the repetition of Chopin’s Mazurka in A minor, op. 17 nr 4. Throughout the film, the Mazurka serves to highlight the collective memories of a group of five women: three sisters – Maria, Karin, and Agnes – their late mother and their nursemaid Anna. The Mazurka is initially heard from the beginning of the B section in a non-diegetic context as Anna bites into an apple while gazing thoughtfully at a photograph of her deceased daughter.9 Serving as a type of Proustian “petite Madeleine,” the apple, along with the Mazurka, help to summon not only Anna’s private reminiscences, but also memories of the three sisters. Chopin’s Mazurka continues to sound as the scene shifts to focus on Agnes, who is enchanted in a moment of synesthesia of her own – one that unlocks repressed memories of her late mother. As Agnes inhales the fragrant perfume of a white rose, we hear the climactic double forte transition between the B and A section of the Mazurka.10 We are drawn deeper into the recesses of Agnes’s memories as the Mazurka continues to accompany a flashback to childhood where she jealously studies the closeness between her mother and her sister Maria and, in the next scene, we witness a rare moment of physical closeness as Agnes gently caresses her mother’s cheek.

Here, the salon piano is partially visible in the foreground as are white roses, which refer back to the scene with Agnes. But all the while it is unclear from the angle of the shot as to whether this is diegetic music and whether anyone is actually seated and playing the Mazurka beyond the frame – a “fantastical gap” that surely delighted Bergman. This provides a brilliant segue to a different point in the film – a flashback involving an adult Maria actually playing the Chopin

---

9 As pointed out by Egil Törnqvist, everything in this scene is “carefully composed” from the placement of the flowers, the apple, the candle, the photo and the bed – “nothing is there by coincidence.” The apple, according to Törnqvist (1995:148), “links Anna, whose dead daughter was undoubtedly an illegitimate child, with the Eve of the Fall, with Original Sin.”
Mazurka – but she remains invisible while the camera, instead, fixates on Maria’s husband Joakim. Bergman tips the viewer off that this is indeed diegetic music when there is an unexpected stop mid-phrase with a sudden cluster chord at the page-turn of the Breitkopf und Härtel 1936 edition, signaling that Maria has impulsively ended her practice session. This seems to be an innocent snapshot of private bourgeois life, but this could not be further from the truth. It is, after all, the morning after an adulterous liaison between Maria and the town doctor and she is using Chopin’s music as a mask, hiding behind its intrinsic beauty and hoping desperately to cover her adulterous tracks by fabricating an innocent scene of domestic music making.

The Mazurka is also heard accompanying the final frames of the film, wherein the sisters smile, laugh, and share secrets in a scene of exquisite pastoral beauty. The visuals of this nostalgic moment are summoned by Anna, who has just opened Agnes’s diary: “Wednesday the third of September.” With this, the camera pans down from Anna’s lips and superimposed, is a voice-over from beyond the grave. It is the voice of Agnes: “My sisters Karin and Maria have come to see me. It’s wonderful to be together again.”

The transition from Anna’s to Agnes’s voice directly follows the musical transition from the B section to the A section of the Chopin Mazurka thus creating a narrative and conceptual link to Agnes’s white-rose synesthesia scene from earlier in the film, which features the same musical transition. Here, the Mazurka serves to connect chains of character-pairs, thus underlining the interconnectedness of their lives. The Mazurka also acts as a *leitmotif* of recollection, reminiscence, and nostalgia similar to Tristan’s ancient tune. In this way, the Mazurka carries an emotional “sense memory” and interlinked “remembrances of times past.” But why is this tune embedded in the collective memories of the women? We cannot know the exact origins of the so-called Ur-melodie but it seems probable that this was a piece of music associated with their mother – perhaps something she used to play at the piano. According to Frank Gado, Bergman indicated in the script that *Cries and Whispers* was to be set in a house built “for a distinguished gentleman’s cast-off mistress” indicating that the three sisters are products of an adulterous relationship.10 Perhaps it is this deep-rooted collective sexual guilt inherited from their mother that manifests itself in the maladies of the sisters: Maria’s adultery, Karin’s sexual frigidity, and Agnes’s cancer of the womb. In

10 Quoted in Gado 2007:411. Gado further connects this to the general ambience of “sexual estrangement” and “marital unhappiness” that exists in the film.
any case, through repetition, the Chopin Mazurka acts as a living connective tissue, generating a network of collective memories, permitting Bergman to elegantly highlight the psychological and sexual interconnectedness of the sisters and their inability to escape the shadow of their mother.

*****

An examination of musical repetition in Ingmar Bergman’s films helps to better appreciate the meaning of his narratives and the motivations of his protagonists. Musical repetition is almost always varied, thus inviting the viewer to examine the opposition between authentic and fake, Urtext and copy, and sincerity and performance. Bergman often uses musical repetition to underscore deep-rooted psychological and metaphysical connections between so-called amalgamative character doubles (e.g. Carl and Rigmor). At other times, musical repetition exposes ruptures between disjunctive character doubles (e.g. the sisters in *Cries and Whispers*). Bergman’s repetition can also be heard on Wagnerian *leitmotivic* planes of remembrance, where musical excerpts unlock memories of times past.

For *In the Presence of a Clown*, Carl Åkerblom becomes obsessed with the musical world of Schubert. By repeatedly listening to “Der Leiermann,” he becomes increasingly engrossed in the realm of his amalgamative character double – a clown from death's realm. The Schubert song thus contributes to his psychological collapse and eventual amalgamation with the white clown. In *All these Women*, perpetual repetition of the same Aria on the cello leads to the fragmentation of Felix into a mute, invisible musician who becomes seamlessly amalgamated with music itself. In *Cries and Whispers*, repetition of the Chopin Mazurka helps to unlock repressed memories for a group of women, instigating a metaphorical reincarnation of the mother-figure, promoting both communion and collapse for a mix of amalgamative and disjunctive character-pairs.

Musical repetition serves to create links and rifts between pairs of amalgamative and disjunctive character doubles and, in this way, Bergman shows us how, when verbal interaction fails, music can succeed in communicating deeper philosophical, spiritual and psychological truths. Understood this way, Bergman’s repeated excerpts of classical music can be seen as serving up powerful “melodic moments” that aid in generating “Gefühlswegweiser” in the style of Wagnerian *leitmotifs*. Like the ancient tune that connects the key events in Tristan’s life, Bergman’s repeated excerpts are also found at climactic moments in his narratives, serving to guide emotion and
highlight unifying narrative themes across a uniquely Bergmanian mythic universe populated by countless reincarnations of Karins, Johans, Henriks and Almas.

Table 1: Repeated Classical Music Excerpts in Films by Ingmar Bergman

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film</th>
<th>Musical Excerpt</th>
<th>Repetition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prison</td>
<td>Bach, Cantata No. 137</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Joy</td>
<td>Beethoven, Symphony No. 9 in D Minor, Op. 125</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mozart, Flute Quartet in A Major, K. 298</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mendelssohn, Violin Concerto in E Minor, Op. 64</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summer Interlude</td>
<td>Tchaikovsky, Swan Lake, Op. 20</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Devil's Eye</td>
<td>Scarlatti, Sonata in E-Major, K 380</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Scarlatti, Sonata in D Major, K 535</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Scarlatti, Sonata in F Major, K 446</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through A Glass Darkly</td>
<td>Bach, Cello Suite No. 2 in D Minor, Sarabande</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All These Women</td>
<td>Bach, Orchestral Suite No. 3 in D Major, Aria</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beethoven, Adelaide, Op. 46</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cries and Whispers</td>
<td>Bach, Cello Suite No. 5 in C Minor, Sarabande</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chopin, Mazurka in A Minor, Op. 17 No. 4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autumn Sonata</td>
<td>Chopin, Prelude in A Minor, Op. 28 No. 2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fanny and Alexander</td>
<td>Schumann, Piano Quintet in E-Flat Major, Op. 44, Movement 2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bach, Sonata No. 2 for Flute and Harpsichord in E Flat Major, Sicilienne</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Britten, Cello Suite No. 3, Op. 87</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the Presence of a Clown</td>
<td>Schubert, Winterreise, final section “Der Leiermann”</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Schubert, Sonata in B Major, D 960, movement II</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saraband</td>
<td>Bach, Cello Suite No. 5 in C Minor, Sarabande</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCES


The trace is in fact the absolute origin of sense in general. Which amounts to saying once again that there is no absolute origin of sense in general. The trace is the difference which opens appearance [l’apparaître] and signification. […] And it is a fortiori anterior to the distinction between regions of sensibility, anterior to sound as much as to light, is there a sense in establishing a “natural” hierarchy between the sound-imprint, for example, and the visual (graphic) imprint? The graphic image is not seen; and the acoustic image is not heard. [emphasis added] The difference between the full unities of the voice remains unheard. And, the difference in the body of the inscription is also invisible. (Derrida 1979:65. Original emphasis unless indicated otherwise.)

In some respects existing only in the present of hearing, music is seemingly either there or gone. Yet, the compelling presence and poignant evanescence of music form no simple binary. Indeed, the mnemonic relation between music and the page can be expressed in a range of possible permutations: written and heard, written but unheard, unwritten but heard, unheard and unwritten. With this in mind and examining a possibly rather “odd couple” of the Chanson de Roland and the works of Guillaume de Machaut, this essay hopes to offer a complementary study of the relation between different musical cultures and manuscript contexts.¹ The earliest surviving version of the Roland makes up one half of the manuscript Oxford, Bodleian Library, Digby 23 though its afterlife shows surprising affinity with a later work from a different genre, Machaut’s Le Voir Dit, a long narrative poem incorporating forty-six letters and including lyric insertions, some of these with musical settings.²

As is the case with all surviving manuscripts of epic songs, the version in Digby 23 contains no indication of musical accompaniment. However, from the evidence of one melody transcribed in a compilation of lyric poetry, it appears these works

---

¹ For edition, see Duggan et al. 2005. For a now somewhat dated but still helpful summary of discussions regarding origins, composition and performance, see Brault 1978.
² For edition, see Machaut 1999. All translations into English are by Maxwell (with thanks to Dr Peter V. Davies).
were chanted to a single melodic phrase.\textsuperscript{3} Although the absence of written music in chanson de geste manuscripts generally is a banal fact, what will be suggested here is that in Digby 23 that absence may have been made something more. Dating from the early twelfth century or before, the Oxford text survives in a codex, which also contains a copy of Calcidius’s translation of Plato’s \textit{Timaeus}, the two works possibly bound together as late as the fourteenth century.\textsuperscript{4} The assemblage of these two texts may serve to highlight connections between vernacular epic and themes of platonic thought, pointing to a readership context sensitive to the wider significance of an older vernacular tale. Space here only permits the briefest illustration of a reading that could be developed at vastly greater length. Here poetry, philosophy and music are intertwined, especially in the matter of metre and measure, the \textit{Timaeus} presenting music as a disciplining force acting through the facets of harmony, melody and rhythm:

> Moreover, so much of music as is adapted to the sound of the voice and to the sense of hearing is granted to us for the sake of harmony; and harmony, which has motions akin to the revolutions of our souls, is not regarded by the intelligent votary of the Muses as given by them with a view to irrational pleasure, which is deemed to be the purpose of it in our day, but as meant to correct any discord which may have arisen in the courses of the soul, and to be our ally in bringing her into harmony and agreement with herself; and rhythm too was given by them for the same reason, on account of the irregular and graceless ways which prevail among mankind generally, and to help us against them. (Plato n.d.)

Thus the addition of the \textit{Timaeus} as co-text may point to a platonic gloss to the \textit{Roland}, the cosmological significance here is that unruly matter pulls at the simplicity of form. In the \textit{Roland}, characters repeatedly either break measure or seek to do so. Roland’s mockery renders Ganelon, initially singled out for his command of words, splutteringly inarticulate with rage, as is later the case with both Marsilie and Baligant. In his famous rebuke, Oliver warns Roland that “measure is better than folly” (“Mielz valt mesure que ne fait estultie.” l. 1725). Later, the social harmony of the Franks is threatened by Charles’s’ paroxysmal grief, prompting his counsellor, Geoffrey of Anjou, to exhort his lord to put aside his immoderate woe: “‘Sire emperere, […] / Ceste dolor ne demenez tant fort!’” (ll. 2945-46). The emperor’s

\footnotesize
\textsuperscript{3} For the most recent overview of the arguments surrounding this aspect (and others) of the chanson de geste, see Boutet 2011:353–69.
\textsuperscript{4} On aspects of the relation, see in particular Murray 2004:115–26.
tragedy is that form, whether artistic or social, cannot be allowed to break; Charlemagne is doomed to live on the edge of the “irregular and graceless” breaking into an unbearable excess of pathos. Equally, in the midst of this, Roland himself appears as the missing music in his own poem.5

The dramatic situation painted in the Roland mirrors various larger oppositions, not least between philosophy and art, both masteries of affect in their own way, with the former conceived as moderation and control, the latter as the spectacular maximisation of effect at the expense of proportion. Thus the music missing from the pages of the Oxford Roland is restoratively compensated in Digby 23 by an addition that highlights the epic text’s philosophical “musicality”. Here vernacular epic is recontextualised, the earliest surviving version of the Roland effectively allegorised by its incorporation into a single codex with the Timaeus.

Whereas in the Oxford Roland the music is conspicuous by its absence, in the manuscripts containing the Voir Dit it is highlighted by its prominent place on the page, designed and drawn to appear at least as much (if not more) to the eye than to the ear of the beholder. The Voir Dit is presented complete in three manuscripts, all of them numbering among the “complete works” Machaut codices: A: Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fonds français 1584; E: BnF, fonds français 9221; and F-G: BnF, fonds français 22545–22546. (For brevity these will hereafter be referred to by their sigla.) Evidence suggests that A was produced towards the end of the poet’s lifetime, and E and F-G some 15 years after his death.6

Taken at its most abstract, Machaut’s text is ultimately the poet’s address to song’s simultaneous celebration and betrayal of presence through audition’s fall into memory. Musical presence here is bound up with a truth playfully veiled by the conventions of both allegory and debates about sincerity in love. Yet, transcending such surface preoccupations, the Voir Dit is also a tale about writing, narrating its own genesis and even its production in manuscript form. The “believability” of this “true tale” is such that, whatever its actual basis in historical fact, it stands as useful witness to the journey from author to performer to reader, from inspiration to writing. In that respect, the Voir Dit has a multitudinous presence. It is a tale which purports to be true and which is told in the first person, yet which also contains

---

5 This comment ties in with Peter Haidu’s reading of the poem, in which Haidu presents the turbulent Roland as a necessary sacrifice to the foundation of the state’s sedentary peace (Haidu 1993). On the impossibility of irreplaceable objects in medieval literary culture in this regard, see also Aranye 2002.

6 The accepted chronology for the Machaut “complete works” manuscripts is that presented by Avril (1982:117-133).
extensive allegorical passages, a practice Laurence de Looze terms “pseudo-autobiography” (de Looze 1997).

What is the role of music here? The lady of the tale, Toute Belle, is an exacting audience, reader and performer. Described as the best singer for a hundred years, she is primarily interested in Machaut’s lyrics set to music, “qui onques plus me plaist” (see notably letters 22, 28, and 32). A dutiful memoriser, during the lovers’ final meeting she has learned by heart her lover’s newly composed ballade before the secretary has even finished notating it, an action which in itself tells us much about the transmission from composer to reader.

Quand j’eus ma balade finee,
Ma douce dame desiree
Dist: “C’est bien fait, se Dieus me gart.”
Adonc par son tresdoulz regart
Me commanda qu’elle l’eüst
Par quoi sa bouche la leüst,
Car, en cas qu’elle la liroit,
Assez mieulz l’en entenedoroit.
Et je le fis moult volentiers
Et du cuer; mais endeme[n]tiers
Que mes escrivains [l’escrisoit],
[Ma douce dame] la lisoit,
Si qu’elle en sot une partie
Ains que de la fust departie. (ll. 2361–74)

[When I had finished my ballade, my sweet lady said, “God help me, that is well composed.” And with her sweet look she asked me to give it to her so that she could read it out loud, for, in reading it, she could hear and learn it better. I did this willingly but she, meantime, while my secretary was still writing it, began to read it, so that she had already learnt some of it before she left that place.]

The manuscript presentation of this episode deserves comment. A shows the author writing notated music before the lady (see fig. 1). This is a symbolic action in at least two ways. First, the text speaks of the secretary writing at this point – not the lover himself, who composes and dictates. Second, the ballade which is being spontaneously composed – and learnt – at this point in the story is not, in fact, set to music.
The first of these discrepancies can be explained through the symbolic nature of the action. A, produced in the poet-composer’s lifetime, is careful to show him fully involved in all dimensions of his work, even if that representation involves a falsification of the actual process of production. This reinforces the claim explicit in a rubric to its index to have direct access to his wishes and implicit in the clarity of the musical presentation and the staging of a number of images such as this one.\(^7\)

However, the second discrepancy – the appearance of music in a scene where it is not called for – is more intriguing still. A, like the posthumous F-G, does not present the music to the Voir Dit within the tale, but elsewhere in the manuscript, in keeping with the narrative itself in the introduction to the tale. This also suggests the Voir Dit was already conceived as part of a complete-works volume when composed:

\[
\text{Des autres choses vous diray} \\
\text{Se diligemment les querés} \\
\text{Sans faillir vous les trouverés} \\
\text{Aveuques les choses notees} \\
\text{Et es balades non chantees} \\
\text{Dont j’ay mainte pensee eû} \\
\text{Que chascuns n’a mie sceu} \\
\text{Car cilz qui vuet tel chose faire} \\
\text{Penser li faut ou contrefaire. (ll. 521–29)}
\]

[I tell you that you will find the other pieces if you look carefully among those set to music and the ballades which have no music and with which I have been much preoccupied (which not everyone has been aware of), for those who would like to make such pieces must think carefully or else pretend.]

Thus, in A this is the only non-verbal reminder of the presence of the music which plays such a prominent role in the tale: where there is music to a lyric insertion it is indicated by the rubric “et y a chant”. As already mentioned, the posthumous F-G follows A in its presentation of the music outside of the Voir Dit itself. However, E disobeys the instructions in the text, and flamboyantly and joyously presents the music within the tale, across the full three-column width of the page (see fig. 2). More than a gratuitously virtuoso mise en page, we see here a recognition of how the

---

\(^7\) This is explored more fully in Maxwell 2009.
*Voir Dit*, so lavishly illuminated in the other manuscripts, was deemed particularly worthy of visual decoration, even though (for whatever reason) only four miniatures are present.

Machaut studies have long hunted for traces of the author behind the elaborate manuscript presentation. Such a plentiful corpus of “complete-work” codices is unique from this period, and Machaut’s works, especially *Le Voir Dit*, present him as particularly concerned with presentation and transmission. Accordingly, in sources as reputable as the Grove Dictionary of Music (and its descendents), Machaut’s “supervision” of production is stated as plain fact.\(^8\) \(A\) is favoured by those wishing to credit the author with the compilation of his works, while collections which do not follow the pattern of this manuscript, such as \(E\), are dismissed as unreliable or “unofficial”. Yet, in sympathy with Machaut, critics such as Jacques Derrida would certainly caution that such a complex culture of composition and production illustrates the problems of harping dogmatically on a single point of authorial origin.\(^9\)

Here, \(E\) stands in stark contrast to \(A\). By acting against the instructions in the text (instructions which, for want of a better word, could be described as “authorial”), \(E\) contests the place of the author, both here in the *Voir Dit* and elsewhere. Thus \(E\) targets a contradiction lying at the heart of the transmission of this most seemingly authorial figure, with music, virtuoso *mise en page* and even references to performance of the works serving only to highlight his absence.

Such removal – or relegation – of the medieval Rémois author finds a helpful mirror in critical writing emanating from the postwar Parisian Left Bank. As Roland Barthes remarks, “when the Author has been found, the text is ‘explained’ – victory to the critic” (Barthes 1977:147). However, the reverse is also true (hence the hitherto uncertain status of \(E\) within the Machaut corpus): as the presentation of *Toute Belle* reminds us, it is both easy and pleasurable to be “seduced” by an author, especially one as multitalented as Machaut. Yet “it is the flash itself which seduces, or rather: the staging of an appearance-as-disappearance” (Barthes 1975:9f). Thus, although *Toute Belle’s* voice marks a refusal to give in to her Pygmalion poet and simply become an obedient construct of his desire, her

---

\(^8\) See most recently Arlt (2006-). The most recent text to make this claim is the acclaimed Leach (2011), with, however, the important distinction that she discusses the various arguments and states her views clearly aware of what and how much she is assuming (chapters 1-2).

\(^9\) Derrida (1987) would perhaps be his most pertinent intervention here. His discussion focuses on an illumination by Matthew Paris of Plato seemingly dictating to Socrates (Oxford, Bodleian, Ashmole 304, f. 42v). On Derrida’s discussion as well as for a more carefully contextualised account of its medieval context, see in particular Camille 1996:115–50.
resistance is central to the strategies of erasure in Machaut’s own self-construction. While the tantalizing presence of the author in A and within Machaut’s works may give pleasure, we grasp at the open garment in vain to reveal more, such that, even after the careful work of several generations, we are left frustrated in our efforts to arrive at a historical truth when its elusiveness is in fact also part of the historicised game. As Barthes says, “in the text, in a way, I desire the author,” that verb capturing the impasses of a dialectic between presence and absence (Barthes 1975:27). Machaut and his collaborators thereby invite us to both accept and mistrust the authorial fetish. Authors do exist and have been live presences and loci of agency, but they also want to disappear. Thus, the different approaches in manuscripts represent less right-hand and left-hand paths of inquiry than complementary possibilities for reading – particularly for reading music(s) – that find form in the divergent approaches of different compilers.

Fig. 1: Paris, BnF, fr. 1584 (A), f. 242 (detail)
Image courtesy of the Bibliothèque nationale de France
Fig 2: BnF, fr. 9221 (E), fol. 198v

Image courtesy of the Bibliothèque nationale de France
BIBLIOGRAPHY OF WORKS CITED


The starting point for the following reflections about performance practice and its relationship to the musical work is a critical article in The New Grove Dictionary (6th ed. 1980). The article deals with one of the legendary musicians of the twentieth century, the Russian-American pianist Vladimir Horowitz who is criticised in a way that is unusual in a dictionary. My intention is not so much to take a stand to this criticism but to widen the approach and examine the statements (arguments) from a broader perspective, to contribute to a more general discussion about musical evaluations and their attachment to different opinions on what phenomenon the musical work is. During the 1920s and 1930s there was a radical change in ideals of composition and performance practice. The hypothesis of the author is that this change is grounded not only in new aesthetical ideals, but also in a different opinion on the nature of the musical work. This shift in paradigm is the result of a series of changes in society in which also (the) musicology played an important role.

In the article Horowitz is criticized for lack of stylistic sensitivity and for not subordinating himself to the intentions of the composer. Michael Steinberg, the author of the article, says that “It is nearly impossible for him to play simply, and where simplicity is wanted, he is apt to offer a teasing, affettuoso manner or to steamroll the line into perfect flatness.” Steinberg continues to say that Horowitz “conceives of interpretation not as the reification of the composer's ideas, but as an essentially independent activity;” and he exemplifies his criticism with the interpretation of Schumann's Träumerei, where Horowitz “places the highpoints anywhere except where Schumann placed them.” Steinberg concludes the article with the judgement: “Horowitz illustrates that an astounding instrumental gift carries no guarantee about musical understanding.” (Steinberg:723).

This criticism is interesting from several angles. Firstly it is unusual in a dictionary that strives for objectivity to make such a challenging statement. Horowitz was after all one of the most charismatic and admired pianists of the twentieth century. He was seen as “the last romantic”, a true heir of the “golden age” of piano playing, a performance tradition emanating from Liszt through Rubinstein and Paderewsky to Rachmaninoff and Hoffman. One cannot but suspect that Steinberg disliked the romantic style of playing that Horowitz represented. Secondly it is possible to connect Steinberg's judgement to a changing attitude towards the musical
work and its relationship to the score that took place in the twentieth century. Since Steinberg exemplifies his criticism it is also possible to verify his statement.

Steinberg’s choice of work is not random. *Träumerei* was one of Horowitz’ favourite pieces, both as a separate encore and as a part of *Kinderszenen*. The home page of Horowitz includes 69 different studio- and live-recordings and 49 of these have been studied in the present investigation. Even if there is a large span in the renditions there is at least a possibility to discuss Steinberg’s statements. In the live recording here chosen here, the one from the second of July 1974 in Washington the principle of inverted dynamic principle, that will be discussed later, is very evident.

When Steinberg writes that Horowitz ”places the highpoints anywhere except where Schumann placed them” the first question to take into consideration is what Steinberg means by highpoints. There are at least three possible interpretations.

The first highpoints to discuss are on a phrase-structure level. These are the only ones that Schumann has indicated by a crescendo sign. If one ignores the repeat of the first two phrases, *Träumerei* is built up of six phrases with a similar wave-like curvature, an ascending triad towards a chord and then a diatonically falling, sequenced movement back to the starting point. In most phrases Schumann has indicated a crescendo in the ascending triad. In a few renditions Horowitz seems to play as written, but in most recordings he explores different possibilities. Most often he makes a diminuendo at the end of the ascending triad instead of a crescendo. And he does not emphasize the highpoints, the chords in the middle of the phrases, as Steinberg takes critical notice of (see example 1).

Example 1

![Example 1](image)

From a modern “Urtext” perspective the natural question is why Horowitz does not play as written. There are probably several explanations for this. One touches upon the ambivalent character of the highpoint in the phrase. Schumann himself has obscured the chord by an arpeggio in the left hand. He has also located the highpoint on the second instead of the first beat of the bar, which undermines the
character of a clear highpoint. And most of the chords are not placed in root position. The reason for this has to do with the character of the piece which due to lack of space must be left out of this discussion.

Another explanation lies in a typically romantic way of interpretation that Horowitz applies – to mark highpoints by means of inverted dynamic. One of the most fundamental principles in the romantic art of rendition is that ascending lines are played crescendo and descending lines diminuendo. The rule is so consequently put forward in the performance directions that it sometimes seems superfluous to indicate this effect every time a melody is ascending or falling. A rule that becomes routine loses the fundament of its existence, its expressivity. To do the other way around is then a way to avoid the conventions and through surprise create a new expressivity. This inverted dynamic principle became such a prominent feature of the romantic performance style that it became a new rule in itself. Horowitz adopts himself to this widely spread romantic convention, a tradition that Steinberg (does not know about or,) perhaps (rather) does not sympathise with.

It is also possible to see the highpoints from a perspective of large-scale form. According to the dynamic rule that ascending pitches should have more and descending less intensity, a third highpoint may be seen in the second phrase of the middle section at bars 13-16, where the phrase is transposed up a fourth. This highpoint is slightly more ambivalent in Horowitz’s renditions. In most of the recordings he plays according to the basic rule with a strong crescendo towards climax, but in a few of the recordings he makes a diminuendo according to the principle of inverted dynamics discussed above (as is very evident in this performance). Schumann seems also to have left to the performer to decide how to shape this climax (see example 2).

Example 2.
However, Steinberg’s criticism must also be judged from a perspective taking account of highpoints on the level of the piece in its entirety. *Träumerei* has a narratively constructed form, where the ultimate highpoint lies in the moment of surprise in the last phrase of the piece, when the expected A major chord is exchanged for a G major chord in bar 22. This moment of surprise is the goal towards which all the other phrases get their raison d’être.

All phrases start in a similar way with an ascending broken major triad but develop in different harmonic directions (B flat-major, A major, D major etc.). Metaphorically it may be possible to compare the musical form to (with) a meditation where one tries to return to a “mantra” every time the thought flutters away. The song *Mondnacht* from *Liederkreis* has a similar recurrent melody and development towards a peripeteia in the last phrase of the piece, but has another large-scale form. The architectonic form of *Träumerei* is a three-part ABA form where the moment of surprise is emphasized when the expected A major chord in the repeat is changed to a G major chord. The highpoint is not only emphasized through this harmonic surprise. In spite of the large span of the hands Schumann seem to emphasize the chord by not playing it arpeggio. The chord is also put in a root position (see example 3).

Example 3.

In nearly all recordings Horowitz emphasizes this narrative structure of form in a conventional way. The G-major-chord is dynamically emphasized and the character of peripeteia is underscored through a following continuous and sensitively performed diminuendo. On the level of large-scale and narrative form Horowitz emphasizes the highpoints where they are musically motivated if we try to understand Schumann’s intention. Here Steinberg is simply wrong.

From what has been said it seems difficult to understand Steinberg’s criticism that Horowitz puts the highpoints “everywhere except where Schumann put them”. My hypothesis is that there may be something else that has irritated Steinberg. It is Horowitz’s way to punctuate longer musical phrases by emphasizing smaller subordinated parts. Normally every phrase has one main stress or in a wave-like type
of melody, an ascending and falling dynamic curve that corresponds to the melodic movement. The phrase may in its turn be divided into smaller parts or waves. Horowitz emphasizes these subordinate phrases in a way that makes the overall wave-like curvature seem fragmented (see example 4).

Example 4.

One explanation for this is again that this is a part of a romantic prosodic style. For example, it can be seen in the bel canto style of Mattia Battistini, one of Horowitz’ models. It is still heard in the twentieth century in the sighs and portamenti of for example Beniamino Gigli or Giuseppe di Stefano. It has also an idiomatic-stylistic ground in the romantic type of melody that is mostly not built as hierarchically built up as in the classical style. This means that the interpreter has more freedom to choose among conceivable prosodic articulations. Horowitz often favours shifts in harmonic tension over melodic arcs. It is also a part of his neurotic personality. To have a personal style was among the most important criteria of value during the romantic Era and to create contrasts in dynamics and timbre to keep the attention of his audience was essential for Horowitz. In his pursuit of a personal style he also extracted inner voices in the accompanying parts, a way also to be found in for example many variants by Chopin. Schumann himself breaks the musical phrase by means of a sudden change in dynamic in the following piece Am Kamin in Kinderszenen (see example 5 bar 17-18).

Example 5.
The most interesting aspect of Steinberg’s criticism emerges in a broader perspective as a sign of a shift during the twentieth century as regards to what the musical work is. The crucial question is the relationship between the score and the music itself.

After an exceptional start of his career in the 1920’s and 30’s Horowitz began to get bad reviews especially by the New York critics. Since these were influential and were imitated by other critics around USA, Horowitz had negative reviews in the USA at the same time as a wide audience all over the world idolized him. Harold C. Schonberg explains the changing attitude by the fact that a new generation now enters the scene in American musical life. The older generation of critics, born in the 19th century, were often educated in a late romantic tradition with the same musical ideals as those Horowitz represented. The new critics were instead educated in Paris. Their aesthetic ideal was the neoclassical anti-romantic ideal that emerged during the two world wars as a reaction towards the expressive German style of Wagner, Mahler, and Richard Strauss. Their ideals of style were the music of Ravel, Stravinskij, and “Les Six”. This means that these critics repudiated much of what characterized the romantic tradition. Transcriptions were banned and the romantic virtuosity was seen as vulgar. The performer was no longer seen as a co-creator in the musical work but as a servant. Romantic expressive means as broken chords, portamento and rubato became old-fashioned. Performing directions to play ”sans expression”, without expression, are to be found in works by Ravel, Stravinskij and Hindemith. The musical ”text” was seen as more important than the expressive meaning of the music. To give prominence to large-scale structures, the long lines in the music became more important than to stress emotional details. Fidelity to the work became synonymous with fidelity to the score.

These new performing ideals also lead to a new view of the musical work. When the performer no longer was seen as a co-creator, the work became less identified with those dimensions that belong to the transformation of the score to a sounding phenomenon. Timbre, dynamic, and rhythmic variety got a subordinate role. The dynamic and sonorous contrasts, which had been expanding during the romantic Era, were diminished. The renditions became more alike, more one-dimensional and the sonorous differences between foreground and background decreased. And the performing directions of the composer got a more secondary role for the meaning of the musical work. Steinberg’s criticism that Horowitz was not faithful to Schumann’s intentions may be regarded as a result of this shift in the ontology of the musical work.
Without evaluating the new ontology – the view of the musical work in the twentieth century is an idea as all other ideas, no worse or better – it brings some problems from a historical perspective.

Earlier on the co-creating role of the performer was not only necessary but also seen as an ideal. Improvisational elements like diminutions or thorough-bass realisation were natural elements in music making. To improvise “in extempore” was the starting point for the creation of music. Still at the end of the 18th century those who could not vary a repeat was seen as inferior musicians. In the 19th century the improvisational element in current sense diminished and was transformed to the rendition of the score. The first criteria of value were that a rendition ought to be as if the composer himself was improvising the work in the spur of the moment. From a historical perspective the twentieth-century view, that to be faithful to the work one has to play exactly as written in the score, is an alien view. It must primarily be seen as a reaction towards the romantic style and the liberties towards the score that the musicians took in the 19th century.

It is also a problematic view from an ontological perspective. Music in the Western art tradition is primarily a performance art. The score is only dots, neumes, on a paper. It is not possible to separate the musical work from the performance conventions. The transformation to a sounding structure is done by means of the performing codes of the time. By associating the musical work with some sort of simple, mechanical realization of the pitch-time-dimensions of the score the musical work was separated from its performance. The paradoxical result was that one did not see that the claim that the performers were to play only as written was a performing code in itself.

When Steinberg criticized Horowitz’s rendition for not being faithful to Schumann’s intention, this does not only mean that Steinberg had other performance ideals than those Horowitz embraced. It also implies that he had another conception of what the musical work is and is about. Steinberg supports his criticism from an a-priori-apprehension of what the musical work is. But this is not possible. From a historical point of view it is more correct to reverse the perspective and look upon the musical work as something that is created by the performing codes of its time. This means that the musical work has an inherent variability, depending on what in a given time and culture is seen as variable dimensions, but also depending on the changing performing rules from time to time.

Even the musicology played a central role in the identification of the musical work with its score. The philologist’s ideas about an “Urtext” diminished the
variability of the musical work. The musical analysts’ starting point in the score left the performance outside the musical work. Paradoxically even the scientific study of performance praxis took its starting point in this “objectified” musical work and not in the historically based work-concept of its time. This is most evident when it comes to the ideas about the musical work in the Romantic Era that in many ways was an inverted idea of the twentieth century concept.

From this perspective it is possible to understand what otherwise may be seen as a paradox: when thoughts about “Werktrue” and “authenticity” emerges more broadly in the middle of the twentieth century, Horowitz’s renditions of romantic music are criticized for not being faithful, in spite of the fact that they reflect the romantic performance style.

Steinberg’s (and Virgil Thomson’s in the 1940s) critic of Horowitz supports Richard Taruskin’s hypothesis that modern performing praxis and ideas about authenticity emanates from a modernistic anti-romantic ideal rooted in a contemporary musical work-concept. This may also be confirmed when listening to renditions of romantic composers on period instruments. When Norrington and Gardiner perform Schumann, Mendelssohn or Brahms, their styles of performance are closer to Karajan and Solti than Nikisch or Furtwängler.

The participation of musicology in this process puts the question about its ideological role in focus. Musicology does not only describe musical and social changes. It also influences and is influenced by these in a complicated interplay that from a scientific point of view is far from problem-free. The problems become even greater when people like Steinberg try to combine two different roles, the roles as a scholar and as a critic. (Steinberg studied musicology with Oliver Strunk and theory and analysis with Edward Cone and Milton Babbitt.)

The claim one has to put forward is that humanist scholarship must be conscious of its ideological role. It ought to reflect on its historical position and on the spirit of its time. One of the historical processes one has to be extra careful about is the mechanism of fashions. The age you react against you usually has the least sympathy for. Nothing is as outmoded as the fashion that has just been passed over. The repudiation of the romantic ideal in the twentieth century is something to be extra cautious about. If one uses a work concept emanating from a reaction towards the era one wants to understand, this may not only lead to misunderstandings but also to anachronisms.
RECORDINGS

Live recording discussed above from Washington 1974-06-02.

LITERATURE


Schonberg, Harold C. “Horowitz” Art. in *Oxford Music Online*.


Until recently there was only one recording of Finn Mortensen’s *Symfoni* (1978): Mariss Jansons’ recording with The Oslo Philharmonic Orchestra from 1982. In the fall of 2011, Terje Mikkelsen’s recording with Münchner Rundfunk-Orchester was issued. This paper questions how the two mentioned recordings could be read as documents through which we can learn to understand Mortensen and his *Symfoni* differently. It is not important in this context what the performers themselves have claimed about Mortensen or their interpretations. Instead, their interpretations will be read as statements in their own right.

**Introduction**

There is no neutral reading of any text. Any reading is a series of choices about which aspects of the work to ignore and which to highlight. The same applies to the reading, in performance, of a score. The score can thus only be understood in the act of a “performative interpretation,” and as it is interpreted it becomes something different from the imaginary neutral that it never was. The uninterpreted score – the notes on the page – is nothing but a heap of indexical references, lacking a pragmatic and syntactical framework in which those references could be understood. The ostensibly neutral score is thus a simulacrum because it is in want of a different original, where the differences could give the key to its meaning. It is only through two texts not saying the same that they can begin to have meaning, although we must assume that they somehow speak of the same matters if we are to understand the differences as meaningful interpretations.

There ought to be more than two different readings if we are to speak of critical interpretations. Roland Barthes (1993) showed with clarity how simple signification is the basis of myths. One object of knowledge cannot have a finite interpretation through one other utterance. Instead, the signifier/signified relationship between these two entities is merely the first in a texture of relations and meanings.

---


2 I use Levinson’s “performative interpretation” to denote a musician’s interpretation through playing whereas a “critical interpretation” is the scholar’s/critic’s interpretation through words. See Levinson 1995.
A singular critical reading of a score runs the risk of begetting a *mythological fallacy*, in which the score is assumed to contain neutral knowledge that the scholar extracts, and unless the scholar objects to his own conclusions and introduces multiple plausible interpretations, he will infer a one-to-one relation between his so-called critical interpretation and the score.

Whereas the scholar can interrogate an interpretation through discussion, the performer does not have that liberty. The performer could by all means make several performances, but this rarely happens in time proximal enough so that we could see the performances as two different arguments on the same matter. This is especially clear with recordings, where one interpretation is pinned down. Arguably, a first “performative interpretation” will thus *always* be subject to a mythological fallacy until another performance is created to enter into dialogue with the first.3

That is why Mikkelsen’s recording of *Symfoni* is so important. Regardless of how excellent Jansons’ recording may be, it has had a limited value in our understanding of Mortensen. There is nothing in the recording that can contradict the one-to-one relationship between the aspects of the score and recording that is focussed in the interpretation. Connecting what we find in Jansons’ recording to the score is not enough. We lack both a motivation for the connection and a discussion of alternative aspects that might be at stake in Mortensen’s music. Our reading will be imaginary and there cannot be anything in Jansons’ recording that counters Jansons’ reading, as another interpretation could accomplish. It is only through a second recording, such as Mikkelsen’s, that we can truly understand what was at stake in the first recording. It is only in light of the second recording that we can begin to see the significance of the aspects that were ignored in the first recording; and similarly, it is through Mikkelsen’s recording that we can see more clearly which aspects of the score that Jansons’ emphasized. Although we may assume that Mikkelsen’s recording is primarily a reading of the score itself, it is also a reading, re-reading and criticism of Jansons’ reading of the score.

Before we have a look at how these readings manifest and relate to the score and each other, let us take a brief look at the discourse surrounding Mortensen’s *Symfoni*.

---

3 This is not the place to discuss the complicated relationship between performances and recordings and their ontological differences. Live performances will in this article be ignored, as they are not documented as recordings.
The symphony and its reception

Perhaps \( \text{Symfoni} \) qua work is not a simulacrum. Perhaps there is an “original”; or we should perhaps call it an “authentic” version of the work because there are some references that are recurring so often when we speak of early Mortensen and his \( \text{Symfoni, op. 5} \) that it would be a failure not to acknowledge these.

The literature on the work is sparse. Elef Nesheim is the only scholar who has devoted a significant amount of time to Mortensen,\(^4\) but there are also a few other composers, scholars and critics who comment upon the \( \text{Symfoni} \). He began composing it in 1945 but it was during the winter of 1952/53 that most of the work was completed (it was first performed in 1963). It is often called a Neo-classical work (Nesheim 2001:118; Reitan 1988:9; Strømholm 1988:8). Bruckner\(^5\) was an influence to Mortensen, and so Mozart, and even Bach (Nesheim 2001:113). The \( \text{Symfoni} \) can also be seen as a culmination of Mortensen’s studies of Paul Hindemith’s \textit{Unterweisung im Tonsatz} (Reitan 1988:9), a book with which he had worked since the Second World War. All these influences were then incorporated into Mortensen’s own musical language (Nesheim 2011:3).

The work has raised no particular issues among its commentators. Nonetheless, they do emphasize the influences differently. A passing remark from the composer himself refers to Wagner: “Like the first theme of the first movement the material here leads one to think of the ‘unending melody’” (Nesheim 2011:6). There are nonetheless no other influences for the \( \text{Symfoni} \) that are discussed at length. I have excluded journalistic criticism of the piece, as it is neither deep nor specific enough.

What can we hope to gain from the analysis of the performances? A pertinent question is how the conductors’ readings of the score can relate to acknowledged musicological/historical knowledge of influences. I will not come to a simple conclusion, such as finding that one influence is exaggerated whereas another influence is pivotal to understand Mortensen. Still, getting a basic stylistic understanding of \( \text{Symfoni} \) is a necessary backdrop for us to speak of the work in

\(^4\) Peter Szilvay could be mentioned in this context. Szilvay has worked on editing the \( \text{Symfoni} \) and Mikkelsen’s interpretation is based on this. As I discuss general attitudes towards interpreting \( \text{Symfoni} \), I do not see how Szilvay’s filological work would significantly change my analysis.

\(^5\) Øistein Sommerfeldt points out the “Brucknerian grandeur in certain passages” (Nesheim 2011). In a newspaper interview Mortensen says: “Bruckner yes! His works should be performed more often. Without him I would not have thought of writing for orchestra” (ibid.). Reitan (1988:9) reiterates this connection. See also Nesheim 2001:112f.
meaningful terms. More importantly, the analysis can reveal other kinds of meaning in Mortensen’s work than historical/philological referential meaning. The narrative and texture is rather at the fore of their interpretations, and their takes on the issues are very different. To make the following argument comprehensible I will confine the discussion to the first movement of *Symfoni*.

**Two different narratives**

The two conductors present very different introductions. At first, it may seem as if Mikkelsen’s interpretation is the more dramatic of the two. He uses a far more extensive dynamic range, and there is more vibrato and rubato. Each slur and phrase is given a substantial weight on its own, and there is no doubt that Mikkelsen’s phrases are more expressive than Jansons’.

But Jansons’ narrative does not rest on the short phrases. The basic unit of his narrative phrasing rather encompasses the fugal introduction as a whole. The dynamic range is limited in Jansons’ interpretation, and he uses little vibrato or rubato. What I called phrases in Mikkelsen’s interpretation are downplayed in Jansons’ rendition of the work. With Jansons, these elements (the short phrases) are not independent but they are instead interdependently weaved into the texture as a whole. Mikkelsen discursively lets one phrase take over from the other. He withdraws the present phrase dynamically and with rubato, and then carefully introduces the next. Jansons way of letting one instrument take over from the next is rather stealthy. It is as if the voices were already sounding when they are introduced; the voices are therefore subordinate to the texture and counterpoint under Jansons’ baton. Thus, the melodies interweave into one coherent texture where the elements themselves are not at the fore, but it is the sum of the texture and timbre that is what artistically is at stake.

**Narration of time**

Both interpreters’ narratives are linear, but the scope of time is different. Jansons builds up to the first climax (four bars before B in the score) by building one subtle and slow crescendo. From the perspective of phrasing, this entire minute and a half sequence is the smallest unit that he works with. Mikkelsen, on the other hand, divides the score into phrases and subphrases. Like Jansons he builds the first minute and a half towards the climax but he does it through concatenating small units of meaning. Particular notes of interest are accentuated, be it through dynamics or agogics, but this is done with subtlety and does not stop the build-up towards the
climax. As Jansons’ recording lacks this accentuation we could say that his phrasing at a smaller level is more limited than Mikkelsen’s. One could even say that his phrasing is static, focussing durative planes of sound rendering the music as a slowly transforming condition. In this context we can speak of Mikkelsen’s interpretation as discursive and dynamic as it plays out one phrase against the next.

**Gesture and form**

We could also voice this as a choice of how to deal with gestures and large-scale form. Mikkelsen’s agogic gestures, his use of ritardando and dynamic withdrawal to prepare for the next element, points out the large-scale elements of the music. Jansons, by contrast, points out the parts of the large-scale form with varying emphasis on texture and timbre. He is, in fact, not very interested in the internal structures of the gestures of the piece. An example is letter A in the score, where Jansons downplays the slurs in favour of the building his continuous crescendo towards four bars before B. Mikkelsen emphasizes each slur more clearly in this passage. He brings out the value of the notes relative to each other, and this gestural differentiation of notes plays back on both the character and on his conception of time, which yet again is based upon smaller values than Jansons’ interpretation. Jansons’ more sober interpretation puts large-scale structure and contrapuntal elements to the fore whereas Mikkelsen presents a Mortensen who is more oriented towards gestures. Mikkelsen does bring out the large-scale elements, but it is done through the ways in which he shapes the gestures of the music.

**Counter-factual historiography**

Had the commentaries on Mortensen’s Symfoni been rich enough, it would have been interesting to investigate whether the availability of only a single recording – Jansons’ – might have limited critical interpretation of the work, and whether the appearance of Mikkelsen’s recording changed our understanding of the Symfoni. A problem with my own analyses of is that I knew both recordings well when I began working on this paper. Was I to write an analysis/criticism only of Jansons’ recording, I would most likely rely more on historical knowledge, by, for example, trying to find intertextual references. These references would serve to find evidence of how Jansons’ interpretation signified the score. It would be interesting if I could discuss, from this vantage point, how Mikkelsen’s recording changed and shed light on my understanding of the first recording. As it is not possible to invest myself with retrospective ignorance, I must conclude with stating that the discussion about how
the conductors deal with time, timbre/texture and the other aspects I have discussed, would not be possible if we had had access only to Jansons’ recording.

**Intertextual conclusions**

I have pointed out the narrative elements at stake in the two interpretations, but how do these relate to the prevailing discourse? With its romantic gestures we could suggest that Mikkelsen’s interpretation is more Brucknerian than Jansons’. Jansons, on the other hand, could be related both backwards in time to Bach and Mozart, and to a more recent modernist aesthetic with his interest in more static conditions and timbrally oriented music. The Neo-classical vein in Mikkelsen’s interpretation could perhaps rather be called Neo-romantic because of the heavy vibrato and use of agogics. Still, the gestural thinking is instead a classical or a baroque feature, alluding to a rhetoric style of playing. On the one hand, Jansons’ sober reading is classical/baroque rather than romantic, but as his interpretation avoids small-scale rhetorical gestures; it would be difficult to speak of it as a Neo-classical interpretation. This sobriety could instead be read in a modernist vein, as already noted. His sparse style could in turn be interpreted in many ways. We could see it as a logical summarization of all the historical influences on the Symfoni; or we could understand it as an answer to recent modernist tendencies (Second Viennese School and Fartein Valen); or perhaps as heralding his future artistic avant-garde output. Yet another way of seeing Jansons’ Mortensen is in light of his affiliation with Yevgeny Mravinsky and the Leningrad Philharmonic Orchestra. From this perspective, we could argue that the sober and sparse Neo-classical interpretation he invokes is a Soviet one, and more particularly that it follows in the spirit of Dmitri Shostakovich.

These interpretations may seem speculative, and I make no claim that they are anything but. Nonetheless, although they do not lead to clear-cut conclusions I would say that they are more true to the interpretive possibilities inherent in Mortensen’s score than the most meticulous philological intertextual investigation. The readings of the interpretations indeed suggest that there are different ways to understand the same passages or forms, and it would be naïve to argue that merely one of these possibilities was artistically valid or true. Each possible interpretation

---

6 This may be contrary to how a historically informed performance practice was as the almost constant use of vibrato is of later date than Bruckner’s time.
speaks in favour of how the actual work may relate to the intertextual references to other works/composers.

**Objections to the analysis**

Through my analysis and the interpretation of the analysis, I have attempted to show how the musician/conductor can contribute to our knowledge about a musical work. It may seem somewhat frustrating that the answers are not clear and that there are so many plausible answers – many of which are contradictory. Also, through this way of investigating I no doubt raise more questions than I answer.

I have made some claims based on artistic differentiation, and my musical integrity is therefore open to examination. Is it required that other informed listeners can or must come to the same conclusions as I did for my argument to be valid? Could there be other plausible performative interpretations, and how would the emergence of such a recording affect the argument here? Would it matter if such a performance was better or worse than the two existing recordings? Who would decide what is better and what is worse? What about my suggestion that we were dealing with a Neo-classicism in the footprints of Shostakovich? Can the critical interpreter introduce and perhaps force upon the work affiliations with which neither composer nor earlier commentators have pointed out? The question of music and language has long been discussed, but do we face particular challenges when we deal with performative interpretation? Can we claim to say anything at all about the musician’s activity or intentions merely from listening and introspection? Is the musician’s intention related to the meaning of the work? Can the musician make a statement of which he is not aware? What would it take for us to acknowledge that our view is open to contradiction?

**Conclusions**

Taking only the score into account, it is difficult to say what is at stake in the work. Jansons’ recording was a first signification, which brought some aspects of the score to sound while repressing others. Nonetheless, it was only with the appearance of Mikkelsen’s recording, that we could here the choices in Jansons’.

Through his conducting, Jansons tells a story about polyphony and texture, and his first phrase spans the minute and a half of the fugal introduction of the first movement. Mikkelsen, with his gestural approach, phrases each instrumental cue. He gives more weight to singular tones of interest and his narrative consists of many small phrases that together build the form of the fugal introduction.
The two interpretations signify different inherent possibilities of the score, and some of these possibilities could not be pronounced or envisioned until they were realized in sounding recordings. That is why I have called the original score a simulacrum, as it asks us to find meanings that a mere structural/analytical reading of the score cannot reveal. We need to actually play the music to become aware of the possibilities. True, there is a complex texture of references running out from the work, but focussing too strongly on these to understand the meaning of the work would be to blind oneself from what may be at stake in the work. The validity of Jansons’ large-scale phrasing and Mikkelsen’s shorter phrases could neither be decided by a reading of the score or by referring to earlier influences. Both influences and score do indeed serve as a fruitful backdrop for us to lead our discussion. Also, the interpretations shed light on Mortensen’s influences, but we need to ask different questions than the analytical and philological to grasp the potential of the Symfoni.

The two conductors’ different narratives point towards possibilities in the score that only a performative interpretation can reveal. I have tried to voice some of these choices, and I have also attempted to show the necessity of consulting performances if we are to make any sense out of musical works artistically.
REFERENCES


HEIDI KORHONEN-BJÖRKMAN & RITVA KOISTINEN

MUSIKINSTRUMENTETS INVERKAN PÅ GESTALTNINGEN AV DEBUSSYS
Flickan med linhåret. Dialog mellan en pianist och en
kantelemusiker


Trots våra olika bakgrunder arbetade vi båda två utifrån musikerns perspektiv: vi skiljer inte mellan ”spel av musik” och ”musikverk” (Cook 2003). Vi intresserade oss för hur och varför olikheter i våra musikerperspektiv förekommer, och om de kan lokaliseras på specifika ställen i stycket. Dessutom var vi intresserade av huruvida vår uppfattning om stycket och vårt förhållande till det skulle ändras under projektets gång.¹


Konsertversionen av Finlands nationalinstrument kantele liknar harpan i många avseenden, till klangfärg och tekniska egenskaper. Konsertkantelen har 39 strängar stämda i diatonisk skala (C-dur). Ett av de grundläggande elementen i kantelespelet är kromatiska tonväxlingar av C-durskalans toner genom spakar, som alltså motsvarar konsertharpans pedaler. Konstmusikrepertoaren för kantele består i stor utsträckning av nykomponerad musik. Därtill spelar man arrangemang från klassisk-romantisk repertoar för piano eller harpa. *Flickan med linhåret* är med sitt förhållandevis snäva tonomfång möjlig att spela direkt ur pianopartituret på kantele.2

Kärnan i vårt forskningsmaterial består av en inspelningssession, där vi spelade stycket och diskuterade. Vi transkriberade sessionen tillsammans (VLI 2011). Inspelningen gjordes som en ljudinspelning (90 minuter) och kompletterande videoinspelning (35 minuter).3 Inspelningssessionen föregicks av tre förberedande sammankomster, av vilka en var en presentation inför publik, och efterföljdes av två

2 Den högsta (c4) och den lägsta (G1) strängen i Ritvas kantele omfattas inte av spakarnas kromatiska tonväxlingar. Ritva skapade tonen Gess genom en låg stämning av strängen.

3 Vi hanterade både ljud- och videoinspelningsapparaterna själva.

**Olika utmaningar för pianisten och kantelemusikern**

Analysen av det inspelade materialet visade att den mest slående olikheten ur musikerperspektiv är att *Flickan med linhåret* är ett förhållandevis svårt stycke för kantelemusikern, och en betydligt mindre komplicerad – dock inte problemfri – uppgift för pianisten.


Exempel 1, takt 5–6

![Exempel 1, takt 5–6](image)

Under inspelningssessionen påpekade Ritva att kantelemusikern i *Flickan med linhåret* måste ”göra en hel del innan stycket sitter”, och Heidi noterade att ”du [Ritva] verkar göra [stark betoning på ”göra”] så mycket mer med fingrarna än jag”. Det ”arbetsamma” intrycket kan alltså vara relaterat till kantelemusikerns fysiska kontakt med sitt instrument: det är stor skillnad i att ta en ton genom och känna

---

4 Samtliga notexemplet är typsatta av Torbjörn Björkman med LilyPond.
fingertoppen mot ljudkällan (strängen) och att ta tonen genom att slå på en tangent som slår på en hammare som slår på strängen. Musikern och klangen har alltså mycket närmare kontakt i kantelespel än i pianospel. Det här återspeglas i Ritvas upplevelser:

Jag anknyter utformningen av klang starkt till kroppens sinnesupplevelser, särskilt till hur jag använder mina armar och hurdan kontakten mellan fingertopp och sträng är. Olika sätt att knäppa påverkar klangfärgen. (RK 2011:8)

En del av utmaningarna beror på att kantelemusikern spelar ett arrangemang av ett pianostycke och måste modifiera den tekniska realisationen av notbilden. Exemplen nedan illustrerar hur Ritva ändrade partiturets fördelning mellan noter spelade för vänster respektive höger hand.

Exempel 2a, takterna 33–34, ursprunglig fördelning

Exempel 2b, Ritvas fingersättning

Särskilt takterna 19–22 kräver fysisk ansträngning av kantelemusikern. I pianoversionen av *Flickan* gestaltas det här stället som styckets ”topp”: det är tacksamt att spela, för där kan man njuta av rörlighet och behöver inte vara försiktig med dynamiken. (VLI 1: 37.)

Exempel 3, takt 19–22

Exempel 4, takt 11–12


**Om det individuella instrumentet, stämningen och tidsdistributionen**


De olika sätten att hantera tempot och tidsdistributionen var intressanta att betrakta. Ett första intryck av våra genomspeiningar (två i början, en i slutet av sessionen) var att Heidi spelade en aning snabbare. Utan att vi gjorde några exakta tidmätningar – sådana var inte intressanta för vår forskning – gick det ändå med lättthet att observera att våra val av tempi inte var långt från varandra. Ritva

---

5 Under sammankomsterna hade Heidi inte en enda gång ett ”favoritinstrument” att spela med.

Exempel 5, takt 27–28

Mästerverk eller mellanmål?

En betydelsefull skillnad i piano- och kanteleverionerna var vår uppfattning om vilken roll *Flickan med linhåret* har i sviten av tolv preludier. För Heidi framstod stycket som ”ett mellanmål” eller ”en andningspaus i den långa serien av preludier” (VLI 2011:14), som är enklare att spela som en del av en svit med preludier än för sig. Separat spelat växer stycket enligt Heidi till ett större verk än vad det är, en attityd som väcker en stark reaktion hos Ritva.

Ritva [med emfas]: Om det bara var en ”andningspaus” mellan två temperamentsfulla stycken, hade Debussy brytt sig om att skriva så här många slags föredragstecken?

Heidi: När man övar så är det klart att man noterar tecknen, men när man sedan spelar [igenom], så kommer de här sakerna liksom automatiskt.

Ritva: Kanske där finns ett potential till bågge [stark betoning på ordet bågge].

Heidi [upprepar]: Det är ändå svårt att spela för sig. Det är psykologiskt enklare att börja stycket efter det föregående preludiet. (Ibid.)

Citatet ovan avslöjar att Heidis förhållande till *Flickan med linhåret* ingalunda var oproblematiskt, trots att stycket är ett ”enkelt” Debussyverk för piano. Ritvas relation till stycket var uttänkt; hon hade arbetat sig igenom utmanande musikaliska och tekniska frågor och förstärkt sin interpretation om ett ”litet mästerverk”. Hon försvarade styckets självständighet, och påpekade att kantelemusikern inte har möjlighet att spela svitens andra preludier, och att ”åtminstone mitt arbetssätt är sådant att jag finslipar miniatyren” (VLI 2011:14 & 16). Heidi hade inte behövt lösa tekniska problem i samma utsträckning som Ritva, men verkade sakna något annat att ”finslipa”, något som skulle ge karakter åt stycket.6

**Den dynamiska skalans relativitet**

Anledningen till att Heidi upplever det ”psykologiskt enklare” att spela *Flickan* som en ”andningspaus”, torde bero på den dynamiska skalans relativitet. Efter ett kraftfullt stycke (exempelvis preludiet *C'est qu'à vu le vent d'ouest*, som föregår *Flickan med linhåret*) är örat adapterat till en viss ljudnivå. *Flickan* låter svagare, även om man

---

inte spelar den särskilt försiktigt. En kantelemusikers öra är adapterat till en mindre volym och en snävare dynamisk skala.

Trots den större fysiska ansträngningen som utförandet kräver är den absoluta ljudnivån mindre och nyanserna finare på kantele än på piano. Kantelemusikern kanske förväntar sig att karaktären i *Flickan med linhåret* byggs runt de möjligheter, som en mindre volumnivå möjliggör. Heidis beskrivning nedan (HKB 2011:3) illustrerar skillnaderna i våra relationer till ljudvolym.


Den speltekniska och musikaliska ”enkelheten” i *Flickan* är förrädisk. Man måste kunna betona rätt och nyansera fint inom en ganska snäv skala. Vad gör man under de långa bågarna, då pianots klang försvinner för snabbt? (HKB 2011:3–4)

Även det här citatet visar att Ritvas tolkning baserade sig på en avvägd reflexion och en auktoritet: ”Det var som att spela för sin lärare” (ibid.). Ritvas etablerade relation till stycket återspeglades också i att Ritva förberett den vokabulär som hon uttryckte sig med vid inspelningssessionen, medan Heidi var den som ställde frågor till Ritva och bytte spontant samtalstema efter de idéer som hon fick under dialogen. En betraktelse av vår dialog och interaktion visade alltså att vi intog delvis olika roller under projektet. Ritva observerade dock (RK 2011:4) att våra sätt att diskutera började närma sig varandra under inspelningssessionen.
Om vokabulären


Exempel 6, takt 24–25

Ritva hade, förutom att hon reflekterat över de franska föredragstecknen, arbetat med att tänka ut ett sätt att verbalisera sin spelupplevelse,. Uttrycket ”omväxlande 'aktivitet' och 'passivitet’” beskrev kvaliteten hos Ritvas fysiska fingerarbete. Metafren om ”armen som gungar på vågor” beskrev de inledande takterna av stycket. För Heidi fungerade inte den här metafrenen, eftersom hon associerade den till en stor rörlighet i handleden. Risken i överdriven rörlighet är brist på kontroll i anslaget och överdriven och felaktig accentuering på tonerna dess och ess i spelfiguren (VLI 2011:6).
Heidis attityd till de franskspråkiga föredragstecknen var annorlunda: för henne var språket bekant och hon var van vid termerna från tidigare spelad fransk musik. Hon uppfattar franska föredragsanvisningar som integrerade delar i ett partitur av fransk musik, en kulturell kutym att översätta de italienska. Därför var de franska termerna för Heidi inget hon behövde specifikt behövde ta ställning till. Exempelvis ordet ”cedez”, (i takterna 11, 23 och 27) hade Ritva tolkat som ”släppa taget” (hesittäen) var i Heidis ögon en motsvarighet till den italienska musiktermen ”ritardando”, alltså en generisk uppmaning att sakta in (ibid.).

**Avslutande kommentarer**

Pianistens och kantelemusikerns uppgifter i *Flickan med linhåret* är olika: pianisten ska relatera ska till en existerande uppförandepraxis, medan kantelemusikern skapar en ny. Ritva som den klassiska kantelespelets pionjär är den som i många avseenden kan betraktas ha skapat en Debussy-tradition på kantele.

Den utvalda synvinkeln, musikerns, fokuserar på de ”arbetsamma” aspekterna i ett musikverk. De är ofta dolda för lyssnaren:

Då kantelemusikern spelar *Flickan med linhåret* möter hon vissa utmaningar: hur kunde denna miniatur klinga ”oskyldigt”, ”ljus”, ”rent”; hur kunde man få musiken att flyta så att den friktion som uppstår ur tekniska obekvämligheter inte förmedlas till lyssnaren? (RK 2011:8)

Vi var intresserade om vår studie skulle leda till att våra respektive relationer till stycket ändrades.
Lite modifiering skedde: våra tempoval påverkades av varandras utföranden, och Heidi försökte inhämta idéer för nyansering och balans i de arpeggierade ackorden från kantelens specifika klangfärg.

Framför allt fick vi en fördjupad insikt i olika tolkningar och om de instrumentrelaterade orsakerna till tolkningarna. Vi fick också kunskap om hur det är att fungera som en kollegial lyssnare och diskussionspartner. De personliga tolkningarna ändrades slutligen förhållandevis lite, eftersom instrumentens egenskaper gav ramar för vad som var möjligt och ändamålsenligt att göra.
REFERENSER

FORSKNINGSMATERIAL


LITTERATUR


Clarke, Eric; Cook, Nicholas; Harrison, Bryn; Thomas, Philip (2005). ”Interpretation and performance in Bryn Harrison's être-temps.” *Musicae Scientiae*, XIX (1), s. 31–74.


Leong, Daphne & Korevaar, David (2005). ”The Performer's Voice: Performance and Analysis in Ravel's *Concerto pour la main gauche.*” *Music Theory Online*, vol. 11(3). http://www.mtosmt.org/issues/mto.05.11.3/mto.05.11.3.leong_korevaar.html


Historical questions
My paper will follow two different tracks, note however that it has the character of the tip of the iceberg. I will discuss what Theodor Adorno and Norbert Elias mean to me in connexion with my research on the musical life in Europe in the Eighteenth century. I want to understand how the structure of music changed, how reactions to different kinds of music changed, and how these changes could be understood as music was used in different ways in relation to the on-going psychic changes of men/women within the changes in society. For reasons to be clear – reasons that can be understood as interwoven in my career as a musicologist – I’ll speak more of Adorno than Elias.

I met the writings of Adorno early on in my career but Elias much later. Both, however, have been of great importance to me. Elias was the first scholar to receive the Adorno Prize in 1977. Adorno was, in Elias’s words, a humane Marxist; his reliance on Marx brought with it disadvantages since it bound Adorno “to a system of thought based on the range of experience and knowledge of an earlier epoch, which was only partially appropriate as guidance to the reality of his own time” (2009:84). Elias and Adorno, however, had rather similar backgrounds, and shared many experiences. Their scholarly output is both similar and different (Bogner 1987).

Adorno’s and Horkheimer’s joint book, *Dialektik der Aufklärung* (2002) which they wrote during their stay in California in the 1940s, is a highly influential study. It says that it is not the rationalization of the world that is to blame for the present evil, but the *irrationality* of this rationalization. To them the enlightenment process started already in Greece, but its promises of freedom and advanced cultural life were soon reversed. The promises of the Enlightenment, moreover, were soon seen to dissolve as a bourgeoisie capitalist society in the Eighteenth century slowly emerged. As they write “with the ending of free exchange, commodities have forfeited all economic qualities except their fetish character […] has spread like a cataract across the life of society […] Individuals define themselves now only as things” (ibid.:21). After 1789 “German” music and philosophy within the established bourgeois order entirely functionalized reason. Thus, with a hint to Kant they conclude: “It became purposiveness without purpose.” If this book gave me much to think about concerning the Eighteenth century, we found, already in the 1970s, other books by
Adorno to be equally engaging (1949; 1967). An Anglo-American wave of Adorno reached us in the beginning of the 1990s, and several “new” musicologists also often referred to Adorno in their work.

The first Elias’ book I encountered was *Involvement and Detachment* (1987). As I now browse through the book, I find many comments in its margin. One of these that I had underlined read: “The inability to control tends to go hand in hand with high emotivity of response, which keeps the chance of controlling the dangers of the process at low level, which keeps at a high level the emotivity of response, and so forth” (p. 48). The comment I had written here was “Rock ⇔ Brahms. Different kinds of music – different uses.” It led me to read *The Civilizing Process* (1978/79). Here I met the concept of “figuration,” and was struck by the metaphor Elias had chosen. It started: “One should think of a mazurka, a minuet […] or rock’n roll […] as mobile figurations of interdependent people on the dance floor […] like every other figuration, social figuration, a dance figuration is relatively independent of the specific individual” (ibid.: 214).

Even if many musicologists in the 1990s must have noted Elias’s Mozart book (cf. below), I realised that probably only few were familiar with Elias’s oeuvre. My essay ”Fr-a-g-me-n-ts” (1995) was an effort to counter this situation. Even today, however, a search for Elias in RILM get few hits. In my essay I pointed out that for Elias the individual was always inseparable from society, just as our language, our knowledge and our consciousness are all intimately connected in the societal process. The societal process, just like processes in nature, is blind and unpredictable. Elias’s book (1983) on the court societies was also very important. I used it a lot as I wrote a book (2002/2008) on the aesthetic project of the history of Western music that attracted some attention. To Elias it was important to show that the court society created a personality type that had to manoeuvre completely in public, but whose behaviour was at the same time very carefully regulated. The refined taste of the courtiers had a demarcating function downwards. The courtiers viewed external objects differently from how the bourgeoisie came to do in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Things in and by themselves, for example courtly music, meant less objectively than what they connoted in relationship to the never-ending power drama. As Elias

---

1 As we didn’t at the time understand his views on popular music one colleague said of Adorno’s ideas of popular music that he didn’t “know how to waltz.” We thought that was true, but it was not (cf. Müller-Doohm 2005:55).
wrote: “While we like to objectify or reify everything personal, court people personify the objective” (1983:100). No courtier should needlessly be surprised by completely unexpected musical structures. Everything was predefined, even compositions’ affect. Composers, as a rule, wrote for the glory of the most high on earth and in heaven.

The bourgeoisie was also exposed to as many constraints as the members of court. The members of the bourgeoisie were above all formed through their professions. But the demands and strains that were part of professional life for the bourgeoisie were different. Leisure could be seen as a free zone in which a meaningful part of the musical aesthetic project could be developed. The bourgeoisie, who principally lived in both a professional and a private world, found themselves (especially at the many German courts), in the shadow of a noble hegemony, which at the same time blocked their ambitions to change. This process carried on for many generations, and the outcome depended upon how one engaged and accepted the noble values of the time, as well as on how different rational and thought processes affected the bourgeoisie in their professional lives.

The structural changes in music can then be understood as the continuous process of psychogenesis and sociogenesis in the eighteenth century. To slightly expand on this interrelatedness between, on the one hand, the different structures of different musics, as for instance Galant and Empfindsamkeit, and, on the other hand, the changes in the evolving mind-sets of the bourgeoisie as they used music, playing and listening to newly composed works by equal members of their own society. From an Eliasian perspective this also means that the socially constructed essentialism that bestows a Sonata composition by for instance C.Ph.E Bach that were bought, played and listened to, become a more and more deep experience for those who came in contact with the music (Bloom 2010). The “phenomenon” that we endow greater values to objects we owe and care for slowly became a more common psychological effect of every commodity from the 18th c. (either the individual in his use of the object was aware of its commodity character or not). It became difficult to separate the socially invested value in the music from its sounding structure per se.

Elias’s Mozart book (1991) was published in Swedish already in 1992. The reception of this book among sociologists and musicologists was both varied and easy to understand, as Elias’s aim was to understand Mozart’s predicaments, his place and role from his contemporary social-psychological situation; in short, why he disillusioned gave up at the age of 35. Elias had begun this project in the late 1970s, but did not proceed with it for many years. It was unfinished and the time his death
in 1990. Since I was familiar with Elias’s writing, the book’s sociological-
psychological message came as no surprise to me.

One of Adorno’s primary interests was the work of music as a sedimented
example of the historical and social situations, contradictions and disillusions of the
art object itself (cf. 1997:33). In contrast to Elias, Adorno was more interested in
studying the concepts of experience in history than the actual use. But Adorno also
wrote much on Beethoven (first published 1993). He started with this in 1934 and
continued until his death in 1969.3 As a “companion” to Dialektik der Aufklärung this
unfinished project was of special interest to me. The book consists of two big essays
and smaller contributions from various places in his large output. Adorno writes
mainly about Beethoven’s instrumental music.

What I consider as a fact, that music primarily is a syntactic system, with little
semantic content – though it is a contextualised object played, composed and
listened to by humans in history – amounts to an almost invincible problem when
one confronts the task of understanding what instrumental music means or what, if
at all, it itself communicates. The long discursive Western tradition has framed the
possibilities for what we believe or take for granted. To what extent music can
communicate any kind of semantic information, however, is a contested problem.
These problems of the interpretation of a sounding structure, however, were as a
rule not of special interest to Adorno. In his idiomatic way, he would for instance
state, that it is music that understands us, and not the other way round. To him, the
import of Beethoven’s musical compositions mirrored the general societal
developments that took place during Beethoven’s life. Adorno thus took his
departure from the idea that art’s relationship to society was one to one.

Adorno suggestions about musical structures – not least concerning the
implications or “meanings” of musical structures – are, as always, sweeping (a
standard musicological complaint about his working method).4 Briefly, it can be said
that he offered many comments on general structural differences between the later
two “styles” of Beethoven and tried to show analogous societal developments. While
the music of Beethoven’s middle period showed that the bourgeoisie’s place in
society – their hope for personal freedom within a society imposing collective
constraints on its citizens – had a meaning and was possible, this possibility was later

4 Cf. for instance DeNora (2003:255f); Leppert in Adorno (2002:513-34); Witkins (1998:28-68); and Subotnik
denied them. A dialectical phase towards untruth couldn’t be stopped, thus the balance between personal freedom and social constraints tipped into an unplanned and false direction. The promises of the Enlightenment were felt to slip away; no reconciliation was possible. Beethoven’s music had to change since it was no longer possible to write the music of the middle period kind.

There is a rift between Adorno’s philosophical interpretation of music’s meaning and Tia DeNora’s book on Beethoven (1995). DeNora seeks to understand the social circumstances in which Beethoven lived and worked in Vienna from the 1790s. DeNora shows that it was the nobility rather than the bourgeoisie that took the late style to their hearts. From an analysis of the social status of the audiences that attended and supported concerts with more demanding programmes (music also from the late period), she shows that by openly supporting Beethoven, the prominent nobility could more easily secure their leading position in music culture. The nobility could thus for a while keep its position as the giver of taste in the on-going fight over or negation of power balance between the nobility and the bourgeoisie.

For Adorno, however, it was important to untangle the truth content of Beethoven’s music. This could be known only through philosophical reflection (1993:31; c.f. Spitzer 2006:266ff). Music, Adorno believed, had to become autonomous and an aesthetic art, thus criticising society. Music felt this need, and moreover, as Adorno said in the last sentence in his third fragment on Beethoven’s late style: “In the history of art, late works are the catastrophes” (Adorno 2002:567; c.f. Adorno 1993:233). 5 Defending Adorno’s theory, Spitzer writes that “autonomy is only possible through economic factors: developments in capitalism which produced a bourgeois class capable of contemplating… music in itself” (2006:269). But as I’ve shown elsewhere, there exists no autonomy for any kind of social object (2008:177f). Spitzer also points to the uniqueness of an artwork, and adds, hinting at Adorno’s concept of Nicht-Identität: “Aesthetic particularity has cognitive implications, since the ‘meaning’ of an artwork […] can never be exhausted by interpretation […] It is in this respect that art critiques society” (2006:269; c.f. also Adorno Key Concepts (2008:56f)). But again, how can music as a form of non-semantic communication in itself criticize society? And how did music find this out? I’m not convinced of this line of thought …

As just stated, the problem with Adorno’s complicated message is not just that his music analyses are sketchy and inconclusive, the bigger problem is that to him

---

5 If one understands this comment literally, it is untrue, cf. for instance the music of Brahms (Edström 2002b).
Beethoven’s music worked in parallel with Hegel’s philosophy, or as Adorno meant: Beethoven’s music is even more true than Hegel’s philosophy (1993:36). But as Hegel’s philosophy, Beethoven’s music also needed to be explained philosophically as a (sounding) text: “That music can say just what is its own, that means that words and concepts are not in position to immediately express its content but can facilitate it, i.e. as philosophy.”

6 It was, thus, more than a heightened analogy: “ein Analogon, dass blosse Analogie überschreitet” (1993:288). By this interpretation, Beethoven’s music could, thanks to Hegel, say what Hegel could not, even if Hegel never wrote about Beethoven’s late style (Federhofer 2004:136; Adorno 1993:288). But how the truth that Adorno speaks of can be explained in music remains a mystery; moreover, how can a non-semantic system (music) in parallel with the changes of Western history on the road to Auschwitz, be a sounding proof of the untruth of the Western trajectory?

The simple conclusion thus is that Adorno’s Beethoven project failed.7 It seems as his interest (from the 1920s) in the utopian promises of the music Second Viennese School and his personal musical competence, coloured his later views and experiences of Beethoven’s music. In comparison to his personal and sociological know-how of the music life of 20th century, he does not seem to have been much interested of the musical life in the 18th century. His disinterest in explaining mediation, how the process of interaction between music and society actually worked, is particularly problematic in his Beethoven study (c.f. Paddison 1993:108ff and Subotnik 1991:19).

The overall problem to me, then, is that Adorno does not grapple with the use of music at the time from an ethnological perspective. As DeNora puts it, what is needed “is a greater attention to the … practice of composing, distributing, and consuming music … the social construction of musical worth” (2003:26).8 There is, of course, also the problem of reception. Even if Kivy (2009:24f) has it right: at the end of the century some literati and music critics did wonder about the “best” way to listen to Beethoven’s music, that is they tried out a “non-narrative” way, few if any could mount up to the structural-formalist way (the Expert listener) that Adorno

6 Cf. “Dass Musik nur das ihr Eigene sagen kann: das bedeutet, dass nicht unmittelbar Wort und Begriff ihren Inhalt auszusprechen vermögen sondern nur vermittelt, d.h. als Philosophie” (Adorno 1993:31/my translation/).
8 Adorno’s book of Beethoven’s music is, of course, but one study. The interpretation industry of Adorno is vast and ongoing. For a recent general contribution cf. Szibolsky (2005), for a musicological cf. Hooper (2006).
recommended and was a master of (c.f. Edström 2008:123). And, by the way, in Holmquist's (2011) we find that “the absolute majority of Beethoven’s chamber music” almost never was performed at public concerts (p. 181).

It will come as no surprise then that I find greater use of Elias’s writings. The period of time that is of special interest to me goes from ca.1720–ca.1800, in terms of musical style from high-baroque, galant music, Empfindsamkeit, to late Viennese Classicism. This period of time has traditionally been of relatively little interest to musicologists. This was hardly the time of Bach and Mozart but Graun and Hasse (Schultze 2007). Since I am interested in the interrelated changes between human beings, music and society, a grounded knowledge of the societal changes is of utmost importance. As Elias writes, the changes in society also affected the bourgeoisie, and meant, especially in Germany, that more and more men and women were influenced by enlightened ideas – but also that they discovered the irrationality of the world, contributing to the founding of movements such as Pietism on the one hand, and on the other hand to “taste” for the intelligentsia. Scientific and rational ways of understanding also fostered an opposite, a different kind of sensuality. To my mind, then, the importance of this process from a musicological point of view has not been fully explained in an Eliasian manner. The process clearly took place at different speeds in different countries. As Elias has showed, it was much easier for the French bourgeoisie to rise within the centralised French kingdom, than in a fragmented “Germany,” where the division between nobility and the bourgeoisie was sharp. It fostered here an inward movement through which the bourgeoisie “had to find themselves.” They invested more and more energy in their Kultur, their education and sensibility. This inward-seeking movement found its expressions to a great extent in poetry and music. The new emotional style of letter writing and style of Empfindsamkeit clearly point to this, and can easily be shown in poetical and musical detail. Britain, however, is somewhat a case of its own, since as early as the first half of the seventeenth century commercial forces in an oncoming market society strongly affected the way culture was understood and used. The slow change in the power balance meant that, as the nineteenth century progressed, the taste of a new

---

9 Adorno doesn’t show up in Holmquist references.
10 Already in the 1720s, one can trace how the new musical style, galant style, developed. Scheibe, for one, in the 1730s criticized Bach’s polyphonic music. Cf. Wolff: “An orientation toward the taste and needs of a wider public seems to have been entirely foreign to Bach” (1991:374).
market-oriented capitalistic–industrial bourgeoisie came to overlap with the earlier court taste, a process Elias spoke of in *The Court Society*.

To conclude: Dichotomous thinking à la Adorno, however fascinating,\(^{11}\) sooner or later lands us in a straightjacket and limits epistemological thinking, and especially so, if the researcher has a prophetic disposition or little understanding of how and why cultural objects are *used* in everyday life. Elias thus might have been thinking of Adorno when he wrote in a later preface to *The Civilizing Process*: “Social phenomena in reality can only be observed as evolving and having evolved; their dissection by mean of pairs of concepts which restricts the analysis to two antithetical states represent an unnecessary impoverishment of sociological perception on both empirical and theoretical levels” (1978:186).

Sociogenesis and psychogenesis work together.

---

\(^{11}\) Cf. though Klein (1998:13ff) for the importance of reading Adorno.
REFERENCES


– Theodor W. Adorno Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy

http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/adorno/ (2010.10.28)
Wenn von der Musik als einer selbstständigen Kunst die Rede ist, sollte immer nur die Instrumental-Musik gemeint seyn, welche, jede Hülfe, jede Beymischung einer andern Kunst verschmähend, das eigenthümliche, nur in ihr zu erkennende Wesen dieser Kunst rein ausspricht. (Hoffmann 1810a: col. 631)

In his famous 1810 review of Beethoven’s fifth symphony, E.T.A. Hoffmann asserts that the true nature of music is to be found only when there are no words attached. Were poetry to be mixed in, the pure realm of music would be tainted and music would lose its transcendental nature; and it is precisely in its transcendental nature music has its highest purpose. As Hoffmann explains:

Die Musik schließt dem Menschen ein unbekanntes Reich auf; eine Welt, die nichts gemein hat mit der äußern Sinnenwelt, die ihn umgibt, und in der er alle durch Begriffe bestimmmbaren Gefühle zurücklässt, um sich dem Unaussprechlichen hinzugeben. (Ibid.)

As Pauline Watts (1972) has demonstrated, the view of a spiritual world related to the physical by the medium of music was fundamental to Hoffmann (cf. Negus 1965). At the same time he was himself an avid composer of operas. This considered, it comes as no surprise that he put considerable effort into working out an aesthetic that would justify also the genres opera and song.

Hoffmann presented his theory of romantic opera in the essay Der Dichter und der Componist in Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung in 1813. In short it consists of the realization that also the poet can be in touch with the spiritual world: “… denn das Geheimnis des Worts und des Tons ist ein und dasselbe, das ihnen die höchste Weihe erschlossen” (Hoffmann 1813b: col. 800). The inspired poet has to write a libretto that reveals the spirit-realm; then the music will “… unmittelbar und nothwendig aus der Dichtung entspringen” (ibid.: col. 801).

One reason for Hoffmann’s focus on opera might have been his total disregard of the popular operas performed at the time. As he stated in an 1810 review of Gluck’s Iphigénie en Aulide:

In Hoffmann’s view opera was clearly in need of radical reform if it was to reach the heights of the other genres; curiously though, that is not the case of song. At least some songs actually seem to be on par with instrumental music regardless of their presumably mundane words. Remarkable is also the fact that when Hoffmann writes about song he does not express himself in the same revolutionary manner he uses when talking about instrumental music. On the contrary, his standpoints seem to be those of the previous generation, as are his examples. The ideal composer of song, according to Hoffmann, was Johann Friedrich Reichardt, a composer often seen as stuck in old views, unable to understand the new instrumental music. It seems somewhat paradoxical that Hoffmann refers to Reichardt and the second Berlin Lieder school when he tries to explain his ideal of song. How can this be?

Hoffmann deals with song above all in two reviews in Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung: one of Wilhelm Friedrich Riem’s Zwölf Lieder, Op. 27, and one of Beethoven’s overture and incidental music to Goethe’s Egmont. In addition to these some illuminating statements are made in a review of Reichardt’s Grande Sonate pour le Pianoforte in the same publication. Together these reviews provide an insight into Hoffmann’s views on song. Hoffmann offers Reichardt’s Freudvoll und leidvoll and Jägers nachtlied as examples of the ideal song; we will study these in detail in order to understand that ideal.

If adding words restricts the true nature of music, this seems to put song in a rather precarious position. From this standpoint song cannot be regarded as anything but an impure form of music. But, according to Hoffmann, this is not the way to look at it. Instead song ought to be regarded as a specific art form that is neither poetry accompanied by music, nor music explained by words, as the following description implies.

Wer so, wie R.[eichardt], in die Dichtung einzudringen vermochte, wer so von jeher darauf ausgegangen, beydes, Gedicht und Musik, auf das innigste zu verknüpfen, wird bald sich daran gewöhnen, beydes als integrierende Theile Eines Werks, ja Einer Kunst, anzusehen. (Hoffmann 1814a: col. 345)

When ideal, song is not the art of poetry and the art of music going together hand in hand, but a unique artistic entity.
In Hoffmann’s words it is the object of a song “Mit der einfachsten Melodie, mit
der einfachsten Modulation, ohne alles Künsteln, ohne alles Häschen nach Effect
und Originalität, das Gemüth im Innersten anzuregen ...” (Hoffmann 1814b: col.
683). “Von dem tiefen Sinn des Liedes angeregt, muss der Componist alle Momente
des Affects, wie in einem Brennpunkt auffassen, aus dem die Melodie hervorstrahlt
...” (ibid.: col. 682).

For such a radical innovator as Hoffmann, here he seems to stand curiously firm
in the traditions of the previous century. To bring all emotions into a single focus
sounds quite similar to Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg’s emphasizing the
“Hauptempfindung des Liedes” instead of a poem’s individual words (Marpurg
1759: 169), a view expressed with clarity by Johann Philipp Kirnberger:

Es ist auch unrecht, beym Ausdruck des Affekts, einer oder der andern Strophe allein
zu folgen, man muss vielmehr auf das Ganze acht haben, und daraus den
herrschenden Affekt zum Grunde legen, weil der Affekt einer und der andern Strophe
himmelweit verschieden seyn können. (Kirnberger 1782: 11; see also Mizler 1738: 16-
18.)

Also Reichardt argued for the priority of the whole over the parts of a song.

Das Lied soll der einfache und fassliche musikalische Ausdruck einer bestimmten
Empfindung seyn, damit es auch die Teilnahme einer jeden zum natürlichen Gesange
fähigen Stimme gestatte; als ein leichtübersehbares kleines Kunstwerk muss es um so
notwendiger ein korrektes vollendetes Ganze seyn, dessen eigentlicher Werth in der
Einheit des Gesanges besteht, und dessen Instrumentalbegleitung, wo nicht
entbehrlich, doch nur zur Unterstützung des Gesanges da seyn soll. (Reichardt 1796)

Underlying the demand for a unified whole in a song, present all through the 18th
century, is a technical consideration. When composing a strophic song, the musical
expression must fit all the different strophes of the poem. Hence, when the composer
seeks to imitate the emotion expressed in the poem he cannot look too closely at
every individual word or strophe, but must aim at the whole.

Considering Hoffmann’s visionary views of music as a medium enabling the
listener to reach a transcendental spirit-realm, his focusing on this technical demand
seems a bit surprising. Could this really be all Hoffmann requires of the ideal song,
or is there possibly something more to it? It has already been mentioned that
Hoffmann chooses to illustrate his conception of the ideal song with two examples by
Reichardt. Maybe a closer look at those would provide us with a more elaborate
understanding of Hoffmann’s views?
Jägers Nachtlied.

*Im Felde schleicht ich still und wild,*  
*Lausch mit dem Feuerrohr;*  
*Da schwebt so leicht dein liebes Bild,*  
*Dein süßes Bild mir vor.*

*Du wandelst jetzt wohl still und mild*  
*Durch Feld und liebes Tahl,*  
*Und ach, mein schnell verrauschend Bild*  
*Stellt sich dir’s nicht einmal?*

*Des Menschen, der die Welt durchstreift*  
*Voll Unmuth und Verdruss,*  
*Nach Osten und nach Westen schweift,*  
*Weil er dich lassen muss.*

*Mir ist es, denk’ ich nur an dich,*  
*Als in den Mond zu sehn,*  
*Ein stiller Friede kommt auf mich,*  
*Weiss nicht wie mir geschehn.*

Goethe’s *Jägers Nachtlied* was frequently set to music during the late 18th century (Friedlaender 1902:174-175). Reichardt’s setting, published for the first time in 1781, was not the first, but arguably the most popular. He included it in several later song collections.

As a strophic song with four strophes, the demand on the music to fit all strophes alike clearly applies here. What is at stake in this task becomes particularly clear looking at the different emotions expressed in the four strophes. In the first the protagonist describes himself as “still und wild”. In the second he contrasts this with his loved one’s “still und mild.” In the third it is talk about “die Welt durchstreift voll Unmuth und Verdruss.” Finally in the fourth strophe the protagonist is filled with “stiller Friede.”

Clearly it would be untenable to have the music follow the text word by word; already the contrast between “wild” and “mild” would be unsurmountable. Instead Reichardt has had to create a general musical expression working for all four strophes. With the marking *Langsam und leise* he has chosen to focus on the tranquil.
This is probably the most natural solution; after all this is a “Nachtlied.” Besides, tranquillity is very much an expression also of the first strophe, albeit with an added tension, indicated by the words “schleich” and “lausch.”

This general expression of tranquillity is supported by the uniform rhythm, following the unvaried iambic metre of the poem. Also the simple harmony, consisting of nothing but tonic and dominant, as well as the complete lack of (indicated) dynamic change, helps to purvey a tranquil mode. Even the parameter that does express a little more action, i.e. the melody, stays well within controlled boundaries; in the second half of the song the melody moves a little faster and a little wider, supported by faster harmonic changes, but it never departs from the overall mode.

If tranquillity can be said to express a general nightly mode corresponding to this being a “Nachtlied,” then what about the “Jäger”? Reichardt uses this as the general musical trope all through the song, in that the horn is central for the whole song. Besides two horn parts, suggesting horns as the recommended accompaniment, the melody as well as the accompaniment are completely triadic, imitating the horn (the top horn part is equal to the vocal part).

With his setting Reichardt has responded to the challenge of a strophic song creating music general enough to fit all strophes. But with the focus on nightly tranquillity and the hunting horn he arguably carries the concept of a “Hauptempfindung” further than a mere technical tool.

**Liebe / Klärchens Lied aus Egmont**

*Freudvoll und leidvoll,*  
*Gedankenvoll seyn,*  
*langen und bangen*  
in *schwebender Pein,*  
himmelhoch jauchzend  
zum *Tode betrübt,*  
glücklich allein  
*ist die Seele die liebt,*  
glücklich allein  
*ist die Seele die liebt.*
It is not clear exactly when Reichardt set to music this song from Goethe’s *Egmont*. Already in 1791 he mentioned the intention of writing music to this play, but most likely work was not begun until 10 years later for a performance at the Berlin *Nationaltheater* (Braunbehrens, Busch-Salmen Salmen (2002:124-125). The song was eventually included under the title *Liebe* (without any mention of *Egmont*) in the second volume of *Lieder der Liebe und der Einsamkeit* published in 1804. It later appeared also in the second volume of *Goethes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen* of 1809, here under the title *Klärchens Lied aus Egmont*. In addition to these collections it was published on its own in a couple of editions, something that points to its popularity at the time.

Since the song consists of only one strophe, the technical issue described by Kirnberger clearly does not apply here; the simplicity and single focus lauded by Hoffmann cannot be the consequence of adapting the music to several differing strophes. As a matter of fact Reichardt actually lets the melody follow the text fairly close in this setting, albeit in a relatively general way (i.e. major harmony and upward melodic movement expressing happiness, and minor harmony and downward melodic movement expressing sadness). Regardless of the tone painting though, Hoffmann still finds this to be the ultimate example of a proper song. Why that is will hopefully become clear on a closer examination.

This song is rather short, consisting of a mere 20 bars, divided into 5 phrases of 4 bars each, out of which the last phrase is a slightly ornamented repetition of the one before (which comes natural since it is a repetition of the concluding words). Of the other three phrases, the second is a minor mode version of the major mode first. Only the third phrase stands relatively by itself, but at the same time its melodic material comes solely from the first two phrases. Obviously this sharing of melodic material is something that helps give the song a single focus musically.

Musical unity is achieved also by the uniform arpeggiated accompaniment that remains the same all through the song. In addition the simple harmonies (nothing beyond tonic, dominant, tonic minor and its dominant) also contribute to keep the song in a single focus. And even though the different emotions expressed in the text are followed closely by the melody and harmony, because the musical material used to express these emotions are so uniform, an overall homogeneity is preserved all through.

To use the same musical material to express contrasting emotions might be a handy way to create musical coherence, at the same time it is actually a way to express the very gist of the song, made evident already in the opening words.
“Freudvoll und leidvoll.” In love the step is not long from joy to despair, true love is an inseparable mixture of the two. So, in this setting the music is intricately in sympathy with the text, both on the minute level as well as on the whole.

The simultaneous presence of conflicting emotions reveals also another key characteristic of this song that contributes to the single focus: the complete lack of development. There is no course of events; the text is the completely descriptive portrayal of a static state, i.e. that of love. In Hoffmann’s view this was the central idea not only of the song, but also of the whole play. As he argued in his review of Beethoven’s music to Egmont: “Das, was in Göthe’s Egmont eines jeden Gemüth vornämlich tief anregen muss, ist Egmonts und Clärchens Liebe.” (Hoffmann 1813a: col. 474). In a sense then this song could be said to be the deeper meaning of the whole play brought into a single focus.

If Reichardt’s Jägers Nachtlied carried the concept of a “Hauptempfindung” further than a mere technical tool, then in Klärchens Lied it becomes clear that the unity provided has added a significant dimension to the song. Here unity is no longer a question of a basic common emotion, but of a complex idea binding all parts together. In this unity the different parts are not independent but intertwined, all relating to each other.

As Peter Schnaus has shown, this idea of the whole as a unity of intertwined, dependent parts is crucial to Hoffmann (Schnaus 1977:74). This is because what Hoffmann is aiming at is “...die inhaltliche Paradoxie der Repräsentation des Unendlichen im Endlichen am konkreten Werk faßbar zu machen,” this in order to express the “romantisch-pantheistische Idee vom Unendlichen, Absoluten als dem All-Einen” (ibid.). If music is to reveal the spiritual realm it cannot be expressing an easily representable, graspable whole; to be able to offer the transcendental transference it must express the inexpressible, in the finite it must present the infinite. It is precisely this unity of intertwined, dependent parts that we have seen in the Reichardt songs: the unity of “wild” and “mild” in Jägers Nachtlied and of “freudvoll” and “leidvoll” in Klärchens Lied. In this they are both expressing that inexpressible so crucial to Hoffmann, and hence they are able to transfer the listener to the spirit-realm regardless of their mundane words. And so song does not have to be a less valid genre, but can actually be as justified as instrumental music.

When Hoffmann puts forward Reichardt and the second Berlin Lieder school it is because their views provide an ideal suitable to reinterpretation. Reichardt’s demands for a song to be the “einfache und fassliche musikalische Ausdruck einer bestimmten Empfindung” and a “vollendetes Ganze” offer Hoffmann the perfect
prerequisite for his song ideal. All he has to do is basically to add his transcendental implication on an already existing view. He actually tries to do the same also with opera, where Gluck is the model providing him with an ideal of simplicity and unity. But where the second Berlin Lieder school was still the prevailing ideal of the time, Gluck’s operas were not held in the same high regard. Possibly this was one reason why he put so much effort elaborating his ideal of opera, whereas he dedicated only a few short reviews to his ideal of song.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


"O, hvor jeg vilde ønske at der i mit eget Land var Anledning til at faa dygtig Undervisning!" skriver den syttenårige norske musikkstudenten Agathe Backer Grøndahl 1866 fra Berlin, hvor hun – langt hjemmefra – fikk sin musikalske utdannelse ved Neue Akademie der Tonkunst, som tilsammen varte i tre år.


Denne presentasjonen vil gi en oversikt over situasjonen angående høyere musikkutdannelse i Norge sammenlignet med de andre skandinaviske nabolandene på 1800-tallet. I tilslutning til dette skal de mest betydningsfulle institusjonene for høyere musikkutdannelse i Berlin for skandinaviske musikkstudenter i tidsrommet fra 1850 til 1900 bli nærmere omtalt. Ved hjelp av eksempler på redegjørelser som korrespondanse, dagboknoteringer, biografiske intervjuer samt evaluering av data fra

---

1 Foreliggende tekst er en delpublikasjon av arbeidsresultatene av forfatterens dissertasjonsprosjekt om profesjonaliseringen av den norske musikkutdannelsen og impulser fra Berlin i det 19. århundre.
3 På dette tidspunktet som ennå ugift, er hennes navn Agathe Backer. For enkelhetsskyld benytter jeg konsekvent hele hennes navn. Under dette er hun også i dag kjent som komponist.


---

5 Faktisk fantes det allerede på begynnelsen av det 19. århundre konkrete planer fra enkelte personer om å opprette en musikkutdannelsesinstitusjon samt forskjellige forsøk på å overbevise staten om å investere i et offentlig musikkutdannelses institutt.

6 Bl.a. av Lars Roverud (1776-1850), en pregende musikkpedagog i Christiania på begynnelsen av århundre, som hadde studert sangpedagogikk i Leipzig og Stockholm.
Til tross for at også betydningsfulle musikere som Hallålan Kjerulf, Ludvig M. Lindeman eller Carl Arnold engasjerte seg i planleggingen, ble forslaget forkastet av Stortinget (Gaukstad 1964:15).


II


skandinaviske musikere var dessuten Berlin attraktiv ikke minst på grunn av den geografiske nærheten til de nordiske landene. Byen lå i tillegg på veien mellom St. Petersburg og Paris, en populær reiserute for de betydeligste kunstnerne på denne tiden (op. cit. 189).

III


For å kunne begynne et studium i utlandet måtte mange forutsetninger foreligge. Ved siden av en allmenn utdannelse og elementære musikkunnskaper, samt


\section*{IV}


Først et overblikk over antall studenter fra Norge, Sverige og Danmark som studerte ved Königlich akademische Hochschule für Musik på 1800-tallet:

\begin{flushleft}
\begin{itemize}
\end{itemize}
\end{flushleft}


Databanken kan også være interessant for kjønnsforskningen. Den gir opplysninger om antall kvinnelige studenter fra de forskjellige landene, hvilken undervisning de pleide å delta i og hvilke instrumenter de valgte som hovedfag. Dataene som har blitt samlet til nå, viser at antall kvinnelige og mannlige skandinaviske studenter på 1800-tallet var likt fordelt. Siden kvinner i Tyskland på 1800-tallet ikke hadde tilgang til de fleste studiefagene, ble musikkstudiene en av de første høyere utdannelsemuligheter for dem. Studiene fordypt den musikalske utdannelsen til borgerlige kvinner eller var en tilleggskvalifikasjon for guvernanter eller for kvinnelige klavervirtuoser, som etter sitt studium i tillegg kunne arbeide som pedagog. Under institusjonaliserings-

Selv om det ved musikkutdannelsesinstitusjonene i Berlin ikke for eligger noen retningslinjer angående fordelingen av studieplasser til kvinner og menn, er det tydelig at kvinneandelen generelt har en sterk sammenheng med rangordenen til de forskjellige institusjonene. Høgskolen hadde en lavere status enn universitetet og private akademier, likeledes hadde konservatorier igjen en lavere status enn høgskolen. Dess lavere rangorden, dess høyere andel kvinnelige studenter.

VI

nærer kjent ved denne anledningen, men det er et faktum at han senere assisterte henne under en konsert i London.


\textbf{IX}

Til slutt kan det konkluderes med at det musikalske yrkeslivet til skandinaviske musikere på 1800-tallet i vesentlig grad må ses i lys av utdannelsesforholdet i deres hjemland. Mens det i Danmark og Sverige på grunn av monarkiets behov eksisterte institutter for utdannelse av profesjonelle musikere, fantes det for nordmenn ikke noe lignende tilbud. Orienteringen til det mellom-europeiske utlandet var ofte følgen av dette. Fra 1850 ble Berlin stadig mer attraktiv for norske musikkstudenter. For å kunne starte et studium med et tilfredsstillende omfang og dermed profitere av byens musikkliv, måtte enorme økonomiske forutsetninger oppfylles. Antall skandinaviske studenter i Berlin må ses i sammenheng med utdannelsessituasjonen i hjemlandet deres. Til tross for at videre forskninger utestår angående innflytelsen på profesionaliseringen av musikkutdannelsen av de mange musikere, som fikk sin utdannelse i Berlin, er det allerede nå åpenlyst at denne er betydelig.

Når vi betrakter utviklingshistorien til de musikalske utdannelsesinstitusjonene, blir sammenflettingen av musikklivet i Tyskland og Skandinavia nok en gang tydeliggjort. De opprettede institusjonene er resultatet av en til dels hard og lang politisk og samfunnsrettet prosess og en omfattende kulturell utveksling mellom Nord- og Mellom-Europa, som har vart over flere århunder. En enestående tilkjempet verdi som det gjelder å ta godt vare på.

\textsuperscript{11} I motsetning til hans mor, er ett korrekt stavemåte av etternavnet til Agathe Backer Grøndahls tredje sønn med bindestrek.

---
LITERATURLISTE


KILDER


KENNETH SPARR
DEN GITARRSPELANDE SOCKERBAGAREN
OM CARL JOHAN GRAFSTRÖM OCH HANS GITARRSKOLA


---

¹ Exemplar av denna finns i Statens musik- och teaterbibliotek (2 ex under signum Gi. S. a 1), i Uppsala universitetsbibliotek (signum Sv.instr.mus.tr. Läroböcker 36:8) samt Lunds universitetsbibliotek (signum Musik).

**Gitarren i Sverige under första hälften av 1800-talet**


---


**Gitarrskolor**

Till skillnad från t.ex. pianot och violinen blev gitarren aldrig ett konservatorieinstrument under 1800-talet och det finns exempel på att synen på gitarren var något nedlättande och ibland föraktfull. Det är först på 1900-talet som man börjar se gitarren som ett seriöst musikinstrument och ger den plats i den högre musikundervisningen. En konsekvens av detta var att det saknades en standardiserad undervisningsmetodik eller standardiserade läroböcker för gitarren. Som Erik Stenstadvold framhåller bidrog säkert gitarrens frånvaro vid konservatorierna och bristen på en standardiserad pedagogik till en stagnation i instrumentets utveckling under andra hälften av 1800-talet (Stenstadvold 2010:xii). Det gavs därmed också utrymme för en vildvuxen flora av gitarrskolor och varje gitarrist med självaktningslighet publicera sin egen gitarrmetodik.\textsuperscript{5} Den mest framgångsrika i genren torde vara Ferdinando Carulli vars gitarrskolor gavs ut på många språk, i många varianter och under mycket lång tid. bara i Sverige trycktes Carullis verk i minst två olika versioner, varav den ena gavs ut i inte mindre än åtta upplagor och den andra i minst fyra. Men även Mauro Giuliani's *Studio per la chitarra* gavs ut i en komplett svensk översättning på 1840-talet och trycktes i en andra upplaga under samma årtionde. Utländska gitarrskolor fanns dessutom tillgängliga i Sverige mycket tidigt på 1800-talet. Redan 1801 annonseras t.ex. om Trille Labarres *Nouvelle méthode pour la guitare*.\textsuperscript{6} Några år senare, 1804, görs reklam för en tysk översättning av Charles


\textsuperscript{5} Stenstadvold 2010:xii-xv ger en god översikt över gitarrskolorna och deras utveckling under perioden 1760-1860.

\textsuperscript{6} Dagligt Allehanda 22 september 1801.

**Grafströms Ny Guitarre-Skola för begynnare...**


Guitarrens vänner kunna med skäl kļaga öfver den ringa uppmärksamhet man här i landet egnar detta, om det rätt behandlas, angenäma kammarinstrument. Deremot har man anmärkt, att det dyrbara, svåra och, hvad stämningen beträffar, ömtåliga och

---

7 Stockholms Posten 7 mars 1804  
8 Statens musik- och teaterbibliotek signum Gi. S. a 1  
9 Stockholms stadsarkiv, Jakob och Johannes kyrkoarkiv E II:9 Lysningsbok 1873-1880, 58; Stockholms stadsarkiv, Adolf Fredriks kyrkoarkiv B I a:31, Inflyttningslängd 1891, fol. 95v-96.
kostsamma pianot, numera ej får saknas ens i portvaktarens trånga boning.
(Grafström 1857:4)


---

10 *Intelligensblad för svenska bokhandeln* No. 2 den 23 januari 1858.
11 *Intelligensblad för svenska bokhandeln* No. 24 den 28 November 1857.
knappast ha varit några pekuniära intressen som låg bakom Grafströms publicering av sin gitarrskola eftersom han var verksam som framgångsrik och välbeställd konditor. Jag inbillar mig att det snarare handlar om ett genuint intresse för gitarren och möjlichen med tanke på att stimulera sin förstfödda, dottern Marie Pauline, att bli intresserad av instrumentet.

Carl Johan Grafström bör både ha behärskat gitarrens spel och varit kunnig i musikteori för att kunna skriva en gitarrskola. Kanske han i samband med sin vistelse i Frankrike under senare delen av 1840-talet också kom i närmare kontakt med gitarren där. Han skriver i förordet till sin gitarrskola att ”den är frukten av praktisk erfarenhet”. Var, hur och när han bekantade sig med gitarren är inte känt, men han har haft god kännedom om både Carullis och Giulianis gitarrskolor. Han har dessutom synpunkter på deras pedagogik. Om 1800-talets gitarrskolor skriver Grafström att de innehåller:

(t.ex. Carullis) en mängd mer eller mindre lätt kompositioner, hvilka alldeles icke äro några etuder och således alldeles utan allmän nyttja för eleven, eller också (t.ex. Guillianis[sic]) en så stor mängd och så omständligt utarbetade etuder att nybörjaren snart misströstar och i de flesta fall innan han ännu har lärt något, lemnas i sticket af det tröttnade tålmodet.

Grafström skriver vidare att hans egen gitarrskolas utgifvande är föranledt af en varm önskan, att på kortaste vägen förda eleven grundligt och väl så långt framåt, att han, då skolan är väl genomgången, bör med lättethet kunna exeqvera alla vanliga guitarr-ackompanjemanger och, om han önskar utbilda sig till solospelning, snart skall vara hemmastadd i Mauro Guillianis [sic] superba Guitarrskola för mera försigkomne, till hvilken denna bör anses såsom en förberedelse. (Grafström 1857:4)

Grafström avstod från att ta med traditionella övningsstycken med intressantare musikaliskt innehåll. I stället försés eleven med repetitiva övningsstycken. Det enda stycket som identifieras är skillingtrycket Fjällgubben (Långt upp i Norden på fjällryggens topp...) som var populärt under 1800-talet.12 Liksom Grafströms andra publikationer inom helt andra områden så kännetecknas hans gitarrskola av systematik och noggrannhet i detaljer. Han förutsätter en läsare utan musikaliska

---

förkunskaper och inleder med en utförlig genomgång av musikens och notationens grunder. För den som vill fördjupa sig i mera solistiskt gitarrspel rekommenderar Grafström Giulianis gitarrskola, t.ex. i avsnittet om "fioriturer". Vid tiden för publiceringen av Grafströms skola fanns Giulianis *Studio per chitarra* tillgänglig i svensk översättning och redan före 1850 var den inne på sin andra upplaga (Giuliani 1842-1848). Giulianis skola förutsatte också att eleven hade de grundläggande kunskaper i musik som just Grafströms skola ger. Grafström säger inget detaljerat om anslagstekniken för höger hand, d.v.s. vi får inte veta om vi skall anslå med naglar eller fingertoppar. Om högerhandens placering säger han att den "bör hvila på sitt lillfinger, som stödjas på Guitarrens resonansbotten, midt emellan stallet och ljudhållet." Detta var den brukliga handställningen under större delen av 1800-talet. Han refererar också till den äldre tekniken att använda vänster hands tumme på den lägsta strängen vid vissa ackord och grepp. Däremot säger han inget om användningen av ett capo tasto som annars var vanligt förekommande. Grafströms gitarrskola var i första hand avsett för att utföra ett ackompanjemang till sång och att hans ambitioner sträckte sig inte så mycket längre. Hemmamusicerandet hade stor omfattning under mitten av 1800-talet:

Det man kan kalla nöjeslivet utspelades huvudsakligen i hemmen. Det var där man övade sig i sång och spel, det var där bekantskapsskretsen samlades för att höra de musikaliska talangerna spela eller sjunga sånger och duetter, ... Piano var det viktiga universalinstrumentet och musikhandeln fyndplatsen för de senaste danserna och sångerna. (Tegen 1982:9)

Pianot var förvisso det viktigaste instrumentet i hemmamusicerandet, men man bör dock inte underskatta gitarrens betydelse i sammanhanget. Gitarren hade också vissa fördelar jämfört med pianot: låg inköpkostnad lätt att transportera, lättare att stämma och att hantera.

Carl Johan Grafström


Carl Johan Grafström noteras 1834-1841 som 14-årig lärling hos den kände konditorn Ferdinand de la Croix (1804-1881). De la Croix var en dynamisk och företagsam person och Grafström var lärling hos honom under en expansiv period. Säkert gjorde de la Croix intryck på den unge Grafström och kanske påverkades Grafström av de intellektuella och konstnärliga miljöerna.14 Grafström var parallellt med sitt lärlingskap hos de la Croix elev vid Teknologiska institutet i Stockholm och förblev så åtminstone till 1841. Teknologiska institutet var en föregångare till KTH.

Ett musikintresse fanns tidigt hos Carl Johan Grafström. Han skriver själv i sin dagbok 1841:


Han skaffade sig också ett piano och

---

tog lektioner för en hovkapellist, för piano för direktör Carl Sillén, i harmonilära och komposition för en redan berömd musiker. Slutligen ämnade jag helt och hållet ägna mig åt musiken och blev inskriven i Musikaliska akademin såsom elev.15

Men han blir avrådd av sin lärare i komposition, som tyckte han börjat musicera för sent i livet för att bli något.


Carl Johan Grafström träffade möjlichen sin blivande hustru, Adèle Julie Boutillot (1821-1898) i Frankrike. 1848 gifter sig paret Grafström-Boutillot. Vid bröllopsakten deltar bl.a. musikhandlaren Ninian Caron som vittne.19 1849 föds första barnet, dottern Marie Pauline, och vid dopet vittnade bl.a. Ferdinand de la Croix. Från 1852 finner vi familjen bosatt på Malmortorgsgatan 8 i en fastighet som då ägdes av bokhandlaren (tillika musikförläggaren m.m.) Lars Gustaf Rylander där han också

16 Stockholms stadsarkiv, Överståthållarämbetet för uppbördsärenden, Kammerarexpeditionen, G 1 BC Registre till mantalslängder och mantalsuppgifter. Staden inre 1842 nr 1788, 1843 nr 1778, 1844 nr 1937, 1845 nr 1937.
17 Enligt vänligt e-postmeddelande 2013-02-04 från Yvonne Mårtensson.
18 Stockholms stadsarkiv, Handels- och ekonomikollegium D 1 a 1. Borgarböcker för handlande, sjökaptener m.fl. 1847-1859. Anteckningsbok öfver personer, som hos Stockholms stads Handels-Collegium anhållit om burskap...
19 Stockholms stadsarkiv, Klara kyrkoarkiv E I:8 Lysnings- och vigelböcker 1842-1851

Grafströms första publicerade skrift, *Inga giftiga färger!*, trycktes 1854 och 1856 (Biedenfeld 1854). Inom sitt yrkesområde bedrev han ett omfattande upplysnings- och förändringsarbete i föredrag och tryckta skrifter och han argumenterade utifrån sina gedigna kunskaper om hantverket, men också med vetenskaplig grund i sina kunskaper i kemi m.m.


I september 1878 flyttar Grafström till Stora Badstugatan 68 (nuvarande Sveavägen). Han säljer sin fastighet på kv. Åskeslaget 13 och drar sig tillbaka från

---

20 Stockholms stadsarkiv, Klara kyrkoarkiv C I b:8 Dopböcker över äkta barn (1828-1850) s. 509.
22 Stockholms stadsarkiv, Overståthållarämbetet för uppbördsärenden, Kamrerarexpeditionen, G 1 BB:17 Mantalsuppgift 1850, Jakobs församling nr 317.

**Sammanfattning**


24 Stockholms stadsarkiv, Justitiekollegium 1637-1856, Förmyndarkammaren 1667-1924, Rådhusrättens 1:a avdelning 1850-1924 F 1 A Bouppteckningar 1926:486.
hantverks- till industriproduktion är den mångsidige Carl Johan Grafström en intressant person. Han var en mångsysslare av stora mått och gitarrskolan är bara ett av många uttryck för detta.
KÄLLFÖRTECKNING

OTRYCKTA KÄLLOR

Carl Johan Grafströms dagbok i privat ägo.

Stockholms stadsarkiv

Adolf Fredriks kyrkoarkiv F I:13 Död- och begravningsböcker 1889-1892, 198

Adolf Fredriks kyrkoarkiv B I a:31, Inflyttningstidslängd 1891

Handels- och ekonomikollegium D 1 a 1. Borgarböcker för handlande, sjökaptener m.fl. 1847-1859. Anteckningsbok öfver personer, som hos Stockholms stads Handels-Collegium anhållit om burskap...

Jakob och Johannes kyrkoarkiv A I a:71 Husförhörståd, 1851

Jakob och Johannes kyrkoarkiv E II:9 Lysningsböcker 1873-1880

Justitiekollegium 1637-1856, Förmyndarkammaren 1667-1924, Rådhusråttens 1:a avdelning 1850-1924 F I A Bouppteckningar 1926:486

Klara kyrkoarkiv E I:8 Lysnings- och vigselböcker 1842-1851

Klara kyrkoarkiv C I b:8 Dopböcker över äkta barn (1828-1850)

Överståthållarämbetet för uppbördsärenden, Kamrerarexpeditionen, G 1 AA Kronotaxeringslängd 1841, Jakobs församling nr 75

Överståthållarämbetet för uppbördsärenden, Kamrerarexpeditionen, G 1 BA:39 Mantalslängd År 1840, Jakobs församling nr 61

Överståthållarämbetet för uppbördsärenden, Kamrerarexpeditionen, G 1 BB:2-6 Mantalsuppgifter 1835-1839, Jakobs församling 1835 nr 63, 1836 nr 65, 1837 nr 64, 1838 nr 57, 1839 nr 67.

Överståthållarämbetet för uppbördsärenden, Kamrerarexpeditionen, G 1 BC Register till mantalslängder och mantalsuppgifter. Staden inre 1842 nr 1788, 1843 nr 1778, 1844 nr 1937, 1845 nr 1937.

Överståthållarämbetet för uppbördsärenden, Kamrerarexpeditionen, G 1 BB:17 Mantalsuppgift 1850, Jakobs församling nr 317 Musik- och teaterbiblioteket
Musik och teaterbiblioteket

Kungl. Musikaliska akademiens protokoll för perioden 1830-1840. AI:a 9-12

TRYCKTA KÄLLOR


*Dagligt Allehanda* 22 september 1801.


Giertz, Martin (1979) *Den klassiska gitarren...* Stockholm: P.A. Norstedt & söners förlag


*Intelligensblad för svenska bokhandeln* No. 24 den 28 November 1857 och No. 2 den 23 januari 1858


*Stockholms Posten* 7 mars 1804


INTERNETKÄLLOR

Grafström, släkter, *Svenskt biografiskt lexikon*. Tillgänglig:

Sparr, Kenneth. *En samling äldre gitarrmusik från Skottorp slott*. Tillgänglig:

- *The Guitar in Sweden to the mid 19th Century*. Tillgänglig:


Svenskt visarkiv, *Vis- och låtregister*. Tillgänglig:
In 2003 the critical edition of Niels W. Gade’s Violin Concerto in D minor Op. 56 (1880) was published in *Niels W. Gade Works, Series I: Orchestral Works / Volume 12*, edited by Peder Kaj Pedersen (cf. *Gade-edition I:12*). This paper recapitulates the main aspects of the background, history of composition, and immediate reception of the Concerto, as they are described in the preface of the edition and documented in the critical report. Further the paper adds to the history of reception of the Concerto by describing and evaluating newly appeared sources to one of the early performances.

The scores published in the Gade-edition are both scholarly and practical (cf. Hansen 2006). About half of Gade’s output was unpublished during his lifetime, and thus, the first appearance of many works in the Gade-edition provides a basis for a fuller understanding of his music now being made available both for scholarly research and for performances. Another part of his output consists of works that for some reason or other have slipped out of the repertory, or was never established in it. This part of the works can, in the course of time and under changed conditions of reception, enter or re-enter the repertory on a basis of reliable editions according to modern standards. Gade’s Op. 56 was immediately published and performed, but it did not gain a place in what became the international standard repertory of 19th century works in the genre. Furthermore, it has not as yet been subject to scholarly study; in facts it is hardly mentioned in the literature on Gade and was never, to my knowledge, analysed more thoroughly, neither in biographical nor theoretical literature. It is symptomatic that the discography is very short. Before the appearance of the critical edition, only two complete recordings seem to exist. One is a live recording, made in 1966 (in Mono) with Kai Laursen as violin soloist, accompanied by Southern Jutland Symphony Orchestra conducted by Ole Schmidt, and included in the CD box set *Danish Violin Concertos Vol 4*, issued by Danacord. The other is a recording from 1994 with Anton Kontra as soloist, accompanied by Malmö Symphony Orchestra conducted by Paavo Järvi, issued by *BIS*. In June 2009, *Dacapo Records* issued a new recording based on the Gade-edition, on the CD album *Romantic Violin Concertos* (including Concertos by P.E. Lange-Müller and Rued Langgaard as well). The Tampere Philharmonic Orchestra, conducted by John Storgårds, accompanies the Danish violinist Christina Åstrand as soloist.
The Violin Concerto is the only Solo Concerto in Gade’s oeuvre. He was a violinist himself and thus familiar with the genre. In his youth, he had performed Louis Spohr’s violin concerto Op. 47 1838 with orchestra in Stockholm, but as a conductor, he was in closer contact with the genre than as a solo violinist. It is well known that Gade conducted the first performance of Mendelssohn’s Violin Concerto in E minor op. 64 at Gewandhaus in Leipzig. The Concerto by Mendelssohn, composed in 1845, is considered to be among the most important 19th-century concertos for the instrument, and it seems to have influenced Gade’s general concept of the genre even 35 years later, as far as the tonal and formal architecture and the different characters of the movement are concerned: Minor tonality in the first movement (e, resp. d), the slow movement in the submediant key (C, resp. Bb), and the last movement in (or concluding in) the variant Major (E, resp. D). Further shared features are the early entrance of the soloist in the first movement (bar 2, resp. b. 8), the passionate, elegiac first theme, the position of the cadenza of the first movement so that it links the development and recapitulation (299-351, resp. 207-28), the song-like lyrical second movement, in an ABA form, and the scherzo-like finale in a sonata-rondo form. Furthermore, the idea of connecting the movements, consistently used by Mendelssohn in his Violin Concerto, seems to have been considered, although not implemented, by Gade.

As a conductor of the Copenhagen Music Society from 1850 to his death, Gade accompanied a number of leading violinists, of whom especially two are important in connection with his own Concerto. In 1868 he conducted Beethoven’s Violin Concerto with Joseph Joachim, whom he had known since the Leipzig-years, as the soloist. In 1862, and again in 1865, he conducted Mendelssohn’s Concerto with Wilma Norman Neruda (1838-1911) as the soloist, and in 1867 he conducted a performance of Spohr’s op. 47 with Norman Neruda. Her role, however, seems to having been limited to being of inspiration to Gade, as she never performed the Concerto.

After having moved to Berlin in 1868, Joseph Joachim (1831-1907) had established a school of instrumental music in the Königliche Akademie der Künste (later the Königliche Hochschule für Musik). The Hochschule came to include an orchestra which Joachim conducted in public concerts. He was of great importance as an interpreter in the second half of the 19th century. As a soloist he concentrated on a rather small number of works, including the Violin Concertos by Beethoven, Mendelssohn, Brahms, Spohr, and his own concertos. His involvement in the process of composing Brahms’ Violin Concerto in D-major op. 77 (1878) is well
known. The relation between Gade and Joachim in connection with Gade’s Violin Concerto a few years later has been known since Dagmar Gade published a letter from Joachim to Gade written after having performed the violin Concerto in Berlin (Dagmar Gade (ed.) 1892:320f). The sources show that as early as 23 December 1880 Gade sent a handwritten copy of the score and solo part to Joachim, who promptly answered that he intended to play the Concerto with his orchestra at the Hochschule and asked for permission to play it publicly and to have orchestral parts written out. Gade gave the permission 1 January 1881, and the performance took place 2 February 1881 from the handwritten score and the parts copied in Berlin. Joachim suggested that he would play the Concerto in London, to where he was about to travel, and as it is shown below, it seems like a performance in Copenhagen may have been consider a little later, but actually he never seems to have played it again.

The reception was not altogether positive. A Berlin-review, not considered in the Gade-edition I:12, in the periodical Musik-Welt (19 Februar 1881:214, signed “S.”) revealed a certain disappointment:

Gade’s Werk ist weniger, als man von Gade erwarten darf; recht wirksam erscheint nur das gesangreiche Andante; der Rest präsentiert sich als noble Arbeit, nicht aber als bedeutsam oder besonders fesselnd.

Further the reviewer lamented on the present situation concerning the genre:

In der That besitzen wir doch kein einziges Violin-Concert neueren Datums, welches nach jeder Richtung hin hervorragend ware; auch das von Rüfer, so trefflich es ist, hat seine grossen Schattenseiten; und die Concerte von Brahms, von Goldmark, von Bruch wird man ebenfalls nicht alt entscheiden gelungen bezeichnen können, so viel eminente Vorzüge sie aufweisen, namentlich das von Brahms …

It is not documented that Joachim gave musical advice of any kind to Gade. It seems, however, that Joachim did not leave Gade’s score completely untouched in the Berlin-performance. The Danish violinist, later to be the soloist at the Danish first performance in late 1882, Anton Svendsen (1846-1930), in a letter told his colleague and teacher Valdemar Tofte (1932-07) that Joachim had confided to Svendsen that he had left out a part of the first allegro: “We spoke about Gade’s concerto, and he [Joachim] confided to me, to my horror, that he had deleted a section in the 1st Allegro. Heaven knows what Niels W. would say to that.” (Letter from Svendsen to Tofte, ”Preface” (Gade-edition I:12, p. IX n. 11; a “Drittbrief” not
included in Sørensen (ed.) 2008). Which part, and how long the cut was, however, was not specified.

In the press reception the concerto was generally acclaimed for the high artistic and technical level of the solo part, but the value of the Concerto as a coherent cyclic work was questioned.

The fact that Gade actually worked with the cyclical coherence of the Concerto is documented in the description of sources in Gade-edition I:12; only the final version, however, is printed in the edition, according to the principle of the Gade-edition of publishing the music in “Fassung letzer Hand” (cf. Hansen 2006). Gade seems to have had trouble especially as regards the continuity between the Second and the Third movements. There is no evidence of plans of linking the first and the second movements. In the First movement, Allegro con fuoco, in d-minor, with a second subject in F-major, the recapitulation (from bar 229) states the second subject in D-major and concludes in that key. The connection between the Second movement, Romanze. Andantino, in Bb major, and the Final movement, Rondo Scherzando. Allegro, ma non troppo in D major, has been offered some consideration by Gade. Thus: in the Romanze an important revision was made at the fair copy stage (source B as compared to source E V): the last bars of the Violin Solo part was transformed from long, sustained notes to having a richer melodic profile. Furthermore, an *attacca* beginning of the Third movement was considered (source E III cf. facs. 4 in Gade-edition I:12, p. xxii), and the music before bar 7 of the Third movement had different shapes through the process of composition (sources E VI and F). The first six bars of the final version is a sort of introduction, a change of scene, and they do not occur later in the movement.

The score and parts of the Concerto were published immediately. In late April 1881 Gade offered the Concerto to the Leipzig publishing firm Breitkopf & Härtel, and the music was published on 12 September 1881. The first three performances in Germany, after Joachim’s Berlin-performance, and based on the published material took place on 6 October 1881 in Cologne with Robert Heckmann as a soloist, and again on 13 October in Leipzig and on 3 December in Mönchen-Gladbach, also with Heckmann.

The next performance in Germany (according to Sørensen 2002: 417), the Fifth, if Joachim’s performance is included, took place on 20 January 1882 in Hamburg with Carl Bargelfhr as the violin soloist. Concerning this performance new sources have appeared, kindly made available to me by Dr. Axel Teich Gertinger. The sources include a hitherto unknown autograph letter from Gade to
“Hofkapellmeister” Bargheer, kept in the Lippische Landesbibliothek in Detmold, together with information on concert programs, and three interesting reviews by Hamburg music critics. The letter from Gade to Bargheer refers to the Hamburg performance, which had been preceded by a performance (with piano accompaniment) in Detmold on 15 December 1881.

Carl Louis Bargheer (1831-1902) was a pupil of Spohr and a friend of Brahms. After having served as leader and conductor at Detmold from 1850, he served as leader in Philharmonische Gesellschaft in Hamburg 1876-89. Gade had heard Bargheer, together with Joachim, performing a Concert for two violins by Spohr in 1878. This performance is mentioned in a letter from Gade to his wife Mathilde from Hamburg of 28 September 1878 (Letter no. 946, Sørensen (ed.) 2008:1185-87).

A facsimile of Gade’s letter to Bargheer is shown below, and the letter is transcribed in extenso here:


As can be seen, Gade comments on tempo-indications, but principally he leaves the interpretation to Bargehr.

In the Hamburg program, Gade’s Concerto was framed by two symphonies: a Symphony in F-major Op. 9 by Hermann Götz and Symphony No. 3 in a-minor by Mendelssohn. Of the performance in Hamburg three reviews are known, of which two shall be considered here. The composer Ludwig Meinardus (1827-96), from 1874 was a “Musikkorrespondent” in Hamburg, wrote a very positive review. He saw Gade’s Concerto as “Ein überaus liebenswerthes Erzeugniss virtuoser Violin-Composition” and articulated a well-known figure in the reception of Gade in Germany, an imagined Nordic element:

Die drei stilmäßen Sätze desselben wetteifern mit einander in Ergiebungen des lautertesten, freundlichsten Gesangsausdruckes, gewürzt mit Anklängen und melodischen Wendungen der eigenartigen Volksweisen des Nordens, die hie und da –
z.B. in Dalekarlien und im schottischen Hochlande uralte Erinnerungen aus vorchristlicher Zeit wie schwach nachleuchtende Streiflichter in die Gegenwart herüberstrahlen.

A central issue of the Concerto genre was reflected:


The review concluded that:

Die meisten neueren Erscheinungen dieser Gattung reichen in der bezeichneten Richtung nicht entfernt an das d-moll Concert von Gade heran. …”

The other Hamburg review had a more negative approach to the Concerto. It was written by another composer, Emil Krause (1840-1916), who had studied at the Leipzig Conservatory and after graduation had returned to Hamburg as a teacher. He wrote critiques for the Hamburg Fremdenblatt for more than forty years, and was a professor at the Hamburg Conservatory from 1885. He suggested that a performance by Joachim in Copenhagen may have been planned or considered:

Das neue Violin-Concert von Gade erschien Anfang dieses Winters und hat bis jetzt erst wenige Vorführungen erlebt, die erste durch Heckmann in Köln, eine zweite im Leipziger Gewandhause; demnächst steht der Vortrag des Werkes durch Joachim in Kopenhagen bevor.

The factual foundation of this information is not known, however, and, as mentioned, no such performance is documented to have taken place. The review suggested that the Concerto hardly at all was worth performing:

Musikalisch Neues enthält die Composition jedoch nicht das Geringste, denn der Tonsetzer ergeht sich fast ausschließlich im oft Dagewesenen und daher auch in Dem, was man schon in früheren seiner Werke vernommen. Ueberall sind es die schon
The reviewer admitted, however:

Daß natürlich eine feinfühlende Natur, wie Gade, der über die Tonkunst in allen einzelnen Bestandtheilen vollkommen gebietet, nie etwas Unedles oder gar Triviales schreiben wird, ist selbstredend, dagegen läßt sich jedoch nicht behaupten, daß in dem steten Einerlei von weichen und gar sentimentalen Tongestalten für den Musiker irgend etwas von Interesse vorhanden wäre.

The score called for an extremely competent performer, as was the case with Bargehr:

Man hört das Concert, in dem nebenbei bemerkt die Principalstimme kaum eine einzige wesentliche Pause enthält, nur mit ungetheilter Aufmerksamkeit an, wenn es wie heute so meistergültig seitens der Solopartie wie des Orchesters executirt wird. In dieser trefflichen Vereinigung beider Factoren zum einheitlichen Ganzen lag die künstlerische Bedeutung der Leistung.

The reviewer considered the Second movement to be the most satisfying of the three:

Wollte man von den drei umfangreichen Sätzen des Werkes einen als den in der Composition am besten gerathenen hervorheben, so könnte dies nur die Romanze sein ...

It is clear that the Concerto soon lost the attraction of being a novelty by at foreign composer with a reputation in Germany. Rather early, the Concerto was performed incompletely, the first movement only, for instance on 26 January 1885 in Kassel. In 1885, the Concerto was only represented by one single performance of the first movement.

The label of the Åstrand-album including Gade’s Concerto, *Danish Romantic Concertos*, provides a key word in connection with a “rehabilitation” of Gade’s concerto: Romanticism and the part of Danish cultural heritage which could be labelled as romantic, as far as music is concerned, has become a new possibility in musical life in recent decades, while being discredited during most part of the 20th century. That is an opportunity, also seen in the perspective of the Gade-edition.
REFERENCES


Letter from Niels W. Gade to Carl Louis Bargheer

Lippische Landesbibliothek, Detmold, Mus-h 1B79
MARIT HØYE

SEQUENCES OF GERMAN ORIGIN AT NIDAROS

The archdiocese of Nidaros was established in the medieval town of Nidaros - today named Trondheim - during the winter 1152-53.¹ The liturgical use of the new archdiocese was notated in the *Ordo Nidrosiensis Ecclesiae* ² of the early thirteenth century. Interesting structures can be seen in the building of this liturgical repertory, first of all in the choice and placement of songs derived from other liturgical practices. Chants in the Nidaros repertory show influences from different geographical regions, and the ecclesiastical use at Nidaros seems to have been the result of a conscious selection of chants and readings from European ecclesiastical centres. Between English and Norwegian practice there is a similarity not only in repertoire but also in certain festal assignments. Calvin Bower identified forty sequences of German origin in the Nidaros repertory and he showed that four English manuscripts in particular exhibit repertory and liturgical functions common to the German repertory of Nidaros (Bower 2006:119-134).

The aim of this study is to examine whether such a Western influence is reflected also in the transmission of individual songs. Did sequences of German origin arrive in Nidaros via England or France? To answer this, five German sequences will be examined: *Iohannes Iesu Christo, Laudes salvatori, Sacerdotem Christi, Virginis venerande* and *Sancti spiritus assit*. I will compare the transmission of the sequence melodies in surviving Nidaros sources³ to melodic variants found in English and Continental sources, to identify melodic relationships with other regions and possible paths of transmission for these five sequences to Nidaros.

Sequences of German Origin

Notker Balbulus (c. 840-912), a monk of St Gall in Switzerland, is the first known composer of sequences. In his famous pre-word to his *Liber hymnorum*, “Book of Hymns”, he describes a new type of song that arrived in St Gall from France (c.f.

¹ The area had earlier been a provincial see that was subject to the archbishop of Hamburg-Bremen and later the archbishop of Lund.
² Edited by Gjerlow in 1968.
³ Manuscripts that were in use at Nidaros in the medieval ages only survived in fragmented form.
Crocker 1977:1-14). Notker wrote a number of new texts or proses to these songs and they were preserved for the posterity in his *Liber hymnorum*.

Three of the five sequences here concerned are ascribed to Notker. These are *Iohannes Iesu Christo* (AH53:168) 4 *Sancti spiritus* (AH53:70) and *Laudes salvatori* (AH53:36). The sequence *Virginis venerande* (AH53:246) is ascribed to one of Notker’s students, and *Sacerdotem Christi* (AH53:181) was written by a poet active at St Gall a little later, in the tenth century (Brunner 1999:xl & lxiii). All five sequences appear in the earliest surviving sources with musical notation from the German-speaking area, SG 381 from St Gall and Ei 121 from Einsiedeln, both from the tenth century.5 The sequences spread to Italy, France and England and three centuries later they were in use at Nidaros where they were included in the *Ordo Nidrosiensis Ecclesiae* together with the more than 111 sequences in the official Nidaros repertory.6

An examination of the five German sequences in medieval manuscripts from England and the Continent revealed that all five sequences show quite a consistent use of melodic motives that separate between an Anglo-French, or former West Frankish, and a German, or former East Frankish, melodic transmission. However, a small group of manuscripts was found to mix features from the two traditions. This applied in particular to northeast French manuscripts from Lille, Laon, St Stephen at Arne and Verdun7 together with Lo 18032 from Belgium, Ta 237 from Preetz near Kiel and a few manuscripts from the area around Cologne.

In the following I will show a few characteristic examples of regional melodic variation in each of the five sequences.8 Then, I will discuss in what way such regional features are transmitted with melodies notated in manuscripts that were in use at Nidaros in the Middle Ages.

---

4 *Analecta hymnica medii aevi,* vol. 53 (= Blume 1911).
6 One hundred and eleven pieces are included in the *Ordo Nidrosiensis Ecclesiae* by the main hands and later hands add seven. Several more sequences are notated in the sixteenth century *Missale Nidrosiensis* and in the Norwegian manuals. For more detailed information, see Gjerlow 1968:431-432.
7 Cai 61, La 263, Pa 833 and VN 98, VN 130, VN 759 in my collection of manuscripts.
8 A complete analysis of variants in the five sequence melodies remains outside the scope of the current study.
Transmission and Variants

The transmission of Notker’s *Iohannes Iesu Christo*\(^9\) shows a number of small but quite consistent melodic variants persistent to Anglo-French manuscripts or to manuscripts from the German-speaking realm. In Example 1 I give a transcription of the full melody, all eight phrases, from two manuscripts to give an overview of the type of variant material common to these songs. Example 1 shows a transcription of *Iohannes Iesu Christo* from St Gall (SG 546), representing a German melodic version, and from Rouen (Pa 904), representing an Anglo-French melodic version. Points of melodic variance between the two traditions are marked with boxes.\(^{10}\) The example shows that variations between the two traditions most often concern a different direction in the melodic line or the use of different intervals. In phrase 4 the German tradition gives tone repetition in M1 and the interval of a third, G-b-G, in M2, while the Anglo-French tradition gives stepwise motions: b-a-b in M1 and G-a-G in M2. Melodic variations between the two traditions in the transmission of *Iohannes Iesu Christo* are not extensive but they are remarkably persistent.

*Laudes salvatoris*\(^{11}\) is another of Notker’s sequences. Phrases 3 and 5 of this melody transmit a recurrent melodic motive that behaves differently when notated in manuscripts from the Anglo-French and in manuscripts from the German-speaking area. Example 2 shows the Anglo-French version, represented by the Rouen manuscript Pa 904, that ascends step-wise from D to b, and the German version, represented by the Moosburg Gradual MüU 156, that makes a leap a-c at the top, thus avoiding the b. These variants are quite stable and particular to manuscripts from each area. However, a manuscript from the northeast part of France, VN 98, uses both the Anglo-French and the German variant in its phrase 5 of this melody.

The melody of *Sacerdotem Christi*\(^{12}\) shows several examples of motivic variation particular to Anglo-French manuscripts and to manuscripts from the German speaking area. Example 3 shows seven small melodic motives that occur throughout the nine phrases of *Sacerdotem Christi* and that are transmitted differently in the Anglo-

---

\(^9\) For a transcription of the melody, see also Crocker 1977:148, and Brunner 1999:8f.

\(^{10}\) I have, however, only marked the differences that appear between the main groups of manuscripts in the two traditions. There are still individual differences between the two melodic transcriptions that are only found in this or in a few more manuscripts. Such differences are not accounted for here.

\(^{11}\) For a transcription of the melody, see Crocker 1977:106f.

\(^{12}\) For a transcription of the melody, see Brunner 1999:65-67.
French tradition represented by the English Ox 5, and in the German tradition represented by Mü 19267 from Regensburg. An important difference between the two melodic traditions is that the German version uses tone repetition to a larger extent than the Anglo-French version in phrases 2, 3 and 4. In phrase 1 the interval is extended to G–c instead of the Anglo-French G–b, and phrase 9 gives intervallic movements in Mü 19267 compared to the stepwise descending melodic motive of Ox 5. The melodic variants seem to be quite consistent between the two regional traditions.

The sequence *Virginis venerande*\(^\text{13}\) consists of seven melodic phrases. Four of these, phrases 1, 2, 4 and 5 are closely related melodically. These four phrases give distinct variant readings in Anglo-French and in German manuscripts, respectively, as can be seen in phrase 2 of Example 4. In the melodic transcription we recognise the tone repetition and the descending leap c–a, instead of the Anglo-French b–a, as German melodic features, here transmitted in the manuscript Ei 366 from Einsiedeln.

Notker’s sequence *Sancti spiritus*\(^\text{14}\) was widely disseminated in both the German speaking and the Anglo-French area at an early time, and it has a large number of manuscript concordances throughout Europe. The most immediately striking feature of this melody is the variation in finals over its last five phrases. While the final of the eight first phrases are always on G, the final of phrases 9-10 can be on G or d and the final of phrases 11-13 can be on G, c or d in various manuscripts (see Table 1). An examination of 60 diastematic concordances for this song shows that manuscripts from the German-speaking area transmit phrases 9 and 10 of this melody in G while English and French manuscripts transmit the corresponding phrases in d. Example 5 gives a transcription of phrases 9-10 in Aug 1011 from Augsburg representing a German melodic version and in Cdg 710 from Dublin representing an Anglo-French version.\(^\text{15}\) Further, only English and French manuscripts transmit phrases 11-13 in the higher register, on c or d. The c-final version is the more common of the two and d-final versions seem to be mainly

---

\(^{13}\) For a transcription of the melody, see Brunner 1999:21f.

\(^{14}\) For a transcription of the melody, see Crocker 1977:200f, and Brunner 1999:38-40.

\(^{15}\) A few exceptions are found in manuscripts from areas where a blending of French and German characteristics are known to often take place: two manuscripts from the northwest part of Germany, Köl 156 and Du 12, transmit phrases 9-10 in d, while a few manuscripts from the northeast part of France, VN 98, VN 130, VN 759, Cai 61 and Pa 833, and two manuscripts from Aquitaine, Pa 887 and Pa 1086, transmit phrases 9-10 in G.
notated in North French or related Norman-Sicilian manuscripts. All German manuscripts transmit phrases 11-13 in G.

In all five sequences discussed above, I have identified melodic variants particular to a transmission in Anglo-French manuscripts or in manuscripts from the German speaking area, respectively. Now I will use these variants as reference when examining sequence melodies in the fragmented Nidaros sources, to discuss regional melodic influence in these manuscript fragments as well as possible paths of transmission to Nidaros for these five sequences of German origin.

Sequence Melodies in Fragmented Nidaros sources

Altogether thirteen fragmented manuscripts that were in use at Nidaros transmit the five sequence melodies (Table 2). Three manuscripts are of Icelandic origin, two were written in Norway, four are possibly of Norwegian origin, three are suggested to be from Scandinavia or Germany and one manuscript was written in France.

*Iohannes Iesu Christo* survived in five Nidaros manuscripts. Example 6 shows phrases 2 and 6 of the sequence in four Nidaros manuscripts that transmit these phrases. Hs 1, Hs 3 and Oslo 1101 transmit melodic versions that are closely related to the transcription from the French Pa 904 (see Example 1, phrases 2 and 6). Accordingly, the scribes of these manuscripts would have been influenced from traditions in France or England. Oslo 418 and Oslo 571 transmit the sequence with mixed melodic regional features. Oslo 418 transmits German melodic features in phrase 2 and Western melodic features in phrase 6 (Example 6). Oslo 571 transmits only two phrases of *Iohannes Iesu Christo*, phrases 6 and 7, and these are not complete. However, Example 7 shows that Oslo 571 follows the German tradition in the cadence of phrase 6, while phrase 7 follows the Anglo-French tradition over (ce-) te-ris Ver-(bum). Such a blending of features from the two traditions most often point to areas in the northeast of France, the Low Countries or northwest Germany. A closer comparison with manuscripts from these areas reveal a likeness with melodies in manuscripts from the northeast part of France for Oslo 418, while the melodic

---

16 The Norman-Sicilian manuscript Ma 19421 gives all three last phrases of *Sancti spiritus* in d. Some manuscripts also give one or two of these phrases in d, together with one or two c-final phrases: Ma 289 gives *Sancti spiritus* with phrase 11 in d, while Chr 520, Li 2 and Pa 9437 give the sequence with c-finals in phrases 11-12 and d-final in phrase 13.

17 In particular with La 263 from Laon, but also with Pa 833 from St. Stephen at Arne.
variance in Oslo 571 adheres closely to the melody as notated in two manuscripts from the northwest part of Germany.\(^\text{18}\)

*Laudes salvatori* survived in one Nidaros manuscript only, the Icelandic Hs 1. The surviving fragment transmits only the first eight phrases of the melody. However, the melodic lines of phrases 3 and 5 in Hs 1 ascend step-wise from D to b, thus corresponding closely to the French manuscript Pa 904 of Example 2. The notation of phrases 3 and 5 in Hs 1 suggest an influence from traditions in the Anglo-French area onto the melody in this manuscript.

*Sacerdotem Christi* is also transmitted in Hs 1 and at each of the variant points shown above in Example 3, the melody notated in Hs 1 adheres to the Anglo-French melodic tradition represented by Ox 5.\(^\text{19}\) Oslo 418 on the other hand, displays a blending of the two traditions also with this sequence melody. Example 8 shows that four of the seven melodic motives that were compared in Example 3, the first motive of phrase 1 and phrases 2, 3 and 9, comply with Ox 5 and the Anglo French melodic tradition. The second motive of phrase 1 is, however, notated in accordance with the German melodic tradition represented by Mü 19267.\(^\text{20}\)

*Virginis venerande* has two concordances in the Icelandic Hs 1 together with one concordance in Oslo 418. With this sequence, however, all three concordances in the two manuscripts transmit the German melodic variant notated in Ei 366 of Example 4. In Oslo 978 only the melody of phrases 6 and 7 survived and any regional influence on this manuscript is therefore difficult to decide. Oslo 843 and Oslo 986 on the other hand, both transmit the Anglo-French tradition represented by As 695. Oslo 843 was previously suggested to be of Scandinavian or German origin (Ommundsen 2008, II:118). However, the transmission of Anglo-French melodic features in Oslo 843 makes a German origin for this manuscript less probable. Thus, my findings further support the notion of a Scandinavian origin for this fragmented manuscript.

*Sancti spiritus* has seven concordances in surviving Nidaros manuscripts. Only the Icelandic Køb 138-4 adheres to the German melodic tradition for this sequence, when transmitting phrases 9-10 of the melody with G-final. Six fragmented manuscripts transmit the melody with phrases 9-10 in d. Thus, six of the seven

\(^{18}\) Du 19 from Düsseldorf and Kol 261 from Cologne.

\(^{19}\) Only five of the seven melodic motives of Example 3 survived in the fragmented Hs 1. Thus we do not have access to the first motive of phrase 1a or phrase 9 from this manuscript.

\(^{20}\) The second motive of phrase 3 and the motive of phrase 4 did not survive in Oslo 418.
Nidaros fragments follow an Anglo-French melodic tradition for this sequence. Further, three of the six manuscripts move to c and two changes between c- and d-finals in their transmission of phrases 11-13. A more detailed study of the melodic variants has previously revealed a close relationship with Norman and Norman-Sicilian manuscripts, e.g. Pa 10508 and Ma 289, for the surviving parts of five fragments: Oslo 250, Oslo 664, Oslo 870, Oslo 986 and Oslo 952. The sixth melodic transmission, notated in Hs 1, is characterised by blending Anglo-French and German features in a manner similar to, in particular, the northeast French La 263. Hs 1 and La 263 both give the German version of M1 in phrase 2 together with the Anglo-French version of M2 in phrase 5 as shown in Example 9.

Summary

This study has identified characteristic regional melodic variations particular to the Anglo-French and the German tradition, respectively, in the transmission of five German sequences - *Iohannes Iesu Christo, Laudes salvatori, Sacerdotem Christi, Virginis venerande* and *Sancti spiritus assit*.

Further analyses of the sequences in medieval sources from the use of Nidaros have revealed how each individual chant would seem to have arrived in Nidaros via several different routes. Individual fragments transmitting *Iohannes Iesu Christo* have been shown to relate to melody traditions from the general Anglo-French area, the northeast part of France and the northwest part of Germany, respectively. One of the two Nidaros fragments transmitting *Sacerdotem Christi* shows influence from the Anglo-French area. The second fragment, however, shows a blending of Anglo-French and German melody traditions, which points to influence from northeast France or the Low Countries. The Nidaros transmission has only one surviving concordance for *Laudes salvatori* and the melodic variation identified in this source points to the Anglo-French area. *Virginis venerande* on the other hand, would seem to have arrived in Nidaros from both Anglo-French and from German-speaking areas. Finally, melodic variants of the sequence *Sancti spiritus* can, in individual Nidaros sources, be traced to Normandy, to the northeast part of France or to Germany.

---

21 For this study and a broader discussion regarding the transmission of *Sancti spiritus* and characteristic melodic features in each of the Nidaros manuscript fragments, see Høye 2012.

22 This combination is also found in a sixteenth century manuscript from Wesel, Köl 156, but it is otherwise rarely found outside the Swedish, Norwegian and Icelandic sources.
While this study has shown that all five German sequences survived in Nidaros manuscripts also with Anglo-French melodic features, it has proved difficult to identify a particular relationship with English sources. For these five sequences I find instead that characteristic melodic features tend to lean more towards France, particularly Normandy and the northeast part of France.
**List of Manuscripts Consulted**

- **Aag 1**  Aargauische Kantonsbibliothek, Ms WettFm 1
- **As 695**  Assisi, Biblioteca del Sacro Covento, 695
- **Aug 1011**  Augsburg, Diözesanmuseum, DMA 1011
- **Cai 61**  Cambrai, Bibliothèque Municipale, 61
- **Cdg 710**  Cambridge, University Library, Add. 710
- **Chr 520**  Chartres, Bibliothèque Municipale, 520
- **Col 317**  Colmar, Bibliothèque Municipale, 317 (cat. 232)
- **Du 12**  Düsseldorf, Universitätsbibliothek, D-12
- **Du 19**  Düsseldorf, St. Lambertus, 19
- **Du 21**  Düsseldorf, St. Lambertus, 21
- **Ei 121**  Einsiedeln, Stiftsbibliothek, 121
- **Ei 366**  Einsiedeln, Stiftsbibliothek, 366
- **Eusk 1**  Euskirchen, Kath. pfarrei St. Martin 1
- **Eusk 2**  Euskirchen, Kath. pfarrei St. Martin 2
- **Graz 17**  Graz, Universitätsbibliothek, 17
- **Hs 1**  Copenhagen, Det Arnamagnæanske Institut, Hs 1 *Missale Scardense*
- **Hs 3**  Copenhagen, Det Arnamagnæanske Institut, Hs 3
- **Hr 5**  Muzeum východních Čech v Hradci Králové, Hr 5
- **Ker 9**  Kerpen, Karh. pfarrei St. Martinus, 9
- **Ker 10**  Kerpen, Karh. pfarrei St. Martinus, 10
- **Ker 98**  Kerpen, Karh. pfarrei St. Martinus, 98
- **Køb 138-4**  Copenhagen, Royal Library, NKS 138-4
- **Köln 156**  Köln, Erzbischöfliche Diözesan- und Dombibliothek, 156
- **Köln 220**  Köln, Erzbischöfliche Diözesan- und Dombibliothek, 220
- **Köln 226**  Köln, Erzbischöfliche Diözesan- und Dombibliothek, 226
- **Köln 229**  Köln, Erzbischöfliche Diözesan- und Dombibliothek, 229
- **Köln 261**  Köln, Erzbischöfliche Diözesan- und Dombibliothek, 261
- **Köln 1001b**  Köln, Erzbischöfliche Diözesan- und Dombibliothek, 1001b
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Library, Location, Manuscript Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>La 263</td>
<td>Laon, Bibliothèque Municipale, 263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li 2</td>
<td>Limoges, Bibliothèque Municipale, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo 18032</td>
<td>London, British Library, Add. 18032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo 14</td>
<td>London, British Library Cotton Caligula, A.xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo 3759</td>
<td>London, British Library, Egerton 3759</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo 622</td>
<td>London, British Library, Harley 622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo 3965</td>
<td>London, British Library, Harley 3965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo 4</td>
<td>London, British Library, Royal 2.B.iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 289</td>
<td>Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, 289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 19421</td>
<td>Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, 19421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 20-4</td>
<td>Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, 20-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mü 19267</td>
<td>München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 19267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MüU 156</td>
<td>Munich, Universitätsbibliothek, 2 156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O Lv 59</td>
<td>Czech Republic, Vlastivédný ústav muzeum v Olomouc, R 59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 251</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 418</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 571</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 664</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 843</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 870</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 952</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 952</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 978</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 986</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 1101</td>
<td>Oslo, Riksarkivet, Lat. fragm. 1101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ox 5</td>
<td>Oxford, Bodleian Library, Lat. liturg. b.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PaA 135</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque de l’Arsenal, 135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 778</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 778</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 830</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 833</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 833</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 887</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Code</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 904</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 1086</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 1086</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 1105</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 1105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 1112</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 1112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 1118</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 1118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 9437</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 9437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 10508</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 10508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 10511</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 10511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 13524</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 13254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 14819</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, lat. 14819</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 3126</td>
<td>Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, nouv. acq. lat. 3126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PaK</td>
<td>Praha, Statni Knihovna CSR, XXIII.A.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rei 227</td>
<td>Reims, Bibliothèque Municipale, 227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD 74</td>
<td>St. Dié, Bibliothèque Municipale, 74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SG 381</td>
<td>St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, 381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SG 383</td>
<td>St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, 383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SG 484</td>
<td>St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, 484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SG 546</td>
<td>St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek, 546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMi 73</td>
<td>Saint-Mihiel, Bibliothèque Municipale, 73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SolS III</td>
<td>Zentralbibliothek Solothurn, S III 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tal 237</td>
<td>Tallin, Historical Museum, 237.1.228a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VN 98</td>
<td>Verdun, Bibliothèque municipale, 98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VN 130</td>
<td>Verdun, Bibliothèque municipale, 759</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VN 759</td>
<td>Verdun, Bibliothèque municipale, 75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LITERATURE CITED


Table 1

Examples of the use of finals in phrases 9-13 of *Sancti spiritus* in individual manuscripts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript</th>
<th>Location/Region</th>
<th>Phrases 9-13 in</th>
<th>Phrases 11-13 in</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mü 19267</td>
<td>Regensburg, xiv</td>
<td>in <em>G</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo 14</td>
<td>England, xii</td>
<td>9-10 in <em>d</em></td>
<td>11-13 in <em>G</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pa 10508</td>
<td>Normandy, xii</td>
<td>9-10 in <em>d</em></td>
<td>11-13 in <em>c</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ma 19421</td>
<td>Catania, Sicily, xii</td>
<td>9-13 in <em>d</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript</th>
<th>Provenance</th>
<th>Sequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hs 1</td>
<td>Iceland, xv 3/4</td>
<td><em>Iohannes Iesu Christo</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Laudes salvatori</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Sacerdotem Christi</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Sancti spiritus assit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Virginis venerande</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hs 3</td>
<td>Iceland, xv</td>
<td><em>Iohannes Iesu Christo</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Sancti spiritus assit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kob 138-4</td>
<td>Iceland, xvi</td>
<td><em>Sancti spiritus assit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 251</td>
<td>France, xii</td>
<td><em>Iohannes Iesu Christo</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 418</td>
<td>Norway, xiii</td>
<td><em>Sacerdotem Christi</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Virginis venerande</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 571</td>
<td>Scandinavia or Germany (?)</td>
<td><em>Iohannes Iesu Christo</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 664</td>
<td>France (or Norway?), xii</td>
<td><em>Sancti spiritus assit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 843</td>
<td>Scandinavia or Germany (?)</td>
<td><em>Virginis venerande</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 870</td>
<td>Norway (?), xii/xiii</td>
<td><em>Sancti spiritus assit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 952</td>
<td>Norway (or Sweden?), xv</td>
<td><em>Sancti spiritus assit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 978</td>
<td>Norway (?), xv</td>
<td><em>Virginis venerande</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 986</td>
<td>Norway, xv</td>
<td><em>Sancti spiritus assit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oslo 1101</td>
<td>Norway (?), xv</td>
<td><em>Virginis venerande</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

25 http://www.kb.dk/permalink/2006/manus/17/dan/ (Manuscript online), fol. 55v-57r.
29 Ommundsen 2007 II:175-177, facsimile on p. 176.
30 Ommundsen 2007 II:118-121. Facsimile in Eggen 1968 II: pl. 149-152.
Example 1

_Iohannes Iesu Christo_

1. Io-han-nes, le-su Chri-sto mul-tum di-le-c te vir-go,

2a. Tu e-ius a-mo-re car-na-lem
2b. In na-vi pa-ren-tem li-qui-sti.

3a. Tu le-ve con-iu-gis pe-ctus re-spu-sti Mes-si-am se-cu-ius,

4a. Tu-que in ter-ra po-si-tus glo-ni-am con-spe-xi-sti fi-li- i De-i,

5a. Te Chri-stus in cru-ce tri-um-phans ma-tri su-ae de-dit cu-sto-dem,
5b. Ut vir-go vir-gi-nem ser-va-res at-que cu-ram sup-pe-di-ta-res.
Example 2

_Laudes salvatorii, Phrase 3_

3a Car-ne glo-ri-am de-i-ta-tis oc-cu-lens
3b Io-seph, Ma-ri-ae, Si-me-on-i sub-di-tur;

MuU 156
Example 3

Points of melodic variation in *Sacerdotem Christi*, Phrases 1a, 2, 3, 4 and 9

Ox 5

1a *Sa-cer-do-(tem)*

(Marti-)num cun-cta

Mü 19267

Ox 5

2a (Panno-)ni-a lae-te-(tur)

2b (Ita-) li- a ex-sul-(tet)

Mü 19267

Ox 5

3a Gal-li-ae

(divi-)si- o sa-cro cer-tet

3b pa-ri-ter

pa-trem o-mnes gau-de-(ant)

Mü 19267

Ox 5

4a (Ger-)ma-ni-ae

9a cun-cti po-sci-mus,

4b Do-mi-num

9b cae-lo gra-ti-am

Mü 19267
Example 4

*Virginitis venerande*, Phrase 2

As 695

2a *Fi-li-ae ma-tris sum-mi re-gis sa-cro-sancta Ma-ri-ae,*
2b *Quam si-bi in so-ro-rem De-i ad-o-pta-vit fi-li-us.*

Ei 366

Example 5

*Sancti spiritus*, Phrases 9 and 10 in G and in d

Aug 1011

9a *Tu a-ni-ma-bus vi-vi-fi-can-dis a-guas fe-cun-das;*
9b *Tu a-spi-ran-do das spi-ri-ta-les es-se ho-mi-nes.*

10a *Tu di-vi-sum per lin-guas mun-dum et ri-tus ad-u-na-sti, Do-mi-ne,*
10b *I-do-la-tras ad cul-tum De-i re-vo-cas, ma-gi-stro-rum op-ti-me.*

*Final on G:** Aug 1011, Ei 366, MuU 156, Ker 9, Köl 1001b, Köl 226, Köl 261, SolS III, Köl 229, Graz 17, Eusk 1, Du 21, Eusk 2, Köl 220, Ker 10, Ker 98, Mü 19267, Tal 237, OLV 59, Hr 5, PaK, SG 546, SG 383, Lo 18032, VN 98, VN 130, VN 759, Ca 61, Pa 833, Pa 887, Pa 1086.

Cdg 710

9a *Tu a-ni-ma-bus vi-vi-fi-can-dis a-guas fe-cun-das;*
9b *Tu a-spi-ran-do das spi-ri-ta-les es-se ho-mi-nes.*

10a *Tu di-vi-sum per lin-guas mun-dum et ri-tus ad-u-na-sti, Do-mi-ne,*
10b *I-do-la-tras ad cul-tum De-i re-vo-cas, ma-gi-stro-rum op-ti-me.*

*Final on d:** Cdg 710, Ox 5, PaA 135, Lo 14, Lo 3759, Lo 3965, Lo 622, Ma 19421, Ma 20-4, Ma 289, Pa 10508, Chr 520, Pa 1112, Pa 14819, Pa 830, Pa 904, Pa 1105, Pa 13254, As 695, Lu 263, Pa 9437, Pa 10511, Pa 3126, Li 2, SMi 73, Pa 778, Col 317, Köl 156, Du 12.
Example 6

*Johannes Iesu Christo, Phrase 2*

Hs 1

2a Tu e-ius a-mo-re car-na-len
2b In na-vi pa-ren-tem li-qui-sti.

Hs 3

O 1101

O 418

*Johannes Iesu Christo, Phrase 6*

Hs 1

6a Tu-te car-ce-re fla-gris-que fra-ctus te-sti-mo-ni-o pro Chi-sti es ga-vi-sus;
6b I-dem mor-tu-os sus-ci-tas in-que le-su no-mi-ne ve-ne-num for-te vin-cis.

Hs 3

O 1101

O 418

Example 7

*Johannes Iesu Christo from Oslo 571, Phrases 6 and 7*

6b (I-dem mor)-tu-os sus-ci-(tas in-que le-su no-mi-ne ve)-ne-num for(-te vin-cis).

7a (Ti-bi sum-mus) ta-ci-tum (ce-te-ris Ver-bum su-um) pa-ter re-(ve-lat).
7b (Tu nos o-mnes pre-ci-bus) se-du-lis a- (pud De-um sem-per com-men-da),
Example 8

_Sacerdotem Christi_ from Oslo 418, Phrases 1a, 2, 3 and 9.

1a *Sa-ker-do-(tem)*  (Martii-)num cun-cta

2a (Panno-)ni-a lae-te-(tur)
2b (Ita-) li- a ex-sul-(tet)

3a Gal-li-ae
3b pa-ri-ter

9a cun-cti po-sci-mus,
9b cae-lo gra-ti-am
Example 9

_Sancti spiritus, Phrase 2_

Hs 1
Nidaros, Sweden, German-speaking area

La 263

Pa 10508
England, France

_Sancti spiritus, Phrase 5_

Hs 1
Nidaros, Sweden, England, France

La 263

SG 546
German-speaking area